

# A'WIL MUKHTALIF AL-HADİT

## AN ANNOTATED TRANSLATION

CHE AMNAH BAHARI

قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ ﷺ

أَسْأَلُكَ غِنَايَ وَغِنَى مَوْلَايَ

قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ ﷺ

اللَّهُمَّ أَحْيِنِي مَسْكِينًا وَأَمِتْنِي مَسْكِينًا

قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ ﷺ

مَنْ قَالَ لَا إِلَهَ إِلَّا اللَّهُ دَخَلَ الْجَنَّةَ

قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ ﷺ

لَا يَزِينِي الزَّائِقُ حِينَ يَزِينِي وَهُوَ مُؤْمِنٌ



IIUM Press







***TA'WĪL MUKHTALIF***  
***AL-ḤADĪTH:***  
**AN ANNOTATED**  
**TRANSLATION**

**Che Amnah Bahari**



**IIUM Press**



Published by:  
IIUM Press  
International Islamic University Malaysia

First Edition, 2009  
©IIUM Press, IIUM

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without any prior written permission of the publisher.

Perpustakaan Negara Malaysia

Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

Ta'wil Mukhtalif al-Hadith: An Annotated Translation/  
Che Amnah Bahari  
Bibliography: p. 435  
ISBN 978-983-3855-89-6

ISBN: 978-983-3855-89-6

# Contents

Preface	ix
Acknowledgements	xi
Technical Notes	xiii
Abbreviations	xv

Introduction	1
--------------	---

Translation of <i>Ta'wīl Mukhtalif al-Ḥadīth</i>	29
--	----

## Chapter One

The People of *Kalām* and the People of *Ra'y*

A. (Reproaches Addressed Against Them)	41
3. Scholars of the People of <i>Kalām</i>	
I. Ibrāhīm Sayyār al-Nazzām	45
II. Abū al-Hudhayl al-'Allāf	75
III. 'Ubayd Allāh ibn al-Ḥasan	77
IV. Bakr al-'Ammī	79
V. Hishām ibn al-Ḥakam	80
VI. Thumāmah	81
VII. Muḥammad ibn al-Jahm al-Barmakī	82
VIII. Aṣḥāb al-Ra'y	84
IX. Al-Jāḥiẓ	93
2. Caution on the People of <i>Kalām</i>	95
2. The Exegesis of the People of <i>Kalām</i> and the People of <i>Ra'y</i>	103
i. The Exegesis of the Rāfiḍites	107

## Chapter Two

The People of *Ḥadīth*

I. <i>Ḥadīth</i> Criticism	113
II. The Misuse of <i>Ḥadīth</i> by the People of <i>Ḥadīth</i>	120



### Chapter Three

Allegation of *Aḥadīth* Said to Contradict al-Qur'ān;  
*Aḥadīth* Invalidated by *Nazar*, *Hujjah al-'Aql* (Reason),  
*'Iyān* (Experience), *Khabar*, *Ijmā'* (Consensus)  
 and *Qiyās* (Analogy)

I.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Said to Contradict al-Qur'ān	129
II.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	133
III.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	134
IV.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	136
V.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> that Contradicts the Book of Almighty Allāh	137
VI.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by Consensus	139
VII.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Said to be Invalidated by <i>Nazar</i> (assumption) and Reason	141
VIII.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Said to be Invalidated by Experience ( <i>'Iyān</i> )	144
IX.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by <i>Nazar</i> and Reason ( <i>Hujjah al-'Aql</i> )	145
X.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	147
XI.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	154
XII.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	156
XIII.	Example of a Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	160
XIV.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	162
XV.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	164
XVI.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by al-Qur'ān	166
XVII.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated al-Qur'ān	167
XVIII.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Said to be Invalidated by <i>Nazar</i> , <i>'Iyān</i> , <i>Sunnah</i> and al-Qur'ān	169
XIX.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	171
XX.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by <i>Nazar</i> and <i>Khabar</i>	172
XXI.	Examples of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	178
XXII.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> which Contradicts in Its Beginning and Ending	181
XXIII.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Said to be Invalid in Its Beginning and Ending	183

XXIV.	Example of <i>Hadīth</i> Said to Have an Internal Contradiction	184
XXV.	Example of <i>Hadīth</i> Said to be Invalid in Its Beginning and Ending	189
XXVI.	Example of <i>Hadīth</i> Invalidated by <i>Nazar</i>	194
XXVII.	Example of <i>Hadīth</i> Said to be Invalidated by the Analogical Reasoning	199
XXVIII.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Hadīth</i>	201
XXIX.	Example of <i>Hadīth</i> Said to be Invalidated by the Book and <i>Nazar</i>	202
XXX.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Hadīth</i>	208
XXXI.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Hadīth</i>	209
XXXII.	Example of <i>Hadīth</i> Said to be Invalidated by <i>Nazar</i> and <i>Khabar</i>	211
XXXIII.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Hadīth</i>	219
XXXIV.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Hadīth</i>	221
XXXV.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Hadīth</i>	223
XXXVI.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Hadīth</i>	227
XXXVII.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Hadīth</i>	231
XXXVIII.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Hadīth</i>	233
XXXIX.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Hadīth</i>	234
XL.	Example of <i>Hadīth</i> Said to be Invalidated by Reason and <i>Nazar</i>	236
XLI.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Hadīth</i>	248
XLII.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Hadīth</i>	250
XLIII.	Example of Contradictory <i>Hadīth</i>	251
XLIV.	Example of Judgement on <i>Rajm</i> or Lapidation Refuted by al-Qur'ān	254
XLV.	Example of the Judgment on <i>Waṣiyyah</i> or will Injunction Refuted by al-Qur'ān	256
XLVI.	Example of Judgment on Marriage said to be Refuted by al-Qur'ān	257
XLVII.	Example of Contradictory <i>Hadīth</i> on the Judgment of <i>Ghusl</i> on Friday	264
XLVIII.	Example of <i>Hadīth</i> Invalidated by <i>'Iyān</i> (Experience)	266



XLIX.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by al-Qur'ān	268
L.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by al-Qur'ān and Consensus	269
LI.	Example of an Incompatible <i>Ḥadīth</i> (in Its Beginning and Ending)	270
LII.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by al-Qur'ān and Reasoning	271
LIII.	Example of Anthropomorphic <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by al-Qur'ān and Reasoning	276
LIV.	Example of Anthropomorphic <i>Ḥadīth</i>	278
LV.	Example of Anthropomorphic <i>Ḥadīth</i>	279
LVI.	Example of Anthropomorphic <i>Ḥadīth</i>	280
LVII.	Example of Anthropomorphic <i>Ḥadīth</i>	281
LVIII.	Example of Anthropomorphic <i>Ḥadīth</i>	283
LIX.	Example of Anthropomorphic <i>Ḥadīth</i>	284
LX.	Example of Anthropomorphic <i>ḥadīth</i>	284
LXI.	Example of Anthropomorphic <i>Ḥadīth</i>	287
LXII.	Example of Anthropomorphic <i>Ḥadīth</i>	291
LXIII.	Example of Anthropomorphic <i>Ḥadīth</i>	292
LXIV.	Example of Anthropomorphic <i>Ḥadīth</i>	294
LXV.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by Consensus and the Book	295
LXVI.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	297
LXVII.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	298
LXVIII.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by <i>Nazar</i>	299
LXIX.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Applied by the Rāfiḍites to Accuse the Companions of Muḥammad as Infidels	304
LXX.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> on Predestination	307
LXXI.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by <i>Nazar</i>	309
LXXII.	Examples of Contradictory <i>Aḥādīth</i> that are Related to Prayer	310
LXXIII.	Example of Contradictory <i>Aḥādīth</i> that are Related to Ablution	313
LXXIV.	Example of Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	316

LXXV.	Example of Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i> on Fasting	316
LXXVI.	Example of Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i> on Fasting	317
LXXVII.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by <i>Nazar</i>	318
LXXVIII.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by al-Qur'ān from Two Perspectives	319
LXXIX.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by <i>Nazar</i>	330
LXXX.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by <i>Nazar</i>	332
LXXXI.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Vindicating the Createdness of al-Qur'ān	334
LXXXII.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by Consensus	337
LXXXIII.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i> Related to the Children of the Polytheist	341
LXXXIV.	Example of Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	342
LXXXV.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by <i>Nazar</i>	347
LXXXVI.	Example of Anthropomorphic <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by al-Qur'ān and Consensus	349
LXXXVII.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by <i>Nazar</i>	356
LXXXVIII.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by <i>Nazar</i>	359
LXXXIX.	Example of Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	367
XC.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>ḥadīth</i>	369
XCI.	Example of contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	372
XCII.	Example of Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	379
XCIII.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by al-Qur'ān	382
XCIV.	Example of Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	389
XCV.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by al-Qur'ān and Reason	394
CVI.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by al-Qur'ān and Reason	400
XCVII.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by <i>Nazar</i>	406
XCVIII.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Ḥadīth</i>	407
XCIX.	Example of <i>Ḥadīth</i> Invalidated by Consensus and the Book	409



C.	Example of <i>Hadīth</i> Invalidated by Reason	410
CI.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Hadīth</i>	414
CII.	Example of Contradictory <i>Hadīth</i> on Drinking of Water	419
CIII.	Example of Contradictory <i>Hadīth</i> on Impure Water	421
CIV.	Example of Contradictory <i>Hadīth</i> on <i>Hajj</i>	422
CV.	Example of <i>Hadīth</i> Invalidated by Reason	423
CVI.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Hadīth</i> on Transaction	427
CVII.	Example of Two Contradictory <i>Hadīth</i> on Menstruation	429
CVIII.	Example of <i>Hadīth</i> Invalidated by Reason	430
CVIV.	Example of <i>Hadīth</i> Invalidated by <i>Nazar</i>	433
Bibliography		435

## Preface

The intention of translating the book – *Ta'wīl Mukhtalif al-Ḥadīth* which was edited by al-Najjār began late in 1995. At that time I was writing my doctoral thesis, which was highly concentrated on this *Ta'wīl*. The content of this book, to my mind is worthy to be translated because it deals with the needs to understand and appreciate (1) the reason behind the citation of the *ḥadīth* of the Prophet, (2) the dynamism of the content of the *ḥadīth* of the Prophet, (3) the correct and proper method of interpreting the *ḥadīth* of the Prophet, and (4) the method of contextualizing the *aḥādīth* of the Prophet in our daily life. Ibn Qutaybah has provided various perspectives of *ḥadīth* interpretation to its readers and it is upon us to reflect on them for our consumption. The intention of translating *Ta'wīl*, however, could not be fulfilled due to other commitments then. With the sabbatical leave granted to me by IIUM, I began this work of translation as well as its annotation in earnest in July 2006 and completed it in May 2007. The result of my labours is the book that now lies in your hands.

**Che Amnah Binti Bahari**  
Gombak, Selangor  
1 July 2007



## Acknowledgements

The entire work of translating and research on the subject of this book was made possible due to the grant of sabbatical leave given to me by IIUM as well as some financial resources managed by the Research Management Centre, IIUM. To IIUM is due my thanks and acknowledgement. My gratitude also goes to Mr. John Lansky of Institute of French Studies, Petaling Jaya for assisting me in understanding the French translation of *Ta'wīl Mukhtalif al-Hadīth*, translated by Gerard Lecomte in 1962, published in Damas. And to Nirwan, PhD student of ISTAC, thank you so much for assisting me in the *ḥadīth* quotations. Finally, I am entirely to be held responsible for this work of translation and paraphrase of the contents of *Ta'wīl Mukhtalif al-Ḥadīth*. May Allāh forgive me for all of the shortcomings in rendering it into English.





## Technical Notes

- Arabic is a rich language and a term can render diversified meanings. To translate from Arabic into English, at times we need to add some phrases in English to suit an Arabic word. Our additions to that translation are marked by brackets ( ). While square brackets [ ] and curve brackets { }, referred to the quotations made by Ibn Qutaybah in his *Ta'wīl Mukhtalif al-Ḥadīth*. In addition, numbers are coded according to paragraphs which are not found in al-Najjār's *Ta'wīl Mukhtalif al-Ḥadīth*.
- In the present work of translation, quotations of Qur'ānic verses and Biblical citations are cited. Those Qur'ānic quotations are mainly taken from Abdullah Yusuf Ali's *The Holy Qur'an, Translation and Commentary* published by Amana Corporation, Maryland, 1993. The Biblical citations are cited from *The Holy Bible, The New Revised Standard Version* published by Thomas Nelson, 1989.

Words from Arabic text have been transliterated in accordance with the system generally adopted by scholars in Islamic Studies.



## Abbreviations

1. *‘Āriḍat al-Aḥwadhī*

Abū Bakr Muḥammad ibn ‘Abd Allāh ibn Muḥammad ibn ‘Abd Allāh known as Ibn al-‘Arabī (d. 543AH), *‘Āriḍat al-Aḥwadhī bi-Sharḥ Ṣaḥīḥ al-Tirmidhī* (Bayrūt: Dār al-Kutub al-‘Ilmiyyah, 1997).

Footnote: *‘Āriḍat al-Aḥwadhī*, 3: 174 – it means that the reference is taken from *‘Āriḍat al-Aḥwadhī* of volume 3, page 174.

2. *Al-‘Ilāl*

Abū al-Faraj ‘Abd al-Raḥmān, ibn ‘Alī ibn al-Jawzī (510 – 597H), *Al-‘Ilāl al-Mutanāhiyah*, prefaced by al-Shaykh Khalīl al-Mays (Bayrūt: Dār al-Kutub al-‘Ilmiyyah, 1983).

Footnote: *Al-‘Ilāl*, 3:4 (795) – it means that the reference is taken from *Al-‘Ilāl* of volume 3, page 4, *ḥadīth* number 795.

3. *‘Ilāl al-Ḥadīth*

Abū Muḥammad ‘Abd al-Raḥmān al-Rāzī ibn Abī Ḥātim al-Rāzī, *‘Ilāl al-Ḥadīth* (Bayrūt, 1985).

Footnote: *‘Ilāl al-Ḥadīth*, 3:89 (No. 1725) – It means that the reference is taken from *‘Ilāl al-Ḥadīth* of volume 3, page 89, *ḥadīth* number 1725

4. *Kashf al-Khafā'*

Ismā'īl ibn Muḥammad al-'Ajlūnī al-Jarrāhī (d. 1162 AH), *Kashf al-Khafā' wa Muzīl al-Ilbās*, (corrected, and commented) Aḥmad al-Qalāsh (Bayrūt: Mu'assasah al-Risālah, 1985).

Footnote: *Kashf al-Khafā'*, 5: 124 – it means that the reference is taken from *Kashf al-Kahafa'* of volume 5, page 124.

5. *Kanz al-'Ummāl*

'Alā' al-Dīn 'Alī al-Muttaqī ibn Ḥussām al-Dīn al-Hindī al-Burhānfūrī (d. 975 A.H.), *Kanz al-'Ummāl fī Sunan al-Aqwāl wa al-Af'āl*, (ed) Shaykh Bakrī Ḥayānī, (corrected and indexed) al-Shaykh Ṣafwah al-Saqā, (Bayrūt: Mu'assasah al-Risālah, 1405AH/1985), 5<sup>th</sup> edition.

6. Footnote: *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 7: 378 (No. 5743) – it means that the reference is taken from *Kanz al-'Ummāl* of volume 7, page 378, *ḥadīth* number 5743.

7. *Majma' al-Zawā'id*

Al-Ḥāfiẓ Nūr al-Dīn 'Alī ibn Abī Bakr Sulaymān al-Haythamī al-Miṣrī (d.807 A.H.), *Majma' al-Zawā'id wa Manba' al-Fawā'id*, ed. Muḥammad 'Abd al-Qādir Aḥmad 'Aṭā', (Bayrūt: Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyyah, 2001).

Footnote: *Majma' al-Zawā'id*, 5: 254 – it means that the reference is taken from *Majma' al-Zawā'id* of volume 5, page 254.

8. *Al-Maṭālib al-'Āliyah*

Ibn Ḥajar Aḥmad ibn 'Alī al-'Asqalānī, *Al-Maṭālib al-'Āliyah*

*bī-Zawā'id al-Maṣānid al-Thamāniyah*, edited by Al-Shaykh Ḥabīb al-Raḥmān (Bayrūt: Dār al-Ma'rifah, nd.)

Footnote: *Maṭālib al-Āliyah*, 1:400 (No.234) – it means that the reference is taken from *Maṭālib al-Āliyah* of volume 1, page 400, *ḥadīth* number 234.

9. *Mishkāt al-Maṣābīḥ*

Al-Shaykh Walī al-Dīn Muḥammad ibn 'Abd Allāh al-Khaṭīb al-Āmirī al-Tabrizī, *Mishkāt al-Maṣābīḥ*, (ed) Muḥammad Nāṣir al-Dīn al-Albānī (Al-Maktab al-Islāmī lī al-Ṭibā'ah wa al-Nashr, 1961).

Footnote: *Mishkāt al-Maṣābīḥ*, 2:227 (No. 351) – it means that the reference is taken from *Mishkāt al-Maṣābīḥ* of volume 2, page 227, *ḥadīth* number 351.

10. *Mizān al-I'tidāl*

Abū 'Abd al-Allāh Muḥammad ibn Aḥmad ibn 'Uthmān al-Dhahabī (d. 748AH); *Mizān al-I'tidāl fī Naqd al-Rijāl*, ed. 'Alī Muḥammad al-Bijāwī (Bayrūt: Dār al-Ma'rifah, 1963).

Footnote: *Mizān al-I'tidāl*, 2:272 (No. 3677) – it means that the reference is taken from *Mizān al-I'tidāl* of volume 2, page 272, *ḥadīth* number 3677.

11. *Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*

Abū al-Qāsim Sulaymān ibn Aḥmad al-Ṭabrānī, *Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, (ed.) Ḥamdī 'Abd al-Mājid al-Salafī, (Maṭba'ah al-Waṭan al-'Arabī, 1984).



Footnote: *Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, 1:74 – it means that the reference is taken from *Mu'jam al-Kabīr* of volume 1, page 74.

12. *Al-Mu'jam al-Ṣaghīr*

Al-Ḥāfiẓ Abū al-Qāsim Sulaymān ibn Aḥmad ibn Ayyūb al-Ṭabrānī (d. 360AH), *Al-Mu'jam al-Ṣaghīr li al-Ṭabrānī* (Bayrūt: Dār al-Kutub al-‘Ilmiyyah, 1403AH/1983).

Footnote: *Al-Mu'jam al-Ṣaghīr*, 1:24 – it means that the reference is taken from *Al-Mu'jam al-Ṣaghīr* of volume 1, page 24.

13. *Al-Muṣannaf*

Abū Bakr ‘Abd al-Razzāq ibn Hammām al-Ṣan‘ānī (d. 211 AH), *Al-Muṣannaf*, ed. Ḥabīb al-Raḥmān al-A‘zamī (Bayrūt: Al-Maktab al-Islāmī, 1983).

Footnote: *Al-Muṣannaf*, 7:147 (No. 342) – it means that the reference is taken from *Al-Muṣannaf* of volume 7, page 147, *ḥadīth* number 342.

14. *Mushkil al-Āthār*

Abū Ja‘far al-Ṭaḥāwī, *Mushkil al-Āthār* (Bayrūt: Dār al-Ṣādir, 1914).

Footnote: *Mushkil al-Āthār*, 3:194 – it means that the reference is taken from *Mushkil al-Āthār* of volume 3, page 194.

15. *Al-Musnad*

Aḥmad ibn Ḥanbal, *Al-Musnad*, (examined, commented,

indexed) Şidqī Muḥammad Jamīl al-‘Aṭṭār (Bayrūt: Dār al-Fikr, 1994).

Footnote: *Al-Musnad*, 6: 287 (No. 18004) – it means that the reference is taken from *Al-Musnad* of volume 6, page 287, *ḥadīth* number 18004.

16. *Musnad Abū ‘Awānah*

Abū ‘Awānah Ya‘qūb ibn Ishāq al-Isfarāyīnī (d. 316AH), *Musnad Abū ‘Awānah*, (Bayrūt: Dār al-Ma‘rifah, nd.)

Footnote: *Musnad Abū ‘Awānah*, 1:99 – it means that the reference is taken from *Musnad Abū ‘Awānah* of volume 1, page 99.

17. *Musnad al-Ṭayālīsī*

Sulaymān ibn Dāwūd ibn al-Jārūd (d. 204AH), *Musnad al-Ṭayālīsī* (Ḥaydar Ābād, al-Hind: Dār al-Kitāb al-Lubnānī wa Dār al-Tawfīq, 1321).

Footnote: *Musnad al-Ṭayālīsī*, 233 (No. 1669) – it means that the reference is taken from *Musnad al-Ṭayālīsī*, page 233, *ḥadīth* number 1669.

18. *Al-Mustadrak*

Abū ‘Abd Allāh Muḥammad al-Ḥākim al-Naysābūrī, *Al-Mustadrak ‘alā al-Ṣaḥīḥayn*, (ed.) Yūsuf ‘Abd al-Raḥmān al-Mar‘ashlī (Bayrūt: Dār al-Ma‘rifah, 1986).

Footnote: *Al-Mustadrak*, 3: 139 – it means that the reference is taken from *Al-Mustadrak* of volume 3, page 139.

19. *Ṣaḥīḥ Ibn Ḥibbān*

Al-Amīr 'Alā' al-Dīn 'Alī ibn Balbān, *Ṣaḥīḥ Ibn Ḥibbān bi-Tartīb Ibn Balbān* (d. 739 AH), (edited, commented) Shu'ayb al-Arnā'ūṭ (Bayrūt: Mu'assasah al-Risālah, 1993).

Footnote: *Ṣaḥīḥ Ibn Ḥibbān*, 15:375 (No. 6930) – it means that the reference is taken from *Ṣaḥīḥ Ibn Ḥibbān* of volume 15, page 375, *ḥadīth* number 6930.

20. *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*

Abū al-Ḥusayn Muslim al-Ḥajjāj al-Qushayrī al-Naysābūrī (d. 261AH), *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, (ed) Muḥammad Fū'ad 'Abd al-Bāqī (Istanbul, Turkiya: Al-Maktabah al-Islāmiyyah, 1950).

Footnote: *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, 3 (No. 1920) – it means the reference is taken from *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim* of chapter 3, *ḥadīth* number 1920.

21. *Silsilah*

Al-Albānī, Muḥammad Nāṣir al-Dīn, *Silsilah al-Aḥādīth al-Ḍa'īfah wa al-Mawḍū'ah* (Al-Riyāḍ: Maktabah al-Ma'ārif, 1992).

Footnote: *Silsilah*, 3:41 – it means that the reference is taken from *Silsilah* of volume 3, page 41.

22. *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*

Abū Sulaymān ibn al-Ash'ath al-Sijistānī al-Azdī, *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, (edited and commented) Muḥammad Muḥy al-Dīn 'Abd al-Ḥamīd (Bayrūt: Dār al-Fikr, nd.).

Footnote: *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 2:7 (No. 4252) – it means that the reference is taken from *Sunan Abū Dāwūd* of volume 2, page 7, *ḥadīth* number 4252.

23. *Sunan Al-Dārimī*

Abū Muḥammad ‘Abd Allāh ibn ‘Abd al-Raḥmān ibn Faḍl ibn Bahrām al-Dārimī (d. 255 AH), *Sunan Al-Dārimī* (Dār Iḥyā’ al-Sunnah al-Nabawīyyah, nd).

Footnote: *Sunan al-Dārimī*, 2:145 – it means that the reference is taken from *Sunan al-Dārimī* of volume 2, page 145.

24. *Sunan al-Dāraquṭnī*

‘Alī ibn ‘Umar al-Dāraquṭnī (d. 385 AH), *Sunan al-Dāraquṭnī*, commented by Abū Al-Ṭayyib Muḥammad ‘Abdī, (Bayrūt: ‘Ālam al-Kutub, 1986).

Footnote: *Sunan al-Dāraquṭnī*, 1: 43 – it means that the reference is taken from *Sunan al-Dāraquṭnī* of volume 1 page 43.

25. *Sunan Ibn Mājah*

Abū ‘Abd al-Allāh Muḥammad ibn Yāzid al-Qazwīnī, *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, (ed.) Muḥammad Fu’ād ‘Abd al-Bāqī (Bayrūt: Al-Maktabah al-‘Ilmiyyah, nd.).

Footnote: *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 1:5 (No. 5) – it means that the reference is taken from *Sunan Ibn Mājah* of volume 1, page 5, *ḥadīth* number 5.

26. *Sunan al-Tirmidhī*

Abū 'Īsā Muḥammad ibn 'Īsā ibn Sawrah, *Sunan al-Tirmidhī*, (edited and commented) Aḥmad Muḥammad Shākir, (Bayrūt: Dār Iḥyā' al-Turāth, n.d).

Footnote: *Sunan al-Tirmidhī*, 4:28 (No. 1418) – it means that the reference is taken from *Sunan al-Tirmidhī* of volume 4, page 28, *ḥadīth* number 1418.

27. *Al-Sunan al-Kubrā*

Abū Bakr Aḥmad ibn al-Ḥusayn ibn 'Alī al-Bayhaqī, *Al-Sunan al-Kubrā*, (ed.) Muḥammad 'Abd al-Qādir 'Aṭā' (Bayrūt: Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyyah, 1999).

Footnote: *Al-Sunan al-Kubrā*, 3:4 – it means that the reference is taken from *Al-Sunan al-Kubrā* of volume 3, page 4.

28. *Sunan al-Nasā'ī*

Jalāl al-Dīn al-Suyūṭī, *Sunan al-Nasā'ī bi-Sharḥ Jalāl al-Dīn al-Suyūṭī* (Bayrūt: Dār Iḥyā' al-Turāth al-'Arabī, n.d).

Footnote: *Sunan al-Nasā'ī*, 3:214 (No. 8318) – it means that the reference is taken from *Sunan al-Nasā'ī* of volume 3, page 214, *ḥadīth* 8318.

29. *Tahdhīb Tārīkh.*

Abū al-Qāsim 'Alī ibn Hibat Allāh known as Ibn 'Asākir (d. 571AH), *Tahdhīb Tārīkh al-Dimashq al-Kabīr*, (ed.) Shaykh 'Abd al-Qādir Badrān, (Bayrūt: Dār Iḥyā' al-Turāth al-'Arabī, 1987).



Footnote: *Tahdhīb Tārīkh*, 6:65 – it means that the reference is taken from *Tahdhīb Tārīkh* of volume 6, page 65.

30. *Al-Tamhīd*

‘Abd Allāh ibn Muḥammad ibn ‘Abd al-Barr al-Qurṭubī (d. 463 AH), *Al-Tamhīd li-mā fī al-Muwaṭṭa’ min Ma’ānī wa al-Maṣānid*. (ed.) Muḥammad ‘Abd al-Qādir ‘Aṭā’ (Bayrūt: Dār al-Kutub al-‘Ilmiyyah, 1999).

Footnote: *Al-Tamhīd*, 2:378, it means that the reference is taken from *Al-Tamhīd* of volume 2, page 378.

31. *Al-Targhīb*

Zakiyy al-Dīn ‘Abd al-‘Azīm ibn ‘Abd al-Qawī al-Mundhirī (d. 656AH), *Al-Targhīb wa al-Tarhīb*, commented by Mustafā Muḥammad ‘Imārah (Bayrūt: Dār Ihyā’ al-Turāth al-‘Arabī, 1388AH/1968).

Footnote: *Al-Targhīb*, 2:340 – it means that the reference is taken from *Al-Targhīb* of volume 2, page 340.

32. *‘Umdat al-Qārī*

Badr al-Dīn Abū Muḥammad Maḥmūd ibn Aḥmad al-‘Aynī (d., 855H), *‘Umdat al-Qārī Sharḥ Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī*, (ed.) ‘Abd al-Allāh Maḥmūd Muḥammad ‘Umar (Bayrūt: Dār al-Kutub al-‘Ilmiyyah, 2001).

Footnote: *‘Umdat al-Qārī*, 3:45 (No 1356) – it means that the reference is taken from *‘Umdat al-Qārī* of volume 3, page 45, *ḥadīth* number 1356.



## Introduction

Before reading the translation of *Ta'wīl Mukhtalif al-Ḥadīth* into English it is crucial for readers to know in advance who Ibn Qutaybah is, what his specialty is, what his contributions in the science of ḥadīth is? These questions will be addressed in the following discussion.

### A. THE LIFE OF IBN QUTAYBAH

Abū Muḥammad 'Abd Allāh ibn Muslim ibn Qutaybah al-Dīnawarī, otherwise known as Ibn Qutaybah (al-Marwazī or Abū Muḥammad), is born in the month of Rajab in 213 A.H/ 828 A.D. in Kūfah.<sup>1</sup> According to other sources, however, he was born in Baghdād, descended from a Persian family from Khurāsān and related on the maternal side to the Bāhilī family of Baṣrah.<sup>2</sup> Little is known of his childhood and adolescence. However, an examination of the rapid development of science among Muslims in the third century of Islam<sup>3</sup> reveals some information regarding Ibn Qutaybah's educational activities from the examination of the lives of his teachers. Among the scholars who had a great impact on Ibn

---

Ibn al-Nadīm, *Kitāb al-Fihrist*, trans. Bayard Dogde, *The Fihrist of al-Nadīm*, 2 vols. (New York: Columbia University Press, 1970), 1: 170; 2: 1080, hereafter cited as *Fihrist*.

Ibn Khallikān, *Wafayāt al-A'yān wa Anbā' Abnā' al-Zumān*, 3 vols., (Qum: Manshūrāt al-Sharīf al-Riḍā, 1322), 3: 42 - 44, hereafter cited as *Wafayāt*.

See 'Ajjāj, Muḥammad al-Khaṣīb, *Al-Sunnah Qabla al-Tadwīn* (Bayrūt: Dār al-Fikr, 1971), 300; Ibn Kathīr, *Al-Sīrah al-Nabawiyyah*, ed. Aḥmad 'Abd al-Shāfi, (Bayrūt: Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyyah, n.d.), vol. 1, 501f; Louis Gardett, "Religion and Culture," *The Cambridge History of Islam*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1970), vol. 2, 569f.

Qutaybah's outlook, particularly in the sciences of philology and *ḥadīth*, was Abū Ḥātim Sahl al-Sijistānī (d. 255 A.H./ 868 A.D.) who was then a prominent philologist from Baṣrah.<sup>4</sup> Another scholar of philological studies who taught Ibn Qutaybah was al-'Abbās al-Riyāshī (d. 257 A.D./ 871 A.D.). According to Ibn al-Nadīm, al-Riyāshī, also known as Abū Faḍl, was a trustworthy man, accurate in what he quoted and transmitted from the works of al-Aṣma'ī (d. 213 A.H./ 828 A.D.) and Abū 'Ubaydah (d. 210 A.H./ 826 A.D.)<sup>5</sup>

Looking at the persons who became instrumental in the intellectual training of Ibn Qutaybah, especially in his philological learning, we could say that he must have benefited a great deal from them. Mostly thanks to their guidance, Ibn Qutaybah, with his diligence, ability and hard work, was able to produce many books related to the field of philology. Perhaps, this is why the name *kātib al-udabā'* meaning "a person who writes extensively on the subjects related to all kinds of literature" was ascribed to Ibn Qutaybah.<sup>6</sup> This is proven since observation of the contributions made by Ibn Qutaybah reveals his interest in the quest for knowledge. He did not spend all his time on Arabic grammar and related subjects only, but also studied theology and *sharī'ah* under the patronage of Ishāq ibn Rāhawayh al-Ḥanzalī (d. 237 A.H./ 851 A.D.). Ibn Qutaybah was a young man of twenty-four by the time his teacher, al-Ḥanzalī, passed away. According to Ibn al-Nadīm, al-Ḥanzalī was a *Sunnī* theologian and a disciple of Ibn Ḥanbal (d. 241 A.H./ 855 A.D.) as well as the protégé of the Ṣāḥibids of Nisābūr. Apart from that, al-Ḥanzalī was one of the great jurists and a great scholar of *ḥadīth*. He was known

<sup>4</sup> Ibn Hajar al-'Asqalānī, *Lisān al-Mizān*, 5 vols., (Bayrūt: Mu'assasah al-'Alamī, 1986), 3: 358, hereafter cited as *Lisān*.

<sup>5</sup> *Fihrist*, 2: 1114.

<sup>6</sup> *Wafayāt*, 3: 44.

his strict adherence to the teaching of the *ḥadīth* itself.<sup>7</sup> Ibn Qutaybah who was under al-Ḥanzalī's tutelage was able to learn and benefit from his teacher's wide range of knowledge of *sharī'ah*, *ḥadīth* and other subjects related to the Prophetic teachings, Arabic philology and the judicial system. Having all this information, Ibn Qutaybah was able to compose books ranging from poetry criticisms, legal discussions and theological polemics to social etiquette.

Ibn Qutaybah, with all the knowledge that he had acquired from his teachers, later was appointed as *qāḍī* in 236 A.H./ 850 A.D. in Dīnawar, a mountainous country near Qaramayn. He held that post until 257 A.H./ 871 A.D. and because of his tenure as a judge at Dīnawar, his name was further accredited with the place of his tenure office and he was thus identified as Ibn Qutaybah al-Dīnawarī.<sup>8</sup> In the year 257 A.H./ 871 A.D. Ibn Qutaybah devoted himself to the writing of his works in a district in Baghdād where he remained until his death in 276 A.H./ 890 A.D. However, in Ibn Khallikān's appraisal of Ibn Qutaybah, the date of Ibn Qutaybah's demise seems to differ. Some reported that it was in the month of Dhū al-Qa'dah in 270 A.H./ 884 A.D; others reported that it was in the year 271 A.H./ 885 A.D.; and yet another source held it to be in the middle of the month of Rajab in 276 A.H./ 890 A.D. Among these dates Ibn Khallikān maintained that the correct date of Ibn Qutaybah's death was in the middle of Rajab, in the year 276 A.H./ 890 A.D.<sup>9</sup>

---

*Fihrist*, 2: 1080.

*Fihrist*, 1: 170.

*Wafayāt*, 3: 43. It would be better if Ibn Khallikān could furnish the reason for his choice of the correct date of demise of Ibn Qutaybah.



Among the ardent disciples of Ibn Qutaybah as Ibn Khallikār recorded was Ibn Qutaybah's son, Aḥmad ibn 'Abd Allāh, who was responsible for transmitting Ibn Qutaybah's writing to Egypt with the assistance of his own son (Ibn Qutaybah's grandson), 'Abd al-Wahīd.<sup>10</sup> While in Andalus, Ibn Qutaybah's writings were transmitted by Qāsim ibn Aṣbāgh (d. 340 A.H./951 A.D.). As for the transmission of Ibn Qutaybah's ideas to the eastern part of the 'Abbāsīd empire, it was facilitated by 'Ubayd Allāh ibn 'Abd Allāh ibn 'Abd al-Raḥmān al-Sukkarī (d. 323 A.H./935 A.D.) and 'Abd Allāh ibn Ja'far ibn Durustawayh (d. 341 A.H./952 A.D.).<sup>11</sup>

## B. IBN QUTAYBAH'S WORK

In expounding Ibn Qutaybah's intellectual contribution, Ibn al-Nadīm maintained that Ibn Qutaybah was a prolific writer whose numerous works were in demand. He was accurate in what he quoted and was an authority on language, grammar, *gharīb* form in al-Qur'ān interpretation of poetry and law.<sup>12</sup> Despite his Persian origin, Ibn Qutaybah was able to specialize in the Arabic language and authored books of high quality, which were mentioned earlier.

Arabic is the language of Islam. Therefore, the need to understand and master Arabic, the language of al-Qur'ān was paramount. To understand the concept of Islamic faith, which call for the *ummah* to be united and appreciate responsibilities and apply *sharī'ah*, one needs to know Arabic. This means that Islam as religion and Arabic as the language for communication are interrelated. That is why many *mufasssirūn*, while explaining the

<sup>10</sup> Ibn al-Faraḡī, *Tārīkh 'Ulamā' al-Andalus*, 5 vols. (Al-Qāhirah: Dār al-Kutub al-Miṣrī, 1989), 1: no. 59, 62; 3: no. 767, 431 - 432.

<sup>11</sup> *Fihrist*, 2: 983.

<sup>12</sup> *Fihrist*, 1: 170.

Qur'ānic verse which said that al-Qur'ān was revealed in Arabic<sup>13</sup> to verify that Arabic is one of the factors in the foundation and cohesion of the Islamic *ummah*.<sup>14</sup> Historically, the need to understand Arabic as the important source to understand Islam was emphasized from the institution of learning during the Prophet's time, the Umayyad era and extending to the 'Abbāsids. It is also observed that Muslims during this era not only studied Arabic for communication purposes, but also to understand subjects related to Islam as extracted from al-Qur'ān itself. The period of the second and third centuries of Hijrah is considered to be an active period of intellectual development, especially in Islamic Theology that Ibn Qutaybah came to champion the correct Islamic teachings through his skills and mastery of Arabic against all sorts of dualism, Persian Manichaeism, Judaism and Christianity. At the same time, Ibn Qutaybah was known to have engaged in elucidating the Islamic doctrines, which have been challenged by various opposing groups among the Muslim scholars themselves, particularly the brutal traditionalism of thethropomorphists and the dry rationalism of the Mu'tazilites. In order to overcome these problems, Ibn Qutaybah formulated his ideas and wrote extensively in three areas of Islamic learning, namely, Arabic language, jurisprudence and theology.

## 1. ARABIC LANGUAGE

As mentioned earlier, al-Qur'ān was revealed to Prophet Muḥammad AS in Arabic and it is an important language to Muslims. Even

---

*Sūrah al-Ahqāf*, 46: 12.

Syed Maḥmūd al-Ālūsī, *Rūḥ al-Ma'ānī*, 20 vols., (Bayrūt: Dār al-Kutub, 1994), 13: 162 - 163.

though Islam is a universal religion, Arabic has always assumed its own special position. Islamic belief and practices were explained and stipulated in Arabic and were accepted and experienced by the Arab tribes. Since the teachings of Islam were expressed in Arabic, this language has a special significance to Ibn Qutaybah. This is obvious in his writings such as:

- (i) *Kitāb al-Qirā'āt* and
- (ii) *Kitāb I'rāb al-Qur'ān*.<sup>15</sup>

These two books unfortunately are not traceable in any form. The titles have shown to us that during Ibn Qutaybah's time the style of Qur'ānic reading, bound by the precise rules of *tajwīd* (Qur'ānic cantillation) but based on the principles of plurality of authorized "reading", developed into an organized discipline in itself.

According to Ibn Qutaybah, the most authentic Qur'ānic style of reading was the discipline applied by 'Abd Allāh ibn Mas'ūd (d. 39 A.H./ 659 A.D.).<sup>16</sup> This discipline of Qur'ānic reading is equally important to the discipline of Qur'ānic commentary or *tafsīr*. To interpret al-Qur'ān, a person needs to master the Arabic language, the history of Qur'ānic revelation (*asbāb al-nuzūl*), grammar and philology; all these skills combined in such a person, as Ibn Qutaybah, and enabled him to write

- (i) *Kitāb Ta'wīl al-Qur'ān* and
- (ii) *Kitāb Tafsīr Gharīb al-Qur'ān*.<sup>17</sup>

<sup>15</sup> *Wafayāt*, 3: 43; *Fihrist*, 1: 170.

<sup>16</sup> *Ta'wīl*, 288; *Le Traité*, 319.

<sup>17</sup> *Wafayāt*, 3: 42.

*Kitāb Ta'wīl al-Qur'ān* was published by Dār Ihyā al-rabiyyah, Bayrūt, 1958. It discussed various rhetorical interpretations of Qur'ānic verses. This book seems to be an influential reference to readers for it was written in an abridged form by Ibn Muṭarrif under the title: *Kitāb al-Qurṭayn*, published by Dār Ma'ārif, al-Qāhirah, 1356. *Kitāb Tafsīr Gharīb al-Qur'ān*, known also as *al-Ma'ānī al-Qur'ān*,<sup>18</sup> was edited by Aḥmad Muḥammad Ṣāliḥ and published by 'Isā al-Ḥalabī, Cairo in 1958. This book discusses, among other things, the derivatives attributed to God (*al-nā' al-ḥusnā*), an explanation of some of the important literary language used in the Qur'ānic exegeses and the review of the order of *sūrah* of al-Qur'ān. This book is said to have been an important reference for Ibn Muṭarrif's *Kitāb al-Qurṭayn*<sup>19</sup> as mentioned earlier.

Another aspect of Arabic language that was shaped by Qur'ānic injunctions can be observed from Ibn Qutaybah's writings. They were classified as follows:

- (i) *Kitāb al-'Ilm*,
- (ii) *'Uyūn al-Akḥbār*,
- (iii) *Kitāb al-Shi'r wa al-Shu'arā'*,
- (iv) *Kitāb al-Marātib wa al-Manāqib min 'Uyūn al-Shi'r*,
- (v) *Kitāb Farā'id al-Durr*,
- (vi) *Kitāb al-Ma'ānī al-Kabīr*,

---

*Lisān al-'Arab*, 3: 358.  
*Ibn Qutayba*, 135.

- (vii) *Kitāb al-Ashribah*,
- (viii) *Kitāb Adab al-Kātib*,
- (ix) *Dīwān al-Kātib*,
- (x) *Kitāb al-Anwā'*,
- (xi) *Kitāb al-Ma'ārif*.<sup>20</sup>

The above mentioned books, as can be seen from their titles, emphasize the importance of *adab* or literary works in the eyes of Ibn Qutaybah and the high esteem of *adab* as part of the culture of the society during his lifetime. *Adab*, as it is known, appears in relation to literature, mainly in the form of poetry, proverbs and speeches. However, the term *adīb* to Ibn Qutaybah as indicated in his '*Uyūn al-Akḥbār*' differs from the term '*ālim*', for the latter signifies a person who specializes in a single branch of knowledge, while the term *adīb* is a person who masters various branches of knowledge.<sup>21</sup> '*Uyūn al-Akḥbār*' was published in four volumes by Dār al-Kitāb al-Miṣrīyyah, Cairo, 1349. Although this book appears to discuss general issues current during Ibn Qutaybah's time, it also highlighted his concepts of *ummah* through the meaning of *adab*, that is, applying the literary tools to explain his ideas dealing not only with social and ethical notions but also with practical matters and moving eventually into intellectual spheres.<sup>22</sup> Hence, *adab* according to Ibn Qutaybah, was more than a literary genre. It is also a tool for educating the society at large. It is unfortunate that *Kitāb al-'Ilm* is not available to readers or else they might understand better Ibn Qutaybah's view, as implied in the title of the work, of knowledge and its relation to *adab* as a

<sup>20</sup> *Fihrist*, 1: 170f.

<sup>21</sup> '*Uyūn*', 2: 129.

<sup>22</sup> Lecomte says that '*Uyūn al-Akḥbār*' is a continuity of Ibn Qutaybah's thought as indicated in his *Adab al-Kātib* see *Ibn Qutayba*, 145.



ole. This shortcoming, nevertheless, has been overcome with the availability of *Kitāb al-Shi'r wa al-Shu'arā'*, which was published in 3 volumes by Dār al-Ma'ārif, Cairo, undated. This book presents Ibn Qutaybah's canon of poetry in which he distinguishes "good" poetry from "bad" applying the classification as a mean of educating society and at the same time refuting the conventional view which judged poetry purely on the basis of the period in which its author lived. Ibn Qutaybah then asserted: "He who studies *adab* but does not act on it and fails to control his passion is no *adīb*." This book is of great influence to readers and was translated into Dutch by W. J. van Ershausen, published in Leiden, 1875; translated into German with quotations by Noldeke: *Beiträge zur Kenntnis der Poesie der alten Araber*, in 1864 and into French: *Introduction au Livre de la Poesie des Poètes* by Gaudefroy-Demombynes, published in Paris, 1947.

*Kitāb al-Marātib wa al-Manāqib min 'Uyūn al-Shi'r* which is unfortunately not available to readers in any form, is possibly a continuation of *Kitāb al-Shi'r wa al-Shu'arā'*. This is because the latter deals with both poets and poems, whereas the earlier work classifies the grades and virtues from the best poems. As for *Kitāb al-Ḥā'id al-Durr*, it is no longer available but from the title of the book which means "the germs of the pearl," we can assume that this book was an anthology of the best poems according to Ibn Qutaybah's classification denoted in other books of his *Kitāb al-Shi'r wa al-Shu'arā'*.

*Kitāb al-Ma'ānī al-Kabīr*, known also as *Ma'ānī al-Shi'r*, is another piece of Ibn Qutaybah's work, which indicates that he was as

extremely prolific writer. This book is available to readers and was published in two volumes by Dā'irat al-Ma'ārif al-'Uthmāniyyah Hyderabad, 1949. The content of this book shows Ibn Qutaybah's continuation of the critical assessment of poetic literature indicated in his previous two major books, i.e., *'Uyūn al-Akhhbār* and *Al-Shi'r wa al-Shu'arā'*.

Looking at its title, *Kitāb Ashribah* or "Book of Drinks" of Ibn Qutaybah, readers tend to associate the custom of wine-drinking with the Arabs of the past. *Kitāb Ashribah* was published by Dār al Kutub, Damascus, undated. It established Ibn Qutaybah's juridical opinion on fermented drinks and was written in literary style particularly Chapter 1. In general, the exposition of the reprehensible result of intoxicant or *khamr* and *nabīdh* consumption, which is associated with gambling or *maysir*, is accomplished based on Qur'ānic injunctions and Prophetic traditions. This book also contained an implicit criticism on the part of Ibn Qutaybah of the witty side of *khamriyyāt* (wine-poem) genre<sup>23</sup> in vogue during the 'Abbāsīd era with Abū Nuwās (d. 200 A.H. / 815 A.D.) as the great bacchic poet. Abū Nuwās writes: "In the way I exalt (wine) I am like *qā'idī* (stay at home) exalting the *taḥkīm*...."<sup>24</sup> From this line of poetry, it is clear to the reader why Ibn Qutaybah criticized wine poems, intoxicant is forbidden in Islam.

Ibn Qutaybah's notion of *adab* is further clarified in his books *Kitāb Adab al-Kātib* and *Dīwān al-Kātib*. The latter book, as indicated by its title, is a register of secretaries but one is unable to

<sup>23</sup> Harb, F. "Wine Poetry (*Khamriyyāt*)", *'Abbāsīd Belle-Lettres*, ed. Jul Ashtiany, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990), 219, hereafter cited as *Wine poetry*.

<sup>24</sup> *Wine poetry*, 227.



serve Ibn Qutaybah's method of registration of secretaries since his book is nowhere to be found. *Kitāb Adab al-Kātib* known also as *Adab al-Kuttāb* consists of transcribed course-notes taken down by students of philology and literature and was intended for specialists and not for general readers. It was published by Dār al-Kutub al-ʿIlmiyyah, Bayrūt, 1988. In this book, Ibn Qutaybah also asserted that a writer or *kātib* should have moral and intellectual qualities instead of only having purely linguistic training. Therefore, readers will construe, despite its lexicographical information that this book was written with a didactic purpose in mind. This is obvious particularly in its introduction where Ibn Qutaybah mentioned that obscure or unintelligible vocabulary is unacceptable "...in the good old days when *adab* had not yet lost its freshness...."<sup>25</sup> Here more is implied by the term *adab* than a mechanical set of rules and guidelines. This great piece of work has had a great impact on society for centuries. Commentary works like *Sharḥ Adab al-Kātib* by al-Jawālīqī (d. 538 A.H./ 1144 A.D.), published in Cairo, 1350 H. / 1127 A.D.), published in Bayrūt, 1901, demonstrate that *Kitāb Adab al-Kātib* has been well-received by readers. Hence, apart from commentary, this book was also being translated into French by comte de Slane with the title: *L'Introduction du Kitāb Adab al-Kātib d'Ibn Qutayba*, published in Damas, 1957 and into English: *An Extract from I.Q.'s Adab al-Kātib with Translation and Notes* by Sproul, published in Leipzig, 1877.<sup>26</sup>

---

Ibn Qutaybah, *Adab al-Kātib*, (Bayrūt: Dār al-ʿIlmiyyah, 1988), 15.

For more information, see *Ibn Qutayba*, 102 - 107.

From the foregoing discussion, we observe that one important aspect of the scholars of the past is that they specialized in many areas of study. In relation to Ibn Qutaybah, it is observed that many of his writings indicated varied subjects but were written in such a way that these varied subjects are closely related to each other. Many examples can be seen in his *Kitāb al-Anwā'* and *Kitāb al-Ma'ārif*. *Kitāb al-Anwā'* known also as *Manāẓir al-Nujūm* by al-Bīrūnī (d. 440 A.H./ 1048 A.D.) is a treatise on practical astronomy and meteorology. Although the discussion concentrated on astronomy and meteorology, Ibn Qutaybah successfully established the link between his subject matter with philology and lexicon and thesaurus works. In addition to this, he also cited poems to substantiate his statements in each related subject of his discussion particularly in Chapter One. Due to its remarkable nature, *Kitāb al-Anwā'* has become an important reference to readers and was edited by Pellat and Hamidullah, published in 1956 by Dā'irat al-Ma'ārif al-'Uthmāniyyah, Hyderabad. Pellat also wrote commentaries of *Kitāb al-Anwā'* rendered into French under the title: *Le Traité d'astronomie et de Meteorologie Populaire d'Ibn Qutayba*, published in *Arabica*, I, January, 1954 and *Dictons Rimes, Anwā' et Mansions Lunaires Chez Les Arabs*, published in *Arabica*, II, January, 1955. However, al-Bīrūnī in his *al-Āthār al-Bāqiyah* criticized Ibn Qutaybah, as indicated in the latter's *Kitāb al-Anwā'*, of his unending support of Persian merits in the field of astronomy.<sup>27</sup> *Kitāb al-Ma'ārif* is another example of Ibn Qutaybah's scholarly work on very diverse subjects. Its title, *Things Known* denotes that it is a historical manual with encyclopedic appendices on various subjects. It discusses the history of the Prophet, his companions and contemporaries, the

<sup>27</sup> *Ibn Qutayba*, 108 - 109.

mayyad caliphates, the 'Abbāsīd caliphates, the people of *ra'y*, the people of the *ḥadīth*, lectures on al-Qur'ān, the transmission of poems, pedagogy, government, the sects and the history of dynasties. *Kitāb al-Ma'ārif* was published by Dār al-Kutub, Bayrūt, undated. There is also an interesting commentary on *Kitāb al-Ma'ārif* which was written by Pellat, entitled *Ibn Qutaybah wa al-Thaqāfah al-'Arabiyyah*. This commentary work is available in the edition of *Langes of Tāḥā Husayn*, published in Cairo, 1962.

Other *adab* works which Ibn Qutaybah, who belonged to the Kūfah school of grammar, was involved in were the writing of books devoted to a study of grammar, said to be a "dry" but, nevertheless, an important discipline. This is evidenced by a small number of books written by him in this field. The reported titles of his work related to this field display how serious and sincere he is in appreciating the Arabic language:

- (i) *Kitāb Jāmi' al-Naḥw* and
- (ii) *Kitāb Jāmi' al-Naḥw al-Ṣaghīr*.<sup>28</sup>

Unfortunately, neither of these works has reached us in any form or else we would have been able to see the style of work ordered by one of the Kūfah grammarians and later compare this with the works of the Baṣrah grammarians. Nevertheless, Ibn Qutaybah's books of grammar, though not available to us today, stand as a proof that sheer hard work is a key to the mastery of any language particularly of the "boundless" philology inherent in

---

*Fihrist*, I:170.

Arabic which was an important asset to Ibn Qutaybah in his future career as a *qāḍī* or a judge.

## 2. JURISPRUDENCE

Ibn Qutaybah was a *qāḍī* by profession and held this post for twenty years. With his experience as a judge for such a long period and with his great interest in writing, one would have expected him at least to write about his experiences with the juridical problems raised by the masses of his time. Indeed, Ibn Ḥajar reported that Ibn Qutaybah authored three books related to the juridical field, namely:

- (i) *Kitāb Jāmi' al-Fiqh*,
- (ii) *Kitāb al-Tafqīyyah*, and
- (iii) *Kitāb al-Maysir wa al-Qidāh*<sup>29</sup>

Unfortunately, there is no trace of these books except for *Kitāb al-Maysir wa al-Qidāh* which was published by Dār al-Kutub al-Miṣriyyah, Cairo, undated. This book is a discussion of a juridical-philological study on games and chance. In fact, looking at the titles of these three books it is apparent to the reader that Ibn Qutaybah, with his strong-grounding in Arabic and its related field of study, was able to discuss the prevalent issues of his time adequately. These works particularly *Al-Tafqīyyah* and *Jāmi' al-Fiqh*, were probably related to the detailed aspects of Islamic Law rather than on the principles themselves. After all, earlier scholars had already systematized the four *madhāhib*. Abū Ḥanīfah (d. 150 A.H./ 767 A.H.) has established Ḥanafite School, Mālik ibn Anas (d. 180 A.H./ 796 A.D.) with Mālikite School, Ibn Ḥanbal (d. 241 A.H. 855 A.D.) with Ḥanbalite School, and al-Shāfi'ī (d. 204 A.H. / 815

<sup>29</sup> *Lisān al-'Arab*, 3: 357 - 359.



2.) with Shāfi'ite School. Comparatively, Ibn Qutaybah's contribution to jurisprudence, apart from being a judge himself, is not compared to his contribution to Arabic, exegesis and theology.

### 3. THEOLOGY

Ibn Qutaybah's contribution to the field of theology was considerable. He should be recognized not only as the great master of Arabic literature but also as a theologian.<sup>30</sup> In fact, it was in the theological field of study that Ibn Qutaybah penned many of his words and ideas and from these works that we can see his inclination to the view of majority on al-Qur'ān and Sunnah of the Prophet as opposed to Mu'tazilites sympathy. Ibn Qutaybah, as stated, earlier lived in a period before and after the *mihnah* and the central theological discussion of that time was the createdness and the uncreatedness of Qur'ān and other issues related to it. It might be expected then that Ibn Qutaybah, who was at an impressionable age of twenty years old, would display his support for the rally made by the Mu'tazilite scholars of his time at least in his writings. However, this expectation would be wrong. Ibn Qutaybah, in contrast, had much more natural doctrinal growth and an open theological mind, hence, he suffered from no theological or spiritual complexes. A glance at the reported titles of books related to Ibn Qutaybah's overall theological activities will display how deeply he was involved in the exposition of the Islamic doctrines which had been eroded by mindless tradition and pretentious rationalism. The titles are as follows:

---

*Ibn Qutayba*, 884 - 847.

- (i) *Kitāb Khalq al-Insān*,
- (ii) *Kitāb Dalā'il al-Nubuwwah*,
- (iii) *Kitāb al-Ḥikāyah wa al-Maḥkī*,
- (iv) *Kitāb al-Taswiyah Bayn al-'Arab wa al-'Ajam*,
- (v) *Kitāb Gharīb al-Ḥadīth*,
- (vi) *Kitāb Iṣlāḥ al-Ghalāt*,
- (vii) *Kitāb al-Radd 'alā al-Mushabbihah*,
- (viii) *Kitāb al-Masā'il wa al-Jawābāt*,
- (ix) *Kitāb al-Ma'ārif*, and
- (x) *Kitāb Ta'wīl Mukhtalif al-Ḥadīth*.<sup>31</sup>

Of the first four books mentioned above, *Khalq al-Insān*, *Dalā'il al-Nubuwwah*, *Al-Ḥikāyah wa al-Maḥkī* and *Kitāb Taswiyah Bayn al-'Arab wa al-'Ajam*, only the last one can be traced. This book, known also as *Kitāb al-'Arab wa al-'Ajam*,<sup>32</sup> was published by Dār al-Kutub al-Miṣriyyah, Cairo, undated. It presents Ibn Qutaybah's concern with the anti-Shu'ūbī<sup>33</sup> tradition on the relative merits of the Arabs, the Persians and the inhabitants of Khurāsān. Despite his Persian ancestry, one could not trace in this book any anti-Arab attitude though this attitude was prevalent among the Persian writers in the 'Abbāsīd era. Should the other three books be discovered someday, we will be able to correlate the ideas contained in them as implied in their titles, with *Taswiyah Bayn al-'Arab wa al-*

<sup>31</sup> *Wafayāt*, 3: 42 - 43. There are more works, problematic ones said to be attributed to Ibn Qutaybah, see *Ibn Qutayba*, 102 - 178.

<sup>32</sup> *Lisān al-'Arab*, 3: 435.

<sup>33</sup> Norris, H.T., "Shu'ūbiyyah in Arabic Literature," *'Abbāsīd Belle-Lettres*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990), 31 - 47.

Islam. It seems certain that these works are all related to the concept *ummah* in particular and foundation of Islam in general.

Further readings reveal that the masses during Ibn Qutaybah's time, particularly after the *miḥnah*, to borrow Watt's words, "...were heartily sick of the endless hair-splitting discussions of the createdness and uncreatedness of al-Qur'ān...."<sup>34</sup> These discussions of the createdness or uncreatedness of al-Qur'ān were presented in the light of the dry, rational approach of the Mu'tazilites. The result of this kind of discussions not only led to various schisms among the Muslims but also degraded the value of the Islamic teachings. This "degradation" became especially pronounced with the official announcement of *miḥnah* by al-Ma'mūn who called for the affirmation of the createdness of al-Qur'ān by all Muslims scholars and laymen alike. Again, this event led to further discussions of al-Qur'ān, other issues related to it, and those discussions were reported to resort to a method that was based both on the pure rationalist attitude and groundless traditions. The negative impact out of the necessary intellectual exercises, prompted Ibn Qutaybah to write *Kitāb Gharīb al-Ḥadīth*. This book reveals the significant position of ḥadīth of the Prophet to Muslims. It presents the definition of the principal terms of fiqh like: *wuḍū'*, *ṣalāt*, *zakāt*, *nikāḥ*, *buyū'*. It also explains in detail the meaning of *kāfir*, *fāsiq*, *munāfiq* and *ahl al-bid'ah*. This is followed by the discussion of *aḥādīth* of the Prophet and Ibn Qutaybah applied, to explain the status of *ahl al-ahwā'* like Rāfiḍah, Murji'ah, Qadariyyah and Khawārij. This book, despite

---

*Formative*, 281.



its clear and explicit exposition of juridical matters, seems to invite criticism from Al-Iṣḥāḥānī (d. 356 A.H./ 967 A.D.). He criticized certain ideas brought forward by Ibn Qutaybah, found in a book under the title, *Kitāb al-Radd 'alā Ibn Qutaybah fī Gharīb al-Ḥadīth*.<sup>35</sup> If only Iṣḥāḥānī's review of Ibn Qutaybah's work were available, readers would be able to compare Ibn Qutaybah's methodology with that of Iṣḥāḥānī's and later could see the scope and the differences opinion that lie between them.

*Kitāb Iṣlāḥ al-Ghalāt*, known also as *Iṣlāḥ al-Ghalāt Abī 'Ubayd fī Gharīb al-Ḥadīth*<sup>36</sup> as indicated by its title, is another example of Ibn Qutaybah's critical approach to the comprehension of the Prophetic *aḥādīth*, particularly that of detaching the *ḥadīth* from the elements of 'faux pas' and fault-finding. This book, however, is nowhere to be found. Therefore, readers are unable to probe the so-called mistakes in *ḥadīth* interpretations committed by Abū 'Ubayd al-Qāsim ibn Sallām (d. 224 A.H./ 839 A.D.).

*Kitāb al-Radd 'alā al-Mushabbihah*, known also as *Al-Ikhtilāf fī al-Lafẓ wa al-Radd 'alā al-Jahmiyyah wa al-Mushabbihah*, or as Ibn Ḥajar names it, *al-Radd 'alā al-Qā'il bī Khalq al-Qur'ān*, discusses Ibn Qutaybah's refutation, firstly, on the *Mushabbihah*'s attitude on the Attributes of God. Secondly, it explains the position of the Mu'tazilites and the Jahmiyyah on the issue of the pronunciation of al-Qur'ān. This work was edited by Muḥammad Zāhid al-Kawtharī and was published in 1349 by Maṭba'ah al-Sa'ādah, Cairo.

<sup>35</sup> *Ibn Qutayba*, 148.

<sup>36</sup> *Fihrist*, 1: 190.

*Kitāb Masā'il wa al-Jawābāt*<sup>37</sup> or *Al-Masā'il wa al-Ajwibah al-Ḥadīth wa al-Lughah* or according to al-Suyūṭī, *Kitāb al-wābāt al-Ḥādīrah* was published in Cairo in 1349. This book treats two main issues, current during Ibn Qutaybah's time. First, it discusses the philological aspect of *ḥadīth* and second, the commentaries of *ḥadīth*. According to Lecomte, this book was a complement to *Kitāb Ghārīb al-Ḥadīth* and *Ta'wīl Mukhtalif al-ḥadīth*.<sup>38</sup>

#### 4. KITĀB TA'WĪL MUKHTALIF AL-ḤADĪTH

It is appropriate to end the discussion of Ibn Qutaybah's life and work with a short summary of his great theological work, *Kitāb Ta'wīl Mukhtalif al-Ḥadīth*,<sup>39</sup> which we are translating into English. The manuscript of *Ta'wīl Mukhtalif al-Ḥadīth* was in the hand of Ismā'il Khaṭīb al-As'adī. He has arduously edited and was first published 1326 A.H. This piece of work known also as *Mukhtalif al-Ḥadīth Ikhtilāf Ta'wīl al-Ḥadīth*<sup>40</sup> or *Mushkil al-Ḥadīth*<sup>41</sup> was further edited, arranged according to proper paragraphs and precisely ordered the Qur'ānic verses and the citations of poems by Muḥammad al-Zuhūrī al-Najjār. This then was published by Dār al-Jīl, Beyrūt, 1393/1972. According to Al-Najjār, the manuscript owned by As'ardī contains a lot of valuable information on the narrators of *ḥadīth*. Interestingly, it is also noted that Ibn Qutaybah has

---

According to Ibn Kathīr, the term *jawābāt* here, does not tally with Arabic grammar and it should be replaced with *ajwibah*.

*Ibn Qutayba*, 127.

*Le Traité*, xix - xx.

*Fihrist*, 1: 171.

*Wafayāt*, 3: 42.

provided to readers three chains of narrators to ascertain that he has written *Ta'wīl Mukhtalif al-Hadīth*, as in the following:

1. “We were informed that Al-Shaykh al-Imām Abū al-Ḥasan, ‘Alī ibn Ibrāhīm al-Baghdādī al-Nuḥās said Al-Shaykh al-Ḥāfiẓ Abū Bakr, Muḥammad ibn ‘Alī ibn Thābit al-Baghdādī said: We were informed that Abū ‘Alī ibn al-Ḥasan ibn Shihāb al-Akbarī said: We were informed that Abū ‘Abd Allāh, ‘Ubayd Allāh ibn Muḥammad Shaykh Hamadān al-Faqīh said: Abū Bakr, Aḥmad ibn Ḥusayn ibn Ibrāhīm al-Dīnawar that Abū Muḥammad, ‘Abd Allāh ibn Muslim ibn Qutaybah said: [Praise to Allāh, Master of the universe and reward to those who fear Him. And may Allāh bless Muḥammad, seal of the Prophets as well as the members of his family, the good and the pure. May Allāh rejoice you....]”
2. Al-Shaykh Abū Ja‘far Aḥmad ibn Muḥammad ibn ‘Abd al-‘Azīz has narrated from Abū ‘Alī, Ḥusayn ibn Muḥammad al-Ghassānī who said he was informed by Abū al-‘Alī, Ḥakīm ibn Muḥammad ibn al-Jazīmī who was also being informed by Abū Ishāq, Ibrāhīm ibn ‘Alī ibn Muḥammad ibn Ghālīt and the latter by Aḥmad ibn Marwān al-Mālikī who was then informed by Abū Muḥammad ibn Qutaybah:....
3. “We were informed by Shaykh Abū al-Ḥasan ibn Šāliḥ ibn Maymūn al-‘Asqalānī at the City of ‘Asqalān in the month of Jamādī al-Ūlā, the year of

430 said: We were informed that Abū 'Abd Allāh, 'Ubayd Allāh ibn Muḥammad al-'Akbarī, known also as Ibn Baṭṭah had said: We were informed by Abū Bakr Aḥmad ibn Muḥammad al-Dīnawarī said that he has read with 'Abd Allāh ibn Muslim ibn Qutaybah, who said: [Praise to Allāh....]"

Apart from the manuscript of al-As'ardī, probably due to the existence of these chains of narrators, Al-Najjār informed that there are another three manuscripts on *Ta'wīl*, namely:

1. The manuscript of al-Baghdādiyyah, edited by Maḥmūd al-Shukrī Afandī al-Ālūsī, available at Library of Marjāniyyah, Baghdād.<sup>42</sup>
2. The manuscript of al-Dimashqiyyah, compiled by Muḥammad Jamāl al-Dīn al-Qāsimī al-Dimashqī, 401A.H., available at the Library of 'Umriyyah, Dimashq.
3. The manuscript of al-Miṣriyyah, compiled by Muḥammad Khalūsī, available at the Library of Dār al-Sa'ādah, Miṣr.

According to Al-Najjār, who has the privilege to study all our manuscripts, there are numerous variations between those manuscripts, but are insignificant as they do not affect the comprehensive meaning of the text. For examples, in *Ta'wīl* of al-ijjār, page 39, footnote 1, the term بالجنة is used, but in the

---

Today, this manuscript is probably non-existent due to the invasion of the Americans for they burned down many libraries including at Marjān.



manuscript of al-As'ardī it reads: المسمين الجنة. Similarly, on page 123, footnote 1, the term الرومي is applied but in the manuscript of al-Baghdādiyyah, al-Najjār observed that there is an erroneous application of the term التقفي. This, however, does not affect the whole meaning of the sentence.

*Ta'wīl Mukhtalif al-Ḥadīth* was also translated and annotated into French by Lecomte: *Le Traité Des Divergences Du Hadit D'Ibn Qutayba*, published by D'Amerique et d'Orient in 1962. We believe that Lecomte has referred to the version rendered by Ismā'īl al-Khaṭīb al-As'ardī for his work of translation in French. In this French version, Lecomte has coded each paragraph with numbers and hence separating one paragraph to the other. This facilitates the readers to differentiate the points. For our translation of *Ta'wīl*, we have referred to al-Najjār's version. While translating it into English, we followed numerals which were coded by Lecomte to assist our job in comparing the French version and Arabic text, should there be any discrepancies. We noted two places where Lecomte did not render his translation into French. This is probably due to error of oversight.

In terms of the content, *Ta'wīl Mukhtalif al-Ḥadīth* discusses, among other things, an exposition of the ill use of *ḥadīth*, *kalām* and the principles of *ḥadīth* criticism. Although this book deals with the exploitation of *ḥadīth* interpretations by the masses of Ibn Qutaybah's time, it actually indicates not his negative attitude to the science of *kalām* and the science of *ḥadīth* per se but his refutation of the method of *ta'wīl* (allegorical interpretation) as used by the people of *kalām* and the people of *ḥadīth* to present their ideas that focused on the issues related to the religion and at the same time expressed

se interpretations in the light of their denominations. According to Attas, *tafsīr* means scientific interpretation while *ta'wīl* refers to intensive form of *tafsīr*. In both *tafsīr* and *ta'wīl* the process of interpretation is based on al-Qur'ān and Prophetic traditions reported by knowledge of the semantic field that governs the conceptual structure of the Qur'ānic vocabulary which project the Islamic vision of reality and truth.<sup>43</sup> In other words, *tafsīr* and *ta'wīl* are based on established knowledge of terms derived from the Arabic language and as organized, applied in al-Qur'ān, and reflected in the Prophetic traditions. Both *tafsīr* and *ta'wīl* also emphasize the conditions of established knowledge of the given linguistic symbol and their significations as determined by the semantic contexts. To illustrate his point further, al-Attas gave an example of *tafsīr* and *ta'wīl* as interpreted based upon the established knowledge shown in the following. According to him, when God says that He brings forth living from the dead<sup>44</sup> and we interpret it to mean that God brings forth the bird from the egg, this is *tafsīr*. But when we interpret the same passage to mean He brings forth the believer (*al-mu'min*) from the disbeliever (*al-kāfir*) or that He brings forth the knower (*al-'ālim*) from the ignorant (*al-jāhil*), then this is *ta'wīl*.<sup>45</sup> This explains that *tafsīr* refers to the discovery, detecting or revealing of what is meant in an ambiguous expression. *Ta'wīl* refers to what the ambiguous expression actually means. The discovery, detecting or revealing of the meaning of two ambiguous words as indicated in the above quoted Qur'ānic

---

Al-Attas, *The Concept of Education in Islam*, (Kuala Lumpur, ISTAC, 1991), 5, hereafter cited as *Education*.

*Sūrah al-An'ām*, 6: 95.

*Education*, 5.



verses revolve around the living (*al-ḥayy*) and the dead (*al-mayyit*). To show the process of *ta'wīl*, al-Attas quoted another verse of al Qur'ān, translated as: "He sends down rain from the skies to revive an earth that is already dead."<sup>46</sup> In another verse God says, translated as: "The skies contain rain."<sup>47</sup> The word *raj'* (return) as stated in the verse and interpreted as rain, signifies something that return repeatedly. Thus, the rain brings good as "returns" repeatedly from the skies by which He brings forth the living plants from an earth that is dead. In fact, there is a close conceptual connection between the Qur'ānic concept of return or *raj'* and its concept of *dīn* (religion). It is a fact that one of the basic meanings of the term *dīn* is recurrent rain so that the term rain symbolizes the true religion. So Islam, the true religion, is like rain by which He gives life to man who is otherwise dead like the earth. Thus a believer, a man who saturates himself in true religion, is "living," and a misbeliever is "dead." Alluding to this, the Prophet said: "The similitude of one who remembers his Lord and one who does not remember his Lord is like the living and the dead." This is how *tafsīr* and *ta'wīl* work.

It should be noted that the way Ibn Qutaybah used the term *ta'wīl* is different from that of al-Attas. However, for the sake of discussion, the above explanation on *ta'wīl* is to illustrate its meaning. Historically speaking, at the time of Ibn Qutaybah, if the above process of *ta'wīl* was required of a person to follow before he could embark upon the work of interpreting the Qur'ānic verses or the Prophetic traditions, one can understand why Ibn Qutaybah, a

<sup>46</sup> *Sūrah al-Baqarah*, 2: 164.

<sup>47</sup> *Sūrah al-Tāriq*, 86: 11.

assir, a *muhaddith* and a *qāḍī* who knew the process of *ta'wīl*, denounced the method of *ta'wīl* forwarded by the people of *im*. In relation to this, we observed that the aim of Ibn Qutaybah writing *Ta'wīl Mukhtalif al-Ḥadīth* was to explain and clarify the mod of *ta'wīl*<sup>48</sup> on the apparent divergences found in the *aḥādīth* of the Prophet SAAS. The reason as to why Ibn Qutaybah focused on *aḥādīth* of the Prophet SAAS was that, those *aḥādīth* were relied by the *mutakallimūn* of his time to uphold their denomination for personal use. At the same time, Ibn Qutaybah was reminding giving caution to the Muslim masses so that they would not be swayed by such wrong interpretations, which then would lead to erroneous opinions. The term *mukhtalif*<sup>49</sup> as applied in the title of book, *Ta'wīl Mukhtalif al-Ḥadīth*, is a derivative of the Arabic *ikhtilāf* meaning "difference of opinion." In the study of *ḥadīth* literature, the term *ikhtilāf* is used in connection with discussions related to religious matters and is regarded as the beginning of rationalism.<sup>50</sup> To explain this, one could refer to some of the Sufi traditions which say: "...those who were before you were deceived on account of asking questions and their *ikhtilāf*

---

<sup>48</sup>For a good exposition of the rules of *ta'wīl*, see Al-Ghazzālī, *Fayṣal al-'Afrīqah Bayna al-Islām wa al-Zandaqah*, trans. McCarthy, *Freedom and Fulfillment*, (Boston: G.K. Hall & Co., 1980), 151 - 152; Ibn Rushd, *Faṣl al-Maqāl wa Taqrīr Mā Bayn al-Sharī'ah wa al-Ḥikmah min al-Ittiṣāl*, trans. Hourani, *Averroes on the Harmony of Religion and Philosophy*, (London: Luzac Company, 1961), 63 - 64.

<sup>49</sup>Comte maintains that the term *mukhtalif* should be used in the title of Ibn Qutaybah's book, *Ta'wīl Mukhtalif al-Ḥadīth*, instead of *mukhtalaf*. This is because the latter term denotes diverse *ḥadīth*, while the former means divergences in *ḥadīth* and this term therefore, conveys the idea that Ibn Qutaybah intended the reader to understand. See *Le Traité*, vii.

<sup>50</sup>His statement is made by Wensinck, see *Creed*, 112f. However, this opinion is not true for *'aql* as a tool to understand Islam, begins to be used with its acceptance, see Introduction of this writing.

(differences) from their Prophets....",<sup>51</sup> "...I command you to fear (and to be obedient servants even to a Ḥabashī slave. For whome of you live long shall witness many *ikhtilāf* (dissensions) but beware of novel things for they are errors. Whoever live to see should cling to my Sunnah and the Sunnah of the well-guided caliph who walked in the right path."<sup>52</sup> These two *ḥadīth* express the idea of *ikhtilāf* in theological issues, which Prophet Muḥammad had warned the Muslims to be aware of. Ibn Qutaybah applies this real meaning of *ikhtilāf* in writing his *Ta'wīl*. In other words, Ibn Qutaybah is correct in entitling his book *Ta'wīl Mukhtalif al-Ḥadīth* to show that *ikhtilāf* in theological issues should be cautiously approached. This is because there are some *aḥādīth* of the Prophet whose *matn* seem to contradict the teachings of al-Qur'ān or another *ḥadīth* or even the *Shari'ah*. What Ibn Qutaybah did in his *Ta'wīl* among other things, was to discuss this issue of *mukhtalif al-ḥadīth* and he asserted that *ta'wīl* of any conflicting issues derived from the Prophetic traditions should be viewed from a proper perspective, so that it allows no conflict between those said issues and *Sharī'ah*. Although *Kitāb Ta'wīl Mukhtalif al-Ḥadīth* discusses significant topics on the *ḥadīth* of Prophet SAAS and issues related to *kalām*, this book was not given due respect by the Muslim surveyors of Islamic Theology; nor was its significance always recognized by the very followers of Ibn Qutaybah. There are three main reasons why Muslim theologians did not duly notice Ibn Qutaybah's *Ta'wīl*. The first reason is that, Ibn Qutaybah was better known in the field of literature. His other writings, particularly *Kitāb Adab al-Kātib* that was the main source

<sup>51</sup> *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, 4: Book 43, *ḥadīth* 130, 183.

<sup>52</sup> Al-Tirmidhī, Aḥmad ibn 'Īsā, *Al-Jāmi' al-Ṣaḥīḥ wa huwa Sunan Tirmidhī*, 8 vols., (Bayrūt: Dār Iḥyā' al-'Arabī, nd.), 5: *ḥadīth* 2676, 44 hereafter cited as *Sunan al-Tirmidhī*.

reference in literature for centuries, has eclipsed Ibn Qutaybah's contribution in theology as inferred in his *Ta'wīl*. Apart from that, *Ta'wīl* is not free from citation of long poems.<sup>53</sup> As a result, his theological ideas were surpassed by the ambiguous meanings inherent in the poems themselves, which certainly did not attract readers to read *Ta'wīl*.

The second reason is that, the great and simplified writings on the foundation or the principle of Islam which is free from poetical lyrics, propounded by his successors, like al-Ash'arī's *Maqālāt al-Islāmiyyīn* and al-Nasafī's *'Aqā'id* outshone Ibn Qutaybah's theological ideas, as implied in his *Ta'wīl*. Thus, readers probably, saw no reason to read Ibn Qutaybah's *Ta'wīl*, nor did they feel obligated to refer to him and indeed, why should they do so if there were profound versions in its nature like al-Ash'arī's *Maqālāt* or al-Nasafī's *'Aqā'id* were accessible to them? Most importantly, on this basis also, *Ta'wīl Mukhtalif al-Ḥadīth* is about a technical issue in the sciences of *ḥadīth* by which al-Shāfi'ī has already ironed out in *Al-Risālah*.

Another reason why Ibn Qutaybah's *Ta'wīl* was not well accepted by the readers, as compared to the work written by al-Nasafī or al-Ash'arī, lies in the fact that, both al-Nasafī and al-Ash'arī had to need to justify the supremacy of Islam over Christianity, Judaism, Zoroastrianism or other religious forms, which tended to threaten the continuity of Islam. These kinds of threats, however, were prevalent during Ibn Qutaybah's time. Hence, relatively Ibn Qutaybah in his

---

See for example *Ta'wīl*, 62, 71; *Le Traite*, 69 - 70.

*Ta'wīl* could not concentrate fully on theological questions, which were raised within the Muslim *ummah* because he had to also pay attention to the outside challenges, which tended to pose a threat and corrupt the Muslim mind. At the same time, Ibn Qutaybah had to prove his theological freedom from the unpopular labels of Jahmism, Jabarism, Anthropomorphism, Qadarism and Mu'tazilism. He also had to vindicate his arguments by means of his intellectual capacity and loyalty to the true teachings of Islam. All these prevented the readers from reading *Kitāb Ta'wīl Mukhtalif al-Ḥadīth*.

To conclude, the contribution of Ibn Qutaybah can be observed from his writings. Ibn Qutaybah has authored thirty books in the areas of jurisprudence, Arabic language and Literature and theology. In the field of jurisprudence, he has written three books two of which are not extant. While in the field of literary work which constituted Arabic language, Ibn Qutaybah has written eighteen books. However, only eight books of his are extant in manuscripts and published in book form and the rest unavailable. In the area of theology, Ibn Qutaybah has written nine books, four of which are not extant, and five of which are extant in manuscripts but one manuscript still remains to be edited.



# TRANSLATION OF *TA'WĪL MUKHTALIF* *AL-ḤADĪTH*

↓ THE NAME OF ALLĀH THE COMPASSIONATE THE  
MERCIFUL

bū Muḥammad ‘Abd Allāh ibn Muslim, may Almighty Allāh bless him, said: “Praise be to Allāh, Master of the universe and reward to those who fear Him. And may Allāh bless Muḥammad, seal of the prophets and the members of his family, the good and the pure. May Allāh rejoice you by your submission to Him and may He surround you with His solicitude. May He help you to come to the truth and attitude to His Mercy. May He place you in the rank of the elected ones.”

“You wrote to me, informing me of the criticism of the people of *ilām* hurled against the people of *ḥadīth* and how they accused each other of spreading lies and transmitting contradicting narrations of *ḥadīth*; so much so that disparity occurred and that denominations proliferated, that virtuousness has been derogated, that enmity among Muslims widen due to accusation made to others as infidels and each faction of opinion adhered to its own doctrines supported by *ḥadīth*.”

“The Khawārij deduced their views from their (*ḥadīth*) narrations: ‘Take out your sword and put onto your shoulder and wreak havoc on *em*<sup>1</sup>’; [One faction of my community will continuously hold to the

---

Al-Hāfiẓ Nūr al-Dīn ‘Alī ibn Abī Bakr Sulaymān al-Haythamī al-Miṣrī (d.807 A.H.), *Majma’ al-Zawā’id wa Manba’ al-Fawā’id*, ed. Muḥammad ‘Abd al-Qādir Aḥmad ‘Atā’, (Bayrūt: Dār al-Kutub al-‘Ilmiyyah, 2001), 5: 254, hereafter cited as *Majma’ al-Zawā’id*; ‘Alā’ al-Dīn ‘Alī al-Muttaqī ibn Ḥussām al-Dīn al-Hindī al-Burhānfūrī (d. 975 A.H.), *Kanz al-‘Ummāl fī Sunan al-Aqwāl wa al-Af’āl*, (ed) Shaykh Bakrī Ḥayānī, (corrected and indexed) al-Shaykh Ṣafwah al-Saqā, (Bayrūt: Mu’assasah al-Risālah, 1405AH/1985), 5<sup>th</sup> edition, 6: 68 (No. 14882), hereafter cited as *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*; Abū ‘Abd al-Allāh Muḥammad ibn Aḥmad ibn ‘Uthmān al-Dhahabī (d. 748AH); *Mizān al-‘Itidāl fī Naqd al-Rijāl*, ed. ‘Alī Muḥammad al-Bijāwī (Bayrūt: Dār al-Ma‘rifah, 1963), 2:272 (No. 3697), hereafter cited as *Mizān al-‘Itidāl*; Al-Hāfiẓ Abū al-Qāsim Sulaymān ibn Aḥmad ibn Ayyūb al-Ṭabrānī (d. 360AH), *Al-Mu’jam al-Ṣaghīr li-al-Ṭabrānī* (Bayrūt: Dār al-



(absolute) truth. They will not be affected by any controversie (created by others)];<sup>2</sup> [Whoever is killed while defending his wealth (will die as) a martyr.]”<sup>3</sup>

3. “While the Qā'id (those who do not participate in the war) relief on their (*ḥadīth*) narrations: [You are responsible for the solidarity o

---

Kutub al-'Ilmiyyah, 1403AH/1983), 1:74, hereafter cited as *Al-Mu'jam al-Ṣaghīr*.

- <sup>2</sup> Badr al-Dīn Abū Muḥammad Maḥmūd ibn Aḥmad al-'Aynī (d. 855H) *Umdat al-Qārī Sharḥ Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī*, (ed.) 'Abd al-Allāh Maḥmūd Muḥammad 'Umar (Bayrūt: Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyyah, 2001), 25:73 (No. 7311), hereafter cited as *Umdat al-Qārī*; Abū al-Ḥusayn Muslim al-Ḥajjāj al-Qushayrī al-Naysābūrī (d. 261AH), *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, (ed) Muḥammad Fu'ād 'Abd al-Bāqī (Istanbul, Turkiya: Al-Maktabah al-Islāmiyyah, 1950), 3:152 (No. 1920), hereafter cited as *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*; Abū Sulaymān ibn al-Ash'atī al-Sijistānī al-Azdī, *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, (edited and commented) Muḥammad Muḥy al-Dīn 'Abd al-Ḥamīd (Bayrūt: Dār al-Fikr, nd.), 2: 231 (No. 4252) hereafter cited as *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*; Abū 'Abd al-Allāh Muḥammad ibn Yāzīd al-Qazwīnī, *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, (ed.) Muḥammad Fu'ād 'Abd al-Bāqī (Bayrūt: Al-Maktabah al-'Ilmiyyah, nd.), 1:5 (No. 6), hereafter cited as *Sunan Ibn Mājah*; *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 12:165 (No. 34501).

- <sup>3</sup> *Umdat al-Qārī*, 13:47 (No. 2480); *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 4:247 (No. 4772) Abū 'Isā Muḥammad ibn 'Isā ibn Sawrah, *Sunan al-Tirmidhī*, (edited and commented) Aḥmad Muḥammad Shākir, (Bayrūt: Dār Iḥyā' al-Turāth, n.d) 4:28 (No. 1418, 1419, and 1421), hereafter cited as *Sunan al-Tirmidhī*; *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 2:861 (No. 2580); Abū Bakr Aḥmad ibn al-Ḥusayn ibn 'Alī al-Bayhaqī, *Al-Sunan al-Kubrā*, (ed.) Muḥammad 'Abd al-Qādir 'Atā' (Bayrūt: Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyyah, 1999), 3:377; 8:323; 8:582. hereafter cited as *Al-Sunan al-Kubrā*; Abū 'Abd al-Allāh Muḥammad al-Ḥākim al-Naysābūrī, *Al-Mustadrak 'alā al-Ṣaḥīḥayn*, (ed.) Yūsuf 'Abd al-Raḥmān al-Mar'ashī (Bayrūt: Dār al-Ma'rifah, 1986), 3:639, hereafter cited as *Al-Mustadrak*; Abū al-Qāsim Sulaymān ibn Aḥmad al-Ṭabrānī, *Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, (ed.) Ḥamd 'Abd al-Mājid al-Salāfī (Maṭba'ah al-Waṭan al-'Arabī, 1984), 1:153 hereafter cited as *Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*; *Majmā' al-Zawā'id*, 6:264 (No. 10462); 6:265 (No. 10465); 6:265 (No. 10467); *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 4:416 (No. 11180); 4:419 (No. 11197); 4:426 (No. 11239); Al-Shaykh Walī al-Dīn Muḥammad ibn 'Abd al-Allāh al-Khaṭīb al-'Āmirī al-Ṭabrīzī, *Mishkāt al-Maṣābiḥ*, (ed) Muḥammad Nāṣir al-Dīn al-Albānī (Al-Maktab al-Islāmī lī al-Tibā'ah wa al-Naṣh, 1961), 2: 274 (No. 351), hereafter cited *Mishkāt al-Maṣābiḥ*; Zakī al-Dīn 'Abd al-'Azīm ibn 'Abd al-Qawī al-Mundhirī (d. 656AH), *Al-Targhib wa al-Tarhib*, commented by Mustāfā Muḥammad 'Imārah (Bayrūt: Dār Iḥyā' al-Turāth al-'Arabī, 1388AH/1968), 2:340 hereafter cited as *Al-Targhib*.

community for the hand of Allāh is on it<sup>4</sup>]; [Whoever moves y from the *jamā'ah* (community) within a short distance mediates the guardianship of Islam<sup>5</sup>]; [Listen and obey a leader, 1 if he is an Abyssinian slave whose nose and ears were mutilated!<sup>6</sup>]; [Perform prayer behind any individual whether he is a d or an impudent man!<sup>7</sup>]; [You need a leader whether he is a teous or an impudent man. Stay at home, if they come searching you, retreat into your room. And if they force (to open) the door, to them: {Pay for my sin and yours!}<sup>8</sup>]; [Be the servant of Allāh , is killed and not the servant of Allāh who kills.<sup>9</sup>]"

"The Murji'tes deduced their support from their (*ḥadīth*) ations: [Whoever says that there is no other deity other than ih, he is promised paradise. It is said (by an unknown person who d the Prophet): [What (happens) if he commits fornication and t? The Prophet replied: [Even if he commits fornication and t.<sup>10</sup>] And [Whoever proclaims sincerely that there is no other y except Allāh may enter paradise and will escape the fire of

---

*Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, 12:447; *Majma' al-Zawā'id*, 5:282 (No. 9100).

*Al-Mustadrak*, 1:117; *Al-Targhīb*, 1:368; Al-Hafīz Nūr al-Dīn 'Alī ibn Abī Bakr al-Haythamī (d. 807AH), *Mawārid al-Zam'ān ilā Zawā'id Ibn Ḥibbān*, (edited and commented) Shu'ayb al-Arna'ūṭ and Muḥammad Riḍwān al-'Arqasūsī (Bayrūt: Mu'assasah al-Risālah, 1414AH/1993), 5:290 (No. 9135 and 9136), hereafter cited as *Mawārid*.

'*Umdat al-Qārī*, 24:334 (No. 7142); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 2:955 (No. 2860); *Al-Sunan al-Kubrā*, 8:268; *Mishkāt al-Mayābīh*, 2:316 (No. 3662); *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 6:50 (No. 14799).

*Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 6:54 (No. 14815); Ismā'īl ibn Muḥammad al-'Ajlūnī al-Jarrāhī (d. 1162 AH), *Kashf al-Khafā' wa Muzīl al-Ibbās*, (corrected, and commented) Aḥmad al-Qalāsh (Bayrūt: Mu'assasah al-Risālah, 1985), 2: 37 (No. 42), hereafter cited as *Kashf al-Khafā'*.

Aḥmad ibn Ḥanbal, *Al-Musnad*, (examined, commented, indexed) Ṣiḍqī Muḥammad Jamīl al-'Aṭṭār (Bayrūt: Dār al-Fikr, 1994), 6:287 (No. 18004), hereafter cited as *Al-Musnad*.

'*Umdat al-Qārī*, 16: 347 (No. 7083).

*Al-Musnad*, 8:94 (No. 21471); 8:99 (No. 21490); 8:108 (No. 21522); 8:340 (No. 22527).

hell.<sup>11</sup>] And [I have planned intercession in favor of the members my community, guilty of grievous sin!<sup>12</sup>]

5. The opponents of (the Murji'ites) put forward their (*ḥadī* narrations: [The fornicator, at the moment he commits fornication no more a believer. The thief, at the moment he commits theft is more a believer!<sup>13</sup>]; [He is not a believer, one whose neighbour is r protected from his evil!<sup>14</sup>]; [He is not a believer, one whose tong and hands (power) do not spare the Muslims<sup>15</sup>]; [He will come out the hell fire as if he is devoid of human form<sup>16</sup>]; [He will come out the hell fire burned and (his skin will grow or develop) just like t seeds that start to germinate due to the (rich silt) out of the mount

<sup>11</sup> *Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, 5:197; *Majma' al-Zawā'id*, 1:31 (No. 16); *Kanz 'Ummāl*, 1:60 (No. 203); 1:61 (No. 205); 1:61 (No. 206); 1:295 (No. 141); 1:418 (No. 1779).

<sup>12</sup> Sulaymān ibn Dāwūd ibn al-Jārūd (d. 204AH), *Musnad al-Ṭayālīsī* (Hay' Ābād, Hind: Dār al-Kitāb al-Lubnānī wa Dār al-Tawfīq, 1321), 233 (1 1669); 270 (No. 2026), hereafter cited as *Musnad al- Ṭayālīsī*.

<sup>13</sup> *'Umdat al-Qārī*, 23:421 (No. 6782); 23:448 (No. 6810); 13:35 (No. 247 *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, 1:76 (No. 100); 1:77 (No. 105); *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 4:2 (No. 4689); *Sunan al-Tirmidhī*, 5:15 (No. 2625); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 2:12 (No. 3936); Abū Bakr 'Abd al-Razzāq ibn al-Humam al-Ṣan'ānī (d. 211 A' *Al-Muṣannaf*, ed. Ḥabīb al-Raḥmān al-A'zamī (Bayrūt: Al-Maktab al-Islā 1983), 7:417 (No. 13688), hereafter cited as *Al-Muṣannaf*; *Al-Sunan Kubrā*, 10:314; Abū Muḥammad 'Abd Allāh ibn 'Abd al-Raḥmān ibn F ibn Bahram al-Dārimī (d. 255 AH); *Sunan al-Dārimī* (Dār Iḥyā' al-Sun al-Nabawiyyah, nd), 2:115, hereafter cited as *Sunan al-Dārimī*; *Majma' Zawā'id*, 1:131, 132, and 133 (366-369, 371-374); *Al-Mu'jam al-Kal* 11:244, 12:346; 'Abd Allāh ibn Muḥammad ibn 'Abd al-Barr al-Qurṭubī 463 AH), *Al-Tamḥīd li-mā fi al-Muwajja' min Ma'ānī wa al-Maṣānīd*. (e Muḥammad 'Abd al-Qādir 'Aṭā' (Bayrūt: Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyyah, 199 2: 376; 4: 212; and 7: 407, hereafter cited as *al-Tamḥīd*; *Kanz al-'Umm* 1:261 (No. 1309); 1:261 (No. 1310); 1:262 (No.1311); 1:262 (No. 132 1:264 (No. 1326); 1:406 (No. 1733); *Al-Targhib*, 3:248-9; *Mishkāt Maṣābiḥ*, 1: 22 (No. 53).

<sup>14</sup> *'Umdat al-Qārī*, 22:171, (No. 6016); *Al-Musnad*, 5:514 (No. 16372); 10:3 (No. 27232); 3:13 (No. 7883); *Al-Mustadrak*, 1:10 and 14: 65; *Kanz 'Ummāl*, 9:50 (No. 24885) and 9:56 (No. 24922).

<sup>15</sup> *'Umdat al-Qārī*, 23:117 (No. 6484); *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, 1:65, (No. 65 and 6 *Sunan al-Tirmidhī*, 5:17 (No. 2627 and 2628); *Sunan al-Nasā'ī*, 8:105; *Sun Abū Dāwūd*, 3:4 (No. 2481); *Al-Musnad*, 2:560 (No. 6525); 2:625 (1 6820); 2:630 (No. 6850); 2:646 (No. 6906); *Mishkāt al-Maṣābiḥ*, 1:10, (1 6 and 33); *Al-Tamḥīd*, 9:244; *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 1:149 (No. 738, 739, a 740); *Sunan al-Dārimī*, 2:300; *Mawāriḍ*, 1:38 (No. 26).

<sup>16</sup> *'Umdat al-Qārī*, 6:118 (No. 806); 25:187 (No. 7437).



ream or (his skin will grow or develop) just like a (small) palm tree about to grow<sup>17]</sup>"

. "As for the Qadarites, they based their ideology on their (*ḥadīth*) narrations: [Every child is born according to (its) disposition (*fiṭrah*), is his parents who finally make him Jew or Christian.<sup>18]</sup> The Almighty Allāh said: {I have created all of my servants as true believers. It is the satan that stray them away from their religion.}<sup>19]</sup>"

. "The *Mufawwiḍ* argued on their (*ḥadīth*) narrations: [Work! The fate of man will be guided according to what he has been created for. And whoever is categorized as the blessed ones, he will (be inclined to) work for his happiness and whoever is categorized as the rejected ones, he will (be inclined to) work for his destruction<sup>20]</sup>; [Allāh created the back of Ādam and with two handfuls, he said to the one on His right: In paradise by My mercy, and He said to the one on His left: {To hell, I will not be bothered with it!}<sup>21]</sup>; [The blessed one is blessed from the womb of his mother and the rejected ones, from the womb of his mother!<sup>22]</sup>"

. "The Rāfiqites, who were known for their accusation of the companions of the Prophet as infidels, referred to their (*ḥadīth*) narrations: [Some people will come and meet me at the water basin but they are digressed elsewhere and will be separated from me and I will say to them: {O My Lord! My companions! My companions!} and it is said to him: {You will never know what they could have done after (your demise)! Upon that separation, they will

---

'*Umdat al-Qārī*, 6:118 (No. 806); 25:187 (No. 7437) and 4: 544 (No. 806); *Al-Sunan al-Kubrā*, 10:321; *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 14:438 (No. 39197); *Al-Targhīb*, 4:407.

*Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 4:229 (No. 4714) and 4:230 (No. 4716); *Majma' al-Zawā'id*, 7:316 (No. 11946, 11947, 11948, 11949).

*Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, 17:360, 362-3.

'*Umdat al-Qārī*, 25:293 (No. 7552) and 13: 490 (No. 4949); *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, 4:2039, (No. 2647); *Sunan al-Tirmidhī*, 4:445 (No. 2136); *Mishkāt al-Masābiḥ*, 1:31 (No. 85); *Mawārid*, 2:811 (No. 1809); *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 1:360 (No. 592 and 1595); *Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, 4:237, 7:119-121, 18: 129-131.

*Majma' al-Zawā'id*, 7:248 (No. 11778); *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 6:134 (No. 15149).

*Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 1:106 (No. 491); *Al-Mu'jam al-Saghīr*, 2:5.

continuously renounce the religion and will be apostates!} <sup>23</sup>]; [And after me, there will be a group of infidels who will kill each other! <sup>24</sup>] And in relation to the idea of the prominence of 'Alī, the (Rāfiḍites) argued based on their (*ḥadīth*) narrations: [You are adored by me as Harūn adored Mūsā and there will be no Prophet after me! <sup>25</sup>]; [The one whose master is 'Alī, is a master as well! Lord! Be a friend of his friends and be an enemy of his enemies! <sup>26</sup>]; [You are the executor of my will! <sup>27</sup>]"

9. "The Opponents of (the Rafiḍites) and the supporters of the prominence of the two *shaykhs* (leaders - Abū Bakr and 'Umar) argued based on their (*ḥadīth*) narrations: [Take examples from those who will come after me (Abū Bakr and 'Umar)! <sup>28</sup>]; [Allāh, His Prophet and the Muslims will only listen to Abū Bakr! <sup>29</sup>]; [The best of his community after the Prophet is Abū Bakr. <sup>30</sup>]"

10. "The supporter of wealth based their argument on their (*ḥadīth*) narrations: [My Lord! I pray that You will give me and my master,

<sup>23</sup> 'Umdat al-Qārī, 23:216, (No. 6582) and 11: 53 (No. 3349).

<sup>24</sup> 'Umdat al-Qārī, 2:262 (No. 121); 24:51 (No. 6868), 24:280 (No. 7077); *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, 1:82 (No. 66); *Majma' al-Zawā'id*, 6:39 (No. 10705), 7:409 (No. 12293, 12297); *Al-Targhib*, 1:132; *Al-Mu'jam al-Sagħūr*, 1:153; Abū Ja'far al-Taḥāwī, *Mushkīl al-Āthār* (Bayrūt: Dār al-Šādīr, 1914), 3: 194, hereafter cited as *Mushkīl al-Āthār*.

<sup>25</sup> 'Umdat al-Qārī, 11: 446 (No. 3706); *Sunan al-Tirmidhī*, 5:641 (No.3730, 3731); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 1:45 (No. 121); *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 11:599 (No. 32881); 13:151 (No. 36470); 13:192 (No. 36572); *Majma' al-Zawā'id*, 9:96 (No. 14642, 14643), 9:98 (No. 14652); *Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, 1:146-148.

<sup>26</sup> *Sunan al-Tirmidhī*, 5:633 (No. 3713); *Mawārid*, 2:987 (No. 2204); Al-Āmir 'Alā' al-Dīn 'Alī ibn Balbān, *Ṣaḥīḥ Ibn Hibbān bi Tartīb Ibn Balbān* (d. 739 AH), (edited, commented) Shu'ayb al-Arna'ūt (Bayrūt; Mu'assasah al-Risālah, 1993), 15: 375 (No. 6930), hereafter cited as *Ṣaḥīḥ Ibn Hibbān*; *Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, 3:179 – 180; *Al-Mustadrak*, 3:110, 134, 371; *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 1:45 (No. 121); *Majma' al-Zawā'id*, 7: 55 (No. 10978), 9:88 (No. 14610-14611), 9:90 (No. 14617), 9:91 (No. 14618); *Mushkīl al-Āthār*, 2:207-8; *Mishkāt al-Maṣābiḥ*, 3:243 (No. 6082); *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 11:602 (No. 32904), 11:609 (No. 32950), 11:610 (No. 32951), 13:105 (No. 36343).

<sup>27</sup> 'Umdat al-Qārī, 12:402 (No. 4459).

<sup>28</sup> *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 1:37 (No. 97); *Al-Sunan al-Kubrā*, 8:153; *Al-Mustadrak*, 3:75; *Mawārid*, 2:978 (No. 2193), *Mishkāt al-Maṣābiḥ*, 3:278 (No. 6221), *Mushkīl al-Āthār*, 2: 83, 84, and 85; *Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, 9:72.

<sup>29</sup> *Al-Mustadrak*, 3:477.

<sup>30</sup> 'Umdat al-Qārī, 11: 392 (No. 3655); *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 11:567 (No. 32684).



th and comfort!<sup>31</sup>]; [My Lord! I pray that You will keep me  
y from endless misery.<sup>32</sup>]"

"The supporters of poverty based their argument on their (*ḥadīth*)  
ations: [My Lord! Make my live miserable, make my death  
rable and resurrect me among the miserable ones!<sup>33</sup>]; [Poverty is  
r off for a believer than a long rope (that bridles) at the neck of a  
e!<sup>34</sup>]"

"The partisans of the *Badā'* based their argument on their  
'*ith*) narrations: [(Warm) relationship prolongs the duration of life  
the practice of alms giving drives off fatal destiny!<sup>35</sup>] 'Umar said:

Lord, if you have registered me among the rejected ones  
inate my name and register me among the blessed ones!]"

"The (above) are among the various narrations related to  
prudence, in which the jurists differed upon deciding its  
l decisions. (These differences) disunited the Ḥijāzis and the  
jis. And they differed on most chapters of jurisprudence and each  
up) edified its own principle in the (*ḥadīth*) narrations."

"They (the "pseudo" people of *ḥadīth* have made many)  
mnies (statements) about Almighty Allāh and found arguments in  
seemingly anthropomorphic *aḥādīth*. Some examples are: the  
at of the horse; the hairy chest; the light of the two arms; the visit  
re angels, a document in the golden cage, evening of 'Arafah; a

---

*Al-Musnad*, 5:343 (No. 15754); *Majma' al-Zawā'id*, 10:173; *Kanz al-Ummāl*, 2:186 (3673); 2:218 (3819).

Jalāl al-Dīn al-Suyūṭī, *Sunan al-Nasā'ī bi-Sharḥ Jalāl al-Dīn al-Suyūṭī* (Bayrūt: Dār Ihyā' al-Turāth al-'Arabī, n.d) 8:261, hereafter cited as *Sunan al-Nasā'ī*; *Al-Musnad*, 3:214 (No. 8318); *Al-Sunan al-Kubrā*, 7:12; *Mishkāt al-Maṣābiḥ*, 2:756 (No. 2467); *Mawā'id*, 2:1099 (No. 2443); *Kanz al-Ummāl*, 2:189 (No. 3688); *Ṣaḥīḥ Ibn Hibbān*, 3:305 (No. 1030).

Abū Bakr Muḥammad ibn 'Abd Allāh ibn Muḥammad ibn 'Abd Allāh known as Ibn al-'Arabī (d. 543AH), *ʿAridat al-Aḥwadhī bi Sharḥ Ṣaḥīḥ al-Tirmidhī* (Bayrūt: Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyyah, 1997), 5:153 (No. 2352), 2:1381-2 (No. 4126), hereafter cited as *ʿAridat al-Aḥwadhī*; *Al-Sunan al-Kubrā*, 7:12; *Al-Mustadrak*, 4:322; *Kanz al-Ummāl*, 6:470 (No. 16593 and 16592); *Mishkāt al-Maṣābiḥ*, 2:665 (No. 5244).

*Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, 7:295; *Kanz al-Ummāl*, 6:470 (No. 16594).

*ʿUmdat al-Qārī*, 15:154 (No. 5985 and 5986); *Al-Targhib*, 2:32; *Kanz al-Ummāl*, 3:356 (No. 6909); *Kashf al-Khafā'*, 2:41.

young and curly haired man wearing a golden mask; the uncover leg (*sāq*) of doom's day which they were disputing each other; the creation of Ādam in His image;<sup>36</sup> he placed his hand between my two shoulders until I felt the coldness of his fingers between my pectorals; and the heart of the believers is between two fingers of the hand of the Almighty Allāh.<sup>37</sup>

15. They (the "pseudo" people of *ḥadīth*) narrated all kinds of nonsense that created criticism against Islām, and made the unfaithful mock (their narrations), discouraged the apostates (who were in the midst of) accepting (Islām) and reinforced the doubts among people. Other narrations of (the "pseudo" people of *ḥadīth*) were (related) that the buttock of the *hūrā'* stating that it measured one mile in each direction; whoever recited such and such a verse, or who does this that will be living in paradise 70,000 palaces. In every palace, contained 70,000 apartments and each apartment comprised 70,000 beds and each bed will have this or that and the likes."

"Other (examples of their) traditions were the (pseudo) *aḥādīth* stating that the mouse was a Jew and does not drink a camel's milk and this was just like the Jew who does not drink a camel's milk; a crow was perverse; a cat was the product of the coughing of a lie and a pig was the product of the coughing of an elephant; a lobster was a tailor who stole the thread and was metamorphosed; that lizard was a Jew who stingily (treated) his parents and was metamorphosed; the Canopus was found in Yaman; Venus was a prostitute who went up to heaven, taking along with her the supreme name of Allāh and was metamorphosed as a star; a gecko spat fire against Ibrāhīm while *'izāyah* (a kind of lizard) was spreading water on him but a lizard spat on him; a ghouel comes every night to the cellar of Abū Ayyūb; 'Umar was fighting body to body with a gergel and (the former had) bitten him; the earth was leaning on the back of a fish; the people of paradise were the first to sample the liver of

<sup>36</sup> *Umdat al-Qārī*, 15: 345 (No. 6227).

<sup>37</sup> Abū al-Qāsim 'Alī ibn Hibah Allāh known as Ibn 'Asākir (d. 571AH) *Tahdhīb Tārīkh al-Dimashq al-Kabīr*, (ed.) Shaykh 'Abd al-Qādir Badrī (Bayrūt: Dār Ihyā' al-Turāth al-'Arabī, 1987), 6:65, hereafter cited *Tahdhīb Tārīkh*.

; a wolf entered paradise because it had eaten a tax collector; if a falls in a container one has to submerge it fully, because one of its gs contains the poison while the other contains the antidote. The brings poison and remedy;<sup>38</sup> a camel was created from demons<sup>39</sup> the likes. It will be too lengthy if one were to mention all (of r narrations).”

“(The people of *kalām*) said weird things against (the people *ḥadīth*) such that (the latter) accused a *shaykh* as a liar but still ismitted (the *ḥadīth*) narrated from him for it was (unanimously eptable) by other *muḥaddithūn* (plural form of *muḥaddīth*) and the ykh’s name will not be in the (*ḥadīth*). In addition, they even demned Yaḥyā ibn Ma‘īn, ‘Alī al-Madīnī and their friends. They ) argued based on the *ḥadīth* narrated by Abū Hurayrah, which ; disputed by all companions of the Prophet. In fact, ‘Umar, hmān and ‘Ā’ishah confirmed that (Abū Hurayrah) was lying. art from that (the people of *ḥadīth*) also argued based on the ing of Fāṭimah bint Qays whose words ‘Umar, ‘Uthmān and ishah condemned saying: [We will not abandon the Book of our d and the Sunnah of our Prophet for (the nonsense in) that man’s saying!]”

“They ridiculed a man for his opinion on *qadr* (free will) and they ) refused to transmit (a narration of) names (like) Ghaylān, ‘Amr ‘Ubayd, Ma‘bad al-Juhanī, ‘Amr ibn Fā’id. However, they ined the same narration which they narrated from their friends o professed the same doctrine (on *qadr*) such as Qatādah, Ibn Abū ūbah, Ibn Abū Najīḥ, Muḥammad ibn al-Munkadir and Ibn Abū i’b. They also condemned a *shaykh* who was ranked on the same el of ‘Alī and ‘Uthmān and were against those who held the idea he prominence of ‘Alī over (Uthmān). However, they transmitted n Abū al-Ṭufayl ‘Āmir ibn Wāthilah, the flag carrier and Jābir al-

---

*Umdat al-Qārī*, 10:66 (No. 3320), 14:756 (No. 5782); *Al-Musnad*, 3:7 (No. 7144); 3:82 (No. 7575); 3:449 (No. 9727); *Al-Sunan al-Kubrā*, 1:252; *Mishkāt al-Maṣābīḥ*, 2:431 (No. 4115); 2:436 (No. 4143); *Mushkāt al-Āthār*, 4:282-283; *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, 10:48 (No. 28301).  
*Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, 9:64 (No. 24967).



Ju'fī (even though) both of them professed the idea of *raj'ah* (return to the earthly life after death).”

18. “They also said that they (the people of *ḥadīth*) were the people who barely understood things that they have narrated and we scarcely able to appreciate the treasures they were searching. In relation to that, they said:

[Camels loaded with poetry, barely understand what they carried.

Except that they are good in the knowledge of the camel

I affirm that the camel knew not what were loaded on its back when it went early in the morning,

And when it came at night, it knew not what were on its back.]

19. “In discussing (any) knowledge, (the people of *ḥadīth*) were on concerned with the wordings and the name of a *ḥadīth*. They were elated when somebody said to them that such and such a person was an authority in the area of the chain of narrators and an authority in the *ḥadīth* narration. But at the same time (the people of *ḥadīth*) renounced it when somebody said to them such and such understood what he wrote or practiced in conformity with what he understood.”

“(The opponent of *ḥadīth* also criticized the *muḥaddithūn* saying [What is your opinion of whom we have considered to be a master and of whom we have known for fifty years, and of whom we questioned on the mouse that fell in a well, but he replied, it was clean?]<sup>40</sup> Another person was asked on the saying of Almighty Allā [The wind which brings the nipping frost (*sirrun*)]<sup>41</sup> but he replied: [It was a cricket (*al-ṣurṣur*)]. Another (criticism), when a person was speaking of seventy-seven (*sab'ah wa sab'in*), but he referred to it as Shu'bah and Sufyan. And when a person said to them: [to put a curtain at the praying place like an example on the back of a man]

<sup>40</sup> 'Umdat al-Qārī, 9:58 (No. 2355); Al-Musnad, 3:550 (No. 13099); Majma' al-Zawā'id, 6:343 (No. 10803).

<sup>41</sup> Sūrah Āli 'Imrān, 3:117.

(مثل أجرة الرجل), but they replied: [the example of the back of the mule (مثل آخر الرجل)]. And another person was asked: [When did the narration end?] And the reply: [In two months (فقرين)] instead of [Until the two crescents (إلى شهري هلال)]. Another man said: [He placed his hand in his mouth and chewed it as if 'he was chewing a dish (الفجل)'] but they meant it as 'he was biting it like the stallion (الفحل)'. Another man said: [I only found (the term) the messenger (الرسول) written in my Book but not (the term) Allāh! (الله), that is the terms رسول الله but *al-mustamli*<sup>42</sup> replied: [Write it! But I doubt in writing the terms) الله تعالى (Almighty Allāh) together with رسول is ; if associating a partner to Him.]”

9. “The opponent of the people of *ḥadīth* said: [Most of the *uḥaddithūn* are foolish and devious. Although they have committed any grammatical mistakes, the masses trusted them. And even if (a *uḥaddith*) is immoral, ill-tempered, inarticulate and weak narration of *ḥadīth*, the masses are still fascinated with him!] As such al-‘amash used to flaunt the tablecloth before laying it on his shoulder. Then somebody asked him about its *isnād* (the chain of the narrators), he grabbed the person by his neck and then pushed him to the wall and said: [Here! You got its *isnād*!] He also said: [When I saw a *shaykh* who was not interested in *fiqh* I feel like slapping him.] Despite this folly, he influenced the masses. However, we reckoned that he did that to attract their attention.”

10. Abū Muḥammad said: “I reported here the attacks against the people of *ḥadīth*. I deplore those (attacks) because they continuously persist and nobody fights them neither do they give arguments in favor for those *aḥādīth* nor try to (provide correct) interpretations (on those *aḥādīth*). The masses are immune to those criticisms and tolerated those insults passively since they refrained themselves from responding. However, restraining from responding to (those criticisms) means that it is as if we are acknowledging them. You might remember having read my book, *Gharīb al-Ḥadīth* in which I

---

It means a man who wore tattered garment probably showing his inclination towards asceticism.



have offered a few examples of those pseudo-contradictions and explained them.”

22. “Here, you will find the arguments on the contradictions to be (slightly similar) to that mentioned in my first book. You asked me to take this work in view of the lucrative reward and I, therefore undertook it within the limit of my knowledge and means. I will refer to those *aḥādīth* again, which I have mentioned in my other books, so that this book covers wholesome and exhaustive topics as well as the attacks on those *aḥādīth*. Before dealing with the quotations of the *aḥādīth* and the explanations related to them, I will explain a few clarifications on the people of *kalām* and of *ḥadīth*, saying that I know of each tendency. I hope the censorship authority will not find that there, on my part, a deliberate adulteration of partial words inspired by passion or attack against a personal enemy. I give myself to Allāh for my undertaking and I beg for His assistance.”

## CHAPTER ONE

# THE PEOPLE OF *KALĀM* AND THE PEOPLE OF *RA'Y*

### REPROACHES ADDRESSED AGAINST THEM

Abū Muḥammad said: "I have contemplated – May Allāh have mercy on you – on the sayings of the people of *kalām* and I have noticed that they were mudslinging Allāh with uncanny allegations thus, confusing the masses with their statements. They glanced obliquely at others but are oblivious of their own (spiteful) beams in their eyes. They also doubted (the ability) of others in the transmission of *ḥadīth* except of their own. And they were satisfied with their own interpretations. They also claimed that the ideas which, contained in the Book and the *ḥadīth* (particularly) related to wisdom, examples of the magnificent language; its inimitability and its complexity; the causation, the generation of acts and accidents; the substance and the quantity and quality are not perfectly perceived by anybody."

Some of the (said) problems were to be referred to the scholars among them, they will (only) specify a method to be adopted to find an easy way to solve them. However, what prevented them from solving the problems) was the quest for dominion of power, the sense of nationality, the blind imitation and sense of brotherhood and (giving) their opinions. Human beings are likened to the group animals; they flock together and depend on each other strongly. If

someone among them claims to be a Prophet, even though they know well that the messenger of Allāh is the seal of the Prophets, or even an individual claims himself as the divine God, he will still find himself many followers.”

24. “With their claim that they were knowledgeable in analogical conclusion and reasoning – it is hoped that they made contradiction, just like the mathematicians, the geometricians and engineers, who did not contradict since they depended on the same instruments which indicated the same numbers, figures and forms. And it is hoped that there is not even a single disagreement just like that there is not even a single disagreement among the specialists who agreed upon the nature of water and the pulsation of the arteries as unanimously agreed by (the specialists) before them.”

“What is wrong with people’s thinking? They (continuously) contradict each other and not even two of their leaders among them agree on any point related to religion. For (examples) there is disagreement between Abū al-Hudhayl al-‘Allāf and al-Nazzām : al-Najjār disputed both of them, while Hishām ibn al-Ḥakam disputed all of them. These contradictions also occurred among people like Thumāmah, Muways, Hāshim, al-Awqas, ‘Ubayd Allāh ibn Ḥasan, Bakr al-‘Ammī, Ḥafṣ, Qubbah and others. All of them have their own religious sects based on their own opinions : they commanded their own followers.”

25. Abū Muḥammad said: “If those contradictions were dealing with issues on *furūʿ* and *sunan*, they could be forgiven. However, they should not be as an excuse (to allow) them to hold onto their claims that are based on (wrong) presumptions. And so do the people of *fiqh*, for (it should not be as an excuse to allow them) to have the

ims that are based on (wrong) presumptions since they set the precedence. Their disputes (are not forgiven, especially those that are ated) to issues on Oneness of Allāh, His Attributes, His Power, the light of *barzakh*, the preserved Tablet and the likes, of which the prophet can only apprehend through the Divine Revelation. People ist also refute the principles that are based (solely) on *istihsān* gal preference) or submit them through reason (only) or analogical isoning for (these opinions) will lead to disagreement among ple because they differ in the levels of thinking, ability (to cern) and choices (to made). Indeed, you will never find two sons having a similar view in everything, for example (A) chooses e same thing) which (B) has rejected. However, there is (an ception) in the case of *taqlīd* (blind imitation)."

"A person differs from others in perception, environment, skin or, language, voice, (usage of words), steps and traces, action and ture to the point that one can be differentiated from another by the ps (one makes) and steps (can be differentiated) between a man l a woman. Man is distinguished from others by opinions. But a n, who has different opinion from others, stands to be a victim of se differences. And certainly the wisdom and the power (of Allāh) l not be perfected if there are no contradictory creations. Thus, gs are defined by their opposites. Light is defined by darkness, owledge by ignorance, good by evil, usefulness by harmfulness l sweetness by bitterness. This is in conformity with the saying of ighty Allāh: [Glory to Allāh, Who created in pairs all things that earth produces, as well as their own humankind and other things which they have no knowledge.'] And by couples we mean it as



opposite, for (examples) in gender, male and female, and between dry and humid. And Almighty Allāh said: [That He did create pairs, male and female.<sup>2</sup>]

27. "If it is possible – May Allāh has mercy on you – we would like to dismiss (both) the people of *ḥadīth* and the people of *kalām* else we will live in disunity over unity, anarchy over order segregation over integration and disagreement over agreement. This is because the people of *ḥadīth* hold on to the idea if Allāh wishes to be, it will be, and if Allāh ordains it otherwise, nothing will be! (On the other hand, He is the Creator of good and evil, al-Qur'ān is the uncreated word of Allāh, Allāh will be visible on the Day of Resurrection, the prominence of the two *shaykhs* and the belief in the chastisement of the grave. And they do not dispute those fundamental principles but whoever differs on some of those principles; he will be rejected, disregarded, prosecuted and secluded. However, (the people of *kalām*) differed on the pronunciation in al-Qur'ān and inevitability. All of them also agreed that al-Qur'an in any form, its recitation, written form, hearing and memorization, is uncreated and this is indeed, unanimously accepted (in Islām)."

28. "The masses should adopt the role-model of the eminent scholars, the early jurists and the *mujtahidūn* of whom nobody thought of rivaling and whose authority are uncontested, such as Sufyān al-Thawrī, Mālik ibn Anas, al-Awzā'ī, Shu'bah and Layth ibn Sa'd. And also the great scholars like Ibrāhīm ibn Adham, Muslim al-Khawwās, al-Fuḍayl ibn 'Iyād, Dāwūd al-Ṭā'ī, Muḥammad ibn Naḍr al-Ḥārithī, Aḥmad ibn Ḥanbal, Bishr al-Iḥfāfī and the likes, who are our contemporaries. The names of (other) early scholars includi

<sup>2</sup> *Sūrah Al-Najm*, 53:45.



the leaders of all cities and of all times could not be mentioned here, for it will be too lengthy."

"Indeed, the names as mentioned above, will be recognized, accepted and supported by all. If anybody upholds the opinions of the people of the *ḥadīth* and advocates it in their assemblies or markets, we have said earlier on this subject, nobody will reject or renounce it. However, if someone propagates one of the doctrines of the people of *kalām*, which contradicts the opinion of (the people of *dīth*), not only will the person be rejected, but also (metaphorically) murdered by the glimpse of the eyes."

## SCHOLARS OF THE PEOPLE OF *KALĀM*

### IBRĀHĪM SAYYĀR AL-NAZZĀM

"Let us move on to the people of *kalām*, who claimed that they are knowledgeable in analogical conclusion, able to have wise reasoning and (intellectually) able men - we have to stick to some matters pertain to) their doctrines and try to convince ourselves of none of their sectarian pretexts. We found that al-Nazzām is one of the common man who 'nourished' himself with intoxicated drinks, often took pleasure in immoral activities and guilty of shameful and sinful acts. He said:

[I cease not taking the spirit of wine without regret

The blood that comes not from the wound

Until I feel double in myself and I have two souls in my body

While the bottle lies next to me, it is a body without a soul.]"

31. "We observed that his supporters cited his errors found in his own statement: [The Almighty Allāh has created the world and what is within it, at every moment without destroying it.] They said that this statement means that Allāh creates the existence, and if it is possible (for Him) to create whatever existed, He is indeed able to destroy whatever is non-existent. This opinion shows a false and absurd opinion out of bad discernment. They also reported that he had said: [Indeed, it is possible for all Muslims to agree on one wrong (idea)] and added: [In this way the consensus agreed that the Prophet is sent to the whole mankind unlike other Prophets. And this is wrong for Allāh sent all Prophets to His creatures as a whole. Indeed, the signs of Prophethood are widely known for they are being conveyed to all parts of the world and it is obliged upon the receiver (of the Prophetic message) to confirm it and to follow it.] He also disputed the narrative from the Prophet that says: [I (as a *Rasūl*) was sent to the whole of mankind, I was sent to (the Arabs) and to (non-Arabs)] although in the early part of the ḥadīth (says): [The *Nabī* was sent to his people.<sup>3</sup>] How could he refute the ḥadīth tradition when the consensus and the *istiḥsān* accept it?<sup>4</sup>"

32. "(Al-Nazzām) says that figurative expressions on divorce such as – [you are free!]; [you are disown!]; [you have the bridle on the neck!]; [you are let loose!] and the likes are baseless. According to him, divorce is invalid whether a man has the intention or not. He therefore, contradicts the consensus, tradition and *istiḥsān*. He ofte

<sup>3</sup> *Majma' al-Zawā'id*, 8:259, 261; *Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, 12:413; *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 11:426 (No. 32004).

<sup>4</sup> It is discretion in a legal decision.

as: [If one pronounces the pledge of *zihār*<sup>5</sup> (using) words like *al-ṭn* (abdomen or womb) and *al-farj* (pudendum of the female va), the swearing is invalid. If one swears in the name other than mighty Allāh, the swearing is invalid, for the word *ilā'* is derived in the derivative of the name of Almighty Allāh.]”

“(Al-Nazzām) says: [When a man sleeps in the state of ablution oughout the night and until morning, whether lying on his back, ing or lying on his side; his ablution remains valid, for the (act of) pping does not invalidate the ablution.] He also says: [If (the slim) agreed on the necessity of ablution after sleeping (on their k), it means that they are still following their ancestor's method of ansing themselves after their night sleep. Indeed, it is human are to defecate and urinate in the morning, to wake up but with py eyes and with bad odor from the mouth or even at times when / are fully awake. Therefore, people take their baths due to urity and disease and not due to the sleeping. And the same lies to the opinions that impose bathing on Friday. This is because ple work in the morning at the orchard and used to have their bath n their return.] The above statements contradict with the *ḥadīth* ition and the consensus. In fact, the Prophet said: [My community never agree on a wrong (judgment).<sup>6</sup>]”

“(Al-Nazzām) commented on ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb’s expression, ng: [If the religion is amenable to analogical reasoning, it is er (for us) to clean inside the shoes rather than rubbing outside of shoes.] He added: [That is (the reason as to why) ‘Umar has tly pronounced (his judgment) based on the precepts of

---

It is an aspect of pre-Islamic form of divorce.

*‘Aṣīdat al-Aḥwadhī*, 4:466 (No. 2167); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 2:1303 (No. 3950).

(*Shari'ah*). Hence, it is not strange to find in the expression of 'Umar when he was asked on several judgments on the case of grandfather: {Indeed hell fire will impose upon them a strict legal evaluation.} But 'Umar has given a hundred different judgments on the legal status of the grandfather."

35. "(Al-Nazzām) also commented on the expressions of Abū Bakr when (the latter) was asked on a verse from the Book of Allāh the Almighty: [Which heaven will shelter me? Which earth will carry me? Where should I go? What should I do if I have wrongly attributed a verse from the Book of Allāh, when Allāh intended otherwise?] Then (Abū Bakr) was asked on *al-kalālah*<sup>7</sup> and replied: [I will tell you about it based on my mind! If it is right then it comes from Allāh and if it is wrong then it comes from me; it is something that nobody should intervene, neither the father nor the son!] (Al-Nazzām) said: [This (opinion) contradicts the previous expressions: [Whoever is presumptuous in giving a personal opinion he is committing a presumptuous act! Whoever has no courage to express a personal opinion, should not take a risk of expressing another opinion unless enforcement could be done!]"

36. "He also commented on the expressions of 'Alī when (the latter) was asked on a cow that killed a donkey and he replied: [I will decide based on my thought. If it is in conformity with the decision of the Prophet, it is good or else, my decision will be null and void] ('Alī) added: [Whoever wants to be thrown into the bottom part

<sup>7</sup> *Kalālah* means uterine brother or sister, i.e., a brother or sister by the same mother but not by the same father, while brothers and sisters by the same father but different mother, it is known as full brothers and sisters. Refer *Sūrah al-Nisā*, 4: 12.



he hell, only needs to speak of the legal status of the grandfather.]  
[e then pronounced diverging judgments on it.”

7. “(Al-Nazzām) also commented on the expression of Ibn Mas‘ūd  
i a *ḥadīth* related to Birwa’ bint Wāshiq: [I will give my personal  
pinion, if I am wrong it comes from me and if I am right it comes  
om Almighty Allāh.] (Al-Nazzām) then said: [This judgment is  
ased on a conjecture and it is obscure. If a testimony is testified by a  
njecture, it is illicit! And if a judgment pronounced based on a  
njecture it is even worse than that.] He added: [If only Ibn Mas‘ūd  
id (focused) his intellectual assumption (*nazar*) to pronounce  
dgments on (issues) such as: the cleft – how can it become divided?  
r on happiness – how can one be happy? It would be better for him  
else it would lead him to say scandalous words against Almighty  
llāh that tantamount to error.]”

‘a. “(Al-Nazzām) commented: [(Ibn Mas‘ūd) claimed that moon  
as cleft asunder and he had witnessed it.”<sup>8</sup> It is an obvious lie, for  
mighty Allāh will neither cleave the moon asunder for (Ibn  
as‘ūd) alone or for others who were with him. He will only cleave  
asunder in order to manifest His sign for the whole world as the  
idence for the Prophets. (This sign also serves) as a reminder to  
s servants. It also serves as a proof to all (people in the) cities.  
hy does the whole world not notice it? Why does the new calendar  
t establish during that year? Why do the poets not speak about it?  
y does the infidel not become Muslim after that incident? Why do  
Muslims not quote it in their arguments against the atheists?”

---

<sup>8</sup>*Umdat al-Qārī*, 11: 370 (No. 3636).



37b. “(Al-Nazzām) also commented: “(Ibn Mas‘ūd) has denied the *sūratayn* of the Book of Almighty Allāh. Indeed, he was absent when the Prophet recited them. Why does he not realize that the *sūratayn* are of the same style as the remaining verses found in a Qur’ān? Is he not the best scribe of al-Qur’ān? Is he not the one who arranges the order of the verses and perfects its composition?”

37c. “(Al-Nazzām) commented: [He always practices *al-taṭbi* during *rukū’* until his death. It is as if he is not praying in the company of the Prophet or as if he is absent.<sup>9</sup>] (Al-Nazzām) also hurled the worst insult against Zayd ibn Thābit, because Muslims have chosen and adopted (Zayd’s) method of Qur’ānic recitation but (al-Nazzām’s) preference was of somebody else.”

37d. “(Al-Nazzām) censured ‘Uthmān when he was informed that ‘Uthmān had performed a four *raka‘āt* prayer *taqaddum* (in advance) at Minā. It was the first event of performing a prayer of four *raka‘āt*. Someone remarked about it and (al-Nazzām) replied: [The disparity is evil and discrimination is evil.<sup>10</sup>] And indeed (al-Nazzām) often involved in many disagreements, and he continuously criticized ‘Uthmān since the latter has adopted Zayd’s method of Qur’ānic recitation.”

37e. “(Ibn Mas‘ūd) saw a troupe of Zuṭṭ and said: [I have never seen anybody who resembled most the genie that appeared during the night of genie.] This statement was reported by Sulaymān al-Taynī who narrated from Abū ‘Uthmān al-Nahdī. And Dāwūd reported from al-Sha‘bī and the latter from ‘Alqamah, who asked Ibn Mas‘ūd

<sup>9</sup> *Umdat al-Qārī*, 3: 37 (No. 3356).

<sup>10</sup> *Umdat al-Qārī*, 18: 2, (No 1).

ere you with the Prophet during the night of genie?] He replied: "Nobody among us witnessed it."<sup>11]</sup>

“Discussing Ḥudhayfah ibn al-Yamān, (al-Nazzām) commented: [One day he swears in the name of Almighty Allāh before ‘Uthmān that he does not say about something but some people have heard him saying that. It is said that somebody said to Ḥudhayfah) but he replied: [I buy some part of my religion with others, fearing that it might disappear completely.] – This was related by Mis‘ar ibn Kadām who heard it from ‘Abd al-Malik ibn Iyṣarah and the latter from al-Nazzāl ibn Sabrah.”

“Discussing Abū Hurayrah, (al-Nazzām) criticized: [He was greater liar than ‘Umar, ‘Uthmān, ‘Alī and ‘Ā’ishah.] He used to port a *ḥadīth* by walking with only a shoe and this was relayed to ‘Ā’ishah. She then started to walk with one shoe only and said: [I do not to be different from Abū Hurayrah.]

“(Abū Hurayrah) reported that a dog, a woman and a donkey could nullify a prayer. And ‘Ā’ishah said: [The Prophet performed a prayer in the middle of (our) bed while I was lying on (the same) bed, ridicading) himself from the Qiblah.<sup>12]</sup>”

“(Al-Nazzām) said: [‘Alī was informed that Abū Hurayrah began his ablution with the right side. (‘Alī) in the same clothing asked for some water and started to take ablution beginning with his left side and then said: [I want to be different from Abū Hurayrah.<sup>13]</sup>”

“(Abū Hurayrah) used to say: [My dear friend told me...my dear friend said...I saw my dear friend...!] and ‘Alī said to him:

<sup>11</sup>Umdat al-Qārī, 63: 32, (No. 2).

<sup>12</sup>Umdat al-Qārī, 3: 596 (No.511).

<sup>13</sup>Umdat al-Qārī, 4: 18-19. (No. 211).

[Since when did the Prophet become your dear friend, O Al Hurayrah?].

39d. “(Al-Nazzām) said that Abū Hurayrah has reported [Whoever was in the state of *janābah* (major impurity) by (the early part of) day time should not fast.<sup>14</sup>] On this matter, Marwān sent messenger to ask ‘Ā’ishah and Ḥafṣah, they replied: [The Prophet was in the state of *janābah* by (the early part of) day time and was also in the state of *iḥtilām* (wet dream) but he performed his fasting.<sup>15</sup>] (Marwān) then said to the messenger: [Go and tell Al Hurayrah of this information!] Abū Hurayrah replied: [Indeed, I have narrated this *ḥadīth* and so did al-Faḍl ibn al-‘Abbās, the martyr.] But the masses doubted that (Abū Hurayrah) has heard this (information) from the Prophet.”

40. Abū Muḥammad said: “Those statements of (al-Nazzām) who insulted the companions of the Prophet (indicate) that he has never heard the saying of the Almighty Allāh (as mentioned) in His Glorious Book: [Muḥammad is the messenger of Allāh, and those who are with him are strong against unbelievers but compassionate among themselves.<sup>16</sup>] (It also means that) he has never heard the saying of Almighty Allāh: [Allāh's good pleasure was on the believers, when they swore loyalty to you in the face. He knew what was in their hearts and he sends down tranquility to them.<sup>17</sup>]”

“Even if what they have said about the companions of the Prophet is true, it is, an ill-mannered act! And if there is no other interpretation than that given by (the companions), it would have been better for

<sup>14</sup> *Al-Musnad*, 3:50 (No. 7392).

<sup>15</sup> *‘Umdat al-Qārī*, 8: 95 (1930 and 1931).

<sup>16</sup> *Sūrah al-Faṭḥ*, 48: 29.

<sup>17</sup> *Sūrah al-Faṭḥ*, 48: 18

to mention it and to leave it as it is. And even if it is petty and ligible (on the part of the companions), their qualities, virtues, r attachment to the Prophet, their devotion and their (sacrifices in ns of) wealth, soul and body to the service of the Almighty Allāh incomparable (to us)."

Abū Muḥammad said: "Nothing is more absurd than those ements that were flung against 'Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb such that he le a hundred different judgments over the status of the grandfather that he was one of the supporters of the people of speculation *zar*) and the people of analogical reasoning (*qiyās*)."

r examining and considering this case, how could one say that it is sible for 'Umar to make a decision on a case, by giving a hundred erent judgments and (if it is so) where are the results of those gments? Where is the tenth judgment and where is the twentieth gment? Isn't there anyone among the *ḥadīth* narrators who norized the fifth or the sixth judgment? Even if a *mujtahid* tries to sent the jurisdiction related to the case of the grandfather, be it al decision or maneuver (*hīlah*), he will not be able to furnish en) twenty judgments."

ow could (al-Nazzām) rely upon this absurd *ḥadīth* and then end it by saying that it is narrated by trustworthy narrators? There othing (behind) using that (absurd *ḥadīth*) except (to show) his uity against 'Umar."

Abū Muḥammad said: "In relation to (al-Nazzām's) asation against Abū Bakr that (the latter) was asked about a verse 'alālāh from the Book of Almighty Allāh, he has presumptuously mented it based on his personal opinion. Indeed, Abū Bakr was



asked on the *mutashābih* passage of the noble Qur'ān, of which nobody knows of its interpretation, except Allāh and a knowledgeable ones. (Abū Bakr) refrained from commenting in verse fearing that he might wrongly interpret it and contradict the intended meaning of Almighty Allāh. (Abū Bakr) had to give an opinion concerning *kalālah* based on his personal understanding, this was for the immediate (need) and interest of the Muslims solving the problem of inheritance. And indeed, it was legitimate for him to make a decision based on his personal opinion since it had not been transmitted from the Prophet or mentioned by the Book. Being the leader of the Muslims and as the source of reference for (the masses) at that time, (Abū Bakr) had no alternative except to make the decision and clarify the matter (based on his personal opinion).'

"It is by virtue of the same principle that 'Umar, 'Uthmān, 'Alī, Ibn Mas'ūd and Zayd (were guided to make decision) when they were asked. They were the leaders and the source of reference for problem solving. Thus, it is not (their prerogative) to do as such, that is, apply or reject the application of personal opinion on *kalālah* as (the status of) the grandfather. And this was the issue by which (Ibn Nazzām) and his associates discussed from the angle of *kalām*."

40c. (See also 37a). "Let us refer to the accusation made against Ibn Mas'ūd claiming that he was a liar because he said the moon was cleft asunder and he had witnessed the event. Indeed, (in reality) the accusation of lying is not meant for Ibn Mas'ūd but for (al-Nazzām himself) due to his denial of the sign of Prophethood and his denial of the Glorious Qur'ān, because Almighty Allāh said: [The hour near and the moon is cleft asunder.<sup>18</sup>] If the moon has not been cleft

<sup>18</sup> *Sūrah al-Qamar*, 54: 1.



under at that time, it means that in future the moon will be cleft under. If otherwise, what is the meaning of His saying: [But if they see a sign, they turn away and say, this is (but) transient magic!<sup>19</sup>]? Is it not the evidence that people have seen the moon being cleft under, and that they said: [this is a transient magic]? This is one of any tricks (of al-Nazzām) just like the people (mentioned above) who have commented about the distinctive signs of (Prophethood)."

Al-Nazzām also queried as to) how could one of the miraculous signs of the Prophet be seen only by one, two or several people but not to others? Or is it not possible for one, two or several people to read news just like an individual who mentioned that a wolf had spoken to him? Or such that a person announced that he had received complaint from a camel? Or such that a person declared the dead is been spat out by the earth?"

Id. (See also 37b) "As for the accusation of (al-Nazzām) made against (Ibn Mas'ūd) for rejecting the *suratān* (two *sūrah*) of the glorious Qur'ān, which also means two amulets, Ibn Mas'ūd has his own justification. Indeed, people have their own assumptions and they make mistakes. If such (assumptions and mistakes) can occur among Prophets and Messengers of Allāh, then it can also occur among the ordinary people. The reason for (Ibn Mas'ūd) to omit reciting the *sūratān* in his text is that, he saw the Prophet SAAS reciting (the *sūratān*) for the purpose of seeking protection<sup>20</sup> for al-Asan and al-Ḥusayn and others. This act is similar to the action of seeking protection by reciting: [I seek protection in the perfect Words

---

*Sūrah al-Qamar*, 54: 2.

This refers to an action of putting someone under the protection of Almighty Allāh.

of Allāh.<sup>21</sup>] And (Ibn Mas'ūd) assumed that the *sūratān* consisted not part of al-Qur'ān and he, therefore, did not register them in his text. And it is on this similar basis that Ubayy ibn Ka'b (has applied) in registering 'the invocation of *iftitāh* and *qunūt*' in his text. (Ubay) referred to them as the *sūratān* since he saw the Prophet reading them constantly in the prayer. So, he assumed that they consist part of al-Qur'ān."

40e. (See also 37c) "In relation to *al-taṭbīq*, it is not an obligatory act in the prayer. But what is obligatory is the act of bowing and prostration as Almighty Allāh said: [...bow down and prostrate yourselves.<sup>22</sup>] However, whoever practices *taṭbīq* it means that he is doing the (same) act of bowing. Similarly, whoever places his hands on his knees he is at the (same) time doing an act of bowing. Some people are mistaken about the manners of prayer. Some of them practice *al-iq'ā'*, some practice *al-iftirash* and some practice *al-tawarruk*. All of these practices do not invalidate prayer but indicate the differences in (man's thinking)."

40f. (See also 7) "With regard to the accusation made against (Ibn Mas'ūd) for lying while reporting a *ḥadīth* of the Prophet: [The rejected one was rejected from the womb of his mother and the blessed one was blessed from the womb of his mother!<sup>23</sup>] How could (al-Nazzām) accuse him of lying in narrating the important and famous *ḥadīth* of the Prophet? (This *ḥadīth*) was narrated by sincere and trustworthy narrators and companions of the Prophet and its (*sanad*) reached the Prophet and nobody among them argued its

<sup>21</sup> *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 2:1165 (No. 3525); *Tahdhīb Tarīkh*, 5:100; *Kanz al-Ummāl*, 2:141 (No. 3508, 3505, and 3504).

<sup>22</sup> *Sūrah al-Ḥajj*, 22: 77.

<sup>23</sup> *Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, 3:174; *Al-Tamhīd*, 3:150; *Majma' al-Zawā'id*, 7:282 (No. 11809).

nticity.] What is the purpose of (al-Nazzām) accusing (Ibn ūd) of lying in a matter that is related to the Prophet for which (former) could neither expect any gain nor spare him from any veniences or bring him closer to the ruler, the people and not to amass more wealth, in addition to what he has already ssed?"

could he accuse (Ibn Mas'ūd) of lying in (the ḥadīth narration) igh the scholars of *ḥadīth* have agreed upon it? One of them Abū Umāmah who narrated from the Prophet saying: [The ledge is pre-existing, the ink dries out, the event is pronounced, ite is accomplished with the confirmation of the Book and the et's affirmation of happiness with those who believe, those who od fearing and misfortune to those who are deceitful and hful.] Almighty Allāh said: [Son of Ādam! What you become My will but it is you, who worked out for the thing you wished. t is by My will that you become what you are, but it is you who yed the act of evil for the thing that you wanted. And it is by race and My Mercy that you fulfilled your duties to Me. And it My Favour that you resisted the desire of disobeying Me.]"

'aql ibn 'Abbās ibn 'Abd al-Muṭṭalib narrated a *ḥadīth* from the et, who said: [O young boy! Remember Allāh, He will nber you, entrust confidence in Him, you will find Him in front u; recall yourself to Him in your happy period, He will recall n difficult times. Be mindful that whatever strikes you is not se to spare you and whatever spares you, is not suppose to

strike you! And indeed the pen (and the ink) is dried; it is just another creation, until the day of resurrection.<sup>24]</sup>"

"How could (al-Nazzām) accuse Ibn Mas'ūd of lying in an is which accords to the Book. Almighty Allāh said: [For such He written faith in their hearts and strengthened them with a spirit from Himself<sup>25]</sup>, meaning that He laid the faith in their hearts. This similar to His saying on 'mercy': [That (mercy) I shall ordain those who do right, and practice regular charity.<sup>26]</sup> Whoever Allah has created faith in Him in his heart is indeed being decreed happiness by Him."

"Almighty Allāh said to His Prophet: [Indeed you will not be able guide whoever you love but Allāh Guides whom He will.<sup>27]</sup> Thus it not possible for you to call to the good path, that you love me indeed it is Allāh who calls anybody He wants to the good path. said: [Allāh leaves astray whom He wills and guides whom wills<sup>28]</sup> and He added: [Fir'awn led his people astray instead leading them aright.<sup>29]</sup> In this case, it is not possible to say that Fir'awn has called his people towards wrongdoing and at the same time it is not possible to say that his people were the rightly guided. He said: [Those whom Allāh wills to guide, He opens their hearts to Islam; those whom He wills to straying, He makes their hearts closed and constricted as if they have to climb up to the skies.<sup>30]</sup> He added: [If We had so willed, We could certainly have brought guidance

<sup>24</sup> *Al-Mustadrak*, 3:541; *Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, 11:123, 178, 223; *Kanz 'Ummāl*, 1:132 (No. 630); *Aḥādīth al-Aḥwadhī*, 4:667 (No. 2516); *Musnad*, 1:628 (No. 2669), 1:659 (No. 2804).

<sup>25</sup> *Sūrah al-Mujādalah*, 58: 22.

<sup>26</sup> *Sūrah al-A'rāf*, 7: 156.

<sup>27</sup> *Sūrah al-Qaṣaṣ*, 28: 56.

<sup>28</sup> *Sūrah Fāṭir*, 35: 8.

<sup>29</sup> *Sūrah Tāhā*, 20: 79.

<sup>30</sup> *Sūrah al-An'ām*, 6: 125.



every soul, but the word from Me will come true, I will fill the  
 ll with Jinns and men all together.<sup>31]</sup> There are numerous passages  
 al-Qur'ān and in the *ḥadīth* which are in consonant to its  
 eanings) and it will be too long (for us) to mention all of them.  
 r purpose here is not to produce arguments contradictory to the  
 darites, but we mentioned them here for the purpose of countering  
 ir false and absurd interpretations. I have also mentioned this issue  
 der different topic in my other books."

ow could (al-Nazzām) accuse Ibn Mas'ūd of lying in the case  
 ich is in consonant with (the thinking) of the Arabs of the  
 iliiyyah and (the teaching) of Islam? Some poets said:

[O You! Who develop worries, do not worry!

If fate wants you to have fever, you will have it.

Even if you go up high in the mountain,

How could it protect you since the ink is dried?]

Another poet said:

[This is the decree of fate, blame me or leave me,

If I make mistakes, fate does not make mistake.]

Another poet said:

[The fear to our Lord is the best of all of the graces,

It is by the order of Allāh, I am early or late,

Anyone whom He guides on the right path,

---

*Sūrah al-Sajdah*, 32: 13.



He is on the right path (with a) contented heart,  
But He leads astray whom He wants.]

Al-Farazdaq said:

[I felt the remorse the same as al-Kusa'ī suffered from,  
When Nawār left me,  
She was my paradise and I came out of it,  
As Ādam, when he came out, constraint and force,  
If my hand and my heart had wanted to keep her,  
The destiny would have given me, to choose.]

Al-Nābighah said:

[No man gets anything that he wants,  
If this has not been written.]”

“How could (al-Nazzām) accuse Ibn Mas‘ūd in the matter which is in accord to (the teachings of) the Revealed Books? Wahb Munabbih said: [I have read seventy-two Revealed Books of Almighty Allāh in which twenty of them were ambiguous (in internal nature and fifty of them were unambiguous in its nature. al-Tawrah, Almighty Allāh said to Mūsā: [Go and see Fir‘awn! : then say to him: {Let the sons of Bakrī come out to me, the sons Isrā‘īl from the land of Kana‘ān to the holy land, so that they praise Me, they may glorify Me and satisfy Me! Go and see him : convey to him My message that I will harden his heart so he will understand!} <sup>32</sup>]”

Abū Muḥammad said: "*Bakrī* (my elder son) means that he is as if first son for a man, and the expression '*huwa lī*' (he is my elder son) means that he is the first one, whom I have chosen."

Abū Muḥammad narrated from Muqātil and the latter from 'Amr ibn Fā'id who said to (Abū Muḥammad): [Allāh ordains a thing without consulting it to be!] And (Abū Muḥammad) replied: [Yes! He ordains al-ḥākim to slaughter his son but He does not want him to do it!] Then 'Amr said: [Indeed, that was a dream!] (Abū Muḥammad) replied: Don't you hear him says: [O My father! Do what is commanded for you!] <sup>33</sup>] And this has been affirmed by the 'Ajam community and the Persians, as mentioned it in *Kalīlah wa Dimnah*, which was one of their best ancient books. The firm belief in destiny will not prevent a strong-minded individual to keep away from danger. Nobody should speculate on the hidden fate, but he has to work with determination (*ḥazm*). Abū Muḥammad said: [We hold onto faith and act together and act with determination.]"

Abū Muḥammad said: "I have read in 'Ajam's book that Hurmuz was asked about the reason which urged Fairūz to attack al-Hiyāṭalah (ophthalmites) and later, cheated them. (Hurmuz) replied: [Indeed, one acts in the things where, there is no other act possible, by the will of our Lord. They have neither the power to delay the will nor to prevent it.]"

However asked a question related to the final cause, while he himself was perplexed by the knowledge, (of what we have said earlier), it is meaningless for him. It will be better for him to think about the matter, which has happened (and destined) for him. The

apparent cause, which is in the area of sensible experience, follow the habit of the saying of the men: [What does so and so do?] but they intended to ask: [What has happened to him?] or [What was the outcome of his treachery?]"

"The same pattern applies when they said: [So and so has died] [So and so is still alive] but in actual fact they wanted to say: [He had endured passively (dead or alive).] This was the purpose of the question. Whoever wants to know more would do better to ignore it?"

"We do not elucidate these responsibilities as mentioned in the history (of Hurmuz), with the intention of giving justification to anyone to deny the act fulfilled by man was by decree of fate. The reason is that man can never avoid those that are reprehensible for him and neither can he choose the good ones for himself. And this is the reason why fate is hidden from us, particularly that of His reward and His punishment, which then necessitates justice of the Creator to His creatures.<sup>34</sup>"

40g. (See also 37e). "As for the other *ḥadīth*, which (al-Nazzābī) accused Ibn Mas'ūd of lying that when (the latter) saw the troop of Zuhayr and said: [I have never seen anybody who resembled most of the genie that appeared during the night of the genie.] Then somebody asked (Ibn Mas'ūd): [Were you with the Prophet during the night of the genie?] He replied: [Nobody among us took part in it.] (Ibn Mas'ūd) claimed that he had seen them, as in the first *ḥadīth*, but denied it in the second *ḥadīth*. How could one clarify the authenticity of these two narrations, because they seem to contradict each other? How could

<sup>34</sup>

According to Lecomte, the doctrine mentioned by Ibn Qutaybah seems to announce his tendency towards the doctrine of *kash* propounded by the Ash'arites, refer to Lecomte, *Le Traité*, 36.

accusation of lying be true, when Ibn Mas'ūd was known for his intelligence, his knowledge, his authority on *ḥadīth* as compared to successors, with his closeness to the Prophet SAAS and the ours, which he had enjoyed with the Prophet SAAS? How could it be possible for (Ibn Mas'ūd) to confess that he lied, saying: [Today I lied and tomorrow, I do not!] (Ibn Mas'ūd's) opponents may strive to influence him to confess but (this would be unnecessary) for he could have done it himself. The enemy could not do it albeit Ibn Mas'ūd suffered from mental disability or amnesia or any infirmity, he will not add anything to what he has scrutinized."

In addition, the people of *ḥadīth* do not verify the authenticity of the *ḥadīth* of Zuṭṭī. And nothing was mentioned that (Ibn Mas'ūd) was present and was with the Prophet during the night of the genie. (However,) we acknowledge and accept the method of (the people of *ḥadīth*) because they know the differences between the *ṣaḥīḥ* and the *ḥif* narration since they are the authority on *ḥadīth* and they have devoted themselves to it. Hence, (it goes without saying that) the producer is more skillful and competent in his production."

Thus, we do not doubt that one of the *ḥadīthān* (two *ḥadīth*) in question is false. And it is impossible for 'Abd Allāh ibn Mas'ūd to declare himself to the masses that he had lied. (This act) will pardon his reputation. Even if he had lied, he can be questioned: [Why don't you tell us that you had seen it yesterday?] If that is the case, (the opinion) of the people of *ḥadīth* is right – that the first *ḥadīth* should be omitted. And if the *ḥadīth ān* are (to be considered *ṣaḥīḥ*, the narrator of the second *ḥadīth* has to omit the word *ayrī* (except me). Thus, this proves that (we are right), for when

(Ibn Mas'ūd) was asked: [Were you with the Prophet during the night of the genie?] He replied: [Nobody took part except me..]"

"The (other possibility is that the) narrator has probably omitted the words - 'except me' either because he did not hear it or if he had heard it, he had forgotten it or the next narrator who narrated from him would (definitely) omit it. Such possibilities or anything similar to that could have occurred, for nothing is protected from being stated. As such this proves that, if Ibn Mas'ūd was asked: [Were you with the Prophet during the night of the genie], he replied: [Nobody among us took part in it]. This indeed, is not the answer to the question: [Where were you?] but the correct answer to the question of: [Were you with the Prophet on the night of the genie?]"

"If the sentence of the questioner (being said this way): [Were you with the Prophet on the night of the genie?] and the correct answer should be: [Nobody among us took part except me], this affirms (Ibn Mas'ūd's) statement as found in the earlier part.

41. (See also 38) "As for the issue that (al-Nazzām) report concerning Hudhayfah who swore before 'Uthmān for not saying certain things, but some people heard him said so - they asked (Hudhayfah) and he replied: [I buy some part of my religion with others, fearing that it might completely disappear!] How could (al-Nazzām) report this *ḥadīth* in its most distorted version, without trying to find its defect or its phonetic elements? And he directly reported: [I buy some part of my religion with others.] is he trying to understand the meaning and reflect on its word? In fact, his hostility towards the companions of the Prophet prevented him from critically scrutinizing the words. Indeed, hostility and hatred make a person



blind and deaf. And so does passion, it makes a person blind and af."

Now that – (may Allāh has His Mercy on you) lying and insulting some circumstances are preferable to man. But the most pleasant thing to Allāh is a person who is truthful in his saying and virtuous in his doings. Don't you see that if a man notices a cruel leader, who is powerful but domineering and intends to shed blood of a good Muslim or his acquaintances unjustly? Or to destroy what is most sacred or to burn down his house, and this man invented lies or swore a false pledge, will Allāh reward him or will he be the object of derision of others?

If a man swears that he will not honour relationships with others and will not pay *zakāt*, then asks the opinion of *fuqahā'* on this issue, they will positively say that he should not keep to his pledge. And the mighty Allāh said: [And make not Allāh's name an excuse in your oaths against doing good or acting rightly or making peace between persons.<sup>35</sup>] This means that you should not make any oaths in the name of Allāh as the obstacle preventing you from doing good deed. If you have sworn, annul it. However, you can annul the pledge by paying *kaffārah* and it is the best for you."

likewise, in the saying of the Prophet: [Whoever pledges on something, then decides that it is best for him to act otherwise, let him annul it by *kaffārah* and it is the best (act) for him.<sup>36</sup>] In addition, it is permissible to lie in warring period for it is the most treacherous

---

*Sūrah al-Baqarah*, 2: 224.

*Umdat al-Qārī*, 15: 726 (No. 6680); *Āridat al-Aḥwadhī*, 4:107 (No. 1530); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 1:681 (No. 2108); *Sunan Al-Dārimī*, 2:186; *Majma' al-Zawā'id*, 4:236-7; *Kunz al-'Ummāl*, 16:700 (No. 46408), 16:701 (No. 46412).

time, or for (the purpose of) restoring peace among people or for reuniting a man with his family. It is allowable to practice dissimulation, which is related to a pledge over something if one falls victim to injustice or one fears for his life.”

“Dissimulation means to have a different intention (internally) from the imposter of the pledge. An example of dissimulation is that a debtor, who is in difficulties and is forced to make a pledge in front of a judge by his creditor and is afraid of being imprisoned, can say that the Almighty Allāh prescribes deferment (of the payment.) The debtor could also say: [By Allāh, I have no debt to this man and am imagining it himself that it is only for today] or he could say: [*Wa'l Lāhi* - واللاه - which omits the word 'ي', (as if) a derivative of *lahi* (to amuse) thus, conserving the *kasrah*. This can be proven by studying the sayings of Almighty Allāh:

[O you! My servants who believe]<sup>37</sup> - يا عبادي الذين آمنوا-

[The day the caller will call]<sup>38</sup> - يوم يدع الداع-

[The day the caller will call]<sup>39</sup> - يوم يناد المناد-

“(Apart from that) one can say: [Everything that he owns is for charity] but he actually means it to be: [Everything that he owns not]. This actually means he owns nothing at present. If a man is asked to swear not to pass by the door of his house or he will be victimized and then (he) pretends that the door is a wall and he goes through it. Although he knows that the intention of the imposter of the pledge is for him not to go out from the house in whatever way, but he interprets that he goes out (through the wall) and not through the door. The

<sup>37</sup> *Sūrah al-Zumar*, 39: 10.

<sup>38</sup> *Sūrah al-Qamar*, 54: 6

<sup>39</sup> *Sūrah Qāf*, 50: 41.

ve examples and the likes are known as *al-tawriyah* simulation).”

However, there are some concessions in certain cases. Somebody : [Indeed, in that (concession) there is a loophole for a liar]. One he examples is the saying of Ibrāhīm, the 'friend' of Allāh, while ussing his wife, said: [She is my sister], but he intended to say all believers are brethren.] And this statement is mentioned in al-'ān: [This was done by that idol, the greatest among them, ask n if they can speak intelligently!<sup>40</sup>] But he intended it to be: [This done by that idol, the greatest among them, if only your idol can ak] for in his mind, the condition for an act is to be able to speak. l he knows very well that the idol can neither speak nor act.”

another statement by him: [Indeed, I am sick (at heart)<sup>41</sup>] but he nded it to be: [I could be sick] for everybody is fated to die and sh and it is inevitable for man to feel sick at heart.”

mighty Allāh said to His Prophet: [You are dead and they are d.<sup>42</sup>] This verse does not mean that the Prophet is dead at that icular moment. However, Allāh intended it to mean that truly e day) you shall die and they will die too. Does (al-Nazzām) try to k-up at the phonetic (aspect of the *ḥadūth*) as discussed above? eed, in the statements of (Ḥudhayfah): [I buy some part of my gion with others] and thus, (Ḥudhayfah) has explained the netic, (as his way out).”

fact, I would love to teach you how to look out for the loopholes, examples will be shown to you. Among them are: a Khārijite met

*Sūrah al-Anbiyā'*, 21: 63.

*Sūrah al-Sāffāt*, 37: 89.

*Sūrah al-Zumar*, 39: 30.



a Rāfiḍite and said: [In the name of Allāh, I will not leave you until you have acquitted 'Uthmān and 'Alī or I will kill you!] And (the Rāfiḍite) replied: [In the name of Allāh, I have acquitted 'Alī and 'Uthmān and I am free from (the blame).] However, (the Rāfiḍi actually intended to say: [I am acquitted from blaming 'Alī], meaning that he never acquitted 'Alī<sup>43</sup>) but in the following statement: [... and I have acquitted 'Uthmān]. In this statement, he meant to say that he has acquitted 'Uthmān only and hence, managed to find his way out from the issue."<sup>44</sup>

"Another example is that, a comrade of a king has interrogated an individual, whom he suspected to hate the king and whom he found to reprove the black attire used by the comrades of the king. The individual said to (the comrade): [The light, by Allāh, is in the daylight and (the comrade) was satisfied with the answer. However, the individual intended to say that the light of the eyes is in the black pupil of the eyeball. So, there is no offence or a sinner in this issue.

"Another example: 'Alī said: [Indeed, nobody will enter paradise except he has assassinated 'Uthmān! No I will not enter it. Nobody will enter the hell except he has assassinated 'Uthmān! No I will not enter it.] It was said to him: [What are you doing, O Leader of the believers? You are disuniting the masses.] He replied: [Indeed, you have reproached me a lot on the issue of the assassination of 'Uthmān, is it not that Allāh, who assassinated him? And I was with him.] The masses misconstrued that 'Alī has assassinated 'Uthmān due to the statement: [... 'I was with him.] However, 'Alī intended

<sup>43</sup> As a Rāfiḍite, one can never expect him to censure 'Alī.

<sup>44</sup> The example of dissimulation mentioned here, is one of the specialties about the Arabic language. Ibn Qutaybah has intelligently applied this specialty to vindicate his idea.

y that it is only Allāh who assassinated 'Uthmān and He will (one y) assassinate him as well."

another example, Shurayh has visited Ziyād when he was sick and er on (the latter) died. When he came out, Masrūq sent someone to c him: [What was the condition of the leader? He responded: [I and him giving orders and forbidding acts.] (Masrūq) said: [Indeed, urayh (speaks) in puzzle, asks him again!] (Shurayh) then said: [I and him saying his last will and forbidding people from crying.]"

Shurayh was asked by somebody about (the latter's) dead son: [How your patient now, O! Abū Umayyah?] And he replied: [Now his ment has ended and his families are hoping that he be rewarded in : hereafter.] There are more examples (to be mentioned here) but (that I have stated) need to be fully understood."

We) do not mean to evade discussing the statement which Ḥudhayfah has said to 'Uthmān and of his act of *tawriyah* in his xdge but in fact, his statement reached us in an abridged version d it is not reported to us to be interpreted. However, we will plain it, as if (in a situation which) Ḥudhayfah would have said: len will say the worst thing they know when they lose their temper t they will say the nicest words they know, when they are happy.<sup>45</sup>] r example, it is said that 'Uthmān was in disagreement with his o friends,<sup>46</sup> and he decided to take actions which were not proper cause he did not consult his friends; he then, granted subsidy to deserved people. Someone (came to Ḥudhayfah) slandering thmān and in the worst and uncouth words (one can imagine), ying: [It was said to me that you have proclaimed, I am a tyrant and

---

Ibn Qutaybah was a great mind reader.

The term *sāhibayhī* refers to 'Umar and Abū Bakr.



traitor and the like.] Then, Ḥudhayfah swore in the name of Almiḡh Allāh that he had never said all of those words. To proof his sincerity, he swore that he only wanted to release his anger and (at the same time) he wanted 'Uthmān not to harbour any (bad feeling against him. The anger of the leader against his people is similar to the anger of a father against his son or a master against his slave or the husband against his wife. In fact, the anger of the leader is more serious than that offence. Therefore, to bargain for the (truth) Ḥudhayfah was compelled) to say: [I buy part of my religion with the other part.]”

42. (See also 39) “And as for the accusation made by 'Umar against 'Uthmān, and 'Alī against Abū Hurayrah as a liar (let us discuss this). Indeed, Abū Hurayrah was the companion of the Prophet for about three years and the greatest bulk of the *ḥadīth* (quotations) we have through his narration. He was also the companion of 'Umar for about fifteen years and he died in the year of fifty-nine Hijrī (59 A.H.). Umm Salamah, the spouse of the Prophet, also died in the same year while 'Ā'ishah died a year before it (i.e. in 58 A.H.). When he was transmitting a *ḥadīth* of the Prophet, not known by most of the famous companions and their followers (the companions of the first level): the people suspected and rejected him by saying: [How can it be that you are the only person who had heard it?] Or [Is there anybody with you when you heard it?] 'Ā'ishah was the most abrasive among those (companions) who rejected him and this ill-will continued until the end of their lives. And so did 'Umar, who was abrasive against whoever transmitted numerous *aḥādīth* or reported information related to judicial judgment without any witness. He used to order (the narrators) to reduce the number of narrations so that the masses will not be confused or be corrupted by falsehood (

fed with deceit invented by the hypocrites, the libertines and the louins. That was why most of the famous companions and the se friends of the Prophet such as Abū Bakr, al-Zubayr, Abū Saydah and 'Abbās ibn 'Abd al-Muṭṭalib used to reduce the abers of *ḥadīth*, which they have narrated from the Prophet. ced, some of them did not narrate any *ḥadīth* at all such as Sa'id Zayd ibn 'Amr ibn Nufayl even though he is one of the ten sons promised entrance into paradise."

Alī said: [When I hear the *ḥadīth* of the Prophet SAAS, Allāh kes me derive benefit from it, as much as He wanted it to be. And narrate a *ḥadīth* from a narrator, I adjure him to make a pledge, if he swear I will trust him.] Abū Bakr used to practice this hoth and then he will narrate the *ḥadīth*."

on't you ever realize that how devout people can be, in preserving *ḥadīth* from being distorted or words being added or omitted in transmission? This is because they have heard the Prophet said: hoever reports a lie and attributes it to me, he reserves his place in [ fire.<sup>47</sup>] Likewise, it was narrated al-Zubayr, but he said: [I know ie people who added to this *ḥadīth* the word 'intentionally' *ta'ammidan*) and (I swear) by Allāh, I did not hear the Prophet 1 "intentionally'.]"

uṭarrif ibn 'Abd Allāh reported that 'Imrān ibn Ḥuṣayn said: [By āh! I know I am able to narrate at will the narration from the

---

'Umdat al-Qārī, 2:227 (No. 107); Sunan Ibn Mājah, 1:13 (No. 30, 32, 33), 1:14 (No. 35, 36, and 37); Sunan Abū Dāwūd, 3:320 (No. 3651); 'Aṣḥat al-Aḥwadhī, 4:524 (No. 2257); Al-Musnad, 4:80 (No. 11350), 5:274 (No. 15482); Sunan al-Dārimī, 1:76 and 77; Al-Al-Sunan al-Kubrā, 3:390, 4:120, 10:374; Al-Mustadrak, 1:77; Mawārid, 1:631 (No. 1461), 2:825 (No. 1844); Majma' al-Zawā'id, 1:191; Kanz al-'Ummāl, 12:296 (No. 29498), 11:273 (No. 31498).

Prophet; (even for) two days consecutively I will do it! But what prevents me from so doing is (the fear of making mistakes). One of the companions has heard just what I have seen, saw what I have seen and reported the *ahādith* verbatim. And if I fear myself that I will be suspected for it, just as (the companions) will be suspected for it. Indeed, I am telling you that they have made mistakes but unintentionally did so.]”

“When they were informed that Abū Hurayrah was the most devoted person to the Prophet as compared to others, in particular, worked for him and served him food. Although (Abū Hurayrah) was a terribly poor man, nothing could distract him from his service to the Prophet – not even planting trees (near the oasis) or bargaining in marketplaces. Somebody insinuated that others were too busy in the trade and overwhelmed by that activities most of the time. But not with (Abū Hurayrah) who was inseparable from the Prophet, hence he knew and memorized things, which they knew not or even memorized. They, therefore, remained aloof from him. (Despite this reticence) Abū Hurayrah continued to say: [The Prophet said this, or that...] even of a narration narrated by an untrustworthy narrator.

“Likewise, Ibn ‘Abbās also remained aloof from (Abū Hurayrah) but with the exception that he had never affirmed the deceit or confirmed the truth in the sayings of (Abū Hurayrah) – Praise be to Allāh! – (it is probably that) a person who listened to (Abū Hurayrah)’s narration misconstrued the narration and – by the grace of Allāh may he be protected!”

42a. (See also 39). “As for the sayings of (Abū Hurayrah): [My close friend said....] or [I heard my close friend...], he is referring to the Prophet SAAS and ‘Alī rebutted him, saying: [Since when did he

come your close friend?] In fact, (the term) *al-khullah* means friendship or affection. And *al-khullah* is of two degrees. (The first is affectionate) and the other meaning is more affectionate than the first. This is similar to the term *al-ṣuḥbah* (companionship). It is also of two degrees, one being more affectionate than the other. Don't you realize that when a person says: [Abū Bakr is a companion of the Prophet SAAS], it means that the person is not comparing between Abū Bakr's relationship to the Prophet SAAS with other companions, since they are also his companions? Then, where is the merit attributed to Abū Bakr (as found) in that statement? Indeed, the meaning which the person intends to say is that Abū Bakr is the most special person to the Prophet."

Likewise, (the above understanding) applies to the idea of brotherhood which the Prophet instills among his companions. The relationships between them are more affectionate than (the feeling of) brotherhood that, Allāh instills among the believers: [Indeed the Muslims are but a single brotherhood.<sup>48</sup>]"

The same analogy is applicable to the term *al-khullah*. Among the examples of the closest (relationship) is found in the saying of the mighty Allāh: [For Allāh did take Ibrāhīm for a friend<sup>49</sup>] and in the saying of the Prophet: [If I am at the disposal to choose a close friend among this *Ummah*, I will choose Abū Bakr.<sup>50</sup>] This means that the Prophet will choose (Abū Bakr) for his close friend just as Allāh has chosen Ibrāhīm as His close friend."

---

*Sūrah al-Hujurat*, 49: 10.

*Sūrah al-Nisā'*, 4: 125.

*Umdat al-Qārī*, 3: 523 (No. 466); *Sunan al-Tirmidhī*, 5:608 (No. 3660 and 3659); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 1:36 (No. 93); *Al-Sunan al-Kubrā*, 1:769, 5:450, 5:451, 6:402; *Mushkil al-Āthār*, 1:442 and 443; *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 11:546 (No. 32563), 11:553 (No. 32599), 11:554 (No. 32600).



“As for the general meaning of the term *al-khullah*, it refers to the close friend (brotherhood) which Almighty Allāh has instituted among the believers, for He said: [Friends on that day will be enemies, one to another except for the righteous.<sup>51</sup>] When ‘Alī who harboured bad feeling against Abū Hurayrah, heard the latter saying: [My close friend said....] or [I heard my close friend said....] rebutted him, saying: [Since when did he becomes your close friend?]. (‘Alī, however,) thought that *al-khullah* refers to the ‘close friend’ as indicated (in the *ḥadīth*) that the Prophet SAAS, from one angle, does not choose any close friend. And if he were to choose, he would have chosen Abū Bakr. On the other hand, Abū Hurayrah understood *al-khullah* in its general meaning that is, a close friend (brotherhood) that Almighty Allāh instituted among the believers. In addition, the term ‘*al-wilāyah*’ (sovereign power or friendship), in relation to the Prophet SAAS, from this angle, refers to a close friend of all believers and at the same time he is their ‘*walī*’ (legal leader).”

“The idea of *al-wilāyah* is also found in the saying of the Prophet SAAS: [To anyone of whom I am the *mawlā*, ‘Alī is also his *mawlā*<sup>52</sup>] which means that the friendship between the Prophet and the believers is more affectionate than the friendship that binds the believers together. It is in (this context of) meaning of friendship that is being associated with ‘Alī. If the (meaning) is not in consistent with the meaning of the *ḥadīth*, ‘Alī would have not benefited any eminent (position), and the *ḥadīth* itself would have been rendered

<sup>51</sup> *Sūrah al-Zukhruf*, 43: 67.

<sup>52</sup> *‘Aṣḥab al-Aḥwadhī*, 5:633 (No. 3713); *Al-Musnad*, 1:187 (No. 641), 1:253 (No. 961), 1:321 (No. 1310); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 1:45 (No. 121); *Al-Mustadrak*, 3: 110, 371, and 533; *Mushkil al-Āḥār*, 2: 307; *Mishkāt al-Maṣābiḥ*, 3: 243 (No. 6082); *Al-Mu’jam al-Kabīr*, 19:291; *Kanz al-‘Ummāl* 11:602 (No. 32904), 11:609 (No. 32950, 11:610 (No. 32951), 13:105 (No. 36343), 13:134 (No. 36422).



ingless. After all, the believers are friends, each other. The Prophet is the leader of all believers and there is no distinction between *walī* and *mawlā*. ”

Another example) is the saying of Almighty Allāh: [That is the Allāh is the protector of those who believe<sup>53</sup>] and the saying of the Prophet: [Any woman who is married, without the consent of her *mawlā*, her marriage is null and void.<sup>54</sup>]

“Such were the doctrines of al-Nazzām that we have heard and replied. His doctrines comprised some *aḥādīth* of which he claimed to be incompatible with (the teaching of) the Book and he denounced them by invoking logical reasoning. He also maintained that tradition could be abrogated through logical reasoning. He added that there existed internal contradictions in the *aḥādīth*. We will discuss this in due course, if Allāh wills.”

## Ū AL-HUDHAYL AL-‘ALLĀF

Abū Muḥammad said: “Let us move to the doctrine of Abū al-Hudhayl al-‘Allāf and we observed that he was a liar and a deceiver. A man who adopted the doctrine of Abū al-Hudhayl said that while he was present at the place of Muḥammad ibn al-Abū al-Hudhayl) was asked: [O Abū Ja‘far! My hand is skilful in earning but foolish in spending. How many hundred thousands of dirhams I have distributed amongst my brothers – such and such – you know about it. And I will ask you, by Allāh! Do you know it?]

---

*Sūrah Muḥammad*, 47: 1.  
*al-Mu‘jam al-Kabīr*, 11:202.

(Abū Ja'far) replied: [O Abū al-Hudhayl! I do not doubt your word.] (Then Abū Ja'far) said: [He does not feel happy of my presence except asking for my affirmation and even demanding me to swear.]

45. “(Abū Ja'far) said again that Abū al-Hudhayl has given a hen to Muways ibn 'Imrān. Then he started (to inform others) of the details of his gift, saying: [I did such and such a thing], [because of giving that hen] or [It was after that (event), I have given you that hen.] And when he saw a fat camel he will say: [By Allāh! No! It is not comparable to the hen that I have given you.] (The above examples) should not be the manner of a person who distributed his wealth to his brothers and not to mention (if he has given) two hundred thousand *dirhams*.”

46. “In discussing his mistake related to *al-istiṭā'ah* (power capability), a person reported that (Abū al-Hudhayl) used to say: [The agent at the moment of his action, does not have any power to perform other action.] And (the Mu'tazilites) adhered to the idea that power necessitated action. They also said that everybody agreed to the idea that an agent was powerful at the moment he performed an action because power necessitated action. However, they diverged at the point of knowing whether the power existed before the action. For us, we profess the doctrine on which there is a unanimous agreement. To those who claim that power exists before an action, let them provide the evidence.”

“When (Abū al-Hudhayl) was questioned about the non-existence of the sense of perception at the moment the discernment existed, about the non-existence of life whether it was an accident that occurred at the moment knowledge existed, he neither refuted nor referred back to his first opinion. He, however, claimed that it

sible for the agent to act at the moment of attainment of power by use of the power given to him upon the attainment. (That is why) agent can act in the following stage (of the action).

When somebody asked him: [When does the agent act? Does it happen, in the stage where he does not reach the attainment (of power)?] Or [Does it happen during the attainment of (power)?] and the action, according to you, comprises various stages. Indeed, the action takes place not in any stage except in the stage upon the attainment of power.] In other instances, he said several loathsome statements, which were related to the non-eternity of the pleasure of people of paradise and the non-eternity of the torment of the people of the hellfire."

#### 'UBAYD ALLĀH IBN AL-HASAN

"Let us move to 'Ubayd ibn al-Hasan who at that time was *qāḍī* of Basrah. He was censured because of his mean statements in his sect and his extreme arguments on issues which were either acceptable or refutable to him. He used to say: [Al-Qur'ān presented divergences in itself.] On the issue of *qadr* (predestination), he said that it was true for it has its foundation in the Book and so was the issue of *ijbār* (free will). It was true since it has foundation in the Book. Whoever affirmed (the above ideas) was right. This was because one verse (of al-Qur'ān) provided two different facets of meanings. One day he was asked on *ahl al-qadr* (the people of free will) and *ahl al-ijbār* (the people of predestination) and replied that both of them were right. The reason was that one of the groups

proclaimed the sovereignty of Allāh and the other proclaimed impartiality of Allāh (deanthropomorphism).”

48. “He said: [One can apply the same method in na Whoever calls an adulterer a believer, he is right, and if he call adulterer an infidel, he is also right.] (And) [Whoever says the adulterer is *fāsiq* (perverse), and is neither a believer nor an inf he is right.] Or [Whoever says that an adulterer is a *mun* (hypocrite), not a believer neither an infidel, is also right.] [Whoever says that an adulterer is an infidel but does not assoc partnership with Allāh, he is right.] Or [Whoever says that adulterer is an infidel and associate partnership with Allāh, h right, for al-Qur’ān proves all those ideas.]”

49. “He also said that the same mode (of analogy) could applied on the differences of *sunan* (traditions). For example traditions related to *qar’ah* (knock, rap) and its disparities; slai and its disparities; the murder of a believer due to his infidelity one does not kill a believer due to his infidelity<sup>55</sup> and related to o traditions which the jurists have decided on, all of them v correct.”

50. “He also added: [If a man said that the murderer goes to l he is right or that the murderer goes to paradise, he is rig [Whoever suspends his judgment and postpones the case, he is right], for he understands that Almighty Allāh created man worship Him and that man is deprived of the transcende knowledge).] He also said that the dispute between ‘Alī, Ṭalḥah Zubayr was the outcome of the obedience to Almighty Allāh.] Fi the sayings of (‘Ubayd) one clearly observes the inconsistencies

<sup>55</sup> ‘Umdat al-Qārī, 16: 191 (No. 6915).



outcomings (of his thoughts). It is doubtless that he is a supporter of the people of *kalām*, *qiyās* and *nazar*.”

## BAKR AL-'AMMĪ

Abū Muḥammad said: “Let us move to Bakr, the leader of *kriyyah* and who was one of the most pious people. We found that he has said: [Whoever steals a seed of mustard and then died without repent he is destined to hellfire forever with the Jews and the Christians.] And [Indeed, Almighty Allāh accommodates the Muslims to use some properties of his friend without the knowledge of the owner. And He accommodates (them) to enter an orchard and go in to eat the fruits therein, without taking them out. He also accommodates the Muslims) especially among the thirsty traveler who passes by a flock of sheep to drink its milk.]”

Abū Muḥammad said): “How could He punish a person who took a seed of mustard, without assessing but eternally condemns him to hell? What kind of a crime is there – in taking a seed of mustard to the point that one needs to repent? Is it harmful? In fact, a man who takes firewood from his brother's property, clods of clay from its garden and drink some water from its water basin; these actions are more serious than the stealing of a mustard seed.”

“(Bakr) also said: [Infants do not have the sensation of pain.] When he was asked: [Why does the infant cry when he was pinched or slapped?] He replied: [That was the punishment for the mistake of the parents and Almighty Allāh is full of justice to inflict pain on the innocent, sinless infant.] When he was questioned on the suffering of the defenseless animals, he replied: [Almighty Allāh allows the animals to



suffer for the benefits of man; for irrigation – to halt or to move, deemed necessary.]”

“This is justice! – According to (Bakr), Allāh allows (animals suffering for the benefit of others. At times, he said something contradicts to what is said earlier. The masses will be confused they were to narrate any tradition from him.”

53. “He used to say: [To drink strong wine from the fermented palm is part of the Sunnah and so also (the act of) eating of a young goat and the practice of wiping off (the dirt on the top part of) the shoes.] However, (for Abū Muḥammad) the Sunnah discusses more on religious matters rather than on food or drinks. If a man refuses to eat melon with fresh dates<sup>56</sup> although the Prophet eats them or if a man refuses to eat pumpkin although the Prophet loves it so much, cannot be said that the man has neglected the Sunnah.”

## V. HISHĀM IBN AL-ḤAKAM

54. Abū Muḥammad said: “Let us move to Hishām ibn al-Ḥakam. We observed that he was an extreme Rāfiḍite and he used to discuss Almighty Allāh in terms of forms, signs, limits, measures and all kind of things, which make one feels uneasy to mention. However, the people of *kalām* were aware of this (issue). He used to profess with strict determinism, even stricter than the Sunni determinist. He was asked: [Do you think that Almighty Allāh – with His Kindness, Mercy, Wisdom and Justice – imposes on us something then allows us to strive on our own resources to accomplish it and later on punishes us for it.] He replied: [Indeed, I

<sup>56</sup> *‘Umdat al-Qārī*, 14: 448 (No. 5447); *Al-Sunan al-Kubrā*, 7: 281.

[āh! This can be! But we are unable to talk about it.] "A man asked (Hishām): [O Abū Muḥammad! Do you know that 'Alī has a agreement with al-'Abbās on the issue of Fadak (Wādī/ Oasis lak) in the presence of Abū Bakr?] He replied: [Yes.] Then he was asked: [Between the two of them, who is wrong?] He replied: [Nobody is wrong!] He was asked again: [Praised be to Allāh! How can it be like that?] He answered: [They are like the two angels who stood in front of Dāwūd, both are not wrong but they want him to understand his own error and unfairness.<sup>57</sup>] Similarly, these two sons in question,<sup>58</sup> they intended Abū Bakr to realize his own error and unfairness."

The people of *kalām* reckoned that (Hishām's) idea as incorrect, when he said: [Allāh changes pebble (stone) into a heavy, high and mountain. Then He covers the layers on the soil until it becomes fully grounded. When He completed (the process), He (remains) of). He neither increases nor decreases the soil and matter of that mountain.]"

## THUMĀMAH

Abū Muḥammad said: "Let us move to Thumāmah and we observed that he was an irreligious person for he degraded Islam by abusing it. The way he said was unbelievable for anyone who knew and believed in Almighty Allāh would never said as such! Among famous satirical remark that reminded others of him was that,

---

It seems that Hishām al-Ḥakam has referred to al-Qur'ān - *Sūrah Sād*, 38: 21-22 or Bible - *Samuel*, 1: 11-17 for his analogy. However, he has contradicted the Qur'ānic verses and Bible's information, that Dāwūd commits mistakes and is an unjust man.

'Alī and Ibn 'Abbās.

when he saw people rushing to the mosque on Friday fearing t might miss the prayer; he (mocked them) saying: [Look at th cows! Look at those donkeys!] Then he said to one of his frier [Look at what the Arab<sup>59</sup> has made out of those people.]”

## VII. MUḤAMMAD IBN AL-JAHM AL-BARMAKĪ

56. Abū Muḥammad said: “Let us move to Muḥammad ibn Jahm al-Barmakī. We found that he possessed books on Aristotle t discussed the existent, corruption, essence and limitations of loḡ. He spent most of his time on those books and did not fast in month of Ramaḍān under the pretext that he was physically unfit.”

57. “He said: [Nobody deserves to be offered gratitude fo gesture done or any good action which he has rendered to othe This is (necessary) for him to do so because there should not be ot motives except to seek the reward from Almighty Allāh. Otherwi he is just seeking his own interest or to get his stipend or to ge lucrative gain or to be famous or to strive for personal fortune a profit. He might also act out of pity for the beneficiary of the act out of compassion from his heart just to appease his own tormer These opinions, however, contradicted the saying of the Prophet: [ who does not express his gratitude to man, does not express | gratitude to Allāh.<sup>60</sup>]”

“A member of the people of *kalām* informed that (Muḥammad ibn Jahm) upon his deathbed has said: [Indeed the Prophet has said t

<sup>59</sup>

Thumāmah was referring to the Prophet SAAS.

<sup>60</sup>

*Al-Musnad*, 3: 152 (No. 7944), 3: 167 (No. 8020), 3: 337 (9044); *Sunan A Dāwūd*, 4:255 (No. 4811); *Al-Sunan al-Kubrā*, 6:302; *Al-Mu'jam al-Kal* 1:195.

one-third is still a lot.]<sup>61</sup> And (Abū Muḥammad) said: [One-third is still a lot, the poor have their right in the public treasure, and if they seek (for it) they will get it. If they keep away from it, it will (remain) just like the women,<sup>62</sup> they will have nothing. And Allāh will have no mercy on those who supported them.”

3. Abū Muḥammad said: “I reported from a man, whose horse suddenly bolted, and he informed that the Prophet has said: [Hit your horse) when it rebels but do not hit it, if it stumbles.] But I think: One should not hit it even if he rebels or stumbles.]

Abū Muḥammad said: “I am not sure whether the Prophet has said this, but obviously somebody has wrongly attributed to him. The first saying is correct for a horse snorts when it comes close to a well or it sees something, which the rider notices not. Then (the horse) starts plunge in and this proves to be fatal. (The Prophet) discourages one from hitting the animal when it stumbles. On the contrary, he advises to hit the animal when it rebels so that it ceases to rebel for rebellion results in the laziness of the animal itself.”

---

*‘Umdat al-Qārī*, 14:654 (No. 5659), 14:365 (No. 5354), 10:17 (No. 2743); *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, 3:1253 (No. 1629); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 2:904 (No. 2708), 2:905 (No. 2711); *Al-Musnad*, 1:363 (No. 1474), 1:364 (No. 1479), 1:364 (No. 1482), 1:365 (No. 1485), 1:369 (No. 1501), 1:373 (No. 1524); *Al-Mu’jam al-Kabīr*, 10:297; *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, 16: 616 (No. 46066).

Ibn Qutaybah's analogy of women – *نمرد النساء* – is not particularly applicable in today's sense for women work outside or from their home. If we refer to history – Khadijah, the wife of the Prophet, is a successful business woman. However, he may be correct if he refers to the ideas of postponing pregnancy although the lady is capable of doing so just for the sake of being a career woman.



## VIII. *ĀSHĀB AL-RA'Y* (THE PEOPLE OF PERSONAL OPINION)

59. Abū Muḥammad said: "Let us move to the people of *al-ra'*. We also found that they differed and diverged in deducing analogical reasoning. They practiced *qiyās* (analogical reasoning) and *istiḥṣā*. Then they will advocate (the finding) and announce the judgment on it. They, however, subsequently revert to (another opinion)."

"Sahl ibn Muḥammad has narrated from al-Aṣma'ī and the latter from Ḥammād ibn Zayd that he heard Yaḥyā ibn Mikhnaf said: A man from the east came over to study under Abū Ḥanīfah's guidance for the first time in Makkah. After a year he returned and studied (again) under Abū Ḥanīfah's guidance. He asked (Abū Ḥanīfah) some questions which he has previously asked but (Abū Ḥanīfah) gave different answers for the same questions. Then the man put some dust on his head and said: [O People who are present! I met this man last year and he gave me a legal opinion as contained in this book, I followed it and I shed blood and I married to it, but he reverted to another opinion this year.] Sahl ibn Muḥammad has narrated from Mukhtār ibn 'Amr who informed that a man has asked (Abū Ḥanīfah): [How could this (event) occur?] (Abū Ḥanīfah) replied: [This opinion was given last year, but I have changed my opinion this year.] The man asked again: [Can you assure me that you will not change your opinion again in the near future?] (Abū Ḥanīfah) replied: [I don't know what it will be (in the future).] The man replied: [What I know is that Allāh's curse will be upon you!]"

"Al-Awzā'ī said: [We bear no grudges against Abū Ḥanīfah for applying personal opinion, after all we also apply it, but we detest

n for narrating the *ḥadīth* from the Prophet and later on narrating it opposing other (narrations).]"

1. "Sahl ibn Muḥammad has said that al-Aṣma'ī has narrated from Zayd, saying: [I have witnessed that Abū Ḥanīfah was asked on the position of) *muḥrim*<sup>63</sup> who lost his *izār*<sup>64</sup> (or *iḥrām* sheets) and he put on the trousers. (Abū Ḥanīfah) replied: [He is obliged to pay redemption (*fidyah*)]."

Abū Muḥammad) said: "Praised be to Allāh! 'Amr ibn Dīnār has narrated from Jābir ibn Zayd and the latter from Ibn 'Abbās, saying: I have heard the Prophet SAAS said something related to *muḥrim*. If he fails to find *izār*, he can put on trousers. If he fails to find any proper, he can wear shoes.<sup>65</sup>] Then (Abū Ḥanīfah) replied: [Leave us alone to deal with it.] And (Abū Ḥanīfah) has narrated from Ḥammād and the latter from Ibrāhīm that the Prophet has said: [He has to pay compensation (*kaffārah*)!]"

2. "Abū 'Āṣim has reported that Abū 'Awānah said: [I was sitting) before Abū Ḥanīfah and he was asked on the position of a man who has stolen a small date tree or palm shoot (*wadī*).] Abū Ḥanīfah replied: [His (hand) has to be amputated.] Then (Abū 'Āṣim) told him that Yaḥyā ibn Sa'īd has narrated from Muḥammad ibn Yaḥyā ibn Ḥibbān and the latter from Rāfi' ibn Khudayj, who said that the Prophet SAAS has said: [There is no amputation for the theft

---

*Muḥrim* is a person who is in the state of *iḥrām* during *hajj* in Makkah. In this state a man needs to wear 2 seamless white woolen or linen sheets and he must not comb or shave his hairs and must observe sexual continence. Ibn Qutaybah uses the term '*izār*' – meaning sheet or shawl, which for us today refers to *iḥrām* sheets.

<sup>63</sup>*Umdat al-Qārī*, 7: 532 (No. 1841), 7: 533 (No. 1843); *Sunan Al-Nasā'ī*, 5:135 (No. 2679); *Al-Musnad*, 1:462 (No. 1848); *Al-Mu'jam al-Kubīr*, 12:39, 12:177-178; *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 5:34 (No. 11931).

of fruits or palm shoot.<sup>66</sup>] (Abū Ḥanīfah) said: [I have no knowledge of this *ḥadīth*.] (Abū 'Āṣim) said to him: [Inform the man to whom you have given the verdict.] Abū Ḥanīfah replied: [Leave him! Let him go with the gray mule.] Abū 'Āṣim said: [I fear they will take away his flesh and blood.]

62. “‘Alī ibn ‘Āṣim said Abū Ḥanīfah has narrated a *ḥadīth* which ‘Abd Allāh heard a man saying: [Whoever slaughters a sheep for everybody, I will allow him to marry my first-born baby girl. Then a man takes the offer. And Ibn Mas‘ūd declares that the girl is legitimately his wife and she has the right to the same dowry just like other women have received. Abū Ḥanīfah replied: [This is judgment of a devil.]”

63. “I have never met anybody who has the most sharp-tongued (like) Ishāq ibn Ibrāhīm al-Ḥanẓalī, also known as Ibn Rāhawayh who insulted the people of *ra’y*. He is ready to condemn, warn and criticize against their pernicious speeches. He used to say: [They renounced the Book of Almighty Allāh and the Sunan of the Prophet. They practiced incessantly analogical reasoning]. He enumerated some examples such as: [If a man falls into a deep sleep and he is sitting (from the very beginning of his sleep), he is not obliged to take the ablution] and [(the people of *ra’y*) unanimously agreed that when a person fainted, he ceased to be in the state of ablution.] (Ibn Rāhawayh) said: [There is no (connection) between (faint and) ablution] in (that) decision. This is because there is no legal proof (on that (issue)) for one to conclude the nullity of an ablution. As for the

<sup>66</sup> *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 4:137 (No. 4388); *‘Aṣṣaḥīḥ al-Aḥwadhī*, 6: 181 (No. 1449); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 2:865 (No. 2593), 2:865 (No. 2594); *Sunan al-Dārimī*, 2:174; *Al-Sunan al-Kubrā*, 8:463, 8:457, *Al-Mu’jam al-Kabīr*, 260-262.



ep, on the contrary, there are several *aḥādīth* as evidences. Some of them – the Prophet said: [The eye muscles control the eyes and the muscles are close, the muscles will (relax).<sup>67</sup>] In other *ḥadīth*: [Whoever intends to sleep he is to take ablution.<sup>68</sup>] (Ibn Rāhawayh) said: [(The people of *ra'y*) oblige a person who intends to sleep to have an ablution, but they neglected (to oblige) a person who falls into a deep sleep, in the state of kneeling or prostrating!] and [those two postures, risk causing impurity more than in reclining position. They, therefore, are neither following the precedent nor adhering to logical reasoning.]”

“(Ibn Rāhawayh) said: [(The people of *ra'y*) said that whoever guffaws after the *tashahhud*, his prayer is valid but he has to take another ablution for another prayer.] He added: [This is the most glaring mistake that anyone can observe for they mock at the prayer even before they begin!]

“(Ibn Rāhawayh) said: [(The people of *ra'y*) said that the wealth of a dead man should be bequeathed to his paternal grandfather and his granddaughter. The wealth however, should only be distributed to the grandfather and nothing (should be given to) the granddaughter. This is how things are done – among them – in numerous (cases) among their kinship. (Ibn Rāhawayh) said: [There is no dreadful mistake more than this one – the maternal grandfather plays the role of the mother! How can he overrule the right of his granddaughter? Probably (the people of *ra'y*) assimilated the

---

*Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 1:161 (No. 477); ‘Alī ibn ‘Umar al-Daraqutnī (d. 385 AH), *Sunan Dāraqutnī*, commented by Abū Al-Ṭayyib Muḥammad Abadī, (Bayrūt: ‘Alam al-Kutub, 1986), 1: 16, hereafter cited as *Sunan Dāraqutnī*; *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 1:52 (No. 203).

*‘Umdat al-Qārī*, 10: 641 (No. 3295); *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 1:52 (No. 203); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 1:161 (No. 477).



maternal grandfather with the paternal grandfather. After all they bore the same name!]"

66. Abū Muḥammad said that Ishāq known also as Ibn Rāhawayh has narrated from Wakī<sup>c</sup> that Abū Ḥanīfah said: [What is wrong with him? He raises his hand when he stands up and bows down! Does he want to fly?] ‘Abd Allāh ibn al-Mubārak replied [Yes! He wants to fly when he recites the *iftitāḥ* and also wants to fly when he stands up and bows down!]"

67. (Abū Muḥammad) said: "This is your judgment in the area of religion, as in the saying: [I amputate (the hand) in the case of theft of a bunch of dates but not in the case of theft of firewood and wood I amputate for the theft of flowers but not for the theft of earthenware and glassware. This judgment implies that earthenware and glassware are not parts of wealth, nor is ebony a kind of wood.]"

"Ishāq ibn Rāhawayh also said that Abū Ḥanīfah when asked about the position of a person drinking from a silver container and (the latter) replied: [It does not matter! It is a similar situation to a person who wears a ring on his finger, then plunges his hand (wearing the ring) in water and uses it to drink.] There are numerous examples that are similar to the above cases, but it will be too long to be mentioned here."

68. "In addition to the (above), one of the grievous (examples) is the one that contradicted the Book of Allāh. It is as if they had never read the (Book)! Abū Ḥanīfah does not grant blood money to the victim of the intentional homicide but (said) either to forgive or to get revenge.<sup>69</sup> He also said that the person must not take the blood money

<sup>69</sup> *‘Umdat al-Qārī*, 16: 150 (No. 6880).

mighty Allāh says: [The law of equality is prescribed to you. In case of murder, a free man for a free man, a slave for a slave, a man for a woman. But if any remission is made by our brother (of the guilty party) then grant any reasonable demand and compensate him with handsome gratitude. This is a concession and a mercy from your Lord.] This verse means that whoever has forgiven the act of shedding of the blood, should concur with the price of blood money in proper manner that is, to make a reasonable demand without punishing the guilty party and has to pay in goodwill without any penalty. Allāh also said: [This is a concession and a mercy from your Lord] which means a concession for the Muslim in comparison to what has been practiced by the Isrā'īlites people that the relatives of the victim have no option except to retaliate or to forgive. (The next verse says): [After this whoever exceeds the limits] means paying the blood money and killing the guilty party, [shall be in sin and penalty.<sup>71</sup>] Some opinions said that the guilty party in this verse if killed and the blood money will not be accepted from him for his transgression).

The Prophet SAAS said: [I will never forgive anybody who has shed blood (the guilty party) after he has accepted the blood money.] Hence, this case and other related cases do not contradict the teaching of al-Qur'ān. There is no excuse for this contradiction, and it is not used to contradict the Prophet SAAS after his words have been revealed to all."

"As for the application of personal opinion on *furū'* (secondary) matters, the effect is less serious. Even if the solutions

---

<sup>71</sup> *Uraḥ al-Baqarah*, 2: 178.

<sup>72</sup> *Uraḥ al-Baqarah*, 2: 178.

offered are based on the fundamental legislation, but related to ṭl obligatory matters and the *Sunan*, (it is less severe) for it is a matt of differences in using analogical reasoning and the capacity of ṭl mind.”

“Al-Ziyādī reported that ‘Īsā ibn Yūnus has narrated from al-A‘mas and the latter from Abū Ishāq that ‘Abd Khayr has informed ṭl saying of ‘Alī ibn Abū Ṭālīb: [I have never thought that it was mo important to rub the ankle of the leg than the sole of the foot, until ṭl day I saw the Prophet rubbed his ankle.<sup>72</sup>]”

“I heard that Abū Ḥātim has narrated from al-Aḥma‘ī that Zafr ṭl Hudhayl has informed a man who bequeathed his wealth to anoth man between ten to twenty (items). He said: [He must bequest niṭ items for he has no right to this contract or that contract.] This mean as if you are saying: [For him (the amount is what existed) betwee the two columns and not (all from) the two columns themselves.] W asked him: [For a man, who is fortunate to have a son, it is said him: how old is your son?] He replied: [Between sixty to sixty-two! this is how – according to your analogical reasoning, would mean, l is one year old.] He said again: [On this point, *istiḥsān* applicable!]

“We have narrated from Mālīk as in the *Muwatta’a*’ who then narrate from Rabī‘ah ibn Abū ‘Abd al-Raḥmān informing that he has ask Sa‘īd ibn al-Musayyab:

[How much is the reward for a finger of a lady?]

He said: [Ten camels.]

(Rabī‘ah) asked: [How much is it for two fingers?]

He replied: [Twenty camels.]

(Rabī'ah) asked again: [How much is it for three fingers?]

He replied: [Thirty camels.]

(Rabī'ah) asked: [How much is it for four fingers?]

He replied: [Twenty camels.]

Then Rabī'ah said: [When the injury is so painful and the misfortune is so grievous why must the blood money be decreased?]

He replied: [This is *Sunnah*! O! Son of my brother!]

Abū Muḥammad said: "The strictest adherent to personal opinion and analogical reasoning among the 'Irāqians is al-Sha'bī the most lenient one is Mujāhid. Abū al-Khaṭṭāb has narrated from Mālik ibn Sa'īd who then narrated from al-A'mash and the latter from Mujāhid, saying: [The best kind of veneration is the usage and personal opinion.]"

Muḥammad ibn Khālīd Muḥammad ibn Khidāsh has narrated from al-Ḥusayn ibn Qutaybah who also narrated from Mālik ibn Mighwal the latter from al-Sha'bī, saying: [Looking at the people of al-Basrah – what did those people transmit from the companions of Muḥammad to you to be remembered? What did those people tell you of their personal opinion, so that you can throw it away? (Al-Basrah) replied: [Be aware of their analogical reasoning for if you adopted it, it will forbid you what is licit and it will permit you what is illicit!]]"

Muḥammad said: "I narrated from al-Riyāshī, who then narrated from al-Aṣma'ī and the latter from 'Umar ibn Abū Zā'idah, who said



to al-Sha'bī: [This does not conform to analogical reasoning!] He then shouted: [To the devil with the analogical reasoning.] A Riyāshī has narrated from Abū Ya'qūb al-Khaṭṭābī, who the narrated from his uncle and the latter from al-Zuhrī, saying: [The *ḥadīth* is a male (species) and it loves the masculine (gender) but dislikes the feminine (gender).]”

71. Abū Muḥammad said: “How could one reject the application of analogical reasoning on *furū'* matter? It is doubtless that (the *furū'* matter) is not of the same nature as the *uṣūl* (fundamental) matter. Is it not that the *furū'* matter complies with the *uṣūl* matter? How could the application of analogical reasoning lead to the amputation of the hand for whoever steals ten *darāhim* but spares the one who extorts one hundred thousand *dirhams*? How could (the application of analogical reasoning) lead to flogging the one who accuses a free man to live licentiously, but forgive the one who accused wrongly the honest slave? How could analogical reasoning lead one to decide that the female slave can remarry when her period of menstruation has ended but not for a free woman (widow), who has to remarry only after her three (consecutive) periods of menstruation have ended? How could the application of analogical reasoning lead to the decision that a man is *muḥṣan* when he fornicates with an old, ugly and black lady but he is not categorized as *muḥṣan* if he has fornicated even with one hundred beautiful slaves? How could the application of analogical reasoning lead to oblige the woman who has menstruation to *qaḍā'* (accomplish) the fasting but, it does not impose on the woman to *qaḍā'* the prayer? How could (the application of analogical reasoning) lead to more flogging of anyone who accuses other man as a fornicator than anyone who accuses other man as an infidel? How could (the application

alogical reasoning) lead to giving judgment of homicide based on two testimonies but not to give judgment of fornication, except based on four testimonies?"

## AL-JĀHIZ

Abū Muḥammad said: "Let us move to al-Jāhiz. He was one of the renowned *mutakallimūn* but refuted the *mutaqaddimūn*. He is the most eloquent person in discussion, persuasive in his speech to the point that he may exaggerate the small issue to become a big one and vice-versa. He was able to make things appear different from their usual nature and skilful to argue for the superiority of the blacks over the whites. Sometimes you notice that at times he defends the ṭhmānites over the Rāfiḍite or at times he is in favor of the ṭhāyrites over the 'Uthmānites and the Sunnite. At times, he glorified 'Alī but in other circumstances, renounced 'Alī saying that something came from the Prophet SAAS] and suddenly he said: [this is according to al-Jammār] or [this is from Ismā'īl ibn Ghazwān who said: {So and so is among the abominable persons!}]"

He revered the Prophet SAAS and for him, one should not associate the Prophet) with other individuals in the same book or even on the same sheet or in one or two lines of the sheet. He wrote a book explaining the argument of the Christians against the Muslims. In his citation against the Christians, he gave an exaggerated argument. It seems that he intended to remind the Muslims of what they do not know. But at the same time, he created doubt in the mind of the warm Muslims. One also finds in his book where he wrote a vicious joke, meant to attract youngsters and drinkers of *nabīdh*."

“He ridiculed *aḥādīth* and this was known among the scholars. Some examples which he mentioned were: the liver of the fish,<sup>73</sup> the horn of the demon, the black stone which to him was white, but was blackened by the polytheists and the Muslims were obliged to whiten it upon their acceptance of Islam (as their religion). He also mentioned about a leaflet which informed the revelation on suckling and it was placed under ‘Ā’ishah’s bed but was eaten by the sheep. Other examples were taken from the traditions of the people of the Book about the remorseful act of a cock, a crow, a hoopoe, which buried its mother on its head, the glorification of Allāh by a frog, necklace of a pigeon and other similar examples, which we will mention later, if it pleases Allāh.”

73. “(Al-Jāḥiẓ) – from the (foregoing discussion) – is one of the greatest liars of the *ummah*, one the worst *ḥadīth* fabricators and the confederate of evil acts. Be aware of this! – May Allāh have mercy on you! – His words are parts of his stratagem; he will only say things, which benefit him. Indeed, a confident man is responsible for what he has written and recorded. (But al-Jāḥiẓ) will not do anything that contradicts what he had said or exerted his effort in verifying falsehood, which later rebukes himself. And Al-Riyāshī wrote a poem for me:

[Do not write your error except something,  
Which will bring you joy in the hereafter and;  
You will see it.]”

<sup>73</sup> *Umdat al-Qārī*, 11: 658 (No. 3938).

## TION ON THE PEOPLE OF *KALĀM*

i Muḥammad said: "I was informed that some members the people of *kalām* said that wine was not forbidden for y Allāh has prevented it just to educate man. (Allāh) said: ot your hands tied (like a niggard's) to your neck not stretch to its utmost reach, so that you become blameworthy and .<sup>74</sup>] In another saying: [Admonish them first, next refuse to air beds, and last beat them lightly.<sup>75</sup>] There are also (among le of *kalām*) who said that it is allowable for man to marry e wives as found in the saying of Almighty Allāh: [Marry of your choice, two and three and four.]<sup>76</sup> They said: [It is ie Prophet himself has proven this for he died leaving nine ehind him!) Allāh does not restrain the Prophet (to have nine : mentioned) in al-Qur'ān and thus He will not restrain us doing!]"

ne people (among *ahl al-kalām*) considered that the fat and of a pig are allowable (for them) for Almighty Allāh only its meat. In al-Qur'ān, He said: [Forbidden to you from food l animal, blood, the flesh of the pig.<sup>77</sup>] He therefore, does not ything except for the flesh."

ne people (among *ahl al-kalām*) also said that Almighty ew nothing (of His creations) after they existed and He othing even it if was recorded."

---

<sup>74</sup> *al-Isrā'*, 17:29.

<sup>75</sup> *al-Nisā'*, 4:34.

<sup>76</sup> *al-Nisā'*, 4:3.

<sup>77</sup> *al-Mā'idah*, 5:3.



77. (Abū Muḥammad asked): “Who among them are to be followed? And who will follow this kind of doctrine, this type of sayings, this type of disputes? How can one extract the truth from them? They – throughout (day and night) that passed by – were involved in drawing analogous conclusions and assumptions, which proved to be fruitless leading to astute differences and deviating others from the truth.”

“Abū Yūsūf said: [Whoever seeks religion (of Islām) through *kalām*, he will be an atheist; whoever seeks fortune through alchemy he will fall to misery and whoever seeks obscure *ḥadīth*, he will fall victim to lies.]”

78. Abū Muḥammad said: “When I was in the youthful age, while searching for knowledge, I loved to ascribe all knowledge through cause and effect and I took an active part in it. For example, in some of the intellectual meetings (of *ahl al-kalām*) that I had attended and (of which I am) a stranger to them, I always hoped to gain some benefits from them or to hear some good remarks or to be guided by them. However, I was a witness to their impudence and their lack of respect to Almighty Allāh. Their obsession (for power) led them to pursue analogical reasoning or to make conclusions and often, I came out of it feeling deprave and remorse.”

79. Muḥammad ibn Bashīr, a poet, described them, saying:

“Leave alone the person who professes *kalām*,  
Whoever is God-fearing will not profess *kalām*,  
All sects have their good beginning,  
Then they changed from bad to worse,  
Many have uttered about it,

He does not find in himself short of ideas."

bd Allāh ibn Mus'ab said:

"You know that man has pride in his saying,

It is better for man if he does not say,

Hold yourself from the superfluity of *kalām*,

Indeed in all *kalām*, in it, the superfluity,

Do not associate yourself to any form of innovation,

Do not listen to the hearsay,

Indeed their speeches are like cloud,

Their shadows remain behind,

Indeed Allāh revealed the legal verses,

The Prophet is the living demonstration,

He enlightens the path for the Muslims,

Then do not follow any other path,

Those are the people, who have doubts within themselves,

Who have fear within themselves,

When they mentioned about the innovation in al-Qur'ān,

They act outrageously thinking that they are honest,

Leave them and their followers aside,

And oppose them with a definite silence."

Abū Muḥammad said: "I have heard the saying of 'Umar ibn 'Abd al-'Azīz - May Allāh have Mercy on him - that whoever makes his religion as an object of polemic will often be led to a dispute of ideas. And I often heard them said: [The truth can be attained through analogical reasoning and dialectical argument. This is necessary, for whoever has the intention to argue on a certain point needs to provide his arguments.] Then I saw them engrossed in a long dispute, and imposing on each other to accept their proofs several times and they were astute with their own ideas and never change."

80. A follower of Hishām ibn al-Ḥakam (A) asked a Mu'tazilite (B):

A – "Tell me, is the world finite and has limit!

B – To my mind, finite is of two kinds – first, the finite of time that refers to moment to another moment. Second, *al-aṭrāf* (border or region) and *al-jawānib* (lateral portion or section) means the finite of the area. The world is therefore finite by these two qualities.

A – Tell me about Almighty Creator, is He finite?

B – Impossible!

A – Then are you claiming that it is possible for a finite being to be created by the infinite being?

B – Yes!

A – Why would it be not possible for a thing to be created by 'other being' (which is not a thing), just as, it is possible for finite being to be created by the infinite being?

B – This is because the other beings will be annihilated and become obsolete.

- The infinite being will not be annihilated and become obsolete.
- The non-entity is a negation.
- And the infinite is also a negation.
- Everybody agrees that the non-entity is a thing, except Jahm his disciples.
- And everybody agrees that he is finite.
- I found that every finite thing is *muḥdathan* (contingent) *nū'an* (product) and *'ājizān* (powerless).
- I also found that every thing is *muḥdathan*, *maṣnū'an* and *zan*.
- Then, since you observed that things are being produced, you surely realize that the producer is a thing.
- And since you observed that those things are finite, you will ly realize that the producer is a thing.
- If he is finite, then he is contingent just as you have observed every thing is contingent.
- And if he is a 'thing', he will be contingent and powerless just ou have observed that anything is contingent is powerless. Then, t is the difference between them?
- (B) has no answer."

Another man (A) asked another Mu'tazilite (B) on knowledge:

- "Do you think that *samī'an* (the listener) is similar to *'alīm* (learned)?"
- Yes!



A – (A) replied by reciting a Qur'ānic verse, which means [Indeed Allāh heard the taunt of those who say: 'Truly, Allāh indigent....'<sup>78</sup>], does He hear (the taunt) the moment they said it?

B – Yes!

A – Does He hear (the taunt) before they say it?

B – No.

A – Does He know even before they say it?

B – Yes!

A – Then, I think that *samī'* is similar to '*Alīm*'

B – (B) could not reply."

Abū Muḥammad said: "I said to both of them: [Indeed both of you are persistently involved in debate, and don't you ever change your belief throughout your debates?] One of them replied: [If we were to do that, we will change our ideas several times in a day. And it is enough! Things are quite baffling now!] I replied: [The truth is attained through analogy and debates. But you allowed yourself to be carried away in the criticisms on the issues (which you have unanimously agreed upon); so, what is the use of it? *Taqīd* (imitation) of tradition is more beneficial for you and adhering to the examples set by the Prophet is better for you!]"

83. (Abū Muḥammad) said: "The people of *kalām* disputed on the authenticity of *al-khabar* (*ḥadīth* narration). Some of them said: [It is to be validated by a trustworthy person.] The other said: [It is to be validated by two persons because Almighty Allāh ordained certification to be done by two just people.] Another person said:

<sup>78</sup> *Sūrah Āli 'Imrān*, 3: 181.

o be validated by three people because Almighty Allāh said: {...If contingent from every expedition remained behind, (*tā'ifah*) they would devote themselves to study the religion (in depth) and admonish the people when they return to them.} <sup>79</sup>] They added that a group (*tā'ifah*) composed of at the least, three people."

Abū Muḥammad) commented that the opinion was incorrect. This is because the term *tā'ifah* or a group could comprise one person or two or three or even more than that. *Tā'ifah* also signifies a fraction and an individual could constitute a fraction of a group. Almighty Allāh said: [... And let a party (*tā'ifah*) of the Believers witness their punishment<sup>80</sup>] which means one or two persons. The other man said: The tradition is to be validated by four persons.] This is based on the saying of Almighty Allāh: [Why did they not bring four witnesses to prove it?<sup>81</sup>] Another man said: [The narration is to be validated by five people.] This is based on the saying of Almighty Allāh: [We appointed twelve captains among them.<sup>82</sup>] And the other said: [The narration is to be validated by twenty people]. This is based on the saying of Almighty Allāh: [If there are twenty amongst you, patient and persevering, they will vanquish and overcome a hundred....<sup>83</sup>] Another one said: [The narration is to be validated by seventy people]. This is based on the saying of Almighty Allāh: [Muṣā chose seventy of his people for our place of meeting....<sup>84</sup>]"

Abū Muḥammad) said: "(The people of *kalām*) quoted every number mentioned by al-Qur'ān just to provide the evidence in

---

*Sūrah al-Tawbah*, 9: 122.

*Sūrah al-Nūr*, 24: 2.

*Sūrah al-Nūr*, 24: 13.

*Sūrah al-Mā'idah*, 5: 12.

*Sūrah al-Anfāl*, 8: 65.

*Sūrah al-A'rāf*, 7: 155.

validating the *ḥadīth* narration. And, even if someone were to tell them that the narration is to be validated by eight people, by virtue of the saying of the Almighty Allāh, related to *aṣḥāb al-kaḥf* (companions of the cave) which debated by people of that time: [... seven, the dog being the eighth....<sup>85</sup>] they will accept it. (Abū Muḥammad replied that) it is impossible to count it to be eight unless one counts the dog (as human being) and hence, making it eight. Another opinion held that the narration is not valid unless it is narrated by nineteen people based on in the saying of Almighty Allāh that discusses the storage of hell fire: [over it are nineteen.<sup>86</sup>]

84. "These options of number show that the divergences are due to the different levels of human mind, for every option of number made, it depends on the ability of man's mind. If they correlate the above idea of numbers to the idea that Almighty Allāh sent only one Prophet to the whole mankind, they will understand. (Allāh) ordained them to follow and accept (the Prophet's) teaching. Allāh does not send two Prophets neither four nor twenty and not even seventy at the same time. This idea proves that it takes only one trustworthy and honest man to verify the validity of the narration. Likewise, it needs only one Prophet to transmit the divine words of Almighty Allāh. However, this discussion is not part of this chapter; we therefore, will not prolong the discussion."

---

<sup>85</sup> *Sūrah al-Kahf*, 18: 22.

<sup>86</sup> *Sūrah al-Muddaththir*, 74: 30.

# THE EXEGESIS OF THE PEOPLE OF *KALĀM* AND THE PEOPLE OF *RA'Y*

Abū Muḥammad said: "They interpreted al-Qur'ān in a remarkable manner, intending to reflect their *madhāhib* (schools of thought) by applying *ta'wīl* (interpretation) which accords to their ideology. Some of them quoted the saying of Almighty Allāh: *kursī* (throne) extent over the heavens and the earth<sup>87</sup>] and the meaning for them means His knowledge that nobody knows. A poet [No creature knows the knowledge of Allāh]. This poem means the knowledge of Allāh is beyond human's grasp. However, the *kursī* (كرسي) is not suffixed with hamzah (known also as *ghayr nūz*). And the verb *yukarsi'* (يكرسي) is suffixed with hamzah (known also as *mahmūz*). Hence, they felt reluctant to attribute knowledge of Allāh to *kursī* or *sarīr* (bed). They resorted to use the term *ṣarīf* (roof) as something different (so as to avoid attributing knowledge to Allāh). The Arabs understand *sarīr* but do not apply it (for) it does not mean the frames of the roofs or the wells. He said: [And he raised his parents high on the throne (of knowledge)<sup>88</sup>] which means (he raised his parents) on the *sarīr* (bed)".

Ḥayyāh ibn Abū al-Ṣalt said:

"They glorified Allāh, Who is worthy of glory,

Our Lord is exalted in the heaven.

By the supreme building that preceded men,

He places the massive throne above the heaven,

So majestic that the eyes cannot see,

*Sūrah al-Baqarah*, 2: 255.

*Sūrah Yūsuf*, 12: 100.



You see with it the angels bowing.”

86. “Some of them quoted the saying of Almighty Allāh: [And (with passion) did she desire him and he would have desired her....<sup>89</sup>] (and they interpreted the verse) that the (wife of the ‘Azīz) desired to fornicate (Yūsuf) but he desired to flee from her or spank her. Almighty Allāh said: [...but that he saw the evidence of his Lord....<sup>90</sup>] (which means they doubted), can one really imagine that Yūsuf wants to flee from her or to strike her and that when he sees the sign, he stands before her?”

(Abū Muḥammad said): “In a proper language, it is incorrect to say [He sought for so and so and I doubted him], meaning that the two thoughts are not of the same nature. You are thinking of accusing him but he is thinking of honouring you; such expressions can be justified if the two thoughts are of the same nature.”

“Some (people of *kalām*) said, in reference to the saying of Almighty Allāh: [Thus Ādam disobey his Lord and allows himself to be seduced (*ghawā*)<sup>91</sup>] which expressed that Ādam suffered from indigestion out of eating the fruit from the tree. And they correlated to the sayings of Arabs, the terms – *ghawiya*, *yaghwā* and *ghawa* could be the effect of excessive drinking of milk leading to indigestion (*basham*). And similarly the terms such as: *ghawā* (seduced, misled), *yaghwī*<sup>93</sup> (astray) and *ghayan*<sup>94</sup> (destruction) are one of the forms of *basham* (*ghawiya*, *yaghwā*, *ghawan*).”

<sup>89</sup> *Sūrah Yūsuf*, 12: 24.

<sup>90</sup> *Sūrah Yūsuf*, 12: 24.

<sup>91</sup> *Sūrah Tāhā*, 20: 121.

<sup>92</sup> *Sūrah Tāhā*, 20: 121.

<sup>93</sup> Al-Qurʾān does not use *yaghwī* (as Ibn Qutaybah has stated) but *Yughwī* which means astray, see *Sūrah Hūd*, 11: 34.

<sup>94</sup> *Sūrah Maryam*, 19: 59.

. "Some of them said that (the term *dhara'nā*) found in the saying the Almighty Allāh: [Many of the jinns and men We have made *dhara'nā*) for hell....<sup>95</sup>] that is, to discard them in it. (They) related the term (*dhara'nā*) to ordinary usage – *dharat-hu al-rīḥ* (own by the wind)."

bū Muḥammad said): "It is impossible to compare *dhara'nā* with *arāt-hu al-rīḥ* because in the term *dhara'nā* (ذرائع), it is suffixed with *hamzah* (known also as) *mahmūz*. *Dharat-hu* (ذراته), on the other hand, is not suffixed with *hamzah* (known also as) *ghayr mahmūz*. It is also impossible to construct the term *adharathu* from the statement: [he was thrown off (*adharathu*) from the horse back], which means thrown off (to be similar to *dhara'nā*). This is because *dhara'at* is derived from the form *fa'alat* (فعلت), which is without *hamzah*. As for the term – '*adhrayta*' it is derived from the form *af'alat* (أفعلت). They said this can be supported by the saying of al-Mathāqqib al-'Abdī:

[She said that when I rushed on her (دراأت) I was strapped,

Is this his habit or is this mine?]

bū Muḥammad said that) this is an incorrect derivative for (al-mathāqqib) said: [When I – *dara'tu* (rushed)], he is using the term (د and not dhāl ذ)" which means I rushed or rejected."

They said that the saying of Almighty Allāh: "And remember Dhū al-Nūn, when he departed in wrath, he imagined that we had never over him"<sup>96</sup> and this referred to Dhū al-Nūn who left his people in anger but his people thought that he was protected from

*Sūrah al-A'rāf*, 7: 179.

*Sūrah al-Anbiyā'*, 21: 87.

human anger. They also said that (Dhū al-Nūn) was not angry with his people but rather with his Lord.”

(Abū Muḥammad questioned): “How could (Dhū al-Nūn) leave his people in the state of anger when they are still believers? Is this his mission or the divine order? What is the difference between him and the enemies of Allāh? He could not be angry at the conversion of faith (in Allāh) by one hundred thousand people or even more. Indeed, he is not angry with his Lord and with his people.”

(Abū Muḥammad said): “This is clearly explained in my book *Mushkil al-Qur’ān*. And I do not have the intention to discuss the letters (*hurūf*) and its similarities, in the present book. My objective in writing this book is to inform (readers) of their ignorance and impudence against Almighty Allāh. They distorted the meaning of the Book according to their interest and tuned the line of the interpretation according to their heresies.”

90. “They interpreted the saying of Almighty Allāh: [For Allāh did take Ibrāhīm for a friend<sup>97</sup>] as (Ibrāhīm) is lacking or in need of His mercy. And they used the term *khallah* (need, lack) to oppose the idea that Almighty Allāh has an intimate friend among His Own creations. They based the argument on the statement of Zuhayr:

[And if *khalīl* comes to him one day in need

He says: my wealth is neither hidden nor forbidden.]

(This statement) means that a needy person came to him. (Abū Muḥammad questioned): [What is the benefit of hurling this statement against Ibrāhīm? Don’t you know that all human beings are poor in the sight of Almighty Allāh? What is the difference among

---

<sup>97</sup> *Sūrah al-Nisā’*, 4: 125.

; statements: [Ibrāhīm is an intimate friend of Allāh] and the ment that [Mūsā is the spokesman of Allāh] and that of [ʿIsā is pirit of Allāh]?"

'They said that the saying of Almighty Allāh: [The Jews say: i's hand is tied up<sup>98</sup>] refers to the hand. This hand means the fit just as the Arabs used to say: [I am obliged to so and so for avour] that is to say, in the sense of benefit and favour. (Abū ammad said): [It is impossible to refer the term "hand" here, as fit for (al-Qur'ān says): {Be their hands tied up!<sup>99</sup>} and it adicts to what (the Jews) mean to say. (Allāh) further says: r, both hands are widely outstretched.<sup>100</sup>} Indeed, it is impossible fer the term "hand" in (the sentences like) {their hands are tied} both hands are widely outstretched} as the benefit. This is use (the concept of) 'benefit' cannot be correlated to 'hand' er 'favour' or 'kindness'. It also should not be connected to the phorical meanings of 'two hands.' Or, perhaps, in the case when refers to two kinds of 'kindness,' then one may say: {I am ful for his two hands} (which means I am grateful for his erness). However, the benefits (or bounty) of Almighty Allāh are nd measure."

## THE EXEGESIS OF THE RĀFĪDITES

Abū Muḥammad said: "I am astonished with the Rāfīdites esis of al-Qur'ān, particularly of their claim on the intrinsic ledge (*'ilm al-bāṭin*) acquired by them through magic. This

---

<sup>98</sup>*ʿurrah al-Mā'idah*, 5: 64.

<sup>99</sup>*ʿurrah al-Mā'idah*, 5: 64.

<sup>100</sup>*ʿurrah al-Mā'idah*, 5: 64.



(information) was mentioned by Hārūn ibn Sa'd al-ʿIjlī, the fori Zaydites leader, who said:

Don't you see that the Rāfiḍites are divided?

All of them said horrible things against Ja'far,

Some said that he is a leader,

Others called him the purified Prophet,

Small wonder, I do not comply with their esoteric idea!

I resort to the Most Merciful from those who are involved in esote

I resort to the Most Merciful from all Rāfiḍite,

Clairvoyant in infidelity but shortsighted in religion,

If the people of truth abstain from *bid'ah*, the Rāfiḍites adopt it,

If the people of truth accept it, the Rāfiḍites neglect it,

Even if somebody said the elephant is a lizard, they will certify it,

If somebody said a black man turns to be a fair man, they will ce  
it,

This is more disgusting than the camel's urine for,

It prefers to discharge its urine in front rather from the back

It is disgusting for those who slander (Prophet) as false,

Just as the Christians who slander ʿĪsā as false.]

Abū Muḥammad said: [This is related to an esoteric document they claimed that the leader has written it, informing them of v they need to know about his esoteric knowledge and (the informa on) events that will take place until the day of resurrection.]”

"They also quoted the saying of Almighty Allāh: [And Sulaymān : Dā'ūd's heir<sup>101</sup>] that (Sulaymān) was the leader and the Prophet his heir) inherited the knowledge from him. Likewise, they referred to the saying of the Almighty Allāh: [Indeed Allāh commands you to sacrifice a heifer<sup>102</sup>] and (the Rāfiḍites alluded this sacrifice) to 'Ā'ishah. As for the saying of Almighty Allāh: [Strike the body with a piece of the (heifer)<sup>103</sup>] (the Rāfiḍites alluded) to Jah and Zubayr. And the verse on wine and gambling,<sup>104</sup> (the ḥiḍites alluded) to Abu Bakr and 'Umar; while the verse on sorcery and evil<sup>105</sup> (the Rāfiḍites alluded) to Mu'āwiyah and 'Amr ibn al-'Āṣ. There are many strange ideas that I dislike to mention and those who read this book would detest hearing them."

"Some members among the people of *adab* used to say: [How similar is the exegesis work of the Rāfiḍites to the interpretation of a poem of the people of Makkah!] One day they said: [I never found a more incorrigible liar than Banū Tamīm!] They also claimed:

[The house of Zurārah is surrounded by its ruin,

And Mujāshi', Abū Fawāris and Nahshal]

The names mentioned above are among the members of their tribe. If anybody asked: [What is your opinion of that poem?] He replied: [The house is the house of Allāh and Zurārah is the black stone.] If anybody asked again: [And who is Mujāshi'?] He replied: [He is the well of Zamzam which is brimming with water!] He was asked again: [And who is al-Fawāris?] He replied: [He is Abū Qubays (the

---

*Sūrah al-Naml*, 27: 16.

*Sūrah al-Baqarah*, 2: 67.

*Sūrah al-Baqarah*, 2: 73.

*Sūrah al-Baqarah*, 2: 219.

*Sūrah al-Nisā'*, 4: 51.

mountain)!) Another question was asked: [And who is Nahshal?] replied: [Nahshal is the most farsighted man! Then he said: [Nahs is the lamp of the Ka'bah for he is a tall and dark man – tha Nahshal!]]”

95. “(The Rāfiḍites) were the most schismatic group and formed most sects. Among them was a group that called themselves as Bayāniyyah, which correlated with *bayān*. Somebody said: Almighty Allāh referred to him when He said: [Here is a p statement (*bayān*) to men, a guidance and an instruction to those v are pious.<sup>106</sup>] This group was the first to highlight the issue of createdness of al-Qur’ān.

“There was another group (among the Rāfiḍites) who cal themselves as al-Manṣūriyyah, the disciples of Abū Manṣūr al-K He said to his disciples: [Were they to see a piece (*kisfan*) of the falling on them;<sup>107</sup> – that verse is referring to me!] Among this gro there were several of them, renowned to be the most quarrelsom the destroyer. Al-Ghurābiyyah was another member of the Rāfiḍi They claimed that ‘Alī resembled most the Prophet SAAS more t the crow to another crow. (They also said that) Jibrīl who was sen ‘Alī had mistakenly gone to the Prophet because of their cl resemblance.”

96. Abū Muḥammad said: “Among the various sects and factions, only know the Rāfiḍites who claimed human beings as divine. ‘A Allāh ibn Saba’ claimed that ‘Alī was a divine being. ‘Alī t scorched him and his disciples with fire saying:

<sup>106</sup> *Sūrah Āli ‘Imrān*, 3: 138.

<sup>107</sup> *Sūrah al-Tūr*, 52: 44.

[When I saw the detestable act,

I lighted my stick and I called it qanbar.]

We know that the Rāfiḍites were the only group who claimed (being preferred) Prophethood. Al-Mukhtār ibn Abū 'Ubayd claimed to be a prophet and said that: [Indeed, Jibrīl and Mikā'il came to (meet) me.] Some people verified his claim and followed him and they are known as al-Kaysāniyyah."





## CHAPTER TWO

# THE PEOPLE OF *ḤADĪTH*

### *ḤADĪTH* CRITICISM

Abū Muḥammad said: "The people of *ḥadīth* will always reach for the truth from their perspectives, follow their own positions and try to be close to Almighty Allāh by the obeying the command of the Prophet, as well as seeking the traditions – *āthār*, *bār* every where – on land, sea, the east and west. Some of them traveled on foot, searching for a *ḥadīth* narration or Sunnah related by a transmitter and upon meeting the transmitter, he will record the *ḥadīth* orally from him. The people of *ḥadīth* will never ceased from examining the narration and discussing it until they comprehended it fully – its authenticity, its defect and (whether it being) abrogated or not, so that they were able to understand from the perspectives of intellect and reason. With this (dilligency), it enabled them to seek the truth when it was hidden, to compile (the *ḥadīth*) when it was scattered, to criticize the persons who refuted the Sunan, to inform the people who know not and to judge the validity of the sayings of the Prophet upon the judgments made by (narrators) should there be any discrepancies in those sayings."

"The adversaries of *ḥadīth* reproached them for examining weak and obscure *ḥadīth* under the pretext of unedited *ḥadīth*. They will never transmit the weak and obscure *ḥadīth* for they

intended to search for the truth. In fact, they compiled the reports that were disordered, authentic and defect so that they can differentiate them. Then only were they able to prove the authenticity of the reports – true (or false.) They applied the same method in verifying *al-ḥadīth al-marfū'*:<sup>1</sup> [to drink water on an empty stomach will cause coagulation] and found that the (so called) *ḥadīth* was intentionally fabricated by 'Āṣim al-Kawzī. (Similarly), the *ḥadīth* of Ibn 'Abbā which reported that he used to spit in the ink pot before writing, was found to be also intentionally fabricated by 'Āṣim al-Kawzī. Thābit said that the *ḥadīth* from al-Ḥasan which reported that the Prophet SAAS never accepted a divorce pronounced by a sick person, was found to be intentionally fabricated by Sahl al-Sarrāj." "They said that Sahl narrated that he saw al-Ḥasan performed prayer between the walls of the grave. This *ḥadīth* was found to be unintentionally fabricated for al-Ḥasan (also) narrated that the Prophet SAAS forbade anyone to perform prayer between the walls of the grave. They also said the *ḥadīth* of Anas, which reported that the Prophet SAAS said: [Man is mounted as long as he keeps his shoes on!] was found to be unintentionally fabricated by Ayyūb ibn Khawṭ."

"The *ḥadīth* of 'Amr ibn Ḥarīth (which said): [I saw the Prophet SAAS demonstrating with a spear between his hands on the day of *ʿīd* (celebration)] was found to be unintentionally fabricated by Mundhir ibn Ziyād. The *ḥadīth* of Ibn Abū Awfā (which said): [I saw the Prophet SAAS touched his beard during his prayer<sup>2</sup>] was found to be unintentionally fabricated by al-Mundhir ibn Ziyād. The *ḥadīth* which Yūnus narrated from al-Ḥasan, saying: [The Prophet SAAS forbade

<sup>1</sup> It refers to the *isnād* of a *ḥadīth* that is traceable in ascending order to the Prophet, though it might be broken somewhere.

<sup>2</sup> *Majma' al-Zawā'id*, 2:195.

nya] was found to be intentionally fabricated by Abū 'Iṣmah, the idī of Marw."

"They claimed that some of the *aḥādīth* memorized by the *issas* were baseless, for examples: [One of the happiness of a man to keep his beard]; [give them the names which they really like or re them the *kunya* which they love most]; [the best trade is cloth ding and the best work is pottery<sup>3</sup>]; [if a beggar is a trustworthy in and whoever does not respect him will be unsuccessful<sup>4</sup>]; [all n are contented except the weaver and the barber]. These types of (called) *aḥādīth* were numerous and uncountable. And although y were transmitted, ultimately they were found to be fabricated."

3. "Ibn al-Mubārak said that the *aḥādīth* narrated by Ubayy ibn 'b: [whoever recites such *sūrah* deserves this or that] and hoever recites a certain *sūrah* deserves certain things] - I think se (*aḥādīth*) are the fabricated works of the atheists! Likewise, re are (numerous) and horrid *aḥādīth* attributed to them. Some mples are: [the sweating of the horse]; [the hairy chest]; [the den cage] and [visits of the angels]. All of them were entionally fabricated, for they did not have a system and the rators. And we have no doubt that these works were fabricated by atheists."

Abū Muḥammad said: "Indeed, there are authentic *aḥādīth* h as: [the heart of the believer is between the fingers of the hand he Merciful One<sup>5</sup>]; [Almighty Allāh created Ādam in His image<sup>6</sup>]; : two hands are of His right hand]; [Allāh carried the earth with

*Kashf al-Khafā*, 1:467.

*Kashf al-Khafā*, 1:161.

*Tahdhīb Tārikh*, 6:65.

*Al-Musnad*, 3:193 (No. 8177); *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 6:129 (No. 15129).



His finger and created things out of His finger<sup>7</sup>]; [do not insult the wind for it is from the breath of the Merciful One<sup>8</sup>]; [the thickness of the infidel's skin in the hell fire is (the distance of) forty forearms of the Omnipotent One<sup>9</sup>].”

102. Abū Muḥammad said: “Those *aḥādīth* have their sources as we will explain in this book, according to its topic, if it pleases Allāh. Indeed, it is possible for a man to forget a *ḥadīth* that he has transmitted in the past. Even if somebody reminds and mentions it to him, he might not be able to recall it. However, when he is informed that he is the first transmitter of the *ḥadīth* he will be able to confirm the source of the transmission of the *ḥadīth* as if it comes from himself or as if the source comes from the person who informed him. The reason for this (test) is for the purpose of assuring the conservation of the good *ḥadīth* and out of respect for the Sunnah.”

“This method is applied in the transmission of *ḥadīth* by Rabī‘ah ibn Abū ‘Abd al-Raḥmān, who narrated from Suhayl ibn Abū Ṣāliḥ who narrated from his father. The latter then narrated it from Abū Hurayrah who declared that the Prophet while (giving the judgement over a case) requires the (suspect) to answer despite the presence of witnesses.<sup>10</sup> Then, Rabī‘ah readdressed the *ḥadīth* to Suhayl, but the latter could not remember it. Later on Suhayl transmitted it again with the same *isnād* – Suhayl narrated from Rabī‘ah, his father and Abū Hurayrah. The same method is also applied in the transmissio

<sup>7</sup> *Mishkāt al-Maṣābiḥ*, 3:54 (No. 5524).

<sup>8</sup> *Al-Mustadrak*, 2:272.

<sup>9</sup> *Al-Musnad*, 3:231 (No. 8418); *Al-Targhib*, 4:483.

<sup>10</sup> *Majma‘ al-Zawā‘id*, 4:261 (No. 7047), 4:262 (No. 7048, 7049, 7057); *‘Aridat al-Aḥwadhī*, 6:73 (No. 1344); *Al-Tamhīd*, 2:134-139, 2:141-151.

ḥadīth by Wakī' and Abū Mu'āwiyah who narrated from Ibn Layyah, as in the following two ḥadīth."

13. "One of them is narrated from Ibn Abū Najīḥ who then narrated it from Mujāhid saying that Muḥammad ibn Hārūn had narrated it from Ibrāhīm ibn Bashshār, Ibn 'Ulayyah, Abū Mu'āwiyah, Ibn Abū Najīḥ and Mujāhid who referred to the saying of Almighty Allāh: [On the day when the firmament will be in dreadful commotion.<sup>11</sup>] (Mujāhid) said that the terms *tadūr* and *ḥawran* signified a similar meaning that is to rotate, revolve or set in motion."

The second ḥadīth is transmitted by 'Amr and from 'Ikrimah who referred to the saying of Almighty Allāh: [from their strongholds (defense)<sup>12</sup>] and ('Ikrimah) said that it referred to the fortress (*al-ṣūn*). Interestingly, Ibn 'Ulayyah was then asked about the two ḥadīth but he could not remember them. Later on, Ibn 'Ulayyah transmitted the ḥadīth again, using the above chain of narrators."

Another example (of verifying the validity of the ḥadīth) is that, Ibn Layyah narrated a ḥadīth from Ibn 'Uyaynah who then narrated from 'Amr ibn Dīnār and the latter from 'Umar ibn 'Abd al-'Azīz who considered the divorce pronounced under aversion as null and void. Then Ibn 'Uyaynah was asked by Ibn 'Ulayyah on the above ḥadīth but he could not remember it. Subsequently, Ibn 'Uyaynah transmitted the ḥadīth again, using the above chain of narrators."

14. Abū Muḥammad said that Mu'tamir ibn Sulaymān said that he has narrated from Munqidh and the latter narrated from Ayyūb ibn al-Ḥasan, who said: '*Waiḥa*' brings the meaning of the word of

*Sūrah al-Tūr*, 52: 9.

*Sūrah al-Aḥzāb*, 33:26.

mercy! In addition to that, they used to refer to the weak mo (*turuq*)<sup>13</sup> such as the *ḥadīth* narrated by 'Amr ibn Sa'īd, who th narrated it from his father and the latter from his grandfather. Th chain of narrators was taken from a book. (Due to this reason als Mughīrah paid no attention to a *ḥadīth* transmitted by Sālim ibn Al al-Ja'd or Khilās or (any *ḥadīth* taken from) the compilation of 'Al Allāh ibn 'Amr. Mughīrah also said: ['Abd Allāh ibn 'Amr has book, known as *al-Ṣādiqah* (the truthful). I would not like to have even for two cents!] He added: [A *ḥadīth* of 'Alī which w transmitted by the companions of 'Abd Allāh ibn Mas'ūd was mo authentic than a *ḥadīth* transmitted by the companions of 'A himself.] Shu'bah said: [I would prefer to fornicate various tim than to narrate a *ḥadīth* from Abān ibn Abū 'Iyāsh.]”

105. “The adversaries of the people of *ḥadīth* accused (t *muḥaddithūn*)<sup>14</sup> of not knowing what they had transmitted and (at t same time) committed many grammatical mistakes. The mass would not have the ability to know the merits (of the *ḥadīth*). Aft all everybody is subject to error or defect! So, what difference does make to them if al-Zuhrī, the most knowledgeable person in all kin of knowledge, is to be referred to them? And not to mention names the *mutqinūn* (God fearing) like: Ḥammād ibn Salamah, Mālik il Anas, Ibn 'awn, Ayyūb, Yūnus ibn 'Ubayd, Sulaymān al-Tayn Sufyān al-Thawrī, Yaḥyā ibn Sa'īd, Ibn Jurayj, Awzā'ī, Shu'ba 'Abd Allāh ibn al-Mubārak and others, (they take no notice them).”

<sup>13</sup> Throughout this book, Ibn Qutaybah used the term *turuq* to refer to *isn* (chain of narrators).

<sup>14</sup> Plural form of *muḥaddith* - a person who excel in *ḥadīth* and areas related it.

Nevertheless the scholars in a specific field of knowledge could not be blamed for making mistakes in another field. As such, a *ḥaddīth* should not be penalized for committing errors in *i'rāb* (extension in grammar), nor the jurists be censured for making mistakes in poetry. Hence, it is incumbent on all scholars of all kinds of knowledge, to excel in the area of their specialization. If the masses need their (opinions) they should be able to enlighten them. Indeed, a man can acquire several kinds of knowledge as much as he needs, for Allāh will grant the favour to whom He wants."

"It is said that Abū Ḥanīfah, the famous man of his time in legal decisions and inclines to dialectical assumptions, is asked: What is your opinion on a man who took a stone, flung it straight to the head of another man and killed him? Will you consider this case murder? He replied: [No! Even if he hit him with Abū Qubays (son of Qubays)!]"

Abū al-Marʿī said to his audience: [Allāh decrees your needs in the best form which benefited you most.] And Qāsim al-Tammār saw a group of (onlookers) laughing at a statement made by Bishr, said that (Bishr's) statement was similar to what the poet has said:

[Indeed Salmā may Allāh protect her,

Stingy of something so that others will not take away from her.]"

Bishr was the leader of the people of *ra'y* while Qāsim al-Tammār an eminent disciple of the people of *kalām*. However, the statement of Qāsim, which was in favour of Bishr, was more convincing than the grammatical mistakes committed by Bishr."



“Bilāl said to Shabīb ibn Shaybah, who was seeking justice for ‘A al-A‘lā ibn ‘Abd Allāh ibn ‘Āmir: [Bring him to me!] Shabīb replied [I have called him but he refused.] Then Bilāl said: [the mistake could be attributed to everything (*kull*).<sup>15</sup>]

107. (Abū Muḥammad said): “I do not know anybody among people of knowledge and the people of *adab*, who does not make mistakes in their disciplines, like: al-Aṣma‘ī, Abū Zayd, A ‘Ubaydah, Sībawayh, al-Akhfash, al-Kisā‘ī, al-Farrā’ Abū ‘Amr Shaybānī and the likes. They were prominent (scholars) in Qur’ān recitation and exegesis. In fact, during the *Jāhiliyyah* era and with the advance of Islam, people still referred to the poets despite many mistakes in their meaning and grammar. (Those mistakes) were committed by the poets and they were prominent in language and (notwithstanding that) their poems were used to furnish (philological) arguments.”

## II. THE MISUSE OF ḤADĪTH BY THE PEOPLE OF ḤADĪTH

108. “The people of *ḥadīth* were also subject to errors as other people. This, however, does not hinder us from criticizing them, in our book. It is related to those who prevented others from occupying themselves in understanding of they have written for (the purpose of) deepening their knowledge (of *aḥadīth*), which they have compiled and searched for the *ḥadīth* on [the necessity of searching for knowledge....] in ten or twenty modes (of transmission). Indeed, it is inadequate to search for one and two authentic modes, particularly for anyone who considers that knowledge is the means to get closer

<sup>15</sup> The editor of *Ta'wīl Mukhtalif al-ḥadīth* noted that the usage of the term (every, all) does not tally with the former statement.



nightly Allāh. In fact, (searching for more than ten or twenty des of transmission) is an exhaustive job for the seeker and it does benefit the successor. People of this kind, to our mind, are wasting their time. They should occupy themselves with activities, which are more beneficial to them."

3. "Some people nicknamed (the *muḥaddithūn*) *al-Ḥashwiyyah*, *Nābitah*, *al-Mujbirah* or *al-Jabariyyah*. The other group called them *al-Ghuthā'* (scum) and *al-Ghuthar* (residue). All these nicknames, however, do not appear in any tradition as reported from the Prophet. Likewise, (nickname) that attributed to the Qadarites, is not narrated from him. It is said that the Qadarites are the enemies of this *ummah*, if they fall sick, do not visit them and if they do not participate in their funeral rite.<sup>16</sup>"

describing the Rāfiḍites there was a *ḥadīth* reported by Maymūn Mihrān and the latter from Ibn 'Abbās saying: [I heard the Prophet said that there will be a time, a group of people will exist and be known as *al-rāfiḍah*. They reject Islām; kill them because they are polytheists!<sup>17</sup>]"

to describe the Murji'ites, there was a *ḥadīth* which said: [There are three categories of people in my *ummah* who have no right to my *shā'ah* (intercession), and they are cursed by seventy Prophets. These are *al-Murji'ah* and *al-Qadariyyah*.<sup>18</sup>] As for the Khawārij, there was a *ḥadīth* which said: [They deviated from the true religion

---

*Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 4:222 (No. 4692); *Al-Musnad*, 2:389 (No. 5588); *Majma' al-Zawā'id* 7:301 (No. 11890); *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 1:118 (No. 554, 555), 1:137 (No. 647).

*Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, 12:243 (No. 12997); *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 1:223 (No. 1128)

*Majma' al-Zawā'id*, 7:301 (No. 11886-11888); *Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, 8:281 (No. 8079); *Al-Targhib*, 3:185; *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 1:118 (No. 559).

just as the arrow deviated from the target and they are the dogs c people of the hell.<sup>19]</sup>

110. “These names were not referred to by the Prophet SAA were invented by people. The anger led some people to say tha Jabarites were similar to the Qadarites. However, if this name ap to them, then the name, Jabarites was meaningless. If it was all for the Qadarites (to do so) then it was allowed for others like Rāfiḍites, the Khārijites and the Murji’ites to do so. And eac these sects will call the people of *ḥadīth* by a similar name just a Qadarites has done. In fact, those names should not be used in way one fancies it to be. It should be applied in its proper pos and perspective. Likewise, it is impossible to say that a shoe col is similar to a shoemaker or a carpenter is similar to a blacksr The *fiṭrah* (instinct) is the innate nature of man<sup>20</sup> but through *n* (assumption), it will refute this innate nature.”

111. “As for (the explanation of) *fiṭrah* – if a man enters a asking for a Qadarite or a Murji’ite of the city, anyone can show a small child and the elderly, young and old woman, the layman the elite, the man of the street and even the criminal. If he asks to the people of Sunnah they will show him the people of *ḥadīth*. group of people comprising the Qadarite, Sunnite, Rāfiḍite, Murji Khārijite pass by and somebody insults a Qadarite, this insult will be hurled against the people of *ḥadīth* by the masses. Nobody c deny or reject this idea.”

<sup>19</sup> ‘*Umdat al-Qārī*, 11:354 (No. 3611), 13:594 (No. 5047), 16:207-8 6930); *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 4:244 (No. 4767); *Al-Mu’jam al-Kabīr*, 1: (No. 13349).

<sup>20</sup> *Sūrah al-Rūm*, 30:30.

2. "As for the explanation of *nazar*, it is the Qadarites who allied the limit (*qadar*) to themselves but others resort it to the mighty Allāh. And a man who claims himself to be part of a thing better off than something said to be connected to him. This means that something is made for him and not he who made it himself."

The *ḥadīth* as mentioned earlier refers to the (actual meaning of) Magians of the *ummaḥ*. They resemble the Magians for they confessed dualism, which is affirmed in the saying of Allāh: [Take for (worship) two Gods for He is just One Allāh.<sup>21</sup>] The Qadarites said: [We do things which Allāh does not want (us to do) and we are forced to do whatever He does not want to do.]"

3. "Someone told me that a disciple of the people of *kalām* asked a man of *ahl al-dhimmaḥ*.<sup>22</sup> [O man! Don't you want to accept Islam?] He replied: [As long as Almighty Allāh wants it (to be Islam)] The man said to him again: [Indeed, Allāh wants it but Iblīs does not want to call you that!] He replied: [In that case, I remain the strongest one!]"

"Ishāq Ibn Ibrāhīm ibn Ḥabīb al-Shahīd reported that Quraysh ibn Anas heard that 'Amr ibn 'Ubayd said: [On the day of reckoning, I will be standing face to face with Allāh Who will ask me: {Why did you say that the murderer is destined to hell?} And I will answer: {It is You, Who said it!} and then I will recite the verse: When a man kills a believer intentionally, his recompensation is hell, to abide therein, forever.<sup>23</sup>] Quraysh ibn Anas said to someone: [I am the youngest in the assembly – do you think that He could answer if

---

*Sūrah al-Naḥl*, 16:51.

This refers to non-Muslims living in Muslim country.

*Sūrah al-Nisā*, 4:93.

you say: [Indeed, Allāh forgives not (the sin of) joining other (with Him but He forgives whom He pleases other sins than this and (from the verse) how could you know that I refuse to forgive murderer?) 'Amr ibn 'Ubayd replied: [I am unable to do anything!]]”

115. Abū al-Khaṭṭāb narrated from Dāwūd ibn al-Mufaḍḍal Muḥammad ibn Sulaymān narrated from al-Aṣbāgh ibn Jāmi' and the latter from his father, saying: “I was performing the ḥajj (circumambulation) with 'Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭāb at the Ka'bah when he reached al-Multazam, which is situated between the Ka'bah and the blackstone, ('Umar) put his stomach to the wall and say Allāh! Forgive me of what You have decreed for me and do forgive me of what you do not decree for me.]”

116. Sahl ibn Muḥammad narrated from al-Aṣma'ī and the latter from Mu'ādh ibn Mu'ādh who informed that Al-Faḍl al-Riqā' heard a man saying: “O Allāh! Set me to be a Muslim!” (Al-Riqā' said: “it is not possible”, and the man said: “Our Lord make our Muslims, bowing to Your (will) and our progeny a people, Muslim bowing to Your (will).”)<sup>24</sup>

117. Sahl narrated from al-Aṣma'ī that Abū Ma'shar al-Madanī said that according to Muḥammad ibn Ka'b al-Quraẓī: “Man is too insignificant to be disposed to the kingdom of Almighty Allāh and to other things which He does not want to exist.”

118. Sahl narrated from al-Aṣma'ī that Abū 'Amr said: “I testify that Allāh leads astray whom He wants, and leads to the right path whom He wants and to Allāh Alone is the final decision and whose

<sup>24</sup> *Sūrah al-Nisā'*, 4: 116.

<sup>25</sup> *Sūrah al-Baqarah*, 2: 128.

[Come and argue with me!] I will reply: [You can do without

Abū al-Khaṭṭāb has narrated from Abū Dāwūd and the latter al-Ḥasan ibn Abū al-Ḥasan, saying that (Abū al-Ḥasan) heard al-ʿAjāj who was with Wāsiṭ, who while giving the sermon said: "O! Show me the right path to follow, show me the error for me to (and) do not hide from me the right path, so that I will not be stray." Abū Muḥammad said that (the event) was related to the of the Almighty Allāh: [And We should certainly have caused confusion in a matter which they have already covered with confusion.<sup>26</sup>"]

ʿAmr ibn ʿAwn al-Qaysī, one of the *bakkāʾīn* (those who recently weep until he loss their sight) heard the saying of Saʿīd ibn ʿArūbah: "I do not know of any verse in al-Qurʾān most forceful e than the word of Mūsā: [...this is no more than Your trial, by it cause whom You will to stray and You lead whom You will into ight path....<sup>27</sup>] and (Abū Muḥammad) said to him: [Is al-Qurʾān eful on you? By Allāh! I will never speak to you forever and I do peak to him until he died.]"

Ishāq ibn Ibrāhīm al-Shahīdī narrated from Yaḥyā ibn ʿAyyūb al-Ṭawīl and the latter from ʿAmr ibn al-Naḍr saying: "I walking side by side with ʿAmr ibn ʿUbayd. Then, I sat beside and he told me something. I replied: [That is not the way our panions said it.] He asked: [And who are your companions?] I ed: [Ayyūb, Ibn ʿAwn, Yūnus and al-Taymī.] He said: [Those are the filthiest among the filthy people and they are lifeless.]

*Sūrah al-Anʿām*, 6: 9.

*Sūrah al-Aʿrāf*, 7: 155.



Abū Muḥammad said: [Those four names mentioned earlier were prominent men of their time, particularly in knowledge, *fiqh* and they struggled (to perform) the *'ibādah* and (they ensured) the cleanliness of food. They followed closely the ways of the people of the past (especially) from the companions of the Prophet and their successors. (Can this) certify that those four names (as mentioned earlier) were the filthiest among the filthy people?"]

"Some people claimed that those who followed closely the ways of the companions and their successors did not profess the same doctrine as the companions and the successors. They also claim that (the companions) accepted the same ideas as (held by the people of *kalām*) on predestination. We said to them: [Why do you adhere (the group) of al-Ḥasan, 'Amr ibn 'Ubayd and Ghaylān? And why do you not adhere to (the group) of 'Alī, Ibn Mas'ūd, Abū 'Ubayda Mu'adh, Sa'id ibn al-Musayyab and the likes. Indeed, these people are better models and more credible in giving evidence for arguments as compared to Qatādah, al-Ḥasan and Ibn 'Arūbah?]"

122. "As for their saying that they recorded the *ḥadīth* from the people with whom they disputed such as Qatādah, Ibn Abu Najīh and Ibn Abū Dhi'b, they prevented others from recording (the *ḥadīth* in book) as has been done by 'Amr ibn 'Ubayd, 'Amr ibn Fā'id, Ma'bad al-Juhānī. Indeed, they recorded the *ḥadīth*, which they narrated from knowledgeable persons, authority and trustworthy individuals in the *ḥadīth* narration. It is inevitable for those who are in position, to record the traditions from the (trustworthy narrators) and to practice those traditions or else (people) will rely on passion. Equally, it is the same principal that when a just and trustworthy person accepts other's testimony, it is not for his own favour, his son or his father.

also not for other fringe benefits or even to prevent him from difficulties. It is forbidden to accept the words of a sincere person if his word agrees with his sectarian opinion or conforms to his passion if he is convinced of the truth in his creed. And to get closer to the mighty Allāh, he has to be certain of his conviction at all cost and therefore, will not believe any grammatical mistakes, any addition and any omission in it.”

3. “They said that each group of various doctrines always claimed that the truth is found in their doctrines while their adversaries are in error, led astray by their passion and so also are the people of *ḥadīth* (deviated by passion). How do they know that they are absolutely on the right path? One could reply to that question by saying that the supporters of various doctrines, when they are in agreement with other groups, will always agree on one point. (It means) whomever hold fast to the Book of Almighty Allāh and the Sunnah of the Prophet, that person will be enlightened by the divine light and guided to the truth.”

He (above explanation) will never benefit the people of *ḥadīth* except in using abusive language for they will never discuss religious matters from other (perspectives like) *istiḥsān* (discretion), analogy, *qiyās*, books of the eminent philosophers or the latest (opinions) of the people of *kalām*.”

4. “It is said people accused the (people of *ḥadīth*) for committing mistakes through transmitting false and contradicting *ḥadīth*. Indeed, they are (to be blamed) for drawing others' attention to lies, errors and weak *ḥadīth*. And we have informed you earlier, about this (matter). As for the contradiction, we will give you the

explanation; its way out and its latest apprise incapacitate you reasoning. And let's rely on Allāh for He is the best support."

## CHAPTER THREE

### ALLEGATION OF *AḤĀDĪTH* SAID TO CONTRADICT AL-QUR'ĀN; *AḤĀDĪTH* INVALIDATED BY *NAẒAR*, *HUJJAH AL-* *IQL* (REASON), *'IYĀN* (EXPERIENCE), *KHABAR*, *IJMĀ'* (CONSENSUS) AND *QIYĀS* (ANALOGY)

#### EXAMPLE OF *ḤADĪTH* SAID TO CONTRADICT AL- R'ĀN

They said: "You have narrated that Almighty Allāh slid His hand behind Ādam's back and brought out of it his descendants and (next) progeny until the Day of Judgment, and they were asked to testify: [Am I not your Lord? They replied: {Yes indeed!}]<sup>1</sup> This statement is in contradiction with the saying of Almighty Allāh: When Your Lord drew forth from the children of Ādam from their backs, their descendants and made them testify concerning themselves saying: {Am I not Your Lord (who cherishes and sustains you)?} They said: {Yes, indeed, we do testify...}<sup>2</sup>. The (above) *ḥadīth* claims that the descendants of Ādam were drawn from his back,

---

*Sūrah al-A'rāf*, 7: 172; *Sunan al-Tirmidhī*, 5: 111 (No. 3075); *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 4: 222 (No. 4693); *Al-Musnad*, 1:102 (No. 311); *Al-Mustadrak*, 1:27 and 2:544; *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 1:113 (No. 529).  
*Sūrah al-A'rāf*, 7: 172.

while al-Qur'ān informs us that Ādam's progeny were drawn from his descendants."

126. Abū Muḥammad said: "It is not as they imagined it to be. The two texts in fact, complement each other. Praise be to Allāh. Both texts are correct. Al-Qur'ān provides the general information and the *ḥadīth* explains it further or even summarizes it by giving evidence from the Sunnah (of the Prophet SAAS).<sup>3</sup> Don't you see that when Almighty Allāh slides His hand on the back of Ādam as the *ḥadīth* says, He (actually) draws out of him his descendants and (the next) progeny until the Day of Judgment. It means that the descendants comprise the sons, their sons and their progeny until the Day of Judgment. If He were to place all of them together and ask them to testify to (the Oneness of Allāh) themselves, (it is nothing new for) He has asked all the descendants of Ādam to testify to themselves."

126a. "As for the saying of Almighty Allāh in His Book: [It is We who created you and give you shape; then We bade the angels to bow down to Ādam and they bowed down....<sup>4</sup>] (One has to observe the arrangement of the verse) in His saying to the angels: [bow down to Ādam] (is placed) after (the terms) [We Who created them] and [We Who shaped them].<sup>5</sup> By (arranging) the terms [We Who created] and followed by the terms [We Who shaped you], it means that Almighty

<sup>3</sup> Refer to Lecomte – no. 126, page 100, line 2 and 3 from the top of the page. He translated as – "Al-Qur'ān provides the (information of the) development which the *ḥadīth* is silence and even summarizes the stages of the development of Sunnah." This part of translation is incorrect for It Qutaybah says something else. Refer to no. 126 of this text.

<sup>4</sup> *Sūrah al-A'rāf*, 7: 11.

<sup>5</sup> Refer to Lecomte, no. 126a, page 100, line 14 from the top of the page. It does not provide the translation to sentences after the citation of the Qur'ān verse – {and (the arrangement of the verse in) His saying to the angels: [bow down to Ādam] (is placed) after (the terms) [We created them] and [We shaped them.]} See no. 126a of this text.



ih intends to (inform us that upon the completion of the process Ādam's creation (and not before it) the angels were summoned to / to Ādam. And this is perfectly acceptable, for when He created um He created all of us from his *ṣulb* (backbone, loin). Then He vens us as He wishes. When He created Ādam He therefore, sted us (also) since we come from him."

b. "Another example is that, a man who received something n you say, two sheep – a male and a female. And you say to him: [giving you many sheep.] Here, you mean to say that by giving man the two sheep, a female and male, you will also be giving more (sheep, which will be born later.)"

c. "'Umar ibn 'Abd al-'Azīz has given one thousand dirhams to ayyn, a poem composer. With that money Dukayn bought a few els and with the blessing of Almighty Allāh, the number of the els increased as time passed by. Then Dukayn said: [This grant om 'Umar ibn 'Abd al-'Azīz.] Here, it does mean that 'Umar has n the whole herd of camels. What he has given were the two els – male and female. (Dukayn) however, attributed all (of his els) to 'Umar for they were the product of what ('Umar) has n to him."

d. "Another example is seen in the expression of al-'Abbās ibn d al-Muṭṭalib about the Prophet:

[Before it, you are blessed in the shadow and resided

In a safe place where the leaves are sewn together.]

e, he means to say that (the Prophet) is blessed in the shade of dise. And he resides in the safe place in paradise. As for the es sewn together, it refers to the leaves from paradise of which

Ādam and Ḥawā' sewed together, to cover themselves. The statement, therefore, explains that during that time the Prophet blessed in the loin of Ādam. Al-'Abbās continued to say:

[Then you came down to the earth, not as a man;

You are neither flesh nor blood.]

The expression means that Ādam came down to the earth and so al did the Prophet who came down (but) in Ādam's loins. As such (that state) he is not a man is neither flesh nor blood. He continued:

[Then you became the sperm that climbed aboard the ship;

When the Nasr<sup>6</sup> and his followers were drowned.]

The sentence says that (at that time) the Prophet was in the stage sperm in the loins of Nūḥ when he went aboard the ship. He continued, saying:

[Then you were passed from the loins to the womb;

When the world revolved, the new generation appeared.]

This poem means to say that the Prophet was passed from loins and wombs. The poet further explains (the various stages of) the Prophet blessed, then descended to the earth and went aboard the ship before he was finally created. This is a simple allusion that the people of the past who virtually carried the Prophet in their loins."

<sup>6</sup> Nasr is the name given to one of the idols of the People of Nūḥ.

## 1. EXAMPLE OF TWO CONTRADICTORY *HADĪTH*

27. They said: “You have reported that the Prophet said: [Do not face towards the *Qiblah* while you are defecating or urinating.<sup>7</sup>] They so reported a (*ḥadīth*) which was narrated by ‘Īsā ibn Yūnus, who then narrated from Abū ‘Uwānah, and the latter from Khālid al-adhdhā’, who then narrated from ‘Irāk ibn Mālik and the latter from ‘Īshah, saying that the Prophet was informed of a group of people who loath to face themselves towards the *Qiblah* while they were defecating or urinating and the Prophet asked someone to bring him a bucket and he faced towards the *Qiblah*. They said that there were contradictions (between the two reports).”

28. Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that one of the *ḥadīth* has been abrogated. This is because it deals with ordain and prohibition. Why don’t they think that one of the two *ḥadīth* is abrogated while the other is the abrogator? It is as if the true meaning has escaped from them! However, for us this issue is not (related) to abrogated text or the abrogator, but each of (the text) has its own condition that we can apply. As for the condition that makes it possible for a person to face towards *Qiblah* while defecating or urinating is, when he is at the desert or in vast empty lands. In fact, during a stopover of a journey to perform their prayer, some of (the companions of the prophet) faced towards the *Qiblah* while defecating and urinating.

---

‘Alī ibn ‘Umar al-Dāraqutnī (d. 385 AH), *Sunan Dāraqutnī*, commented by Abū Al-Tayyib Muḥammad Abadī, (Bayrūt: ‘Alam al-Kutub, 1986), 1:60, hereafter cited as *Sunan Dāraqutnī*, *Al-Sunan al-Kubrā*, 1:47; *Al-Mu’jam al-Kabīr*, 4:137 (No. 39170), 4:138 (No. 3921), 4:141 (No. 3931, 3932, 3933, 3934), 4:142 (No. 3935, 3936, 3937, 3938, 3939); *Al-Mustadrak*, 2: 412; Abū ‘Awānah Ya‘qūb b. Ishāq al-Isfarāyīnī(d. 316AH), *Musnad Abū ‘Awānah*, (Bayrūt: Dār al-Ma‘rifah, nd.), 1: 199, hereafter cited as *Musnad Abū ‘Awānah*.

(The Prophet) then, forbade them to do so<sup>8</sup> out of respect for the *Qiblah* and to avoid impurities that may affect the validity of their prayers.”

“However, some people assume that this rule (of facing towards the *Qiblah* while urinating and defecating) is applicable to them (as well when they are at their house with attached bathrooms. So, the Prophet took his own bucket and faced himself towards the *Qiblah*. The reason for this action is that he wants to demonstrate that this action (of facing towards the *Qiblah* while urinating and defecating) is not a reprehensible act done in their houses with attached bathrooms or wells dug deep in the ground to accumulate human excrement and which is also not a suitable place to perform prayer.”

### III. EXAMPLE OF TWO CONTRADICTORY ḤADĪTH

129. They said: “You have reported that Wakī‘ narrated from al-A‘mash, who then narrated from Abū Ṣāliḥ and the latter from Ab Hurayrah informing that the Prophet SAAS said: [When the lace of one of the slipper breaks, do not walk with one slipper only.<sup>9</sup>] You also said that Mindal narrated from Layth, who also narrated from ‘Abd al-Raḥmān ibn Qāsim and the latter from his father, who heard ‘Ā’ishah said: [When the lace of one of the Prophet’s slippers, he walked with one slipper only while waiting for the other one to be mended.] Thus, there is a contradiction (between the two ḥadīth).”

<sup>8</sup> *Al-Musnad*, 9:177 (No. 23764); *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, 7:511 (No. 27202).

<sup>9</sup> *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 4:70 (No. 4137); *Al-Musnad*, 3: 410 (No. 9488), 3:44 (No. 9721), 3: 623 (No. 10840), 3:524 (No. 10225), 3:518 (No. 10192); *A Muṣannaf*, 11: 166 (No. 20216); *Al-Mu‘jam al-Kabīr*, 7:280 (No. 7137); *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, 15: 409 (No. 41601).

Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that there is no tradition here. Praised be to Almighty Allāh! It could happen to man, and when the lace of his slippers has broken, he can hold it in his hand and walk with one slipper searching for another piece of it. This behavior is, however, (with the exception of the broken slipper) indecent particularly related to shoes, slippers or any apparel which are in pairs; wearing one piece and leaving the other one hanging by itself). Likewise, it is indecent if one puts it on a cloth putting on one side of the shoulder and leaving the other side hanging by its side. As for the case of a broken lace, the owner may walk for one, two or three steps to mend it. This action is neither a reprehensible act nor an indecent one. The judgment of an action is different, pending on the action done in a single or numerous actions."

a. "Don't you see that it is possible for a man to take a step or steps or several steps so as to occupy a space in his left or right in the state of bowing while praying? However, it is impossible for him, in the state of bowing, to walk a distance of one hundred or hundred arm's length.<sup>10</sup> It is also allowable for him (while he is praying) to put on again his coat on his shoulder if it slips off, it is not allowable to roll cloth or to do other actions, which require a long period of time. Smiling does not invalidate the prayer and a loud burst of laughter does."

---

The term *dhirā'* refers to forearm or arm. In Egypt: *dhirā' baladī* = 0.58m; *dhirā' hindūzāh* = 0.656m and in Iraq: *dhirā' ḥalabī* = 0.68m, *dhirā' baladī* = 0.80. See Hans Wehr, *A Dictionary of Modern Written Arabic*, 1994, Otto Harrassowitz: Wiesbaden, 356.



#### IV. EXAMPLE OF TWO CONTRADICTORY ḤADĪTH

131. They said: "You have narrated from 'Ā'ishah who said: [The Prophet never urinates while standing.] In other narration, Ḥudhayf said: [The Prophet urinates while standing.] Thus, there contradiction (between the two reports.)"

132. Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that there is contradiction in it. Praised be to Almighty Allāh. He never urin while standing in his house where 'Ā'ishah also resides in, but used to urinate while standing in uncomfortable places that muddy, murky and filthy. As for the report made by Ḥudhayfah that the Prophet urinated while standing, the Prophet made it at garbage area that prevented him from squatting or deriving comfort from it. Thus, judgment on an emergency action is different from action out of free choice."

132a. Abū Muḥammad said that Muḥammad ibn Ziyād al-Ziyā narrated from 'Īsā ibn Yūnus, informing that he narrated from A'mash, who then narrated from Abū Wā'il and the later from Ḥudhayfah who said: [I saw the Prophet SAAS going to the garbage area and he urinated while standing. I moved away but the Prophet detained me, saying: {Come close to me and I went to him until I found myself standing behind him. He then, took his ablution and rubbed his shoes.}] The term *al-subāṭah* (garbage area) synonymous with *al-mazbalah*, *al-kusāḥah* and *al-qumāmah*."

## EXAMPLE OF ḤADĪTH THAT CONTRADICTS THE BOOK OF ALMIGHTY ALLĀH

They said: "You have reported that Sufyān ibn 'Uyaynah has related from al-Zuhrī who then narrated from 'Ubayd Allāh ibn 'Ubayd Allāh ibn 'Utbah who also narrated from Abū Hurayrah and the rest from Zayd ibn Khālid and Shibl that a man went to the Prophet and said to him: [O Messenger of Allāh! We request you, by Allāh, to make a decision between us, which should be in conformity with the Book of the Almighty Allāh.] Then (Shibl's) opponent, who was more knowledgeable in *fiqh* than him, stood up and said: [He is right, let our business be in conformity with the Book of Allāh and allow him to speak.] The Prophet then allowed him to speak and he said: Your son is a laborer and he has fornicated with (another man's) wife, I have paid the fine of one hundred sheep and a servant. Then, I asked the knowledgeable people and they told me that my son is to be whipped for one hundred lashes and to be exiled for a year. As for his wife, she is to be stoned.] The Prophet SAAS said: [By the One who holds my soul in His hand; I will judge your case in conformity with the Book of Allāh – one hundred sheep and the servant will be returned back to you. Your son will be whipped one hundred lashes and be exiled for a year and the wife will be stoned. Go! O! Unays to the wife of the man, if she confesses, stone her!<sup>11</sup> The man immediately goes to see her and she confesses and is stoned.]"

---

<sup>11</sup> *Umdat al-Qārī*, 16:490 (No. 7260), 9:622 (No. 2725 and 2724); *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 4:153 (No. 4445); *Sunan Ibn Mājah* 2:852 (No. 2549); *Al-Musnad*, 6:60 (No. 17035), 6:61 (No. 17039); *Sunan Al-Dārimī*, 2:177; *Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, 5:234 (No. 5189), 5:238 (No. 5199); *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 5:334 (No. 13102), 5:425 (No. 13503).

Abū Muḥammad said: "This was what was reported to me Muḥammad ibn 'Ubayd who narrated it from 'Uyaynah. He reported that this *ḥadīth* also contradicted the Book of Almighty Allāh for he asked the Prophet to pronounce the judgment for the based on the Book of Allāh. And the Prophet (adjudicated) saying: [By the One who holds my soul in His hand, I will judge your case in conformity with the Book of Allāh.] Then, he ordered stoning and the exile. Indeed, stoning and exile (as they claimed) is not stipulated in the Book of Almighty Allāh. And the status of the cited *ḥadīth* is uncertain, it could be true or false."

(Abū Muḥammad said :) "Indeed, stoning and exile are informed in the Book of Almighty Allāh."

(Abū Muḥammad said:) "We affirm that the Prophet does not reject al-Qur'ān as in his saying: [I will judge your case in conformity with the Book of Allāh], which means al-Qur'ān. And he intends it to mean: [I will judge your case with the judgment of Almighty Allāh] and the term *al-kitāb* (الكتاب) can be interpreted in various ways. Among them, it could mean decree or obligation (*farḍ*) as in the saying of Almighty Allāh: [...thus Allāh has ordained (*kitāb*) prohibitions against you and except for these, all others are lawful]. The term *kitāba* in the verse means obligation."

In another example, He said: [the law of equality is prescribed (*kutiba*) for you....<sup>13</sup>] the term *kutiba* here means compulsory upon you. Elsewhere, He said: [...Our Lord! Why have you ordered (*katabta*) us to fight?<sup>14</sup>] The term *katabta* here means you have prescribed. Likewise, He said: [We have ordained (*katabnā*) them

<sup>12</sup> *Sūrah al-Nisā'* 4: 24.

<sup>13</sup> *Sūrah al-Baqarah*, 2: 178.

<sup>14</sup> *Sūrah al-Nisā'*, 4: 77.

hem, life for life....<sup>15</sup>], *katabnā* here refers to – we have decreed / ordained. Al-Nābighah al-Ja‘dī said:

[The strength of friendship rebounds on our nobleness;

But this is not what Allāh meant it to be with what He wants to prescribe (*yaktubu*).]

poem refers to the strength of family relationship which affects ancestral nobility but this is not what Allāh has imposed by His decree.

### EXAMPLE OF ḤADĪTH INVALIDATED BY CONSENSUS

They said: “You have reported from al-Zuhrī who narrated a ḥadīth from ‘Urwah and the latter from ‘Ā’ishah who said that a lady borrowed some jewels from a family and sold them. The Prophet was informed of this and he ordained the lady’s hand to be amputated.”<sup>16</sup> ‘Urwah said that the consensus agreed that there is no amputation on a borrower for he is considered as trustworthy (*mu’taman*).”

Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that this ḥadīth is *ṣaḥīḥ*, however, it does not convey any obligation to perform it for the ḥadīth does not specify (with clarity) whether the amputation is really to be executed or not. Indeed, (this ḥadīth) does not specify whether it needs to (amputate the hand) or not. It is meant as a warning or threat but without implying the execution of the amputation.”

“Likewise, other (warnings) can be seen in the ḥadīth reported by al-Ḥasan and the latter narrated from Samurah ibn

---

*Sūrah al-Mā’idah*, 5: 45.

*Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 4:139 (No. 4395 and 4396).

Jundub that the Prophet said: [We will execute anyone who murders his servant. We will mutilate anyone who mutilates his servant. The masses agreed that (the Prophet) would not execute a man murdering his servant, nor would he retaliate for the murder of servant. The Prophet intends to instill fear (in the heart) of the servant and at the same time to warn the master not to kill his servant or do any other action similar to that. (In this *ḥadīth*) the Prophet does intend to execute the sentence.”

136b. “Execution will be obligatory if (the Prophet) were to say: [The Prophet executed a man for murdering his servant] or [The Prophet retaliated for the injury of his servant.] However, in saying of the Prophet: [We will execute the one who murders servant], this means that he intends it to be a warning and a threat.

“Likewise, in another saying he said: [Whoever drinks wine he will be lashed and if he repeats it he will be lashed. And if he repeats the third time) he will be lashed. If he repeats another time he will be executed.<sup>18</sup>] This *ḥadīth* is a warning to a drunkard so that he will not repeat the act. This (*ḥadīth*) also proves that the drunkard who repeats the act for the fourth time will be lashed but not to be executed.”

<sup>17</sup> *Al-Musnad*, 7:253 (No. 20124), 7:256 (No. 20142, 20145), 7:256 (20152); *Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, 7:197 (No. 6808-6809), 7:198 (No. 6810-6812-6815); *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 15:5 (No. 39809), 15:34 (No. 39956).

<sup>18</sup> *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 4:165 (No. 4485); *Mawāriḍ*, 1:655 (No. 1518); *Ma' al-Zawā'id*, 6:310 (No. 10666, 10668, 10669), 6:312 (10675); Ibn I Ḥmad ibn 'Alī al-'Asqalānī, *Al-Maṭālib al-'Āliyah bi-Zawā'id al-Mas al-Thumāniyah*, edited by Al-Shaykh Ḥabīb al-Rahmān (Bayrūt: Dā Ma'rifah, nd.), 1: 97 (No. 1760), hereafter cited as *Al-Maṭālib al-'Āliyah Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, 1:228 (No. 620), 2:335 (No. 2397-2398); *Kanz al-'Un* 5:355 (No. 13213), 5:368 (No. 13269), 5:491 (No. 13708), 5:491 (13710); *Mishkāt al-Maṣābiḥ*, 2:305 (No. 3617-3619); *Al-Targhīb*, 3:264.



is is what we can say on all issue of threat – whether it can be executed or not, is by virtue of the *ḥadīth* reported by Abū Hurayrah the Prophet said: [If Allāh promises a reward for an act to someone, He will fulfill His promise, but if He threatens to punish someone He has the privilege to do it or not.<sup>19]</sup>”

### EXAMPLE OF *HADĪTH* SAID TO BE INVALIDATED BY ZAR (ASSUMPTION) AND REASON (*HUJJAH AL-'AQL*)

They said: “You have reported that al-Zuhrī narrated a *ḥadīth* from Abū Salmah and the latter from Abū Hurayrah that the Prophet said: [I have a greater reason to doubt than my father, Ibrāhīm and Allāh has Mercy on Lūṭ for finding refuge in the powerful port. If I have been solicited as Yūsuf was, I would have given up.] They said that this (*ḥadīth*) was an attack against Ibrāhīm, Lūṭ, Yūsuf and the Prophet SAAS himself.”

Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that this (*ḥadīth*) has nothing to do with their claim. Praise be to Almighty Allāh and His Messenger! As for the saying of (the Prophet): [I have a greater reason to doubt than my father, Ibrāhīm], it is uttered upon the revelation of the verse: [Behold! Ibrāhīm said: My Lord! Show me how You give life to the dead. He said: Do you not believe? He said: yes! But to satisfy your own understanding.<sup>21]</sup> Upon hearing this verse, they said: The Prophet Ibrāhīm doubted (the transformation from life to dead) but not our Prophet! When the Prophet said: [I have a greater doubt than my father, Ibrāhīm] (it means an indication of) his respect for

*Majma' al-Zawā'id*, 10: 256 (No. 17602); *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 4: 255 (No. 10416).

*'Umdat al-Qūrān*, 11: 88 (3372); *Al-Musnad*, 3:217 (No. 8336); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 2:1336 (No. 4026).

*Sūrah al-Baqarah*, 2: 260.

Ibrāhīm as well as his awe by the eminent position of Ibrāhīm compared to himself. He also intends to say: [We do not doubt it, & we are worthless without him, how could we doubt him?] The interpretation of the saying of Ibrāhīm: [...but to satisfy my own understanding] means to reassure his certainty through observation. “There are two kinds of certainty, one of them is certainty due to hearing and the other is due to vision (insight). And the certainty due to vision is better than the first one. That is why the Prophet said: The fact reported by other means is not as worthy as the one reported through observation.<sup>22</sup>”

“In discussing the issue of the people of Mūsā, who engaged (choosing) the calf, (Abū Muḥammad) said: [Almighty Allāh] informed Mūsā that his people were worshipping the calf, he does not throw down the tablets (*alwāḥ*) yet, but when he saw them with his own eyes, he was infuriated and threw down the tablet until it broke into pieces. Similarly, the believers who believe in doomsday, resurrection, paradise and hellfire will have the certainty that all these beliefs are true. And on the doomsday – they will observe with their own eyes and the certainty will be heightened. And this is what Ibrāhīm would like to satisfy his heart through observation, which is the greatest level of certainty.”

138b. “As for the saying: [May Allāh has Mercy on Lūṭ for finding refuge in the powerful support<sup>23</sup>], the Prophet is referring to the saying of Lūṭ to his people: [Would that I had power to suppress you]

<sup>22</sup> *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 16: 119 (No. 44130); *Mawārid*, 2:923 (No. 2088); *Mustadrak*, 2:321.

<sup>23</sup> *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 3:113 (No. 5705), 11:505 (No. 32361); *'Umdat al-Q* 12:92 (No. 3375), 13:74 (4694); *Al-Mustadrak*, 2: 561; *Al-Durr al-Manti* 3: 343.

[betake myself to some powerful support<sup>24</sup>] for at that time, Lūṭ annoyed, despaired and worried of his people, leading him to say: finding refuge in the powerful support]. In fact (Lūṭ) is seeking refuge from Almighty Allāh, the Most Powerful Support. They said: [That is why Allāh does not send any Prophet after Lūṭ except from the midst of his own people.]”

10. “And the saying: [If I have been solicited as Yūsuf was, I would have given in], the Prophet was referring to the day when Yūsuf would be freed from a long imprisonment, who then said to his messenger: [Go back to your master and ask him, why the women were cutting their hands?<sup>25</sup>] Yūsuf, however, does not come out of prison even though he was a free man; this proved his great patience and resilience. The Prophet said: [If I were to be in his place and were freed from imprisonment, I would have accepted it without hesitation.] Again, here it proves that Yūsuf is a humble person. If Yūsuf had rushed out of prison immediately with the messenger, just as the Prophet admitted that he would have done if he were to be in Yūsuf's place; there will be no evidence of crime against him. The Prophet also intends to explain that Yūsuf does not feel disheartened by the ordeal (*miḥnah*) inflicted on him by Almighty Allāh; and instead of rushing out from the prison, he remained resigned and confident of the divine reward.”

---

*Sūrah Hūd*, 11: 80.

Refer to *Sūrah Yūsuf*, 12: 31.



## VIII. EXAMPLE OF ḤADĪTH SAID TO BE INVALIDA' BY EXPERIENCE (ʿIYĀN)

139. They said: "You have reported that Abū Saʿīd al-Kī narrated from Jābir ibn ʿAbd Allāh and the latter from Anas Mālik, who reported that the Prophet said, while discussing in year one hundred: [There will not be any living soul on earth on day.<sup>26</sup>] They said: [This ḥadīth is visibly false for they are now in year three hundred (third century) and the number of people is more than what it was supposed to be (as stated in the ḥadīth).]"

140. Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that the narrators of ḥadīth have omitted a word. Or they have forgotten it or the Prophet did not express it explicitly, hence, they did not hear it. To our knowledge we do not doubt that the Prophet intends to say: [There will be no living soul among you (*minkum*) on earth on that day] which means that the narrators have omitted (the term) 'among you' (*minkum*) that is among those who are present in the meeting or among companions of the Prophet in general."

140a. "Likewise, there is another ḥadīth reported by Ibn Masʿūd on the night of the genie: [Nobody among us took part in it except me in which the narrators have omitted (the term) 'except me'.<sup>27</sup> To prove what I have said, I will report a narration according to al-Kudaynah who narrated from Muṭarrif, who then narrated from Minhāl ibn ʿAmr and the latter from ʿAlī who has asked Ibn Masʿūd [Do you give legal opinion to the masses?] He replied: [Yes, I give it to them that what comes last is bad.] (ʿAlī asked him again): [Tell

<sup>26</sup> *Al-Musnad*, 5:75 (No. 14500).

<sup>27</sup> See Paragraph 37e, 40g.

you hear it from (the Prophet)? (Ibn Mas'ūd replied: [I heard him saying that the people will not see year one hundred and they will appear from the earth at a blink of the eyes.<sup>28</sup>] 'Alī shouted: [You are wrong and you miss the point! The Prophet only said to the people who are present on that day. Why would there be nothing for them to hope for after year one hundred?]"

9. "In relation to the *ḥadīth* cited above, there is an error. Another example could be seen in a *ḥadīth* narrated by Muḥammad ibn Khālīd ibn Khidāsh, who narrated from his father, who then narrated from Ḥammād ibn Zayd and who then narrated from Ayyūb ibn al-Ḥasan and the latter from Ṣaqr ibn Qudāmāh al-'Uqaylī who said that the Prophet said: [No baby will be born in year one hundred; in Allāh, one seeks for his needs.<sup>29</sup>] Ayyūb said: [I met Ṣaqr ibn Qudāmāh and asked him about the *ḥadīth* and he replied that he knew nothing.] Abū Muḥammad said: [This is an example of a stake found in a *ḥadīth* and there are diverse opinions on its narration.]"

#### EXAMPLE OF *HADĪTH* INVALIDATED BY NAẒR AND REASON (*HUJJAH AL-'AQL*)

1. They said: "You have reported that 'Abd al-'Azīz al-Mukhtār Anṣārī narrated from 'Abd Allāh al-Dānāj who said that he saw Abū Salamāh ibn 'Abd al-Raḥmān in the mosque of Baṣrah and al-Ḥasan came in and sat down beside him. Then (Abū Salamāh) said that Abū Hurayrah narrated from the Prophet saying: [The sun and

---

*Al-Musnad*, 1:200 (No. 714); 1:296 (No. 1187); *Al-Mu'jam al-Ṣaghīr*, 1:31; *Majma' al-Zawā'id*, 1:270 -1 (No. 963); *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 14:195 (No. 38354).

*Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, 8:27 (No. 7283).



the moon will look as if they are two bulls envelop with fire, on day of the doomsday.<sup>30</sup>] Al-Ḥasan then asked: [What crime have committed?] (Abū Hurayrah) replied: [I only report it to you from Prophet] and al-Ḥasan kept quiet. They said: [Al-Ḥasan has the to ask – what crime has they committed?] These words of al-Ḥ could be a refutation against the saying of the Prophet or against Hurayrah.

142. Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that the sun and the n are not tortured by the fire as a punishment for any crime they committed. In fact, they had created from fire and they wil returned back to their origin. The Prophet also said that upon su one sees the burning fire of Allāh: [If it is not for the wil Almighty Allāh in curbing the fire, everything that is on earth wi destroyed.<sup>31</sup>] The Prophet added: [As the sun rises up a degree ir sky, a door of the hellfire is open and when the noon appear doors of the hellfire are open.] This shows that the intense heat as observes during noon is absorbed from the hellfire. And this is reason why the Prophet said: [Perform your (*zuhr*) prayer in the hours for the intense heat is emitted from the hellfire.<sup>32</sup>] If somet originated from the fire and later it returned to its (original so that is,) fire, hence one cannot say that it suffers punishrn Something which has a limited function like the fire or the star revolves on its orbit,<sup>33</sup> the ocean filled with swell<sup>34</sup> and the lik

<sup>30</sup> *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 14:533 (No. 39533).

<sup>31</sup> *Al-Musnad*, 2:6565 (No. 6901).

<sup>32</sup> *'Umdat al-Qārī*, 10:616 (No. 3259); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 1:223 (No. 680 *Musnad*, 6:338 (No. 18209); *Sunan al-Kubrā*, 1:645; *Al-Maṭālib al-'Ā* 1:63 (No. 223); *Mawārid*, 1:139 (No. 269); *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 9:378 19373, 19374, 19375).

<sup>33</sup> *Sūrah Yāsīn*, 36: 40.

<sup>34</sup> *Sūrah al-Ṭūr*, 52: 6.

e cannot say that all of them are being tortured or rewarded.”

another similar example is that a man who, upon hearing the saying Almighty Allāh: [...then fear the fire whose fuel is man and mes...<sup>35</sup>] may ask what kind of crime does the stone commit?”

### EXAMPLE OF TWO CONTRADICTORY ḤADĪTH

3. They said: “You have narrated that the Prophet said: [There is either an infection nor an evil<sup>36</sup>] then they said to him: [When the st sign of mange<sup>37</sup> appears on the nose of the camel, then the whole op of camels will be infected.] He replied: [Which one will be the st to be infected?] He said: [This one or its meaning?<sup>38</sup>] Then they rated other aḥādīth, which contradict the former: [Do not place a k person in contact with a healthy person<sup>39</sup>] and [Flee from leprosy you flee away from a lion.<sup>40</sup>] And a man who suffers from leprosy nts to make a pledge adhering to Islam and he sends a messenger make his pledge on his behalf but is rejected. He said: [A woman, ouse and animals are evil omens.<sup>41</sup>] They said that all of the above tations) are incoherent and incongruent to each other.”

---

*Sūrah al-Baqarah, 2: 24*

*‘Umdat al-Qārī, 14:751 (No. 5772); Al-Musnad, 1: 577 (No. 2425), 2:252 (No. 4775), 2:532 (No. 6414), 3:402 (No. 9445), 3:579 (No. 10587); Al-Sunan al-Kubrā, 7:351, 8:240; Majma’ al-Zawā’id, 5:120 (No. 8390), 5:121 (No. 8392), 5:121 (No. 8395); Al-Majālib al-‘Āliyah, 2:352 (No. 2450), 2:352 (No. 2452), 2:353 (No. 2454); Mishkāt al-Maṣābīh, 2:520 (No. 4577); Kanz al-‘Ummāl, 15:119 (No. 28600), 15:120 (No. 28611), 15:121 (No. 28612), 15:122 (No. 28623); Sunan Abū Dāwūd, 4:17 (No. 3911 and 3912). Skin disease in hairy and wooly animals caused by an arachnid parasite.*

*Kanz al-‘Ummāl, 10: 124 (No. 28629); Tārīkh Baghdād, 11:169.*

*‘Umdat al-Qārī, 14: 571 (No. 5774), 14:479 (No. 5771); Sunan Abū Dāwūd, 4:17 (39110); Sunan Ibn Mājah, 2:1171 (No. 35410); Al-Musnad, 3:373 (No. 92740), 3:431 (No. 9618); Kanz al-‘Ummāl, 10:124 (No. 28628). Al-Musnad, 3:449 (No. 9728).*

*‘Umdat al-Qārī, 14:36 (No. 5093); Sunan Abū Dāwūd, 4:19 (No. 3922); Al-Musnad, 3:449 (No. 3567 and 3568).*

Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that there is no contradiction those *ahādīth* for each of them has its meaning and applical according to its time and place. If they are placed in their prop position there will be no contradiction. There are two kinds contagious disease. The first one is leprosy. It emits an unpleas smell, which proves to be contagious to anyone who is in cl contact with him or anyone who is his table companion. Likewi his wife who, sleeps with him and sharing the same linen will infected and eventually suffers from leprosy. And so would children for the possibility to be infected is great."

"Another example of disease, which is contagious, is tuberculo The medical doctors are advised not to stay in the company anyone who suffers from leprosy and tuberculosis. They do not m to refer to the contagiousness of the disease but they are referring the unpleasant odor emitted by the patient, which can transmit germs to those who remain in close contact with the patient for a k period of time. In fact, the medical doctors are less likely to beli in superstition – good or bad!"

"Similarly,, when a camel suffers from mange it secretes pus i mucus. When it mixes with the rest of the troop and they scr against each other, the germs will be transmitted out of the mu and pus. (Eventually) other camels will be infected with the dise And this is the meaning of the Prophet's saying: [Do not place sick person with the healthy person] meaning that he fears that healthy person will be infected with the disease through splutte saliva while talking or touching."



Some people thought that the Prophet, by saying as such, intended not to believe or consider the owner of the affected camels as guilty. (Abū Muḥammad) said: [To my mind this idea of guilt is founded, for what we have explained earlier about the contagious disease could be visually observed.]”

4a. “The other kind of contagious disease is plague which has infected the people of the country and they moved out of the country fearing that they will be infected with it. Abū Muḥammad said: [Sahl b. Muḥammad narrated from al-Aṣma‘ī and the latter from some ṣahābīans that a man had ran away from being infected with the plague, rode a donkey and met his family at Safawan. He heard a *cameleer*<sup>42</sup> sang a song:

[One will never outdistance Allāh on a donkey,

Neither on the fastest horse;

Death comes at the prescribed moment,

Indeed Allāh is in front of the night traveler.]

The Prophet also said: [When plague infects people of a country and you are there, do not come out of the country.<sup>43</sup>] He also said: [If you are near the country do not enter it.<sup>44</sup>] In the first *ḥadīth*, the Prophet (SA) means to say that it is useless to run away from the decree of mighty Allāh for one can never escape from the power of Allāh.

For the second *ḥadīth*: [If you are near the country, enter not!] means that one will feel more pleasant in a place, which is free from plague.”

---

Cameleer means the caravan leader who urges the camel to move forward by singing.

*Al-Musnad*, 1:393 (No. 1615).

*Al-Musnad*, 6:186 (No. 17607).



“Thus, from the above explanation you will know the evil om associated with a woman or a horse that may lead man to disaster destruction. He said: [She is affecting me with her evil omen] refe to the infection, which the Prophet said earlier: [No infection....]”

144b. “As for the *ḥadīth* which Abū Hurayrah narrated from t Prophet saying: [Woman, house and animals signify evil omen] suspected to be erroneously transmitted by him. Although he m hear the Prophet (said it), he does not understand it.”

Abū Muḥammad said: “Muḥammad ibn Yahyā al-Qaṭ‘ī, has narrat from ‘Abd al-A‘lā who then narrated from Sa‘īd and he then narrat from Qatādah and the latter from Abū al-Ḥasan al-A‘rāj who sa that two men met ‘Ā’ishah and they said to her that Abū Hurayr has narrated from the Prophet: [Indeed woman, animals and hou signify evil omen.<sup>45</sup>] She jumped and explained: [Liar – by the O who reveals al-Qur’ān to Abū Qāsim! The one who narrated th *ḥadīth* from the Prophet is lying!] Indeed, the Prophet said: [T Jāhiliyyah people used to say that animals, woman and horse signi bad omen.<sup>46</sup>] Then (‘Ā’ishah) recited: [No misfortune can happen the earth or in your souls but is recorded in a decree before We bri it into existence....<sup>47</sup>] to explain the situation.”

144c. (Abū Muḥammad added): “I narrated from Aḥmad ibn Kha who said that he narrated it from Mūsā ibn Mas‘ūd al-Nahdī, w narrated from ‘Ikrimah Ibn ‘Ammār, who narrated from Ishāq, w then narrated from Ibn ‘Abd Allāh ibn Abū Ṭalḥah and the latt from Anas ibn Mālīk who said that one of us met the Prophet sayin

<sup>45</sup> *Majma’ al-Zawā’id*, 5: 124 (No. 8404).

<sup>46</sup> *Al-Mustadrak*, 2:479; *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, 10:11 (No. 28557), 10:116 (N 28585); *Al-Sunan al-Kubrā*, 1:124; *Majma’ al-Zawā’id*, 5:124 (No. 8405).

<sup>47</sup> *Sūrah al-Ḥadīd*, 57: 22.

Messenger of Allāh! We settle down in a house and we prosper amassing wealth. Then we move to a new house, our wealth is depleted and so did our business opportunity.] The Prophet said: Move out and abandon that house for it signifies bad omen.<sup>48]</sup>"

d. Abū Muḥammad said: "This *ḥadīth* does not contradict the former, nor the former contradicts the latter. Indeed the Prophet AS advised them to move out from that house because of its severity being in harsh weather and their incessant misfortune led them to depression. Allāh has created the natural instinct and perception that is innate in man and the latter will hate the place where he (was inflicted with) suffering even though there is no relationship between the place of effect and the man. He will also close and attach to the one who does well to him, even if it is done involuntarily. And simultaneously, he will hate whoever does harm to him, even if it is done involuntarily. Thus, how could the Prophet be superstitious for superstition comes from magic? Indeed, many people among the Jāhili reviled magic but praised those who believed in it. In praising a man, a poet writes:

[He has no apprehension in the difficulties of the journey,

He says: I brave the hostility of the day, the woodpecker and the crow,

He goes on with confidence,

It is only the superstitious man who keeps away from the signs.]

---

*Majma' al-Zawā'id*, 5:125 (No. 8409).

Abū Muḥammad said: [The word *al-khuthārim* means a superstitious man, *al-wāq* means woodpecker and *al-ḥātim* means crow. .  
Muraqqish said:

[I left but I will never leave if I see a woodpecker and  
crow,

The bad signs are like the good signs and

The good signs are like the bad signs,

And similarly, good or evil will never last.]”

144e. Abū Muḥammad said: “Ishāq ibn Rāhawayh narrated from ‘Abd al-Razzāq, who then narrated from Ma‘mar and the latter from Ismā‘īl ibn Umayyah who reported that the Prophet said: [There are three things which man could not evade: superstition, doubt and envy.] Somebody asked: [How could we evade them?] He replied: you (know about) superstition, do not believe in it. If you doubted not find its certainty and if you are envious (of others), do oppress (them)!<sup>49</sup>] Such are the terms used or related to it.”

144f. (Abū Muḥammad) said: “Abū Ḥātim narrated from Aṣma‘ī that Sa‘īd ibn Muslim and the latter narrated from his father who was amazed in those who affirmed superstition and those who reproached it. He said: [When we were in Ṭā’if our camel, which was on the verge of delivering, tried to run away. We followed its prints and met Hānī’ ibn ‘Ubayd of Banū Wā’il, who was in a hurry. He said to us: [Evil is on top of the hill.] Then, we met another man from al-Ḥayy and he said: [If you are searching for the *bughā* kind of bird), you will never find it.] Then we met a boy, who during his childhood was burned by fire, leaving an ugly scar, and as

<sup>49</sup> *Al-Tamhīd*, 3:18.

: [Have you heard about a lone (*al-fāriq*) camel?] He replied: er there is a group of Bedouins, look!] And we met them and d our camel has delivered its newborn and then we took both the el and the newborn with us.] Abū Muḥammad said: [The term *al-* / refers to a pregnant camel, which left its troop.]”

g. ‘Ikrimah said: “We were sitting together with Ibn ‘Abbās, a bird flew by and is chirping. Some of the people who were ent exclaimed: [Good thing! Good thing! Ibn ‘Abbās replied: re is neither good nor evil for the Prophet SAAS prefers good es and favourable signs.]”

h. “(Abū Muḥammad) said that al-Raḳāshī narrated from al-a‘ī who asked Ibn ‘Awn about *al-fa’l* (favourable sign) and he [He is sick but then others hear that he is healthy] or [somebody search of something but then others hear that he discovered it.]”

i. Abū Muḥammad said: “There is yet another instinct imbued an such as love and appreciation of things just as (Allāh created ) the tendency to greet others with *salām* (peace), to extol others safety and goodness. This is the reason why the Arab used to [You will be bestowed with safety] or [You will be bestowed happy morning.] Likewise, the Persians said: [May you live one sand years.] Thus, whoever hears that greeting knows that thing eing laid accordingly and can never) forward it. One could er delay nor increase and not even decrease (its setup). ever, it is man’s nature to love what is good, to feel amaze with l news, prefer to be seen elegant, love to look at a beautiful face ove to have a good name.”



"A man can pass through a garden full of flowers and feels rest but hardly taking anything from it. Or he may stand in front of a lake and marvel at its beauty without drinking from it or desiring drink from it. In some of the *aḥādīth* there is information that Prophet used to love lemon,<sup>50</sup> red pigeon<sup>51</sup> and henna flower.<sup>52</sup> There are some of the examples of the good names and favourable signs. Likewise, he disliked bad names such as Banū al-Nār, Banū Ḥun, Banū Zinyah, Banū Ḥuzn and the likes."

## XI. EXAMPLE OF TWO CONTRADICTORY *ḤADĪTH*

145. They said: "You have reported that Khabbāb ibn al-A said: [We complained to the Prophet SAAS on the parchement of ground due to excessive heat but he does not listen to us.<sup>53</sup>] The complain is related to scorching heat and they asked the Prophet whether they could perform prayer during the cooler part of the day or not. The Prophet SAAS, however, does not take note of the query (which means that he does not permit them to delay prayer.) In another narration, they reported that the Prophet said: [Perform your prayer during the cooler part of the day for the intense heat is emitted from the hellfire.<sup>54</sup>] They said that there existed obvious contradiction and divergence."

<sup>50</sup> *Majma' al-Zawā'id*, 4: 78 (No. 6263); *Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, 22:340 (850).

<sup>51</sup> *Majma' al-Zawā'id*, 4: 78 (No. 6263); *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 14: 184 (38312); *Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, 22: 340 (No. 850).

<sup>52</sup> *Al-Musnad*, 4: 306 (No. 12548).

<sup>53</sup> *Majma' al-Zawā'id*, 2: 28 (No. 1691).

<sup>54</sup> *'Umdat al-Qārī*, 10:616 (No. 3259); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 1:223 (No. 680) *Musnad*, 6:338 (No. 18209); *Al-Sunan al-Kubrā*, 1:645; *Al-Maṭālīt 'Āliyah*, 1:63 (No. 223); *Mawārid*, 1:139 (No. 269); *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 9 (No. 19373-19375).

Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that there is neither urgency nor contradiction between them – by the grace of mighty Allāh! Indeed, the pleasure of Allāh resides in the early (of the prayer) and His forgiveness resides in the last part of the *ṣalāt*. This concession is granted in the case of shortening the prayer *ṣṭr*. Indeed, (performing prayer) in the early part of the prayer *ṣalāt* is fully recommended and the latter part of it, is considered as concession. And it is unlikely for the Prophet to do away with the act, which is recommended most and pleasant to the Almighty Allāh. I do to prove to the masses that it is allowable for them to perform *ṣṭr* (prayer), the Prophet has done it several times."

It is preferable to abandon an action rather than performing it continuously but diminishing in terms of its reward. This is the reason, why the Prophet SAAS did not respond to the complaint made by the companions who were with him. They complained that the heat was too intense for them to perform the prayer and were going to defer it to the cooler part of the day. However, he allowed the companions who were not present (at that time) to perform the prayer during the cooler period of the day so as to provide the sufficient prove (of this concession) to the community as well as to make things easy for them. Likewise, this (concession) is applicable to performing the *fajr* prayer. (The Prophet) said: [Get on the way to rise.<sup>55</sup>]"

Equally, it is observed that the Prophet performed his *zuhr* prayer during the first hour and he does not defer it (to other time). This information is mentioned in a *ḥadīth* narrated by Ismā'īl ibn ibn

---

*Al-Musnad*, 6: 115 (No. 17280), 6:116 (No. 17287), 9:161 (No. 23697), *Sunan al-Kubrā*, 1:671; *Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, 4: 249 (No. 4283); *Kunz al-'Ummāl*, 9:362 (No. 19274), 9:363 (No. 19277), 9:364 (No. 19282-19284).

'Ulayyah who narrated it from 'Awf who then narrated it from a Minhāl and the latter from Abū Barzah who said: [The Prophet performed the *zuhr* prayer in the midday known also as the first hour during which the sun reclined.<sup>56</sup>]

## XII. EXAMPLE OF TWO CONTRADICTORY ḤADĪTH

147. They said: "You have narrated that the Prophet SAAS said [The Prophet has never been accused of infidelity to Allāh. When I was a small boy, two angels were sent to him and they took a clot of blood from his heart, then they washed his heart and restored it in place.] In another narration, the Prophet was reported to have observed the religion of his tribe for forty years, and his daughters were married, respectively, to 'Utbah ibn Abū Lahab and Abū al-'As ibn al-Rabī'. Both of them were unbelievers. They said that there is a contradiction and divergence in the reports, which undermined the Prophet."

148. Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm, by the Grace of Allāh, that the *ḥadīth* is not related to anybody in particular and there is nothing to say about it if we understand the meaning well. The Arabs in general, with the exception of the Yemenites are the descendants of Ismā'īl ibn Ibrāhīm and they still follow the religion of their father, Ibrāhīm. Hence, the pilgrimage and the visits of (*Bayt Allāh*), circumcision, marriage, divorce under the condition that it pronounced three times is valid, the right to remarry if the divorce pronounced for the first time or the second times, the right to blood money, which is evaluated at one hundred camels in case of

<sup>56</sup>

'Umdat al-Qārī, 4: 48 (No. 547); Mişkāt al-Maṣābīh, 1: 188 (No. 5); Kanz al-'Ummāl, 8: 49-50 (No. 21813).

nicide, major ablution after major impurity (sexual intercourse), obedience to the legal judgment on the position of the hermaphrodite through the urinary system, forbidden of marriage among close relatives (*maḥram*), allied or genealogically related. These directives well known among the Arabs. Hence, with this explanation they believed in the two angels (Raḳīb and 'Atīd). Al-A'shā, a pre-Islamic poet said:

[Do not reckon me when I am ungrateful for Your Grace;

On my testimony, I testify in Allāh, I testify that!]

The poet intends to say: [In my word, O! Allāh the Sovereign, I do testify in what I have said!] Some of them believe in the day of resurrection and judgment. Zuhayr ibn Abū Salmā, a pre-Islamic poet describes 'the counting of seven' in his famous poem, though he rejects it, says:

[Your action will be recorded in a book but hidden from you,

Until the Day of Judgment or hasten for reprisal (now).]

In relation to *baliyyah* or a female camel that is tied to the tomb of her master, left there without food and drink until it dies; the Arabs believe that on the day of resurrection, the master would ride the camel. Upon his demise, his relatives must practice *baliyyah* or else, they walk barefooted on the day of resurrection. Abū Zubayd said:

[Like the *balāyā*, its head is on the saddle,

Offer its cheek to the hot sandstorm.]

The term *al-walāyā* is synonymous with *al-barrādhi* (saddle). The Arabs used to make a round hole in the saddle and dressed it to the camel's neck. Al-Nābighah said:



[Their place is God's place and their religion is true,

They only hope that the final ending will change.]

The poet means to say that their deeds will be rewarded and they prefer Syria as their dwelling.”

148a. “The Prophet SAAS used to practice the religion of people – meaning that he believes in Allāh, respects and practices laws like circumcision, major ablution, pilgrimage, acknowledge day of resurrection, judgment and final rewards. Despite the similarities he never comes close to any idols or dishonors them. As he said: [I hate them!] although he knows nothing about the ritual or the legal obligations ordained by the Almighty Allāh on His servants except after he was bestowed with the divine revelation. This is explained in the saying of Almighty Allāh: [Did He not find you orphan and give you shelter and care? And He found you wander and He gives you guidance.<sup>57</sup>] This means that the Prophet SAAS was wondering on the details of belief, Islām and its sharī‘ah. Almighty Allāh guided him.”

148b. “Similarly, another saying of the Almighty Allāh: [...You do not know (before) what revelation was and what faith was...] means that formally the Prophet knows nothing, what al-Qur’ān is and what the prerequisites of faith are. Here, it does not mean that faith is the affirmation (as such) of his forefathers who died as unbelievers and polytheists did acknowledge Almighty Allāh, believed in Him, performed the pilgrimage, but associated other deities to Him, as intermediaries so that they would be closer to Him. They also for

<sup>57</sup> *Sūrah al-Ḍuḥā*, 93: 6-7.

<sup>58</sup> *Sūrah al-Shūrā*, 42: 52.

mselves from injustice, conscious of His punishment and used to fear among themselves not to be oppressors or unjust to anybody.”

Abd al-Muṭṭalib said to King of Abbyssinia, who asked the former his needs: [Some of my camels have disappeared], the king was prised with (‘Abd al-Muṭṭalib), who instead of asking the king to ve away from the Ka‘bah, he asked something else. Then (‘Abd Muṭṭalib) said: [This house has its own owner to prevent others n entering into it.]”

c. “Those people did acknowledge the existence of Almighty ḥ and they believed in Him. How could the good and the pious s not believe in Him before the revelation? This idea is obviously wn to everybody particularly as the saying of the Almighty Allāh: You know not (before) what the revelation was and what the faith ....<sup>59</sup>] that is the faith and prerequisites of faith.”

d. Abū Muḥammad said: “The meaning of the verse is that, the phet SAAS used to practice the religion of Ibrāhīm, Ismā‘īl and tribe, but not of Abū Jahl and those unfaithful ones for Almighty ḥ has informed about Ibrāhīm who said: [...he who follows my s is of me and he who disobeys me is not of me; You are indeed Most Forgiving and the Most Merciful.<sup>60</sup>] He also said to Nūḥ: is not of your family<sup>61</sup>] which means that his own son is an eliever. As for the case of the Prophet who allowed his two ghters to be married to unbelievers; this permission was given ; before the Prophet received the legal prescriptions of Islam. If

---

*Sūrah al-Shūrā*, 42: 52.

*Sūrah Ibrāhīm*, 14: 36.

*Sūrah Hūd*, 11: 46.

an act is a repulsive one, it will be prohibited and if it is a virtuous one, it will be authorized and declared as permissible.”

“Even if the Prophet SAAS had allowed his two daughters to be married to the unbelievers, that was done before the prohibitive marriage between Muslims and unbelievers (was enacted)<sup>62</sup> before the revelation took place. Thus, there is nothing on his part to be (accused of being) unfaithful to Almighty Allāh.”

### XIII. EXAMPLE OF A CONTRADICTORY ḤADĪTH

149. They said: “You have narrated that the Prophet SAAS [My community (*ummah*) is like the rain, nobody knows which of it) is the best, the beginning or the ending.<sup>63</sup>] Elsewhere, he narrated that Islam is obscure in the beginning and the ending.<sup>64</sup> The Prophet had also said: [The best people among my community (reside) during the century when I was sent.<sup>65</sup>] They said that in the (*aḥādīth*, one can see) the contradiction and divergence.”

150. Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that there is no contradiction nor divergence. Indeed, when the Prophet SAAS said that Islam is obscure in the beginning and the ending, he is refer-

<sup>62</sup> The translation – ‘that was done before the prohibition of marriage between Muslims and unbelievers (was enacted)’ were not mentioned in Lecc translation. Refer to page 127, the first paragraph.

<sup>63</sup> *ʿAḥdāt al-Aḥwadhī*, 10:236 (No. 2869); *Al-Musnad*, 6:480 (No. 1: *Mawārid*, 2: 1041 (No. 2307); *Al-Maʿālib al-ʿĀliyah*, 4: 154 (No. 1: *Kanz al-ʿUmmāl*, 12: 162 (No. 34485); *Mishkāt al-Maṣābiḥ*, 3: 292 (6277).

<sup>64</sup> *ʿAḥdāt al-Aḥwadhī*, 10: 69 (No. 2629); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 2: 1321 (3988); *Sunan al-Dārimī*, 2:312; *Al-Muʿjam al-Kabīr*, 6:164 (No. 1: 6:256 (No. 6147), 10: 99 (No. 10081), 8:153 (No. 7659).

<sup>65</sup> *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 4: 214 (No. 4657); *Al-Musnad*, 7: 220 (No. 1: *Sunan al-Kubrā*, 10: 270; *Kanz al-ʿUmmāl*, 11: 527 (No. 32454), 1: (32499); *Umdat al-Qārī*, 11: 383 (3650); *Mishkāt al-Maṣābiḥ*, 3: 21 (6001).



the fact that in the beginning the number of people who accepted Islam was very small and in the end, the number will also be small and they are of the outstanding ones. This is shown in the *ḥadīth* narrated by Mu'āwiyah ibn 'Amr who narrated it from Abū Ishāq, who then narrated from al-Awzā'ī, and the latter from Yaḥyā or Irbāh ibn Ruwaym who told that the Prophet SAAS has said: [The best people among my community will come at the beginning and at the end of time and in between this two periods, there will be mediocre and decrepit people. They are not among you and you have nothing to do with them.<sup>66</sup>] The term *ṭhabaj* from the *ḥadīth* means "mediocre."

Another example of *ḥadīth* that is of the same meaning (as above) is one that is related to the end of the time, (in which) the Prophet said: [The one who holds tight to his religion on this day, will be like holding amber.<sup>67</sup>] Another *ḥadīth* relates to the same idea is that [one who testifies to the Oneness of Allāh on that day is like the martyr of *al-ḥirabā'* (obscured) he said: [They are the ones who enliven my religion when other people have abandoned it.]]

1a. "As for the *ḥadīth* of the Prophet SAAS: [The best one of my community (resides) in the century when I was sent] means that it is possible for us to doubt that the companions of the Prophet are better than anyone who comes later, that is, at the end of time and nobody could have the same merits which are endowed the companions. In another *ḥadīth*: [My community is like the rain, nobody knows which part of it is the best, the beginning or the

---

*Majma' al-Zawā'id*, 9: 547 (No. 16392); *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 11: 527 (No. 32448).

*Ārīdat al-Aḥwadhī*, 9: 37 (No. 2197); *Al-Mustadrak*, 4:439.



ending]. Here, the Prophet intends to place the companions parallel to the people at the end of time. Similarly, when he says: [I am unsure which one is more beautiful, the inner or the outer parts of this material], it means the outer part is more beautiful (than the inner). Here, he intends to put the outer and the inner parts of the material parallel. It is just the same, if you say: [I am unsure which is prettier, the face or the back of the woman?] Indeed, she is prettier by looking at her face, but it is a matter of putting it parallelly, the back with the face."

"Another example is the saying on *tihāmah*: [It resembles honey in the goatskin, I am not sure whether it is better in the beginning or the ending.] The term *al-badī'* is synonymous to *al-ziq* (goatskin). When honey is in the goatskin, its quality does not change unlike milk in a milk skin, it changes. Milk is better in the beginning than in the end but the quality of honey is just the same, whether in the beginning or the end. However, (what is important) is a matter of putting them parallelly, the beginning and the ending."

#### XIV. EXAMPLE OF TWO CONTRADICTORY *HADĪTH*

151. They said: "You have narrated from the Prophet who said: [Do not prefer me over Yūnus ibn Mattā and do not make any preferences among the Prophets.] They added that the Prophet also said: [I am the chief among the sons of Ādam, what an honour! I am the first on earth to be resurrected, what an honour!]<sup>68</sup>] They said: [There is contradiction and divergence in it.]"

<sup>68</sup>

*ʿAṣḍat al-Aḥwadhī*, 13: 90 (No. 3615); *Al-Mustadrak*, 2: 465; 4: 6; *Mishkāt al-Maṣābiḥ*, 3: 123 (No. 5741), 3: 127 (No. 5761); *Mawāriḍ*, 2: 948 (p.

Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that there is neither radiation nor divergence (in those two *ḥadīth*.) When the Prophet that he is the chief of the sons of Ādam on the Day of Judgment, referring to himself as the intercessor, the witness and the flagler advocating and praising (Allāh). He is also the first on earth to be resurrected."<sup>69</sup>

for the Prophet's saying: [Do not prefer me over Yūnus], it is an act of humbleness. Equally in the saying of Abū Bakr: [I am in charge but I am not the best among you], it shows an act of humbleness. The Prophet specified Yūnus over others, not by any means that he is inferior to other Prophets like Ibrāhīm, Mūsā and

In fact, the Prophet intends to say that he declined to be considered better off than Yūnus. And what is wrong with that? He is not better off than Yūnus! Almighty Allāh said: [So wait with patience for the command of your Lord and be not like the companion of the fish, when he cried out in agony.<sup>70</sup>] These verses show that Yūnus was not as patient as other Prophets."

a. "The verse proves that Prophet (Muḥammad) is better off than Yūnus and Almighty Allāh said to him not to behave like him. Hence, the saying of the Prophet: [Do not prefer me over him], reinforces his modesty trait. It is possible that he would not have said: [Do not prefer me to him in terms of deeds for he is better off than me in deeds, hardship and suffering. Indeed, he has suffered a great deal than me.]"

---

2127); *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 11: 404 (No. 31881), 11:404 (No. 31882), 11:433 (No. 32033), 11: 394-5 (39052).

*ʿAṣṣat al-Aḥwadhī*, 11: 219 (No. 3148).

*Sūrah al-Qalam*, 68: 48.

“Whatever merits granted to our Prophet on the Day of Judgment b Almighty Allāh such as the authority and superiority over the othe Prophets and Messengers are not because of the Prophet's deed b because of the special preference granted to him and his communit by the Almighty Allāh. Similarly,, the ordeal of his community is les severe than the people of the past. Almighty Allāh has sent him to h community to teach them a simple and true religion and exempted h community the ordeal that befall Banū Isrā'īl in their ritu obligations. And with this – [...this community is the best of people evolved for mankind<sup>71</sup>] is (an indication of) the special preference ( Almighty Allāh.”

#### XV. EXAMPLE OF TWO CONTRADICTORY ḤADĪTH

153. They said: You have narrated from the Prophet who said [Paradise will not accept whoever has in his heart a little weight ( seed of pride and hell will not accept whoever has in his heart a litt weight of the seed of faith.<sup>72</sup>] They also narrated: [Whoever said th there is no other deity (worthy of worship) except Allāh, will ent paradise even if he is a fornicator or a thief.<sup>73</sup>] Theft and fornicatio however, are of more severe sin than that of the seed of pride, in th eyes of Allāh. They said: [There is divergence (between the tw ḥadīth).]”

154. Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that there is no divergen (between the two ḥadīth.) These statements can be explained fro

<sup>71</sup> *Sūrah Āli 'Imrān*, 3: 110.

<sup>72</sup> *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 4: 59 (No. 4091); *ʿAṣṣat al-Aḥwadhī*, 8: 124 (No. 199); 8: 125 (No. 1999); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 1: 23 (No. 59), 2: 1397 (No. 4173); *Muʿjam al-Kabir*, 10: 75 (No. 10000 -10001), 10:94 (No. 10066).

<sup>73</sup> *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 1: 61 (No. 208).

al judgment. Here, it means that the Prophet is not making judgment on whether [a person will not enter hellfire if he has in his heart a little faith the weight of the seed] or [a person will not enter paradise if he has in his heart a little pride the weight of the seed] but is emphasizing that Supremacy is meant only for Almighty Allāh not others. If a person were to argue with Almighty Allāh on the judgment that one will enter paradise or not, it serves no purpose for He will do what He wants.”

a. “Similarly, it applies to your saying: [The house is small, no leader will reside there in.] Actually you mean to say that in your nation, the house is not proper to be the official residence of the leader; however, the possibility for the leader to reside there in is there. Likewise, you say: [A free man will not stay in this country], you are saying that in your estimation, a free man will not stay in this country; however, there is a possibility for the man to stay in this country.”

b. “Equally, it is seen in his saying: [whoever fast throughout day without break, he will be compressed by hell fire<sup>74</sup>] for he has rejected the gift and offering. He, in turn, rejected the concession and grace granted to him by Almighty Allāh. A person who rejects a concession is similar to a person who deliberately neglects the important deed. Both of them deserve to be punished if Almighty Allāh intends them to be punished.”

c. “Another example: [If a man intentionally kills a believer, his compensation is hellfire.<sup>75</sup>] It means that the judgment of this verse

---

*Al-Musnad*, 7: 168 (No. 19733); *Majmā' al-Zawā'id*, 3: 335 (No. 5163).  
*Sūrah al-Nisā'*, 4: 93.



is that the murderer will be punished as such, however, Allāh will do whatever He wants.”

154d. “This idea is in line with the *ḥadīth* narrated by Ab Hurayrah that [If Almighty Allāh promises to reward someone for his good deeds, would He grant it to him. And if He promises to punish someone for his wrongdoings, He has the privilege to do it or not.]”

154e. Ishāq ibn Ibrāhīm ibn Ḥabīb al-Ṣahābī reported that Quraysh ibn Anas heard that ‘Amrū ibn ‘Ubayd said: “On the day of resurrection, I will be standing face to face with Allāh who will ask me: [Why did you say that the murderer is destined to hell?] And I will answer: [It is You Who said it!] and then I will recite the verse [If a man kills a believer intentionally, his recompensation is hell, he abide therein, forever].”

(Quraysh ibn Anas) said to someone: “I am the youngest in this assembly – do you think that He could answer if you say: [Indeed Allāh forgives not (the sin of) joining other Gods with Him but He forgives whom He pleases other sins than this<sup>76</sup>] and (from the verse) how could you know that I refuse to forgive (the murderer?) (‘Amrū ibn ‘Ubayd) said: I am not able to refute or say anything!”

## XVI. EXAMPLE OF ḤADĪTH INVALIDATED BY AL QUR’ĀN

155. They said: “You have narrated that a man said to his son: [If I die burn my (body) and throw off my ashes into the sea so that I may mislead Allāh! (أضل الله)] And the son did as requested but Allāh gathered his ashes and said to him: [What have you done?] He

<sup>76</sup>

*Sūrah al-Nisā’, 4: 116.*

lied: [Out of fear to You, O Lord!] and Allāh forgave him. They d: [This is (an act of) unbeliever! And Allāh will never forgive the believer and this is stipulated in al-Qur'ān!<sup>77</sup>]

5. Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that the expression: اضل الله (I may escape from Allāh!) You can apply the term اضل in its (fourth form - افعل - *af'ala*)<sup>78</sup> - اضلته - In the saying of nighty Allāh: [Duly recorded, my Lord neither errs nor He gets!<sup>79</sup>] This means: [He will never escape from my Lord!]"

the man (as mentioned above) believes in Allāh, devotes himself to n, fears Him but he knows not one of His Attributes. And he nks that once his body is fully burned to ashes and being blown by wind, he will escape from Almighty Allāh. However, though the n is ignorant of His Attributes, Almighty Allāh forgave him due to knowledge of His reprimands and his fear for His severe nishment. Indeed, some Muslims have committed mistakes on the tributes of Almighty Allāh but they are not being condemned to lfire and their actions and intentions are deferred to Him, Who ows the best!"

## II. EXAMPLE OF ḤADĪTH INVALIDATED BY AL-R'ĀN

7. They said: "You have reported that the Prophet has said: whoever refuses to kill snakes out of fear is indeed an unbeliever!] t Almighty Allāh said: [If you eschew the most heinous of the

---

For examples: *Sūrah al-Nisā'*, 4: 168; *Sūrah al-Mā'idah*, 5:10; *Sūrah al-Anfāl*, 8:36.

For further clarification on this form see Wehr Hans and Cowan J.M., *A Dictionary of Modern Written Arabic* (3<sup>rd</sup> ed.), (Otto Harrassowitz, Weisbaden, 1976), XII-XIV.

*Sūrah Tāhā*, 20: 52.

things that you are forbidden to do, We shall expel out of you all the evil in you.<sup>80]</sup> If this is a sinful action, probably a minor one, how can Allāh expel it from him? And you also observed: [Whoever fornicates or steals and at that moment (of the actions) he said that there is no god worthy to be worshipped except Allāh, he is a believer and will enter paradise] but at the same time you became an unbeliever just because you had refused to kill snake? Indeed, there are contradiction and divergence (in the *aḥādīth*).”

158. Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that there are no contradiction and divergence in it. It is not about the refusal to kill the snakes, nor is it about the grievous sin that tantamount to infidelity. The great sin is that if one refuses to kill the snakes out of fear of vengeance. This was one of the deeds of the Jāhiliyyah. They believed that if a genie were killed the others would avenge against (the murderer). At times, (the genie) would kill the murderer or would befuddle the mind (of the murderer) or would kill the children (of the murderer). The Prophet came to inform them that this was fallacious and said: [Anyone who affirms this as true is indeed an unbeliever] which means one who believes in the fallacious deeds.”

158a. “For us, infidelity is of two types. The first type relates to the disbelief in essential (*aṣl*) matters such as disbelief in Almighty Allāh, His Prophet, His Angels, His Book and Resurrection. These are the essentialities and whoever disbeliefs in one of the essentialities is indeed putting himself outside of Islam. If he dies, none of his Muslim relatives can inherit from him and he merits no *janāzah* prayer.”

<sup>80</sup> *Sūrah al-Nisā'*, 4: 31.



1 the second type (of infidelity) relates to disbelief in one of the boundary (*far'*) matters that is subject to interpretation such as belief in *qadar*, to denounce the practice of rubbing off (something) on the shoes or to denounce the validity of pronouncing the shahādah three times and the likes. Such (disbeliefs), however, do not make a person to be ousted out of the pail of Islam and whoever believes in one of (the *far'* matters) will not be treated as an infidel, rather he is known as a hypocrite in a true sense and not as a disbeliever (*mu'min*)."

## II. EXAMPLE OF *HADĪTH* SAID TO BE INVALIDATED BY *NAẒAR*, *ʿIYĀN* (EXPERIENCE), *SUNNAH* AND *AL-ʿĀN*

They said: "You have narrated that the Prophet said: [My tomb is located above one of the entries to paradise] and [Whatever lies between my tomb and *minbar* is one of the gardens of paradise. Allāh, The Exalted and Glory said: [Beyond the Lote-tree and which none may pass. Near it is the garden of abode.<sup>81</sup>] He said: [And for a garden whose width is that (of the whole) of the heavens and of the earth prepared for the righteous.<sup>82</sup>] You also stated in another *ḥadīth*: [Paradise is located at the seventh heaven.] They said: [Here, there are contradiction and divergence.]"

Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that there are no contradiction and divergence in it. When (the Prophet) said: [Whatever (lies) between my tomb and *minbar* is one of the gardens of paradise]; he does not mean it as a garden in the real sense. He intended to inform that (the acts of) performing the prayers and

*Sūrah al-Najm*, 53: 14-15.

*Sūrah Āli ʿImrān*, 3: 133



remembering (Allāh) here would lead to paradise, that is, part of paradise. While in the expression: [My *minbar* is located above of the entries (ترعة) to paradise], the term ترعة refers to the entrance to the water hole. (This *ḥadīth*), therefore, means an entrance to paradise.”

160a. Abū Muḥammad said: “Abū al-Khaṭṭāb has narrated from Bishr ibn al-Mufaḍḍal and the latter from ‘Umar ‘Abd Allāh, *ma* of Ghufrah who narrated from Ayyūb ibn Khālīd al-Anṣārī inform that Jābir ibn ‘Abd Allāh al-Anṣārī said that the Prophet SAAS came out to meet them, saying: [Rejoice in the Abundance of the garden of paradise!] They asked: [Where is the garden of paradise O Prophet?] He said: [*Majālis* (sessions) for *dhikr* (God’s remembrance)!]”

160b. “Similarly, in another *ḥadīth*: [Anyone who visits a patient on the مخارف (مخرفة - its singular form) refers to طرق that means path or way. In the saying of ‘Uṭaybi ibn al-Khaṭṭāb: [I left you on the similar path (مخرفة) of enjoyment which also means the path. (The Prophet) in his expression: [Anyone who visits a patient are on the path to paradise] meant that (visiting the sick) is as if preparing one’s path to paradise. Similarly, sessions for *dhikr* would lead to the path of paradise. Likewise, in the saying of ‘Ammār ibn Yāsir: [Paradise is below the *bāriqah* (gleam of lightning)] which means the gleam of the sword and in another saying: [Paradise is under the shade of the sword]. Here, these (expressions) intend to say that *jihād* (endeavor or exertion)<sup>83</sup> lead to paradise, which also means that paradise depends on (*jihād*).”

160c. “Some people, however, held the opinion that the space located between (the Prophet’s) grave and *minbar* faced one of the angles:

<sup>83</sup> This exertion or endeavor encompasses physical and spiritual aspects.

gardens of paradise. (They also said) that the *minbar* faced one of the entrances to paradise. This means that (the locations between) these two places were considered as parts of paradise because on all sides (in all direction) they faced towards the sky. For me – the first interpretation is better – Allāh knows the best!”

## 2. EXAMPLE OF TWO CONTRADICTORY *ḤADĪTH*

They said: “You have narrated that the Prophet said: [The *imāmah* is of the (descendent) of Quraysh!] You also said that Abū Ḥudhayfah applied this *ḥadīth* in his support for the Anṣār on the day of the battle of Banū Sā‘idah. You also narrated that ‘Umar, on his deathbed said: [If Sālim, *mawlā* of Abū Ḥudhayfah was alive I will not hesitate on this case!] In fact, Sālim was not the *mawlā* of Abū Ḥudhayfah but he was the *mawlā* of an Anṣārī lady who had raised and liberated him. And he was connected to Abū Ḥudhayfah by a tie of an alliance. You also considered that an *imāmah* (leadership) could be (nominated) among the *mawlā* of an Anṣārī (if a person) has been the *mawlā* of Quraysh. And by this, (the *imāmah*) could then be elected because he was the *mawlā* of (Quraysh) at the same time the *mawlā* of the tribe of his origin. They said: Reinforce the *ḥadīth* the contradiction and divergence!]”

Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that there is no contradiction in the saying. There could be a contradiction if ‘Umar said: [If Sālim had been alive I do not have any doubt on his nomination as your leader or *amīr*!] But he only said: [I do not have any doubt about him!] this could have been (wrongly) interpreted and it is not what he has intended to mean. How could (people) assume

that 'Umar did not care for (the well-being of) the Muhājirūn w<sup>h</sup> the Prophet has affirmed (places) in paradise? Or that he did choose them although he had brought them (together) in consultation? Or that he doubted in the designation of Sālim as t<sup>h</sup> chief? These (assumptions) are grievously wrong and (obviously) erroneous judgment. In fact, 'Umar had consulted (the Muhājirūn discuss) the issue of choosing (an *imām*) to lead the prayer, insisted they choose three (nominees) and ordered his son, 'A<sup>l</sup> Allāh to made them carry out this order. It was then that he sp<sup>oke</sup> about Sālim: [If only that he was alive I do not have any doubt at him!] In relation to al-Jārūd al-'Abdī, he said: [If only 'Uwaymisī Banū 'Abd al-Qays was alive I would have أقدمه (put him forward chosen) him!] And the term - أقدمه shows that he does not thin<sup>k</sup> anybody else except for Sālim and ('Uwaymish) to lead Muhājirūn) in the prayer. Later on, they (temporally) agreed on choice of) Ṣuhayb al-Rūmī and ('Umar) requested him to lead prayer. (Ṣuhayb had to do so) until one of them, agreeable by all elected."

## XX. EXAMPLE OF *HADĪTH* INVALIDATED BY *NAẒ* AND *KHABAR*

163. They said: You have narrated that the Prophet said: [The rises in the horizon between the two horns of satan. Let's perform prayer upon sunrise!] They also said: [You attributed h<sup>is</sup> to satan and that they reached the sky. And the sun, which was t<sup>h</sup> the size of the earth, could move between its horns? With this you claimed that satan could move along the blood stream of Āda progeny and this contact (satan) was the smallest thing while in (former) contact (satan) was the biggest thing. You said that it

proper to perform prayer upon sunrise because at this time (the position) was between the two horns of satan. What could be (the position of) a person to the Almighty Allāh, when he performed the prayer during the sunrise and was between the two horns of satan? And what prevented him from performing his prayer to Almighty Allāh?"

4. Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that whoever denounces this *ḥadīth*, it means that the person does not believe in the creation of satan and genie. Indeed, Almighty Allāh has created them with the ability to change their state and able to disguise at times, as an old man or as a young man or as burning fire or as a dog or as genie and manifesting itself in the heaven or reaching to a man's heart or swimming through the blood stream. (Satan) have been defeated and mentioned by al-Qur'ān, the traditions narrated from the Prophet, the previous Prophets, ancient Books of Almighty Allāh and the ancient people. Indeed, Almighty Allāh has informed us in His Book that satan occupied in the heaven to listen (or get information) but (satans) were driven away by the shooting stars.<sup>84</sup> We were informed by Almighty Allāh that satan said: [I will mislead them and I will create in them false desire; I will order them to slit the ears of cattle and to deface the (fair) nature created by Allāh.<sup>85</sup>] However, satan does not appear before our (sight). How could it order us to do something if Almighty Allāh has not given (satan) the power to reach man's hearts, to create doubts in the mind, to adorn and instill desire as stated by Allāh the Exalted and Glory? Likewise, as narrated in the *ḥadīth* that satan was seen at times as an old *Najd* man as a frog or as a genie. In fact, Almighty Allāh named some genie

---

See *Sūrah al-Mulk*, 67: 5.

*Sūrah al-Nisā'*, 4: 119.



as men just like (ordinary) men and women and the Almighty said [True, there were among mankind who took shelter with persons among the genie<sup>86</sup>] and in relation to the pure women of paradise [restraining their glances, whom no man and genie before them have touched.<sup>87</sup>] This proves that the genie menstruates just like women menstruated and the term الطمث (menstruate) means لوطم بالتمية (having intercourse followed by bleeding)”

164a. Abū Muḥammad said: “We do not have the intention, in this book, to refute the *Zindīq* or the people who denied the manifestations of Allāh, the Exalted and Glory as well as rejected His Prophet. What we intend to do is to refute those who erroneously claimed that there existed some contradictions, divergences and incoherencies in the *ḥadīth*, committed by the Muslims. If there is a reason that leads a person to reject this *ḥadīth*, it could only be due to his inability to perceive it or his inability to understand the reason for not performing prayer during sunrise for (at this state) it lays between the horns of satan. We will show him the meaning so that he is able to comprehend – by the permission of Almighty Allāh – and that it appears reasonable to him and worthy to be examined.”

164b. “Indeed, (the Prophet) requested us not to perform prayer during sunrise because this is the time by which the sun worshipper prostrate to venerate the sun. There were many people of the past who worshipped the sun by prostrating themselves. Almighty Allāh has related to us the story of the kingdom of Sabā’ in which a hoopoe reported to Sulaymān, saying: [I found her and her people worshipping the sun besides Allāh. Satan has made their deeds seen

<sup>86</sup> *Sūrah al-Jinn*, 72: 6.

<sup>87</sup> *Sūrah al-Raḥmān*, 55: 56.

asing in their eyes.<sup>88]</sup> In fact, among the Arabs as well, there  
e people who worshipped the sun, venerated it and called it as  
idess. And al-A‘shā said:

[I know not fear until

kneel down before the goddess]

ere he meant) it as the sun. And some (Qur’ānic) reciters read:  
ill you leave Mūsā and his people, to spread mischief in the land,  
to abandon you (يترك) and the gods.<sup>89]</sup> The term يترك means  
ndon you and the sun which you worship.”

c. “The Prophet dislikes us to perform prayer during the time  
en the sun worshippers are worshipping their god – the sun. And  
teaches us that during that time, satan or *iblis* is facing itself  
ards sunrise. By prostrating to the sun it means that they are also  
strating to satan and thus making satan the object of veneration.”

d. “As for term ‘horns’ here, they are not what (the image) they  
gined them to be such as the horns of cow or sheep. The ‘horns’  
e refer to the side of the head and it has two horns, meaning  
ing two sides. And I have never seen a horn grows from places  
er than this part (of the head) and the fact that it is known as  
rn” is due to the place itself (of which it grows from). And that is  
y Arabs call a thing by the name of the place where it appears or  
erges due to certain reasons. When they said: رفع عقيرته (to raise  
legs)] they meant it as to raise his voice for when a man whose  
was being cut off, would raise his leg and scream for help. Since  
t time onwards, when it is intended for a man to raise his voice, it

---

*Sūrah al-Naml*, 27: 24.

*Sūrah al-A‘rāf*, 7: 127.

will be said to him: [Raise your leg!] And there are numerous examples of these types of sayings among the Arabs. As such this the reason why sunrise (or the eastern part) is expressed as: [This the point where the horns of satan rise up!] By this expression, also does not mean that it is referring to the horns of the cow that person imagines it to be, rather: [Here is the point where the head satan rises up!]"

164 e. "In relation to Dhū al-Qarnayn, Wahb ibn Munabbih said: [ is a man from Iskandariyyah, known also as al-Iskandarūs. He had dream that he came closer to the sun and was able to take off its two horns, one in the east and the other in the west! He told his dreams his people and (from that time onwards) they called him Dhū al-Qarnayn (the possessor of two horns). When it is said that a person has taken its two horns, it means that the person has taken both sides of (any object in discussion)."

164f. "The (term) "horn" also means locks of hair. Each lock of hair can be called a horn. And the Romans are called as [the horny men ذات القرون] because they kept long hair."

"The Prophet SAAS also intends to inform us that during sunrise the sun worshippers venerated the sun. And satan will also move as the sun moves. The sun moves according to its head (orbit). I therefore, requested us not to perform prayer during this time whereby the sun worshippers are worshipping both the sun and satan. Indeed, this is (perplexing) information for us and we do not know except of what have been informed to us. The information that I have informed you, however, constitutes an acceptable and irreproachable interpretation – Allāh knows best!"



4g. "The skeptics do not put forth this information and the likes  
cept to reduce the unseen elements to the sensible ones by  
ducing everything they know to those (sensible ones). It could be  
ings) either among the dead or alive and applying the norms of  
ysical beings to the spiritual beings. When they hear (others  
eaking about) the angels who carry the throne on their shoulders  
th their feet (walking) on the lower heaven, they simply reject (the  
formation) for it contradicts what their eyes visualize – hence,  
king: [How could a spiritual being transverses through the heaven  
d what is located between them and the earth as well as the spaces  
cated above it, without us seeing any of their traces? How could a  
eature be so huge? How could this (creation) be a spiritual being  
at has shoulders and feet?"]

When they heard that Jibrail at times appeared before the Prophet as  
Bedouin or as Dihyah al-Kalbī or as a young man or as in real form  
ith wings that govern the eastern and western part of the heaven,  
ey started asking: [How could he change from one form to another?  
ow could he do it, at times so small and at other times so huge  
ithout adding anything to his volume, his body or attributes?] Here,  
means that they can only (accept things) which their eyes can  
rceive."

f they heard (the saying) that satan could reach the hearts of the  
ogeny of Ādam and able to create doubts and bad thoughts (in their  
inds), they would ask: [Which entrance does it pass through?] Or  
t is possible for two spirits to coexist in the same body?] Or [How  
in it move through the blood stream?]"

54h. Abū Muḥammad said: "If they consider the unseen things in  
e light of the sensible manifestations of the omnipotence of Allāh,



the Exalted and Glory, they could understand that He is the One Who is able to cause all the water from the earth to flow into the sea since (the beginning) of His creation of the earth and what is (found) in it without adding and reducing anything from it. He is also able to digress (an abundant) flow of water through rivers such as the *Dajlā* (Tigre), *al-Furāt* (Euphrates) and *al-Nīl* (Nile) snaking through cities, villages, and monuments and ruins for a month and (He is able too) to dry it up leaving nothing except destruction. He is too able to do whatever they have denied. – Indeed, He is able to shake the earth despite its hugeness and thickness, its oceans, its mountains and its rivers, causing the mountains to hit each other, the (Abundance) water to recede, and the mountains to move from one place to another – He is Benevolence to the objects of His decree! He is the One Who widens the sight of human eyes and with its smallness and fragility, suffices (for a man) to perceive half of the horizon despite its immensity. (The man) is able to see the stars in the eastern and western (horizon) and whatever those exist between them. This (ability of sight) accomplishes a journey of five hundred years! (Allāh) also created angels whose earlobes and shoulders with a distance between them measuring five hundred years journey! What else could they refute, except the things that they know off? Could they see what their eyes do not show? Glory to Allāh! He is the Best Creator!”

## XXI. EXAMPLES OF TWO CONTRADICTORY *HADĪTH*

165. They said: “You have narrated that the Prophet said: [Every child is born according to *fiṭrah* (natural disposition). It is the parents who make out of him a Jew or a Christian. ] You also narrated that

miserable one is miserable since he is in the womb of his mother [the blessed one is blessed since he is in the womb of his mother]; when a drop of sperm congealed, Allāh the Exalted and Glory sends it an angel to inscribe its lifespan, sustenance, happiness and [sorrow] and that [(Allāh) rubbed off the back of Ādam and then took handfuls of clay and He said to it: {To paradise by My mercy!}, [and the other: {To hell and I am not interested!}] They said: [There is no contradiction and divergence. The people of *qadr* (free will) and the people of *ithbāt* (affirm the Attributes of God) use (these *aḥādīth*) to support their argument that leads to schism among Muslims.]”

5. Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that by the grace of the mighty Allāh, there is neither contradiction nor divergence. If the *ʿaṭāzīlites* comprehend well the meaning (of the *aḥādīth*), they will not differ from (the opinion of) the people of *ithbāt* (on the Existence of an Attribute of Allāh) and there will be no dispute (among Muslims). The term ‘*fiṭrah*’ here means beginning and creation and is based on the saying of His Almighty: [Praise be to Allāh Who created (out of nothing) the heavens and the earth<sup>90</sup>], meaning its beginning and in another saying of His: [So set your face steadily and fully to the faith<sup>91</sup>] which means the natural disposition by which He fashioned man.”

As for the expression: [Every child is born according to *fiṭrah*], (the prophet) was referring to the pact which man has been asked in the names of their parents: [...and made them testify concerning

---

*Sūrah Fāṭir*, 35:1.

*Sūrah al-Rūm*, 30: 30.

themselves, (saying): {Am I not your Lord?} They said: {Yea! We do testify!}<sup>92</sup>”

166a. “I do not know anybody who does not confess that he does not have a Creator and Protector even though he does not call Him by His name. Or worships other than Him so as to feel closer to Him or describes Him other than His attributes or relegates Him to a position that is incompatible to His Majestic position. And Almighty Allāh said: [If you ask them, who created them, they will certainly say Allāh!<sup>93</sup>] Therefore, all newborn in this world, is inclined to the true religion (*ḥanīf*) upon the pact and assertion made during the beginning of his creation and this runs through his spiritual reasoning. The Prophet said based on the saying of Allāh the Almighty and Praised be to Him: [I created all of my servants to incline to *ḥanīf* but it is satan that sways them away from the true religion and a Jew will teach his children to be Jews and a Magiar will teach his children to be Magians.] This means that the parents will teach their children accordingly. It does not mean that by the first profession of faith, a person is legally responsible to it or deserves any reward. Don't you see that when the children of unbelievers are among their parents, they are legally bound to their parents' religion and have no merit to (the *janāzah* prayer) if they die? But if they came out from their family and be with the Muslims ruler, they will be legally bound to the religion of the ruler's religion and have merit to (the *janāzah* prayer) if they die. With all this, it rests on the Omniscience of Almighty Allāh.”

166b. “In relation to the above *ḥadīth*, the dispute that lies between the people of *qadr* and *ithbāt* is (only) about (the meaning of) *fiṭrah*

<sup>92</sup> *Sūrah al-A'rāf*, 7: 172.

<sup>93</sup> *Sūrah al-Zukhruf*, 43: 87.

ording to the people of *qadr*, (the term *fiṭrah*) is synonymous to n and for them there is contradiction in the (above-mentioned) *ḥadīth*, while the people of *ithbāt* believe that *fiṭrah* means the which man has professed upon his creation. If only each of the *th* is applied according to its perspective, there will be no rences, or divergence between them.”

## I. EXAMPLE OF *HADĪTH* WHICH CONTRADICTS ITS BEGINNING AND ENDING

They said: “You have narrated from the Prophet that he had : [If anybody among you wakes from his sleep, let him not dip hands in a pot of water except he has washed his hand three s. This is because he knows not where he puts his hand during sleep (فإنه لا يدري أين باتت يده).] They said: [That *ḥadīth* is valid if he not say: {...this is because he knows not during his sleep, where uts his hands (فإنه لا يدري باتت يده). While asleep man knows the e of his hands, his body, his legs, his nose and his other organs of body. (But he knows not where he puts hands) and it is more ous if he has touched his private parts in his sleep. If a man hes his private parts while he is conscious, this will not invalidate *wuḍū’* (ablution). How could he touch it when he is unconscious? Almighty Allāh does not inflict (pain) on man things he knows While asleep, a man may in his dream repudiates (against gs), says blasphemy or lies, thinks of the wife of his neighbour fornicates in his sleep. There is no human law or divine law that shes these acts.”

Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that this is a mere mption, knowing something but ignoring other things. Indeed,



there are several *fuqahā'* among the people of *fiqh* who think that it is obligatory for people who have touched their private parts to have their *wuḍū'* again, whether awake or (after) sleeping. (They derive from the (abovementioned) *ḥadīth* and another *ḥadīth* that said [Whoever touches his private parts, it is obligatory for him to take his *wuḍū'*.] We, however, do not accept this thinking for we consider that the *wuḍū'* that (they) obliged upon those who have touched the private parts, as an act of washing the hands. Indeed, the private parts are the exits for excrements and impurities. Similarly, the *wuḍū'* that (they) imposed after touching the food cooked on fire, as an act of washing the hands from dirt or residues from cooking and roasting."

"We have explained this and we will again provide the evidence (here). Since the *wuḍū'* imposed (by them) upon touching the private parts means washing the two hands, then it is obvious why the Prophet SAAS has commended a man who upon awaking from his sleep, has to wash his hands before dipping them in a pot of water for he knows not where he has put his hands in his sleep. This is to signify that during sleep, he may have touched his private parts or anus which, risking him to have in his hands a drop of urine or trace of sperms if he has had sexual intercourse before falling asleep. If he dips his hands in a pot of water before washing it, the water becomes dirty. Thus, (the Prophet SAAS) explained that a man during his sleep may have unconsciously placed his hands on the private part or his anus."

"As for a man who, while awake, touches any of those parts, his hands will be sullied – for which he must not forget – he needs to

sh his hands before dipping them in a pot of water or before eating shaking hands (with others).”

### III. EXAMPLE OF *HADĪTH* SAID TO BE INVALID IN BEGINNING AND ENDING

١. They said: “You have narrated from the Prophet that he has bidden performing of prayer near a camel’s den for camels are hated from satan. His prohibition from performing the prayer near a camel’s den should not be ignored for (prayer) is a necessary act of devotion. However, when you add (to the expression that) camel is hated from satan (it is unacceptable) for we know that the Prophet knows well; camels breed camels just like the cows breed cows, asses breed horses, lions breed lions and flies breed flies.”

٢. Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that the Prophet and others know that camels breed camels and it is impossible that a female human has given birth to a camel or a camel breeds a satan. Indeed, he intended us to know that the origin of creations, camel was created in a species that originates from satan. This is proven and it is stated in another *ḥadīth*: [It was created from the *a’nān* of satan!] where he means to say that (*a’nān*) refers to surrounding or vicinity just like we say: [So and so reaches the *a’nān* of the sky], meaning surrounding or vicinity. If (the camels) have been created from such (sources), people will say: [It has been created from such sources) or wombs or loins and the likes.”

The Arabs used to link the camel as wild species and they said: [The wild she-camel!] (This is to show that) this is of the type that is most rebellious and difficult. They also claimed that the genies have large flocks of animals in a country of Hush and these animals

roamed with man's animals, which then resulted in wild offsprings. Ru'bah said: [Our flocks (breed) from Hush.] It is possible that from this point of view, the camels might be the offspring of the genie's camels and the *a'nān* of satan which also means from their surroundings. Anybody who denies this is the one who denies the existence of the genies and satan and he will only believe in what his eyes see and whatever his senses feel. These characteristics are related to the doctrines of the *Zindīqs* and the philosophers. It is said that these two groups are known as *al-dahriyyah* and has nothing to do with the doctrines of the Muslims.

#### XXIV. EXAMPLE OF *HADĪTH* SAID TO HAVE AN INTERNAL CONTRADICTION

171. They said: "You have narrated from the Prophet who said: [If dogs are not part of an *ummah* I will order it to be killed, however kill those dogs which are entirely black<sup>94</sup>] He added: [The black dog is demon.<sup>95</sup>] They said: [The order of this killing is it due to its black color or is it due to its (origin from) demon? Although he suggested sparing dogs (of other colors) in general for they are part of an *ummah*, but this fact in itself is not a reason to impose or obliging others to kill (the black dogs).]"

<sup>94</sup> *ʿAṣīdat al-Aḥwadhī*, 6:225 (No. 1489); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 2: 1069 (3205); *Al-Musnad*, 5: 626 (No. 16788), 5:341 (No. 20570-20571), 5:343 (No. 20585), 5:345 No. (20594); *Sunan al-Dārimī*, 2:90; *Al-Muʿjam al-Kabīr*, 11:349 (No. 11979); *Mawārid*, 1:468 (No. 1083); *Mishkāt al-Maṣābiḥ*, 2: 429 (No. 4102); *Kanz al-ʿUmmāl*, 11:44 (No. 40012), 11:48 (No. 40035-40036), 11: 49 (No. 40037-40038), 11:50 (No. 40040); *Al-Targhīb*, 4:67.

<sup>95</sup> *Majmaʿ al-Zawāʿid*, 4: 44 (No. 6109)



They also said that you have narrated that the Prophet SAAS red the killing of the dogs,<sup>96</sup> to the point that there is not even a dog left in Madīnah. How could he give such orders since the dogs are part of an *ummah*? And with this fact, why could it not be a reason that prevents him from imposing others to kill (the black dogs)? They also said that the reason for abandoning the killing is an outcome of the (similar) reason for implementing the killing.”

Abū Muhammad said: “We affirm that all species of animals created by Almighty Allāh are part of an *ummah* of their own whether they are dogs, lions, cows, sheep, ants, grasshoppers and the like. It is just the same as human beings are part of an *ummah*. Likewise, genies are part of an *ummah*, as Almighty Allāh said: ‘There is not an animal that lives on the earth, nor a being that flies on wings, but forms part of communities like you’<sup>97</sup>] which means the genies are just like us, searching for food from noon to night for protection against danger. In addition, Allāh Almighty communicates with them in the same way as He communicates with you O You assembly of genies and men! Came there not unto you messengers from amongst you?’<sup>98</sup>] When the Prophet ordered the dogs to be killed, in any circumstances, this would affect the proportion of the community and cut off its lineage.”

Dogs are useful for men in guarding their houses, watching and protecting their belongings as well as useful for hunting. Indeed, the Bedouins and the inhabitants of the desert would have no food or sustenance without the dog (helping them). Almighty Allāh said:

---

*Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 3:108 (No. 2846); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 2:1068 (No. 3200-3202); *Sunan al-Dārimī*, 2: 90; *Al-Muʿjam al-Kabīr*, 12: 384 (No. 13423), 12: 451 (No. 13639).

*Sūrah al-Anʿām*, 6:38.

*Sūrah al-Anʿām*, 6:130.



[Eat what they catch for you <sup>99</sup>] and this proves that Almighty Allā has created them for our benefit.”

172a. “Abū ‘Ubaydah has mentioned that there were two travelers and one of them had a dog. While they were on their journey, robbers attacked them. One of them fought but he was seized and buried up to his neck. Then the crows and vultures came hovering over him intending to peck and tear out his eyes. Seeing those birds hovering over its master, the dog continuously dug the soil until he was able to come out of it. His friend, on the other hand, managed to flee without giving him any help. On this matter, a poet said:

[His neighbour and companion runs away from him,

But his dog dug the soil and saved him even  
though it was beaten before]

There is no other animal that defends its master like a dog and not as devoted as it is, ever though it has been chased or beaten. There are numerous and true information on dogs but we dislike it and are forced to mention it. Dogs are not only part of an *ummah* but also species among the animals as well as the genies. Ibn ‘Abbās said [Dogs are one of the species of the *jinn* but are of the inferior kind of genie. If it comes to you while you are eating, throw it some food for it has a soul (*nafs*).] This means that (the dog) has eyes, with which they strike. The term *nafs* as in (Ibn ‘Abbās’s statements) means eye [It is said that so and so is the victim of the *nafs*] meaning – the victim of the evil eyes. (Ibn ‘Abbās also) said: [The *jānn* are the metamorphosis of the genies, just as monkeys are the metamorphosis

<sup>99</sup> *Sūrah al-Mā'idah*, 5:4.

he Israelites. It is not impossible that dogs are of a similar  
tion.]”

3. “This matter, however, could not be understood through  
option, analogy or reasoning. Indeed, the issue rests in whatever  
Prophet has informed us and in whatever has been informed by  
e who have heard from those who have seen him. They do not  
e any judgment on this matter except based on what they have  
d from the Prophet or listened from those who have heard from  
or the authentic historical tradition appearing in the ancient  
cs. However, this issue is not related to religious duties or  
native traditions. And this issue has nothing to do with us,  
ther the dogs are wild animals or genies or the product of  
amorphosis. If the dogs are wild, the Prophet has ordered the  
ng of the black dogs, as he said that they are satans and they are  
most ferocious, dangerous and ugliest among the species of the  
s. (In addition), this type of dog is prone to rabies as compared to  
rs and it is useless for it is the worst watchdog, the worst dog for  
ing and the laziest one.”

en (the Prophet) said: [It is satan!], he meant to say that it is the  
t malicious species. Likewise, (in a situation when) somebody  
: [So and so is satan!] or [He is really a rebellious satan!] or [He  
e real lion of ‘Ād!] or [He is the real wolf of ‘Ād!] he meant to  
that the person is akin to the (words used).”

en if the dogs are of the (offspring of) genie or metamorphosed  
a genie, the Prophet is only referring to the black dogs as satan,  
e, one has to kill them for they are harmful. Indeed, satan is the  
llious genie, the *hinn* is weak and inferior kind of genie.”

172c. "As for the Prophet's order to kill the dogs in Madīnah, th order does not contradict his words in any way: [If dogs are not p of an *ummah*, I would have commanded them to be killed.] Indeed his days, Madīnah was the place where the revelations came throu the angel of Almighty Allāh and the angel will not enter a hou when there is a dog or pictorial illustration."<sup>100</sup> This was narrated fr the Prophet."

Muḥammad ibn Khālid ibn Khidas narrated from Muslim i Qutaybah who then narrated from Yūnus ibn Abū Ishāq who narrat from Mujāhid and the latter from Abū Hurayrah who heard from t Prophet saying that Jibrīl informed him: "What prevented me fr coming to see you yesterday was that you have a curtain w pictorial illustrations hanging at the door of your house. There wa dog in your house, chase it away!"<sup>101</sup> The dog belonged to Ḥasan a Ḥusayn but was resting under their bed (*naḍḍ*). This proves that t angel disliked dogs whether in the houses or in the cities. Hence, t Prophet ordered the killing of the dogs or to reduce their numbers away from the places near to Madīnah but he did not order the killi of the dogs at places exterior to places where the angel revealed t revelation. Abū Muḥammad said: [The terms *al- naḍḍ* means bed i one spreads the sheet on top of it.]"

<sup>100</sup> 'Umdat al-Qārī, 10: 582 (No. 3225), 10: 669 (No. 3322), 12:50 (No. 400 Al-Musnad, 5:508 (No. 16346); Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr, 5:93 (No. 4686-469 5:94 (No. 4691-4692), 5:95 (No. 4695-4698); Al-Targhib, 4:45; K 'Ummāl, 15: 403 (No. 41570); Sunan Ibn Mājah, 2: 1203 (No. 3649).

<sup>101</sup> 'Umdat al-Qārī, 10: 581 (No. 3224), 10: 582 (No. 3225), Al-Musnad, 3:5 (No. 10197).

## V. EXAMPLE OF ḤADĪTH SAID TO BE INVALID IN ITS BEGINNING AND ENDING

. They said: "You have narrated that the Prophet said: [There are five perverse animals, which can be killed in sacred or non-sacred places like the crow, vulture, dog, snake, and mouse.<sup>102</sup>] He also said: [All those five animals and other five (animals) with them], and this is a virtuous practice. But to kill them for the reason of being perverse, is not possible since perversity and righteousness could not be attributed to these animals. Reptiles, wild animals and birds are neither satans, genie nor man, to be attributed to perversity or righteousness."

. Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that whoever believes these tales, wild animals and birds are not subject to rebellion or disobedience contradicts the Book of the Almighty Allāh, His Prophets and His Messenger as well as the previous Books of Allāh. Indeed, the Almighty Allāh informed us that His Prophet Sulaymān used to hunt the bird, asking: [Why is it I see not the hoopoe? Or is he among the absentees? I will certainly punish him with a severe penalty or execute him, unless he brings me a clear reason.<sup>103</sup>] This means a valid excuse and justification for its absence was sought. It is not possible for him to punish (the hoopoe) except in the case that it is sinful and disobedience. And sinful act and disobedience constitute perversion. If somebody is known as disobedient, he could not be known as perverse."

---

<sup>102</sup> *Umdat al-Qārī*, 7: 497 (No. 1826), 7: 499 (No. 1827); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 2: 3031 (No. 3087); *Al-Musnad*, 9: 275 (No. 24107), 9:373 (No. 24623), 9:392 (No. 24715), 9:438 (No. 4965), 9:514 (No. 25344), 10:117 (No. 26283), 10:121 (No. 26304); *Mishkāt al-Maṣābīh*, 2: 57 (No. 2699); *Kanz al-Ummāl*, 5: 37 (No. 11944); *Sunan al-Nasa'ī*, 5: 215 (No. 2879).  
<sup>103</sup> *Sūrah al-Naml*, 27:20-21.



“The story of the hoopoe was further explained by Almighty Allāh (in the Qur’ān). After it has been forgiven by Sulaymān, it said: [I have compassed territory that you have not compassed, and I have come to you from Sabā’ with true tidings. I found there a woman ruling over them and provided with every requisite; and she has a magnificent throne. I found her and her people worshipping the sun besides Allāh. Satan has made their deeds seem pleasing to their eyes and has kept them away from the path, so they receive no guidance kept them away from the path, that they should not worship Allāh Who brings to light what is hidden in the heavens and the earth and knows what you hide and you reveal.<sup>104</sup>]

“If these words came from a wise man or perhaps came from the Prophets, they were good statements – a motivation, an encouragement and a clear proof. Can it also possible that these statements were to come from a disobedient, perverse and immoral and (later be) rightly guided?”

“Almighty Allāh also explained about ants and what they have spoken, found in (the following verse): [And Sulaymān was *Dāwūd*’s heir. He said: O you people! We have been taught the speech of birds....<sup>105</sup>], which means that the birds are able to speak exactly like man is able to speak. The verse (continued): [At length, when they came to a lowly valley of ants, one of the ants said: O You Ants!<sup>106</sup> which means that the ants are able to speak just like man. (In other verse) He said: [There is not a thing but celebrates His praise and ye you understand not how they declare His glory.<sup>107</sup>] And elsewhere

<sup>104</sup> *Sūrah al-Naml*, 27:22-25.

<sup>105</sup> *Sūrah al-Naml*, 27:16.

<sup>106</sup> *Sūrah al-Naml*, 27:18.

<sup>107</sup> *Sūrah al-Isrā’*, 17:44.

ou mountains! Sing you back the praises (*awwibī*) of Allāh with  
And you birds (also)...<sup>108]</sup> (The term *awwibī*) means *sabbiḥi*  
ted).”

. Abū Muḥammad said: “I have read in al-Tawrāt and it said that  
on the fortieth day, had opened a small window which he made  
ark. Then, he set free a crow and it never came back even when  
water has receded from the surface of the earth. He then, sent a  
several times and it came back at night, having in its beak an  
leaf. He knew that the water has subsided from the surface of  
earth and he prayed to Almighty Allāh before putting a collar  
and the dove’s neck and painted its leg.<sup>109”</sup>

Muḥammad said: “I also have read in al-Tawrāt that Almighty  
1, upon the creation of Ādam, has said to him: [Eat whatever you  
e from the trees of the garden but do not eat anything from the  
of the knowledge of good and evil or you will die on the very  
you have eaten it.<sup>110]</sup> This also means that you will be  
formed to another situation after death.”

: snake is the most cunning animal among the earthly animals  
it said to the woman: [Both of you will not die even if you eat  
the tree. It is only that your eyes will be opened and you will be  
the goddess who knew the good and evil.] The woman took the  
and ate it, then persuaded her spouse to eat it as well, thus their  
were opened. They realized that they were naked. Then, they  
the fig leaves, weaved them to cover themselves and they heard  
oice of Almighty Allah from paradise and hid among the trees of

---

*Sūrah Saba*, 34:10.

*Genesis*, VIII: 6-12.

*Genesis*, II: 16-17.

the paradise. But He called them. Ādam said: [I heard your voice in the garden and I saw myself naked so I hid myself from your sight. Allāh said: [Who told you that you were naked, indeed you have eaten the fruit of the tree that I have forbidden you from eating. Adam replied: [It is the woman who persuaded me to eat.] And the woman replied: [It is the snake that persuaded me to eat.] Then Almighty Allāh said to the snake: [Since you have done this, you will be cursed and you will walk on your stomach. You will eat the soil and I will induce enmity between you and the woman as well as her children. They will crush your head and you will bite them at their heels.] He also said to the woman: [As for you, you will suffer a loss in your pregnancy, you will deliver your baby in pain and when you refer to your husband, he will dominate you.] He said to Adam [Cursed is the ground because of you. It will yield the thorns and you will get your food out of your sweat until the day you return to dust for you are created from the dust.<sup>111</sup>]

174c. Abū Muḥammad said: “Don’t you see that the snake has exceeded its bound and cheated, and Almighty Allāh cursed it and changed its creation and made the dust to be its subsistence? Is it possible for us now, not to call this animal as perverse and disobedient just as the crow that disobeyed Nūḥ?”

“The people of *nazar* were of the opinion that the crow (deserved) to be called as the separator for it has abandoned Nūḥ and went away. That is why they saw in (the crows) a bad sign and its caw announced separation and banishment. They also derived the term *ghurbah* (absence) from its name (*ghurāb*) and they expanded further the meaning of absence as [threw him far away] or [here is the

---

<sup>111</sup> Genesis, III: 1-19.



unge sheep] or [the strange griffon] which means that it came from r and with difficulty. Those terms were derived from the term *urāb* (crow) because it abandoned Nūḥ and went away from him.”

Id. Abū Muḥammad said: “Another proof could be referred from *ḥadīth* narrated by Muḥammad ibn Sinān al-‘Awfī who narrated m ‘Abd Allāh ibn al-Ḥārith ibn Abzā al-Makkī who also narrated m his mother Rā’īṭah bint Muslim and the latter from her father o said: [I was with the Prophet at *Hunayn* and the Prophet asked of my name<sup>112</sup> and I answered: *ghurāb*. He then said to me my ne as Muslim. The Prophet disliked him to be called *Ghurāb* :ause the crow (*ghurāb*) was perverse and disobedient and hence ‘urāb) was named as “Muslim” for the name Muslim was opposite *Ghurāb* that is, the crow disobeyed but ‘Muslim’ means submitted l it was derived from the term *al-istislām* which means self-render and submission.”

ic Prophet loved a beautiful name and disliked a bad name as we e mentioned in this book. However, if we put aside this matter l concentrate on the term “muslim” which indicates one who bably obeys and disobeys just like the snake, the crow and the use and then relate (the discussion to) the language of the Arabs l its vocAbūlary, we could possibly name those animals as ntioned to be *fāsiq* (sinful) which is synonymous to *khurūj* (went ) from someone who hurt him.”

is said that if the rind of the date peels off, the date will become e. Everything that comes out from something can be called verse (*fāsiq*). And Almighty Allāh said: [...Except *Iblīs*. He was

---

*Al-Mustadrak*, 4: 275.



one of the genies and he broke (*fasaqa*) the command of his Lord....<sup>113</sup>] this means that (the *Iblis*) escaped from the order of his Lord and the obedience which he owed to Him.”

“As for the snake it came out from its hole to hurt man by spoiling their food, biting them, sipping their drinks and spitting venom into it. Likewise, the mouse came out from its hole spoiling man’s food, gnawing their clothes, and setting fire to a person’s house with the oil-lamp. There is no other animal on earth that is more harmful than the mouse. The crow perched on the wound of the camel and pecked at it until it dies. This is why the Arabs called the crow as “*Ibnu Dāyah*” for it does nothing good but only steals man’s food.”

“The dog is a voracious and rapacious animal just like other wild beasts. Those animals as mentioned could be possibly known as perverse for they came out to harm man with their misdeeds. Thus, here is the solution for those who refused to apply the idea of obedience or disobedience to those animals. Perhaps, it is bad!”

## XXVI. EXAMPLE OF *HADĪTH* INVALIDATED BY *NAẒAR*

175. They said: “You have narrated that the Prophet (before he) died has pawned his coat to a Jew for a certain amount of barley.<sup>114</sup> Glory to Allāh! Is there not among the Muslims or noble people or a lender who could assist him? Indeed, Almighty Allāh has extended His bounties to them, enabling them towards the opening of many countries and they benefited from the tax collection that is, from Yaman to Bahrain and to Oman and not excluding the ‘white land’<sup>115</sup>

<sup>113</sup> *Sūrah al-Kahf*, 18:50.

<sup>114</sup> ‘*Undat al-Qārī*’, 8: 366 (No. 2096).

<sup>115</sup> White land here refers to the lands that are fully cultivated.

*lajd* and *Hijāz*. In addition, there are several rich companions like *imān*, ‘Abd al-Rahmān and the likes, where are they?”

y said: “This is a sheer lie! And the one who spread this lie  
nds to praise the (practice of) asceticism and scarcities in the life  
e Prophet. This is an incorrect way of praising the Prophet.”

ow could it possible for a person to be hungry if he (has the  
ity) to equip his armies, to scarifice one hundred animals and to  
om Allāh has granted bounties such as Fadak and others? Mālik  
Anas reported from Abū al-Zubayr and the latter from Jābir who  
: [The Prophet slaughtered seventy camels at Ḥudaybiyyah. Each  
el is meant for seven people.<sup>116</sup> And during ‘*umrah al-qaḍā*’, the  
phet has slaughtered sixty camels in compensation of the ‘*umrah*,  
n which the polytheists have prevented him and others from  
forming it.] How could the Prophet be hungry when he is able to  
d seven orchards in ‘Āliyyah? And how could he fail to find  
ebody to lend him money to the point that he has to pawn his  
t just to get some barley?”

. Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that (the Prophet’s behavior)  
ot like what has been said; it is exaggerated and indeed is  
table! This is because with his wealth the Prophet gives  
erence to others over himself and distributes it to the deserving  
ple among his companions, the poor, the needy and the  
rtunate ones, particularly during the difficult times of the  
slims. He never rejects a beggar or hesitates to give when he  
id them, nor does he amass *dirham* after *dirham*. Umm Salamah  
to him: [O Prophet of Allāh! I see that you are sad, are you

---

*Al-Tamhīd*, 5:5.

sick?] He replied: [No! It is because of seven *danānīr*, which received yesterday. I forgot and left them in the corner of the bed I spent the night without distributing them.<sup>117</sup>]

176a. “‘Ā’ishah was crying when she spoke about the Prophet: my father! He never sleeps on the soft bed or satisfies himself (to fullest) with barley bread.<sup>118</sup>] This statement, however, is applicable to one of two events, as follows. First, (the Prophet) gives preference to others over himself, to the point that he left nothing for himself to eat. This is one of his qualities. And Almighty Allāh said: [But give them preference over themselves, even though poverty was their lot<sup>119</sup>] or else he never eats to his content the barley bread and likes for he hated to eat something to his satisfaction. Indeed, many virtuous men and *mujtahidūn* hated to eat things to their satisfaction and the Prophet was the most dignified one among them as well as the most proper to be followed.”

176b. “Abū al-Khaṭṭāb narrated from Abū ‘Āṣim ‘Ubayd Allāh ‘Abd Allāh who then narrated from al-Muḥabbar ibn Hārūn who narrated from Abū Yazīd al-Madanī and the latter from ‘Abd Raḥmān ibn al-Muraqqi’ that the Prophet said: [Almighty Allāh creates not any container which is full of evil more than the stomach, hence it is inevitable for one to fill one-third of it with food, one-third with drink and one-third is (empty) for it to aerate.]”

“Mālik ibn Dīnār said: [The believer is likened to a sheep (ma‘būrah)?] which means a sheep that swallows a needle in its hay. It is neither useful for the sheep nor for the hay. Somebody said Ibn ‘Umar about *jawārish* (medicinal herbs for gastric) and

<sup>117</sup> *Al-Musnad*, 10: 178 (No. 26576), 10:213 (No. 26734).

<sup>118</sup> *‘Umdat al-Qārī*, 14: 420 (No. 5415).

<sup>119</sup> *Sūrah al-Ḥashr*: 59:9.



lied: [What do I do with it? I have not eaten anything to (the least satisfaction) since a long time ago!] This means that he has stained himself from food even when he was in need of it.”

Al-Ḥasan was eating and a man came to visit him and he said: [Eat!] and the man replied: [I have eaten and I have no appetite for anything now!] (Al-Ḥasan) replied: [Glory to Allāh, how can he eat anything to the point that he has no appetite for other things?] Mālik ibn Anas or somebody else said: [I wish I can sustain myself by sucking pebbles, for I feel ashamed of Almighty Allāh seeing me frequenting the toilet.] Bakr ibn ‘Abd Allāh said: [I do not find life in food unless I replace my full stomach with hunger, or (I do not find life) unless I stop wearing my clothes by using the clothes when I was a slave, or (I do not find life) unless I need neither eat nor wash my hands after eating.]”

To relate the event of) ‘Ā’ishah’s crying: [By my father! Whoever eats barley bread to his (fullest) satisfaction; (he needs to know) that the Prophet never eats the wheat bread or barley bread to his (fullest) satisfaction] for one or the other reason explained earlier. In addition, when she said (using the phrases) “the most tasteless kind of food” (*ḥassa qal-ṭa‘āmayn*), she intends to make clear that, if the Prophet ever eats them to his (fullest) satisfaction, then (it goes without saying that he did the same) to other kinds of food.”

‘Umar said: [If I want I can always have roasted meat brought to me with some *ṣināb*<sup>120</sup> as well as the cooked camel hump.] He added: [If I want, I can always have someone bring me a young animal to be slaughtered, (to be cooked and) mixed with some cereal, raisin and

---

*Ṣināb* refers to a kind of spices made of mustard and dry raisin.



fat until it looks like the gazelle blood and the likes. How (I abstain myself when) I heard Almighty Allāh said to some of you {You received your good things in the life of the world, and you took your pleasure out of them; but today shall you be recompensed with the penalty of humiliation....<sup>121</sup>}”

“Indeed, a rich but greedy man can be a victim of circumstances whereby his wealth is not at his disposal even though he owns furniture, and other treasures to be loaned or pawned. (Contrary) how could a man who hardly owns a single *dirh* fortune offer others charity and (needless to say) to prevent calamity – but thrive (for himself)?”

176c. “How could the wealthy Muslims among the companions of the Prophet know that he is in need of food since he never reveals it to them? Indeed, we also observe this phenomenon among ourselves and among our close ones. We also see a man who in dire need of something, hardly troubles his children, his family, his neighbours to the point that he sells his precious thing or borrows from a stranger or person unknown to him.”

176d. “Indeed, the Prophet pawned his coat to a Jew, because the Jews in his era, engaged in food transaction. The Muslims did not engage in transaction with (the Jews) for the Prophet forbade them from involving in monopoly.<sup>122</sup> Why must they reproach the Prophet with this issue and express their (so called) amazement to the fact that some heretics have accused al-A'mash of lying on this issue

<sup>121</sup> *Sūrah al-Aḥqāf*, 46: 20.

<sup>122</sup> Monopoly refers to a system of transaction whereby a small number of people who own a very large share in something, so preventing others from sharing it.

## VII. EXAMPLE OF *HADĪTH* SAID TO BE INVALIDATED ANALOGICAL REASONING

They said: "You have reported that—the Prophet had commissioned ‘Amr ibn al-‘Āṣ to make judgment among the people, ‘Amr had said to him: [I will judge in your presence, O Prophet!] : Prophet replied: [Do it! If you judge (properly), it will be counted for you, ten good actions but if you make a mistake, it will be counted only one good action for you.<sup>123</sup>]"

They added that such a statement should not be attributed to mighty Allāh for the personal effort (*Ijtihād*) of ‘Amr could be a correct judgement as well as a wrong judgement. He does not have to endeavour for it but to try to do so. The work, the resolution, the real hardship which he has to bear in giving a good judgement is not differ from anyone who had endured like him in reaching an erroneous judgement. What was the reason of crediting him with one good action in one case and ten good actions in the other case?"

1. Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that the personal effort in reaching a correct judgment is not identical to the personal effort in making an erroneous (judgment). If this principle, (as claimed by us) is valid, the Jews, Christians, Magians and Muslims will be of equal (standing). The supporters of various doctrines will have the rights to the same rewards for their personal effort and those supporters as well as their doctrine will be of the same value. Thus, it will lead them to think that they are on the true path and their adversaries are on the wrong path."

---

*Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, 6, (No. 10); *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 3: 299 (No. 3574); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 2:776 (No. 2314); *Al-Musnad*, 6: 244 (No. 17837); *Mishkāt al-Maṣābīḥ*, 2: 333 (No. 3732); *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, 6:7 (No. 14597).

Abū Muḥammad said: "However, to our mind, (the end result) of the personal effort of each individual rests on the *tawfīq* (succor) granted by Almighty Allāh. There will be a lot to discuss on this point as this is not the (suitable) place for it. A man has directed two persons to search for his missing animal and asked them to give their full effort to search for it by promising them a reward if they were successful. One of them had walked fifty kilometers to search for the animal and he troubled himself as well as having a sleepless night but returned empty-handed. The other man walked at a pleasant pace for about a kilometer but returned with the animal. Hence, the one who found the animal deserved the great reward and the valuable presence even though the other one endured more difficulties and troubles than him. What will happen if both of them put in the same effort (for the search)? However, it happens that the act of a man is of the same worth with that of others and it is the Almighty Allāh Who decides to give His preference to anybody He wants. Indeed, He does not owe anything to anybody and nobody has any right over Him."

178a. Abū Muḥammad said: "I have read in the Gospel that 'I (Jesus) had said to the *ḥawāriyyūn* (disciples): [The kingdom of heaven is like a man who came out at dawn to hire the workers at his vineyard on the condition that he will pay each and everyone of them a *dīnār* per day and then he sent them to his vineyard. Three hours later when he came out he saw some people sitting idle at the marketplace and said to them: {Go to my vineyard, I will give you what is fair} and so they went there. Later on, at the sixth hour, he came out and again at the ninth hour as well as at the eleventh hour. Then, in the evening he said to his man: {Give the workers their wages starting from the last one until you reach the first one.} So the man gave the workers their wages equally. When they received the



ges they were upset with the owner of the vineyard and said: {The worker had worked for only one hour but received the same ges as us.} He replied: {I don't ill-treat you, I have given ording to the condition and I have given my generosity to all of i, after all, the wealth belongs to me and I will do what I want with Hence, the first shall be last and the last one shall be the first.<sup>124</sup>}]"

## VIII. EXAMPLE OF TWO CONTRADICTIONARY *HADĪTH*

1. They said: "You have reported that the Prophet had said: hoever contemplates on doing any good action but does not omplish it, will only accrue one good action but if he performs it, will accrue ten good actions.<sup>125</sup>] You also reported that the ntion (*niyyah*) of a man is worth more than his act.<sup>126</sup> Therefore, he first *ḥadīth*, the intention is worth less than the act but in the ond *ḥadīth*, it is worth more than the action. There are tradiction and divergence in the *ḥadīth*."

1. Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that there is no contradiction, ise be to Almighty Allāh. Anyone who contemplates on (doing a) d action but did not accomplish is different from the one who had omplished it. This is because the person who contemplated did act, while the other has acted but without (giving much) thought is action. As for the saying of the Prophet that a man's intention is th more than his action, this means that Almighty Allāh grants the ver the eternity of paradise for his intention and not for his act. If believer is rewarded for his act, the idea of eternity is not

---

Cf. *Matthew*, XX: 1-16.

*Al-Musnad*, 3:17 (No. 7200), 3: 384 (No. 9337), 3: 562 (No. 10471); *Mawārid*, 1: 40 (No. 31); *Ṣaḥīḥ Ibn Hibbān*, 14: 45-6 (No. 6171).

*Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, 6: 185 -6 (No. 5942).



applicable since he acted it for only a few specified years. Hence, the rewards accrued to him are according to that specified time and the time which is twice as much of the time. Indeed, Almighty Allāh will grant the eternity of paradise upon one's intention. This is because the believer has intended to obey Almighty Allāh forever, and his obedience will persist no matter whether He extends his life forever (or not). When he dies, Allāh will reward him for his intention. Similarly, to the infidel, his intention is worse than his act. This is because the infidel has an intention to lead his life as an infidel. And his infidelity will persist no matter whether He extends his life forever or not. When he dies, (Allāh) will (reward) him for his intention.

## XXIX. EXAMPLE OF ḤADĪTH SAID TO BE INVALIDATED BY THE BOOK AND NAẒAR

181. They said: You have reported that the Prophet had stopped at the well of Badr and said: [O 'Utbah ibn Rabī'ah! O Shaybah ibn Rabī'ah! and so and so, have you found that whatever your Lord has promised to be true?] [Indeed we found that whatever our Lord has promised us is true.<sup>127</sup>] Somebody was asking him about this saying and he then replied: [By the One who holds my soul in His hand; truth they are listening just as you are listening.<sup>128</sup>] Almighty Allāh also said: [But you make those who are buried in graves to hear.<sup>1</sup>] He also said: [Truly you cannot make the dead to listen.<sup>130</sup>] They also reported that the Prophet had said on the day of *al-Aḥz*

<sup>127</sup> *Al-Musnad*, 4:210 (No. 12020), 4:524 (No. 13775), 4: 572 (No. 14066); *Ki al-'Ummāl*, 10: 408 (No. 29979).

<sup>128</sup> *'Umdat al-Qārī*, 12: 27 (No. 3976).

<sup>129</sup> *Sūrah Fātir*, 35:22.

<sup>130</sup> *Sūrah al-Naml*, 27: 80.

tions), thus [Allāh, the Lord of the decayed bodies and the humiliated spirits]. When Ibn ‘Abbās asked the Prophet about the spirits: [Where do the spirits go when they are separated from the bodies and where do the bodies go when they are decayed.] He replied: [Where does the light of the lamp go when it is extinguished where does the sight go when one is blind and where does the heart (of man) go when he is sick? Ibn ‘Abbās replied: [No where!]] Then the Prophet answered: [So do the spirits, when they are separated from the bodies.] Those statements, however, do not contradict the sayings of the Prophet: [They are listening just as you are listening] and [You cannot see the torment of the grave.]”

Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that the idea that Almighty Allah resurrects those who are in the grave even if their bodies had decayed and the bones had decomposed and reduced to ashes conforms to intellectual discernment and is authenticated by *nazar*, the Books and the traditions. And certainly the idea that they will be resurrected upon their death in the *barzakh*, also conforms to intellectual discernment and is authenticated by *nazar*, the Books and traditions.”

In the Book, Almighty Allāh said: [In front of the fire will they be brought morning and evening and the sentence will be on the day that judgement will be established, cast you the people of Fir‘aūn into the severest penalty.<sup>131</sup>] This means that those who rejected (faith in Allah), upon death, they will be (brought) in front of the fire, morning and evening, before the day of judgement as well as on the day of judgement and they will be severely tormented.”

---

*Sūrah Ghāfir*, 40:46.

“Almighty Allāh also said: [Think not of those who are slain in Allāh's way as dead. No, they live finding their sustenance in the presence of their Lord. They rejoice in the bounty provided by Allāh and with regard to those left behind, who have not yet joined them (in their bliss) the martyrs glory in the fact that on them is no fear (or cause to grieve).<sup>132</sup>] This relates to the favour granted by Almighty Allāh to the martyr of Badr; May Allāh has mercy on them. When they were exhumed from the pit of the canal (even though they had died) they were sweating (*raṭḥan yatathannawn*) someone exclaimed (in amazement): [We will never refute anything again after this!]”

182a. “I heard Muḥammad Ibn ‘Ubayd had narrated from Ibn ‘Uyaynah that Abū al- Zubayr narrated from Jābir. The latter reported that Mu‘awiyah intended to canalize the water-source which he had dug. According to Sufyān, the water-source is known as Al Ziyād. In Madīnah he invited the Madīnites who have had the relatives slain, to gather their remains. Jābir said that they came to exhume the dead bodies but found sweating bodies and when the spade, accidentally hit a leg of one of the dead men, blood oozed out. Abū Sa‘īd al-Khudrī said: [Nobody can ever deny anything after this!] ‘Ā’ishah bint Ṭalḥah had seen her father in her dream and he said to her: [O my little daughter! Take me out from this place for I suffer from the humidity!] So (‘Ā’ishah) exhumed him (from his grave) after thirty years or so. She (found) that he was lying in a watery place but looked very fresh and nothing had changed him. Then she buried (her father) in *Hijriyyīn*, Baṣrah. This (work of

<sup>132</sup> *Sūrah Āli ‘Imrān*, 3: 169-170.

umation was entrusted to ‘Abd al-Raḥmān ibn Salamah al-mī.”

These facts are well-known and they are valued as visual (*‘iyān*) testimony. If it is possible for those martyrs to be alive and be near to their Lord, who sustained them, it is also possible for them to be happy and rejoice.<sup>133</sup> Likewise, why will it not be possible for their enemies, who waged war against (the martyrs) is alive but tormented in the hell fire? If it is possible for the dead to be alive, why will it not be possible for them not to listen? Indeed, the Prophet SAAS had informed us and he is certainly right.”

b. “As for the tradition stated by the Prophet on Ja‘far ibn Abū Ja‘far: [He is flying with the angels in the paradise and he had called him the man with two wings<sup>134</sup>] as well as other traditions from the Prophet on Munkar and Nakīr on the torment of the grave and (the Prophet’s) invocation: [I seek refuge from (Allāh) against the temptations of life and death. I seek refuge from You against the torment of the grave as well as from the temptations of al-Masīḥ and Ijāl. <sup>135</sup> All those traditions are authentic and one should not doubt them. If such traditions are false then nothing is true in our religion and so are the traditions of our Prophet.”

c. “In relation to the saying of Almighty Allāh: [But you make those who are buried in graves to hear<sup>136</sup>] and truly [You cannot

---

Cf. *Sūrah Āli ‘Imrān*: 169-170.

*‘Ārḍat al-Aḥwadhī*, 7: 155 (No. 3763); *Al-Mu‘jam al-Kabīr*, 2: 108 (No. 1468), 2: 107 (No. 1466 and 1467); *Al-Targhib*, 2: 314; *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, 11: 661 (No. 33189), 11: 663 (No. 33205).

*‘Umdat al-Qūrī*, 10: 133 (No. 2822) and 10: 134 (No. 2823), 15: 461 (No. 6367).

*Sūrah al-Naml*, 27:80.



make the dead to listen<sup>137</sup>], they have nothing to do with the above said matter, for the word *al-mawtā* (dead) means the ignorant one who are (alluded to be) the people of the grave. The real meaning (from those two verses) is that, you are unable to make somebody to understand (a thing) since Almighty Allāh had created him to be an ignorant person. And you are unable to make anybody to hear you since Almighty Allāh had created him to be a deaf person and remote from His guidance. Within those verses also, there are proofs of what we have mentioned earlier that the blind (*al-a'mā*) and the seeing (*al-baṣīr*) are not alike.<sup>138</sup> The term *al-a'mā* means the infidel and *al-baṣīr* means the believer. (In the verse): [Nor are *al-ḡulumāt* (the depth of darkness) and *al-nūr* (the light)<sup>139</sup>], the term *al-ḡulum* means the infidel while *al-nūr* means the faithful. (In the verse): [Nor are the *ḡillu* (chilly shade) and the *ḡarūr* (genial heat) of the sun<sup>140</sup>], the term *al-ḡillu* means the paradise and *al-ḡarūr* means the hell-fire. (In another verse): [Nor are alike those that are *al-aḥyā'* (living) and those that are *al-amwāt* (dead)<sup>141</sup>], the term *al-aḥyā'* (those that are living) refers to the intelligent ones while *al-amwāt* refers to the ignorant ones. (In the verse): [Allāh can make any that He wills to hear, but you cannot make those to hear who are buried in graves<sup>142</sup>], (the verse) gives the meaning that you are unable to make the ignorant to understand since they are just like the dead in the graves. (In fact) there are numerous passages of similar (tone) in al-Qur'ān. Nonetheless, the dead ones (*al-mawtā*) to whom (al-Qur'ān) refers to as the ignorant ones, does not in any case relate to the martyr or

137 *Sūrah Fāṭir*, 35:25.

138 *Sūrah Fāṭir*, 35:14.

139 *Sūrah Fāṭir*, 35:20.

140 *Sūrah Fāṭir*, 35:21.

141 *Sūrah Fāṭir*, 35:22.

142 *Sūrah Fāṭir*, 35:22.

: and (it is incorrect) for people to refer to this argument against [his is because those martyrs are alive as affirmed by Almighty h.”

1. “As for the Prophet's saying: [Lord of the decayed bodies and annihilated spirits], he was referring to something which is known to all people and what is visible to them. But if something is they considered it invalid and annihilated. (In the sight of) Allāh, knows that (the martyrs), are not being annihilated. Don't you see a healthy, big and fat man, can lose half or one third of his body weight when he falls sick for a day or two? We don't know where the soul has gone to, for us it has disappeared and only Almighty Allāh knows where it is and what happens to it. If one fills some water in a glass container and leaves it aside for a day, (one will observe) some part of the water would have evaporated due to heat. The water will completely evaporate if one leaves it for a long period of time. It is not possible for the glass to absorb the water or permeated by the water. We are unsure where the content of the container goes but this is known only to Almighty Allāh. If we extinguish the light of a lamp, it dies off and to us it just vanishes mysteriously but we do not know where it goes. It is Almighty Allāh Who knows how and where it goes. And so do the souls; for us, they are annihilated. The Prophet informed that they are in the bladder of a green bird,<sup>143</sup> located between the higher region of the heaven and valley of the hell, eddying within the air and the like.”

## X. EXAMPLE OF TWO CONTRADICTIONARY ḤADĪTH

---

*Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 15: 676 (No. 42689).

183. They said: "You have narrated that the Prophet said: [Be in agreement with the best ones among you, they will be your delegation to paradise. Prayer is your offering, do not put forward except the best among you.] You also reported: [Perform your prayer with anybody whether he is a good or bad man and it is allowable whether the *imām* is a good or bad man.<sup>144</sup>] Hence, there is divergence and contradiction in the *aḥādīth*."

184. Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that there is neither divergence nor contradiction between them; by the grace of Allāh. The first and the second *ḥadīth* must be applied in their proper perspective. If each of the *ḥadīth* is viewed from its own context, there will be no contradiction. The saying: [Be in agreement with the best among you, they will be your delegation to paradise and do not put forward except the best among you], the Prophet was referring to the *imām* of the mosque among the tribes within the localities, so that the best, the pious and the good reciter of al-Qur'ān among them would be selected and not the illiterate or the wicked one."

"As for his saying: [Perform your prayer with anybody whether he is a good or bad man] and that [It is allowable whether the *imām* is a good or bad man], the Prophet was referring to the leader who would unite and lead his people in the congregational prayer or the prayer of the *a'yād*. (He also urged the Muslims) not to rebel against the leader or to disassociate oneself from the community of the Muslims even if the leader is a perverse man (*fājir*). This is because the *imām* is indispensable, whether he is a good or perverse man. Under th

144

*Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 6:54 (No. 14815); *Kashf al-Khafā'*, 2: 37; Abū al-Faraj 'Abd al-Rahmān, al-Jawzī (510 – 597 A.H), *Al-'Ilal al-Mutanāhiyah*, prefaced by al-Shaykh Khalīl al-Mays (Bayrūt: Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyyah, 1983), 422 (No. 719), hereafter cited as *Al-'Ilal*.

dition, the smaller the number of people, the better it will be organized). This idea is in line with the saying of al-Ḥasan: [Man not do without *wazā'ah* (leader)], which means that a leader who teaches the people, would prevent them from committing evil acts, shedding blood and confiscating the illegal property.]”

## XI. EXAMPLE OF TWO CONTRADICTORY *HADĪTH*

. They said: You have reported that the Prophet said: [Whoever is killed in defending his wealth, he is a martyr.<sup>145</sup>] You also reported he said: [Stay at home, if they come, searching for you, stay in your room. And if they force the door, say to them: Pay for my sin and your sin. Be the servant of Allāh who is killed and not the servant of Allāh who kills.<sup>146</sup>] Indeed, Almighty Allāh has set the example of the two sons of Ādam. He selected the best between them and left the bad one.<sup>147</sup>] This *ḥadīth* contradicts the former.”

. Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that each *ḥadīth* (should be viewed) from its own perspective and not from the other or else there will be divergence (between them). The Prophet when he stated: [Whoever is killed in defending his wealth, is a martyr], intended to explain that whoever fights against the robbers to defend his properties and is killed in his house or during his journey, (is a martyr). And in another *ḥadīth*: [If you see a black man in your

<sup>145</sup> *Umdat al-Qārī*, 9: 248 (No. 2480); *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 4:246 (No. 4772); *ʿAridat al-Aḥwadhī*, 6: 151 (No. 1418, 1419, and 1421); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 2:861 (No. 2580); *Al-Sunan al-Kubrā*, 3:377; 8:323; 8:582; *Al-Mustadrak* 3:639; *Al-Muʿjam al-Kabīr*, 1:153 (No. 353 and 534); *Majmaʿ al-Zawāʿid*, 6:264 (No. 10462), 6:265 (No. 10465), 6:265 (No. 10467); *Kanz al-Ummāl*, 4:416 (No. 11180); 4:419 (No. 11197); 4:419 (No. 11239); *Mishkāt al-Maṣābīḥ*, 2: 274 (No. 3512); *Al-Targhīb*, 2:340.

<sup>146</sup> *Umdat al-Qārī*, 16: 347 (No. 7083).

<sup>147</sup> *Al-Musnad*, 6:287 (No.18004).



house, do not be amazed with him] which means, fights against him with the weapon. This is the perspective of the first *ḥadīth*. But, when the Prophet said: [Stay at home, if they come searching for you, stay in your room. And if they force the door, say to them pay for my and your sin; be the servant of Allāh who is killed and not the servant of Allāh who kills]. This action is to be done, during a chaotic period and when there are differences of opinion in interpretation between people, or rivalry between two leaders in which, each leader seeks power and claims the right for such and such a reason. The Prophet urged people to stay in their houses during (a chaotic period), and not to draw out their sword or to kill anybody. This is because nobody knew between the two factions, which is right and which is wrong and this (is) important in protecting one's religion. (And for this reason), the Prophet also (warned) that during this chaotic period, the (victim of a murder and the murderer will be destined to hell. <sup>148</sup>]

186a. "As for the saying of Almighty Allāh: [If two parties among the believers fall into a quarrel, make peace between them; but if one of them transgresses beyond bounds against the other, then fight against the one that transgresses until it complies with the command Allāh. <sup>149</sup>] This order is still applicable to all even after the period of reconciliation and injustice has ended. Indeed, it is incumbent upon one, two or three persons or the masses (as a whole) to reconcile the conflict between the two factions. However, if it is (achievable yet), it is preferable for us to stay at home, to protect religion, our wealth and ourselves."

<sup>148</sup><sup>148</sup> 'Umdat al-Qārī, 16: 347 (No. 7083); 'Aridat al-Aḥwadhī, 8: 196 (No. 21)<sup>149</sup><sup>149</sup> Sūrah al-Ḥujurāt, 49:9.

## XII. EXAMPLE OF *HADĪTH* SAID TO BE INVALIDATED *NAZAR* AND *KHABAR*

'They said: "You have reported that al-A'mash has narrated from Ibn al-Murrah that according to Abu al-Bukhturī, 'Alī had said: [I was sent to Yaman to negotiate reconciliation among the people there, but I said to him: {I have no experience in making judgment.} When he patted my chest with his hand and said: {O Allāh! Guide his heart and make his speech eloquent.}<sup>150</sup> Since that time, I never hesitate in making a judgment, until the day I sat (with you) in that session.] They also reported that ('Alī) had rendered different judgments on the case of *ummahāt al-awlād* (slave mothers). He has decided on the case but later on changed it. He had also rendered different judgments on the status of the grandfather. He said: Whoever loves to enter the lowest part of the burning hell let him render little consideration of the status of the grandfather.] In another case, he regretted his judgment on the burning of the apostates after being informed of the *fatawā* by Ibn 'Abbās.<sup>151</sup> Apart from that, 'Alī lashed a man eighty times for drinking wine and the man died of the lashing. Then 'Alī paid the blood-money and said: [I pay blood-money for this is the rule which we have established between the Muslims.] But later on 'Alī recommended 'Umar to execute (the ruling of) eighty lashes for drinking wine. 'Alī had also decided to stone to death the liberated slave (*mawlā*) of a wood merchant but he heard the saying of 'Uthmān: [It is obligatory to exercise the legal punishment (*ḥadd*) on an identically known but guilty convict.] However, in this case she was not (identically) known to him and in fact she was a Persian lady, and finally 'Alī

*Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 2:774 (No. 2310); *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 13:120 (No. 36386), 13:150 (No. 36467).

*'Umdat al-Qārī*, 16:199 (No. 6922).

accepted 'Uthmān's advice and called off his intention (to stone her to death)."

"(In other instances) 'Alī had a discussion with Abū ibn Thābit on the position of a slave who redeemed himself (*mukātab*), but Zayd managed to reduce him to silence. In relation to two arbitrators, he had said:

[Indeed, I have stumbled on the stumbling block

For which I shall not stand again

I shall be more skilful in future and I shall persevere

And I will combine various predominant opinions.]

187a. "Dāwūd ibn Abū Hind reported according to al-Sha'bī that 'Alī had reverted to his opinion that, it is forbidden 'to make three times',<sup>152</sup> amputate the hand at the knuckles of the fingers; chafe the finger of the children who were accused of stealing and accept the children's testimony, one over the other, for Allāh had said: [Take for witness two persons from among you, imbued with justice<sup>153</sup>] and [Such as you choose for witness.<sup>154</sup>] Other examples of judgments by 'Alī are: to raise his voice in reciting *qunūt* during *Ṣubḥ* prayer and to mention the names of particular persons,<sup>155</sup> to impose half of the blood-money payment on the relatives of the murdered victim,<sup>156</sup> to

<sup>152</sup> The statement "make it three times" refers to the third (level) of divorce pronouncement but was pronounced on one occasion. For example: [You are from today onwards, forbidden to me!] This statement means that I have pronounced the divorce three times. This kind of divorce is unanimously repudiated for the *maṣlaḥah* of man.

<sup>153</sup> *Sūrah al-Fulāq*, 65: 2.

<sup>154</sup> *Sūrah al-Baqarah*: 282.

<sup>155</sup> Cf. *Sūrah Āli 'Imrān*: 121-124.

<sup>156</sup> This case is related to a man who killed a woman and he has been charged to pay the blood-money. The price of the blood money of a woman is equivalent



use half of the blood-money payment in relation to a person  
 ing only one eye,<sup>157</sup> and to unify the diverse opinions on the  
 ion of a man who preformed 'id prayer with a (feeble-mind)  
 1 in the great mosque while the real *imām* performed it in the  
*illā*."

y said that all of (the judgments made by 'Alī) contradicted the  
 ions of the jurists, judges and government officers. (His ideas)  
 hardly in agreement with his words: [I have never hesitated in  
 ering the judgment, until the day I sat with you during that  
 on], nor were they in conformity with the invocation of the  
 het that Allah will make ('Alī's) speech eloquent and strengthen  
 eart. Indeed, whatever ('Alī) has said has (virtually) contradicted  
 vocation of the Prophet."

Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that when the Prophet prayed  
 llāh to make 'Alī's speech become eloquent and his heart  
 gthened, the Prophet does not mean to say that 'Alī will be in  
 state forever. Indeed, (actions such as) not omitting things, not  
 etting things or not committing mistakes on the various occasions  
 not the qualities of human beings, but are only attributed to  
 ighty Creator. The Prophet knows the power of Almighty Allāh  
 and (he knows very well his own limit in) what is possible or not  
 ible for him to pray. If he were to pray (to Allāh) so that He will  
 nake such and such person to die (it is impossible, for he knows  
 Almighty Allāh has decreed death to all of His creatures. Or if

---

to half the price of the blood-money of a man. Hence, the accrued payment  
 imposed on that man is half the price of the blood-money of a man.

This case is similar to the previous principles (see footnote 344). But in this  
 case, the person who was murdered had had only one eye. Hence the  
 payment of the blood-money is adjustable to only half of the payment instead  
 of the whole amount.



he were to pray to Him so that He will not make such a person to grow old (it is impossible, for he knows that) He made old age as part of human nature.”

“How could he pray in his invocation to Allāh in favour of (‘Alī) so that (the latter) will have those (good and pure) qualities since he himself on some occasions has forgotten some verses of al-Qur’ān, to the points, that Almighty Allāh said: [By degrees shall We teach you to declare the message so you shall not forget.<sup>158</sup>] And (on one occasion), the Prophet accepted ransom (*fidyah*) on the day of *Badr*; the following verse was revealed to him: [Had it not been for previous ordainment from Allāh, a severe penalty would have reached you for the (ransom) that you took.<sup>159</sup>] and the Prophet added: [If the torment befall us, only ‘Umar will survive from it<sup>160</sup> for it was ‘Umar who proposed to renounce the ransom but execute the captives only.”

188a. “On the day of *Aḥzāb*, the Prophet in his defense against the polytheists, wanted to give away some part of Madīnites’ harvest to them but some Anṣārītes protested against this. And when the Prophet was on the verge of accepting the deal with the polytheists Almighty Allāh revealed the verse: [And had We not given you the strength you were nearly inclined to them a little. In that case, We should have made you taste an equal portion of punishment in this life and an equal portion in death; moreover, you will have found none to help you against us.<sup>161</sup>] In fact, the previous Prophets were also subjected to negligence and forgetfulness; however, it will be

<sup>158</sup> *Sūrah al-A’lā*, 87: 6.

<sup>159</sup> *Sūrah al-Anfāl* 8: 68.

<sup>160</sup> *Al-Durr al-Manthūr*, 3: 203.

<sup>161</sup> *Sūrah al-Isrā’*, 17: 74-75.

long for one to mention all the facts and after all the knowledgeable people will have known them.”

b. “As for the Prophet’s invocation in favour of ‘Alī, the reason is only to prevent him from making mistakes, avoiding them as best as could, and to induce him to judge based on the truth in all cases. Another example can also be seen in the invocation made by the Prophet, which is in favour of Ibn ‘Abbās so that Almighty Allāh will make him knowledgeable in (the Qur’ānic) interpretation and in religion.<sup>162</sup> In spite of this invocation, Ibn Abbās does not understand the whole (content) al-Qur’ān and (modestly) said that he does not know the meanings of *ḥanān*,<sup>163</sup> *al-awwāh*,<sup>164</sup> *ghislīn*<sup>165</sup> and *al-raḥīm*.<sup>166</sup> He also made some accounts of juridical statements but was not accepted such as the *muṭ‘ah* marriage, the *ṣarf* (derivatives) and marriage of two slave sisters.”

As such, it was observed that not all invocations made by the Prophet were acceptable to Allāh. Indeed, our Prophet has made an invocation in favour of Abū Ṭālib so that the former was forgiven but the following verse was revealed: [It is not fitting for the Prophet and those who believe, that they should pray for forgiveness for pagans, even though they be of kin after it is clear to them that they are companions of the fire.<sup>167</sup>] He also said: [O Allāh! Guide my people so that they know not<sup>168</sup>] and Almighty Allāh revealed to him: [It is true,

---

<sup>162</sup> *‘Umdat al-Qārī*, 16: 499 (No. 7270); *Al-Musnad*, 1: 572 (No. 2397), 1: 674 (No. 2881), 1: 701 (No. 3023), 1: 703 (No. 3033), 1: 717 (No. 3102); *Al-Mu‘jam al-Kabīr*, 11: 345 (No. 11961), 11: 213 (No. 11531); *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, 13: 459 (No. 37193).

*Sūrah Maryam*, 19:13, *ḥanān* means piety.

Cf. *Sūrah Hūd*, 11: 75, *al-awwāh* means tender hearted.

*Sūrah al-Ḥāqqah*, 69:36, *ghislīn* means the washing of wounds.

*Sūrah al-Kahf*, 18:9, *al-raḥīm* means the inscription.

*Sūrah al-Taubah*, 9: 113.

*Al-Durr al-Manthūr*, 2: 298, 3: 94.

you will not be able to guide every one whom you love; but Allā guides those whom He will.<sup>169]</sup>"

188c. "Finally, the opinions expressed by 'Alī (as mentioned above are not to be repudiated but should be considered as incorrect. Among the worst case is the one that is related the sale of *ummahī al-awlād* (slave mothers), rampant during the time of the Prophet an (recurred in) the time of caliphate of Abū Bakr due to (bad) debts an necessities (for survival). It was 'Umar who forbade this practice o of consideration for the children so that they would not reprobate c feel humiliated due to many reasons that resulted from their slav mother. In general, the masses agreed that the slave mother could ne be freed from her master except when sold, donated or liberated. Th slave mother, therefore, would not suffer from any risks and th status of the slave mother would continue as long as her master wa alive. In whatever circumstances, her child would be an obstacle fo her to be sold. Hence, through *istiḥsān* (discretion) and consideratio for (the well-being of) the children, 'Umar prohibited the sale o slave mother. We, however, do not accept or believe in thi reasoning. But we would like to draw the attention on th argumentations brought forth by 'Alī and his predecessors on th unrestricted issue (of the slave-mother) as well as (the reasons for faltering in its prohibition."

188d. "Where are the people who can give the remarkable judgment better than 'Alī, so sharp in its complexity but subtle in his verdict that no other companions could render them? (This can be seen) i his judgment on the status of a person; if his eye is poked or become small (diminish) or suffers from the difficulty of seeing things due t

---

<sup>169</sup> *Sūrah al-Qaṣaṣ*, 28: 56.

the damage of the cornea. Likewise, it is also found in his judgment a person whose tongue has been cut off which then diminishes the victim's ability to speak and 'Alī gave his judgment under the consideration of ruptured words. His (smart) judgment also (can be seen) in cases like the *qāriṣ* (the pincher) the *qāmīṣah* (the jumper) and the *wāqīṣah* (the neck breaker). They were three little girls who were playing and the first, (A) climbed on the (shoulder) of her friend (B) and the third girl (C) pinched (B) and (B) jumped, causing (A) to fall down, breaking her neck. 'Alī then ordered the price of the blood-money to be divided into three but then he dissolved the allotment for (A) only because she deserved the outcome of what she had done to herself."

Similarly, in another judgment of 'Alī; two men were arguing over the son of a woman. Both of them have a relationship with her and during the same inter menstrual period, they claimed that the boy was their son. Then 'Alī decided that the boy will inherit from both men but the (real) heir will go to the one who lives longer between the two men. Ḥammad narrated from Ibrāhīm and the latter from 'Umar saying that 'Umar has rendered the same judgment and agreed with 'Alī on this point."

8e. "'Umar used to give judgment adhering strictly to al-Qur'ān to the point that the smallest words uttered by him used to scare off a man and the presence of divinity (*sakīnah*) was shown through his speech. 'Ā'ishah has mentioned about him: [By Allāh! He is a skilful man, unique in himself and has the ability to harmonize things!] This means that he is a skillful man (especially) in politics. And al-Ḥāḍirah said: [By Allāh! He outsmarts the con man and too bright to be cheated!] Al-Aḥnaf ibn Qays said: [By Allāh! He takes pleasure



in things and knows thing better than us even before things happen! This means that he has a good perception of things and is hardly wrong about them!”

“The Prophet also mentioned about him, saying: [Each community has its own inspired man or man of great perception. If there is anyone among us in this community, it will be ‘Umar!<sup>170</sup>] ‘Umar has alerted Sāriyah ibn Zunaym al-Du‘alī, saying: [Sāriyah! The mountain! The mountain!] Sāriyah who was in the front line facing the enemies understood what ‘Umar meant, and retreated to the mountain and fought the enemies from one side only.”

“Nevertheless, ‘Umar, in the context in which he has been advised by ‘Alī, said: [Had it not been for ‘Alī’s statement, ‘Umar would have perished!] He also said: [I seek refuge in Allāh from any difficulties which Abū Ḥasan (‘Alī) could not resolve.]”

“Al-Ziyādī narrated from ‘Abd al-Wārith who then narrated from Yūnus and the latter from al-Ḥassan informing that a woman was brought to ‘Umar (for hearing). The woman had delivered in the sixth month of her pregnancy and the masses murmured something about her. ‘Alī said to ‘Umar: [This can happen! And Almighty Allāh has said: {The carrying of the child to his weaning is a period of thirty months<sup>171</sup>} and {The mother shall give breastfeed to their offspring for two whole years.<sup>172</sup>}]”

<sup>170</sup> *Umdat al-Qārī*, 11: 420 (No. 3689); *Al-Musnad*, 9: 316 (No. 24339).

<sup>171</sup> *Sūrah al-Aḥqāf*, 46:15.

<sup>172</sup> *Sūrah al-Baqarah*, 2: 233.

### III. EXAMPLE OF TWO CONTRADICTORY ḤADĪTH

They said: “You have reported that the Prophet said: [Together a solitary traveler there is one satan and together with two travelers there are two satans but three travelers formed a caravan.<sup>173</sup>] also reported that the Prophet sent a courier alone and that the courier had migrated with Abū Bakr. They asked: [How could a man be with a satan when he travels alone? Or how could he say the solitary traveler be similar to satan or become satan? This is impossible!]”

Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that by saying: [Together a solitary traveler, there is one satan], (the Prophet) is referring (the feeling of) desolation due to isolation and being unaccompanied. Satan will threaten an isolated person just like snakes and wild animals do. When an individual went out unaccompanied, he is exposing himself to satan’s action just like a man exposing himself to wild animals or thieves.”

When the Prophet said: [Together with two travelers, there are two satans] he means to say that each of them are exposed to danger that they expose themselves to two satans. And if the number is three, there will be no more solitude, it forms a company and nothing could threaten them.”

Arabic language is full of demonstration and allusion of comparison. (For example), they say: [The long sword-belt man! *in ṭawīl al-nijād*], *nijād* means sword-belt and it is by no means that the person resembles a sword but they mean to say that the

---

*Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 3: 36 (No. 2608-2609).

person is a tall man. A person's height is measured by his sword-belt for a short sword-belt does not fit a tall man."

"When they say: [He has a great pile of ashes] even though there is no sign of ashes in his house or at his door, it means that the person is always hospitable to others and the fire (at his place) kindles continuously. If there is a lot of fuel for the fire, there will certainly be a lot of ashes. Almighty Allāh said in His book: [Al-Masīḥ the son of Maryam was no more than a Prophet; many were the Prophets that he passed away before him. His mother was a woman of truth. They both had to eat their (daily) food.<sup>174</sup>] The fact that both of them had to eat food proved that they (at time will be in the state of being) unclean (*ḥadath*) for when a person eats food he will certainly (comes to the state of being) unclean.<sup>175</sup>"

"Almighty Allāh informed that the polytheist in relation to the Prophet said: [What sort of Prophet is this, who eats food, and walks through the streets?<sup>176</sup>] Here, they are referring to the Prophet who walks through the streets, indicating to people that man needs (to satisfy his daily) necessities by going to the market place. (The polytheists assumed that the Prophet upon his Prophethood hardly needs other things or favours their presence."

190. "As for their saying: [the courier was alone], the courier was the Prophet's courier who sent his message from one town to another town who scribed for him and who was also known as *fayj*. Others :

<sup>174</sup> *Sūrah al-Mā'idah*, 5:75.

<sup>175</sup> *Tahārah* is one of the important facets of life in Islam. To be in the state of having *wuḍū'* at all is an action that is most commendable in the eyes of Allāh. However, this is not easy to be done for man needs to eat. On the day a person eats, he or she will naturally need to wash out the unwanted remnant (call for nature). As such the person will be in the state of unclean (*ḥadath*). And this is what Ibn Qutaybah is trying to say in this passage.

<sup>176</sup> *Sūrah al-Furqān*, 25:7.



him (to sent their message) from one town to another on his own was advised to join with others in his journey so as to form a party with them. This is a normal practice at any time. Whoever decides to write a letter to be sent by a courier to a faraway town does have to use the service of three men and by virtue of the saying of the Prophet: [Together with a man, there is one satan, together with two men, there are two satans but three men form a caravan.<sup>177</sup>] Here, it is necessary for the courier – when he leaves (for his assignment) to take companions and thus, avoids solitude.”

for the departure of the Prophet with Abū Bakr, during the migration, in truth they feared for their lives due to the (threat) of the bandits. They were forced to flee and to seek the company of a caravan just like a person who goes out of his house alone hoping to find some companions on his way. As soon as they were able to look for some companions, Abū Bakr paid for the service of a guide from al-Dīl and they also have the companionship of ‘Āmir ibn al-Ḥaḥrah, the master of (the guide). The four or five of them entered the caravan together.”

#### IV. EXAMPLE OF TWO CONTRADICTORY ḤADĪTH

They said: “You have reported that the Prophet said: [May Allāh punish the thief, if he steals the egg, we will amputate his hand and if he steals the rope we will amputate his hand.<sup>178</sup>] In another report, it is reported that the Prophet said: [No amputation for a theft less

---

*Al-Targhīb*, 4: 71; *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, 6: 722 (No. 17571); *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 3: 26 (No. 2608).

*Umdat al-Qārī*, 16: 62 (No. 6783); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 2: 862 (No. 2583); *Al-Musnad*, 3: 59 (No. 7440); *Al-Mustadrak*, 4: 378; *Mishkāt al-Maṣābiḥ*, 2: 297 (No. 3592).



than a quarter of *dīnār*.<sup>179</sup>] With this, the first ḥadīth is used by Kharijites in their argument for they said: [The amputation for the valid either for a few or several (times).]”

192. Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that Almighty Allāh revealed this verse to His Prophet: [As for the thief, male or female, cut off her hands; a punishment by way of example from Allāh for their crime<sup>180</sup>] and the Prophet added: [May Allāh curse the thief who steals the egg, we will amputate his hand] is indeed in accordance with the Practice (of people) at that time. Then Almighty Allāh informed him that amputation should not be exercised if the value of the theft is less than a quarter of a *dīnār*. The Prophet only knew the Ordinance when he was informed. Almighty Allāh does not teach him the entire (Ordinances) but revealed to him piecemeal. Jibrīl used to bring forth to him the *sunan* (normative tradition) just like he brought forth al-Qur’ān to him. That is why the Prophet said: [The book is brought forth to me just like other things (being brought forth to me)<sup>181</sup>], (the other things’) means the *sunan*. “Don’t you see that in the early period of Islam, the hands and feet of a man of al-‘Uraynah’s tribe was amputated, his eyes were gouged out and then he was left in the hot sun to die? Then, upon receiving revelation, the Prophet prohibited this act of mutilation. And the Prophet also exercised on them a severe punishment for treachery and ungratefulness for not only had they executed their leader (of the tribe) but they also confiscated their car-

<sup>179</sup> *Umdat al-Qārī*, 16: 71-73 (No. 6789-6791); *Kanz al-Ummāl*, 5: 384 (13345).

<sup>180</sup> *Sūrah al-Mā'idah*, 5:38.

<sup>181</sup> *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 4: 200 (No. 4604).

subsequently, when the *ḥudūd* was revealed, this type of mutilation and treachery was prohibited.”

2a. “There were some jurists who thought that the word *al-baiḍah* (egg) in the (foregoing) ḥadīth means the iron helmet which protects the head in fighting and the word *al-ḥabl* (cable) means the navy cables. They also added that each of those two items cost several *nār*. This interpretation, however, is unacceptable to those who know the Arabic language well and the style of Arabic expression. It is pointless to insist on the value of the stolen item or to stress on the fact that worth several *dīnār* and (to discuss) the big cable, which the thief is unable to carry away.”

Indeed, it is not the custom of the Arabs and the non-Arabs (Persian) to say: [May Allāh makes so and so ugly!] Or else he is exposing himself to bashing for stealing a pearl necklace or risking himself to be shackled for a bag of musk. The style that they used to employ, in relation to this issue: [May Allāh curse him!] for risking himself to hand amputation for an old cable or for some wool or for fols. (Often times) the trivial things would be exaggerated so that they appeared to be important.”

## XXV. EXAMPLE OF TWO CONTRADICTIONARY ḤADĪTH

3. They said: “You have reported that the Prophet sought refuge in Allāh from poverty for he said: [I beseech from You to give me health and to give wealth to my master.<sup>182</sup>] You also reported that he said: [O Allāh! Make me live in misery, make me die in misery and

<sup>182</sup> *Al-Musnad*, 5: 343 (No. 15754); *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 2: 213 (No. 819), and 2: 186 (No. 3673).

resurrect me among the miserable ones.<sup>183</sup>] He also said: [Poverty for the believers is better than a beautiful tether on the jaw of the horse.] They said: [There are contradictions and divergences (between the *aḥādīth*).]”

194. Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that there are no divergences in it! Praise be to Almighty Allāh! Indeed, they have made a mistake in their interpretation for they alluded poverty with misery and both terms are different (in meanings). If the Prophet were to say: [O Allāh! Make me live in poverty, make me die in poverty and resurrect me among the poor one] then, certainly there is a contradiction, as they have claimed. The meaning of *maskanah* as in his saying: [resurrect me among the miserable one] is humility and humbleness. It is as if the Prophet is asking Almighty Allāh not to groom him to be among the oppressors and the haughty ones and later to resurrect him to be among them. The term *al-maskanah* is derived from *al-sukūn* (calm, kindness). When a person says: [*Tamaskan al-rajul*] he means to say that the man is gentle, modest, humble and submissive.”

“It is in the same sense that when the Prophet said to a man who performed a prayer: [Submit yourself, be humble and bow your head] he means to show (the sense of) humility and modesty. The Arabs used to say that [*bi al-miskīn!*] means [be on me the misery!] but upon the revelation, (*miskīn*) does not refer to being poor (*faqir*), rather it refers to being submissive and humble (lowering oneself). Similarly, (in the case where) the Prophet said to Qaylah: [O

183

‘*Ārīḍat al-Aḥwadhī*, 9: 153 (No. 2352); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 2: 1381 (No. 4126); *Al-Mustadrak*, 4: 322; *Kanz al-Ummāl*, 6: 489 (No. 16668-16669), 6: 470 (No. 16592-16593).



*īnah!* (Miserable one),<sup>184</sup>] he does not mean it to be: [O Poor | but his humbleness.”

verify what I have said (the following) is the evidence. If the *het* were to ask Almighty Allāh (to make him to be in a state of *ry* which (supposedly to mean) poverty, Almighty Allāh would refused for (the Prophet) has been granted (an abundance of) *th* and yet (in reality) he does not amass *dirham* (wealth).”

ewise, for those who abandoned their orchards as well as their *th* to migrate to Madīnah, like (in the case of) Fadak, one cannot *hat* they died miserably, for Almighty Allah said: [Did He not *you* an orphan and give you shelter (and care)? And He found *wandering* and He gave you guidance. And He found you in *and* made you independent.<sup>185</sup>] The term “*ā’il al-faqīr*” means *and* may or may not have independents. While the term *al-ma’īl* is the breadwinner (of the family) who has dependants and may *ay* not possess property. Thus, in the context of the Prophet – the *tion* of his Prophethood and the situation upon his demise – *ed*, this has been substantiated in the words of Almighty Allāh, *he started poor but died rich. This also proves that misery (kanah) as he has asked for was never meant to be poverty.”*

.. “As for the saying of the Prophet: [Poverty for the believers is *er* than a beautiful tether on the jaw of the horse], he means that *erty* is one of the greatest misfortunes in life as well as one of the *ful* ailments. A person who bears misfortune patiently and *ent* with whatever he has, Almighty Allāh will grant him *entment* in this worldly life and a great reward in the next world.

---

*Majma’ al-Zawā’id*, 5: 450; *Kanz al-Ummāl*, 3: 225 (No. 6403).  
*Sūrah al-Dūḥā*, 93: 6-8.



Thus, poverty and richness resemble sickness and health. (In other words), the situation of a person whom Almighty Allāh tested with sickness but he endured it patiently resembles the situation of a person who endured poverty patiently. However, the reward that Almighty Allāh will grant those who bear the misfortune patiently does not deter us from asking Him for good health as well as to grant us safety.”

“Nevertheless, some people prefer poverty over richness thinking that (the Prophet) asked Almighty Allāh to protect him from the dearth of the soul. They argued with the expression: [So and so is in the dearth of the soul!] even though that person is in good health. They also argued by saying: [So and so is rich in soul] even though that person is in a poor state. This opinion, however, is erroneous! We never know if Prophet or companions of the Prophet or the pious people or *mujtahidūn*,<sup>186</sup> had ever asked: [O Allāh! Make me poor or make me fall sick!] And Almighty Allāh never demands human being to worship Him in this manner but rather to ask Him: [O Allāh! Grant me the sustenance and grant me good health!<sup>187</sup>] And some added: [O Allāh! Do not afflict the test on us except with that which we can bear!] This means that (He) will not test us except with that which (brings) us goodness and not that (brings) us evil. Indeed, Almighty Allāh can afflict the test on His servants one-way or the other so as to appraise their gratitude and patience. (Allāh) said: [And We shall test you by evil and by good way of trial.<sup>188</sup>] Here, it means

<sup>186</sup> *Mujtahidūn* (plural of) *mujtahid* refers to legists formulating independent decisions in legal or theological matters, based on the interpretation and application of the four *uṣūl* as opposed to *muqallidūn*.

<sup>187</sup> *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 2: 200 (No. 7450).

<sup>188</sup> *Sūrah al-Anbiyā'*, 21:35.

ordeal. Muṭarrif said: [I prefer to be spared so that I can show my titude rather than to be afflicted with test and endure patiently.]”

ū Muḥammad said: “I have given a lengthy explanation on this ie in my book *Gharīb al-Ḥadīth*. And I think it is necessary to eat the said subject in this book so that it provides a compilation /various explanations.”

## XVI. EXAMPLE OF TWO CONTRADICTIONARY ḤADĪTH

i. They said: “You have reported that the Prophet said: [The nicator at the moment he fornicates is no more a believer, and the :f, at the moment he steals, is no more a believer.<sup>189</sup>] You also orted that the Prophet said: [Whoever testifies that there is no er deity (worthy to be worshipped) except Allāh, he will enter adise even though he had committed adultery or theft.<sup>190</sup>] Hence, hese statements there are contradictions and divergences.”

5. Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that in the statements – by grace of Allāh!, there is hardly any divergence or contradiction. e reason is that faith in Arabic means affirmation. Almighty Allāh d: [...but you will never believe us even though we tell the th....<sup>191</sup>] which means that you are not convinced with what we

---

‘Umdat al-Qārī, 9: 237 (No. 2475); *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, 1:76 (No. 100-101), 1:77 (No. 105); *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 4:221 (No. 4689); *Sunan al-Tirmidhī*, 5:15 (No. 2625); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 2:1299 (No. 3936); *Al-Muṣannaf*, 7:417 (No. 13688); *Al-Sunan al-Kubrā*, 10:314; *Sunan Al-Dārimī*, 2:115; *Majma’ al-Zawā’id*, 1:131-133 (No. 366-368, 368-369, 371-372, 374); *Al-Mu’jam al-Kubr*, 11:244 (No. 11623); 12:346 (No. 13304); *Al-Tamhīd*, 2:376; 4:212, 7:407; *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, 1:126 (No. 1309-1311), 1:262 (No. 1325); 1:264 (No. 1326); 1:406 (No. 1733).

*Al-Musnad*, 8:94 (No. 21471); 8:99 (No. 21490); 8:108 (No. 21522); 8:340 (No. 22527).

*Sūrah Yūsuf*, 12:17.

said. From this, people said: [I have no faith in whatever you say], which means I am not convinced of it.”

196a. “Believers are characterised in three categories. First, a person who affirms (his faith) with his tongue (without internalizing it in) his heart. He resembles the hypocrites for they said: [Indeed we believe!] And Almighty Allāh said about the hypocrites: [That is because they believed, then they rejected faith....<sup>192</sup>] He added: [Those who believe (in al-Qur’ān) and those who follow the Jewish scripture and the Sabaens and the Christians....<sup>193</sup>] and: [...such of them believe in Allāh and the last day....<sup>194</sup>] The hypocrites do not believe in Allāh and the last day.”

“Here, if (Allāh) intends to refer to the Muslims, He would not have said: [Such of them who believe in Allāh and the Last day] for it is certain that (the hypocrites) will not believe in Allāh and the Last day. What (Allāh) intends to say is that the hypocrites will only confess with their tongue but practice Judaism and Christianity. The people of this category as well as the hypocrites are not believers, in our opinion, even though they said that they believed, for their faith does not result from their adhesion (to the religion) or their intention.”

“Likewise, we will say that those who disobey the Prophets – [‘aṣā (disobey) and ghawā (to stray away from the truth)] but we do not use (the terms) [‘āṣin (disobedient) and ghāwin (enticer)], for his sin resulted not from his affirmation or his adhesion as in the case of the enemies of Almighty Allāh.”

<sup>192</sup> *Sūrah al-Munāfiqūn*, 63:3.

<sup>193</sup> *Sūrah al-Baqarah*, 2:62.

<sup>194</sup> *Sūrah al-Baqarah*, 2:126.



5b. Second, a person who affirms (his faith) with his tongue and internalizing it in his heart. Even though he defiles by sins and thus, submission (fluctuates) but discontinues from committing sin, we will say: [Indeed he believes!], which means that he is a believer as long as he refrains from committing grievous sins. And, as long as he does not break that (limit) or indulge in that (grievous sin), he is still a believer, but of an imperfect faith.”

Don't you realize that when the Prophet said: [The fornicator, at the moment he fornicates is no more a believer] he means to refer to the particular time (of the act) because before at the time he committed the sin, he was a believer and he became a rueful believer after he had committed the sin. Further clarification can be found in another ḥadīth: [When the fornicator fornicates, he deprives himself from faith but if he repents he becomes again as a believer.<sup>195</sup>]

6c. Third, a person who affirms with his tongue, (internalizes it in his heart and performs the obligatory injunctions as well as evades from grievous sins, he is a true believer. He, therefore, perfected the conditions of faith. Indeed, the Prophet said: [A person is not a true believer if his neighbour is not protected from his malice<sup>196</sup>] and it means that the person is not a perfect believer. The Prophet also said: [A person is not a believer if his tongue (sayings) and his hands (power) do not spare the Muslims<sup>197</sup>] which means he is not a perfect

<sup>195</sup>Umdat al-Qurān, 16: 85 (No. 6810); 'Ārīḍat al-Aḥwadhī, 10: 67 (No. 2625); Kanz al-'Ummāl, 5: 314 (No. 12499).

<sup>196</sup>Umdat al-Qurān, 22:171, (No. 6016); Al-Musnad, 3: 13 (No. 7883), 5:514 (No.16372); 10:332 (No. 27232); Al-Mustadrak, 1:10, 14: 65; Kanz al-'Ummāl, 9:50 (No. 24885), 9:56 (No. 24922).

<sup>197</sup>Umdat al-Qurān, 15: 180 (No. 6016), 23:117 (No. 6484); Al-Musnad, 2:560 (No. 6525), 2:625 (No. 6820); 2:630 (No. 6850); 2:646 (No. 6906); 'Ārīḍat al-Aḥwadhī, 5:17 (No. 2627-2628); Sunan Abū Dāwūd, 3:4 (No. 2481); Al-Mustadrak, 1:10, 3:517; Mishkāt al-Maṣābīh, 1:10, (No. 6 and 33); Kanz al-'Ummāl, 1:149 (No. 738, 739, and 740).



believer. In addition, he said: [A person is not a believer if he spends his night on a satiated stomach, while his neighbour spends his night on an empty stomach<sup>198</sup>], which means that his faith is not perfect. Likewise, in another *ḥadīth*: [The ablution is (valueless) if a person begins it not in the name of Almighty Allāh.<sup>199</sup>] It means that the ablution is neither perfect nor excellent. Similarly, in the saying of 'Umar: [There is no faith for a person who does not perform the pilgrimage], he meant not a perfect faith. And when people said: [So and so is mindless!], they meant that the person is of a less perfect mind. Or [So and so has no religion!], they meant to say that the person is less religious.”

196d. “As for the *ḥadīth* of the Prophet which says: [Whoever testifies that there is no other God worthy of worship except Allāh, he will enter paradise even if he had committed adultery or theft], one needs to view this from two perspectives. First, he might have said this (*ḥadīth*) in consideration of the outcome, meaning that the outcome of man's action will lead him to paradise after he has been punished for (the sins of) adultery and theft.”

“The other one is that the offender may benefit from the Mercy of Almighty Allāh and secure the intercession of the Prophet. He thus, will enter paradise due to his testimony that there is no other God worthy of worship except Allāh.”

196e. “Ishāq ibn Ibrāhīm ibn Ḥabīb ibn al-Shāhid narrated from his father and the latter from his grandfather that al-Ḥasan mentioned the Prophet had said: [There is no other God worthy of worship except

<sup>198</sup> *Al-Matālib al-ʿĀliyah*, 3: 7 (No. 2721); *Kanz al-ʿUmmāl*, 9: 57 (No. 24928).

<sup>199</sup> *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 1: 25 (No. 101); *ʿAridat al-Aḥwadhī*, 1: 39 (No. 25) and 1: 40 (26), *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 1: 140 (No. 397, 400); *Al-Musnad*, 4: 83 (No. 11370-11371); *Sunan al-Dārimī*, 1: 176; *Al-Mustadrak*, 1: 269, 1: 146-147, 4: 60.

h – is the price of paradise.] Muḥammad ibn Yaḥyā al-Qaṭ'ī  
 uted from 'Umar ibn 'Alī who then narrated from Mūsā Ibn al-  
 ayyab al-Thaqafī who informed him that he heard Sālim ibn Abū  
 'd narrated a *ḥadīth* from Al-Ma'rūr ibn Suwayd and the latter  
 Abū Dharr that the Prophet said: [Your Lord said to the son of  
 n: {If you come to Me (defile) of sins almost equal to the weight  
 e earth but you do not associate me with others, I will grant you  
 veness almost equal to the weight of the earth and I will not pay  
 heed to the past sins.} <sup>200</sup>]”

ū Mas'ūd al-Dārimī, a descendant of Khirāsh said that his  
 dfather has narrated from Anas ibn Mālik who informed him that  
 Prophet said: [I was asked to choose between the right of  
 cession and the right of half of my community to enter paradise.  
 I have chosen the right of intercession, for it is more general and  
 ter in (scope). Perhaps you think that my intercession is reserved  
 the pious ones – Not at all! It is meant for those who have  
 raced themselves with sinful acts. <sup>201</sup>]”

## XVII. EXAMPLE OF TWO CONTRADICTORY *HADITH*

They said: “You have reported that Ḥammād has narrated from  
 hīm and the latter from al-Aswad that 'Ā'ishah said: [I rubbed off  
 aka) <sup>202</sup> traces of sperm from the garment of the Prophet and later  
 performed his prayer wearing that garment. <sup>203</sup>] Hence, some

*Al-Musnad*, 8: 71 (No. 21369), 8: 72 (No. 21373), 8: 83 (No. 21418).

*Al-Musnad*, 2: 366 (No. 5453); *Musnad al-Ṭayālīsī*, 137 (No. 998).

*Faraka* means to rub something off. The Arabs used to rub something off  
 with dried wheat grains (used for cooking and stuffing fried poultry.)  
 Probably, in this context, 'Ā'ishah may use the dried wheat grains to rub off  
 the stain on the garment of the Prophet.

'*Umdat al-Qūrī*, 2: 639 (No. 230); *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 1: 101-102 (No. 372).

people deduced from your report that it was acceptable to rub off (traces) of sperm from a garment and then wearing it to perform prayer. They also asserted that this act was the practice (of the Prophet). You also reported from 'Amrū ibn Maymūn ibn Mihr who narrated from Sulaymān ibn Yasār saying that the latter heard 'Ā'ishah saying: [Indeed she used to wash the traces of sperm (found) on the garment of the Prophet], she added: [Then I saw her wearing it even though there were a few spots of sperm on it.<sup>2</sup> Some people refuted (the idea of) rubbing off the traces of sperm based on this tradition. For them, (this act) was not acceptable except through washing off the traces found on the garment if they intend to wear the same garment for praying. Hence, there are divergence and contradiction (between the two statements)."

198. Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that there is no divergence or contradiction in (those statements). Indeed, 'Ā'ishah used to rub off the traces when they dried off. The action of rubbing off could not take place unless the thing has been dried off. It happens that traces remain on one's underclothes until they dry off. (These traces dry off very fast in summer. And ('Ā'ishah) used to wash (the garment) when she noticed (the sperm) was still wet. It is not possible to take out something, by rubbing, when the thing is still wet. Therefore, there is no objection if a person who allows (the traces) dry off and then rubs it off. I learned from Ishāq ibn Ibrāhīm known as Ibn Rāhawayh, that the Sunnah confirmed the act of rubbing off traces of sperm."



XVIII. EXAMPLE OF TWO CONTRADICTORY *ḤADĪTH*

They said: "You have reported that the Prophet said: [Any raw becomes pure after being tanned!<sup>205</sup>] When the Prophet passed a dead sheep, he said: [Are you not taking the benefit from its ?<sup>206</sup>] Based on this *ḥadīth*, some jurists have rendered their legal opinion (related to cleanliness). Elsewhere, you reported that (the Prophet) said: [Do not take the benefit from the carcass, neither its nor its nerves.<sup>207</sup>] Some jurists have taken this (*ḥadīth* as their basis) to render their legal opinion. Hence, there are divergence and contradiction (between the two *ḥadīth*)."

Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that there is no divergence or contradiction – Praise be to Allāh! – The word *ihāb* (skin, hide), in Arabic means any (animal) skin that is yet to be tanned and once it is tanned the name (*ihāb*) changed to another. There is a *ḥadīth* which states that 'Umar had entered the Prophet's house, in which there was a raw skin, which also meant a nauseating and not tanned. 'A'ishah, in relation to her father, said: [He held the animal's head on its back (on the upper part of its back) and (this position) prevented blood from oozing into the skin] that is, to ooze into its body. She used (the term *ihāb*) to refer to the body. If (the term) *ihāb* means a tanned skin, she would not have used (the term *ihāb*) to refer to the body. Al-Nābighah al-Ja'dī, described in his poem of a wild cow

<sup>205</sup> *ʿAṣīdat al-Aḥwadhī*, 7: 170 (No. 1728); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 2: 1193 (No. 3609); *Al-Musnad*, 1: 471 (No. 1890), 1: 580 (No. 2435), 1: 735 (3198); *Sunan Al-Dārimī*, 2: 85; *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 4: 66 (No. 4123).

<sup>206</sup> *ʿUmdat al-Qārī*, 14: 530 (No. 5531); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 2: 1193 (No. 3610); *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 4: 66 (No. 4121).

<sup>207</sup> *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 4: 65-6 (No. 4120), *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 2: 1194 (No. 3613); *Al-Musnad*, 6: 461 (No. 18803, 18805-18807); *Al-Muʿjam al-Ṣaghīr*, 2: 101; *Mishkāt al-Maṣābīh*, 1: 158 (No. 508); *Al-Tamhīd*, 2: 330-332, 4: 71.



saying that it disappears from its cub but when it came back (only to find that) the cub had been devoured by a wolf:

[She found proof at the first sight;

Skin (*ihāb*) and debris of bloody entrails.]

When the Prophet said: [Any raw skin becomes pure after being tanned] and at the time he passed by a dead sheep, he said: [Is the owner not taking the benefit from its skin (*ihāb*)] he meant to ask whether (the owner) had tanned the skin (*ihāb*) and derived benefit from it? As for his saying: [Do not take benefit from the carcass neither its skin nor its nerves] he meant to remind them not to use raw skin (*ihāb*) until it has been tanned. The term – nerves (*'aṣab*) as mentioned in the *ḥadīth* is an evidence that *ihāb* or raw skin (come together with) the nerves. The Prophet associated it with raw skin to indicate that (people) tan raw skin but not the nerves. This can be further clarified in a *ḥadīth* reported by Ibn 'Uyaynah who then narrated from al-Zuhrī who also narrated from 'Ubayd al-Allāh ibn 'Abd Allāh and the latter from Ibn 'Abbās saying that the Prophet passed by a sheep owned by the *mawlat* of Maymūnah and said: [Don't they intend to take its skin (*ihāb*), tanned and derived benefit from it?]"

### XXXIX. EXAMPLE OF TWO CONTRADICTORY *ḤADīTH*

201. They said: "You have reported from al-As'ath who narrates from Muḥammad ibn Sīrīn who then narrated from 'Abd Allāh ibn Shāqīq and the latter from 'Ā'ishah who said: [The Prophet does not perform prayer in our *shi'r* (undergarment) or on our *luḥūf* (be

208] Elsewhere, you reported from Wakī' who narrated from Ḥabīb ibn Yaḥyā who then narrated from 'Ubayd Allāh ibn 'Abd al-Raḥmān ibn 'Utbah and the latter from 'Ā'ishah who said: [The Prophet performed his prayer at night beside me and I was in my menses, covered by *mirt* (blanket), which at the same time, partly covered him.] Hence, there are contradiction and divergence between the two statements)."

Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that there is no divergence or contradiction in the two *ḥadīths* for in the first *ḥadīth* (it says) [He did not perform the prayer in our *shi'r*] which is also the plural form of *shī'ār*. *Al-shi'ār* or undergarment can only be called *shī'ār* unless it is used and is in direct contact with the body. Another proof is the saying of the Prophet to al-Anṣār: [You are to me like the *shī'ār* and there are *dithār* (blanket).<sup>209</sup>] which means that you are closer to me than anybody else just like the *shī'ār* which is in direct contact with the body. While the others, being the *dithār* are not as close to me as you are, just like the *dithār* which is placed on top of the *shi'r*. It is the *shī'ār* that carries the sperm, the sweat, the moisture and drops of urine. The user may accidentally be smeared with them. Therefore, (the Prophet) does not perform prayer using the undergarment of his wives, which might be stained with the impurities due to coition or if they were pregnant or if they were during their menses."

"As for the second *ḥadīth*: [The Prophet performed his prayer at night beside me, and I was in my menses, covered by *mirt*,

---

*Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 1: 101 (No. 367); *Al-Musnad*, 9: 398 (No. 24752); *Al-Tamhīd*, 1: 319.

*Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 1: 58 (No. 164); *Al-Musnad*, 5: 538 (No. 16470); *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 12: 5 (No. 33701), 12: 16 (No. 33757), 14: 64-5 (No. 37945).

which at the same time, partly covering him], the term *mirṭ* (blanket) is not similar to the *shi'ār* just like *izār* (shawl) resembles *shi'ar* which is perhaps, made of wool or hair or silk. (*Mirṭ*) is used on to of *izār*.”

202b. Abū Muḥammad said: “For further clarification, (there is a *ḥadīth* narrated by ‘Abdah ibn ‘Abd Allāh who narrated from Muḥammad ibn Bishr al-‘Abdī, who heard (it), from Zakariyya ibn Abū Zā’idah. The latter narrated from Muṣ’ab ibn Shaybah, who then narrated it from Ṣafiyyah bint Shaybah that ‘Ā’ishah had said: [The Prophet went out, one morning, with a *mirṭ muraḥḥal* made of dark hair, draped (around his shoulder<sup>210</sup>). *Muraḥḥal* means embroidered piece of work called *al-tarḥīl*. Umru’ al-Qays in describing his wife said:

[I stood up and walked beside her, trailing behind us

Over our footsteps, the hem of (her) *mirṭ muraḥḥal*.]

This shows that the *mirṭ* is not similar to the *shi'ār* which belongs to ‘Ā’ishah as mentioned in the *ḥadīth*, which was partly covering her and partly covering the Prophet while he was praying.<sup>211</sup> If the *mirṭ* was also the *shi'ār* she would have been uncovered for the *shi'ār* is rather soft (light). It is not big enough to cover both ‘Ā’ishah and the Prophet (in the state) of praying.”

#### **XL. EXAMPLE OF ḤADĪTH SAID TO BE INVALIDATED BY REASON AND NAẒAR**

203. They said: “You have reported that the Prophet was bewitched and the magical spell was thrown into the well of Dhū Arwān. The

<sup>210</sup> *Sunan Abu Dāwūd*, 4: 44 (No. 4032).

<sup>211</sup> *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 1: 214 (No. 652-653); *Al-Musnad*, 10: 6 (No. 25686).

ī took it out and when each knot was untied, the Prophet regained energy. Finally, the Prophet stood up like someone who had just been freed from the shackle.”<sup>212</sup> It is not possible for this event to contradict the Prophet since witchcraft is an act of infidelity. The masses regarded it as one of the works of satan. How could satan have made his way to the Prophet when Allāh had granted him His protection, shielded him in His Name and by His Angels and at the same time received the revelation from satan? Almighty Allāh said in al-ʿĀn: [No falsehood (*al-bāṭil*) can approach it from before or behind it....<sup>213</sup>] You claimed that falsehood or *al-bāṭil* here means the work of satan. Allāh also said: [He alone knows the unseen and does not make anyone acquainted with His mysteries except the Prophet, whom He has chosen and then He makes a band of watchers march before and behind him<sup>214</sup>] which means that (Allāh) placed before and behind (the Prophet) a band of angels to protect him as well as to receive the revelation from the foreign elements which satan might introduce into it.”

1a. “(The rationalists) believed that witchcraft was nothing more than a trick, leading man to disregard his brother or the husband to marry his wife just like the event of defamation and deceit. They said that this was magic, a kind of drug given to a man to keep him away from the woman, to change his nature and to cause his hair and his mind to fall. They also believed that Firʿawn’s magicians fantasized with *sā* with imaginary schemes and they said: [The example is that,

---

<sup>212</sup> *ʿUmdat al-Qārī*, 10: 624 (No. 3268); *Al-Musnad*, 9: 390 (No. 24704).

<sup>213</sup> *Sūrah Fuṣṣilat*, 41:42.

<sup>214</sup> *Sūrah al-Jinn*, 72: 26-27.



when we take mercury and pour it into a container which has the shape of a snake, then expose it to the heat, it resembles the snake. They also derived their evidence from the saying of Almighty Allāh [Their ropes and their rods, so it seemed to him on account of their magic, began to be in lively motion.<sup>215</sup>] Indeed for them, this is an illusion and unrealistic.”

“They also referred to the saying of the Almighty Allāh: [They followed what the evil ones gave out falsely against the power of Sulaymān but the evils were teaching man magic and such things as came down at Babylon to the angels Hārūt and Mārūt<sup>216</sup>] (which according to them, *mā unzila*) means negation, that is, it was never being revealed as such! They also read *al-malakayn* (the two angels) as *al-malikayn* (the two kings) based on the report that al-Ḥasan had read the verse in that manner for it was related to the two white slaves of the people of Babylon.”

204. Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that those who believe in the (foregoing discussion) oppose the opinion of the Muslims, Jews, Christians and people of the Books as well as the opinion of all communities like the Hindus, who are staunch believers of magic, the Byzantines and the Arabs before and after Islam. They also oppose the teaching of al-Qur’ān and its interpretation, and resisted it stubbornly beyond reasoning. Indeed, Almighty Allāh said to His Prophet: [Say, I seek refuge with the Lord of the dawn from the mischief of the created things; from the mischief of darkness as it overspreads; from the mischief of those who practice secret arts and

---

<sup>215</sup> *Sūrah Ṭā Hā*, 20:66.

<sup>216</sup> *Sūrah al-Baqarah*, 2:102.

n the mischief of jealous persons who practice jealousy.<sup>217</sup>] Thus, know that the witches use to blow on knots, which they knotted as the magicians and the amulet makers had done. The Quraysh did to call witchcraft *al-ʿidah* (defamation, slander, witchcraft). The prophet SAAS cursed the *ʿāḍihah* (witch) and the *mustaʿḍihah* (witch seeker) which means the witch and the one who seeks her out. A poet said:

[I took refuge in my Lord against the blowers,

On the knot of the untruth slanderer.]

The poet is referring to the witches.”

a. “Ibn Numayr narrated from Hishām ibn ‘Urwah who heard from his father that ‘Ā’ishah declared that (the chain of the narrators) was considered *ṣaḥīḥ* (authentic) and that the Prophet said: [When I was under the spell, two men came to me, one of them sat beside my head and the other one sat near my leg. One of them asked: {What bewitched the leg?} He said: {It was bewitched.} Then he asked: {Who bewitched it?} He answered: {Labīd ibn al-A’ṣam.} He asked again: {What did he use?} He answered: {A comb, comb instruments and *juff* (membrane) of the male palm tree.} He asked: {Where is the bewitching arm?} He answered: {In the well of Dhū Arwān.}] There is nothing in (this information) to attract the attention of people to themselves or save them from harm, favour or praise the Prophet SAAS. The transmitters of this *ḥadīth* are not liars; nor are they malicious or antagonistic against the Prophet.”

---

*Sūrah al-Falaq*, 113:1-4. Secret arts in its literal meaning are those who blow on knots; a kind of witchcraft practiced by perverted women.

“One could not deny the fact that (this work was attributed to a Jew for Labīd ibn al-A‘ṣam, a Jew, bewitched the Prophet. And before him, it was also Jews, who murdered Zakariyyā ibn Ādhan by sawing the tree trunk, where (Zakariyyā) was hiding. Wahb ibn Munabbih and others have said that when the saw reached his chest he groaned and then Almighty Allāh revealed to him: [Either you stop your groan or I have the earth and its inhabitant perish.] And it was also Jews who killed Zakariyyā’s son, Yaḥyā, based on the statement of a prostitute and her trick.<sup>218</sup> The Jews also claimed that they killed and crucified al-Masīḥ. If it is not for the fact that Almighty Allāh has said: [...but they killed him not, nor crucified him, but it appeared so to them....<sup>219</sup>], we will never know that the crucified man was the resemblance of (al-Masīḥ), for the Jews antagonized him and they claimed as such; while the Christians, being their comrades, affirmed that crucifixion.”

“In addition, (the Jews also) killed Prophets, boiled them and tormented them in all kinds of torture. If Allāh the Exalted and Sublime wishes He would have protected the Prophets from them.”

204b. “Indeed, the Prophet was poisoned by a Jewish woman, by serving him a roasted mutton and it tormented him continuously until he died.<sup>220</sup> The Prophet also said: [The Khaybar meal continuously tormented me and (during) this time (I feel as if) the movement of my artery stopped.<sup>221</sup>] Hence, Almighty Allāh allowed the wish of the Jewish woman to be true – to kill the Prophet. Before this event

<sup>218</sup> Cf. *Mark*, 6:17-29.

<sup>219</sup> *Sūrah al-Nisā'*, 4:157.

<sup>220</sup> *‘Umdat al-Qārī*, 10: 518 (No. 3169).

<sup>221</sup> *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, 11: 466 (No. 32189).

wever, Almighty Allāh allows them not any means to kill the prophets.”

s for casting the spell, it is an easier mean to kill (the Prophets) her than by scorching and torturing. However, if (the rationalists) ist to deny that Almighty Allāh allows not any means for satan to ich the Prophet or Prophets (before him), they can read in the Book Almighty Allāh: [Never did We send a Prophet or a Messenger fore you, but when he framed a desire, satan threw some (vanity) o his desire....<sup>222</sup>] This means that when the Prophet was reciting, atan infused (vanities)” in his recitation – to console him. As for e infusion of satan while he was reciting in his prayer: [Those are : sublime Goddesses and their intercession is desired.] Thus, it is possible for him to add or remove something from the revelation. o you hear not when He says: [But Allāh will cancel anything ain) that satan throws in and Allāh will confirm (and establish) His ns....<sup>223</sup>] This means that whatever vanity is thrown by satan into : revelation will be nullified.”

hen, He added: [That He may make the suggestions thrown in by an, but a trial for those in whose hearts is a disease.<sup>224</sup>] Likewise, s saying in al-Qur’ān: [No falsehood can approach if from before behind it.<sup>225</sup>] This signifies that satan can never add anything to it urther at the beginning or at the end.”

4c. Abū Muḥammad said: “Abū al-Khaṭṭāb has narrated from shr al-Mufaḍḍal who heard (it) from Yūnus. The latter had narrated om al-Ḥasan that the Prophet said Jibrīl came to him, saying: [The

---

*Sūrah al-Ḥajj*, 22:52.

*Sūrah al-Ḥajj*, 22:52.

*Sūrah al-Ḥajj*, 22:53.

*Sūrah Fussilat*, 41:42.



rebellious one ('Ifrīt) among the genies is watching you. When you go to your bed (or go to sleep) recite: {Allāh, there is no god but He, the Living, the Self-subsisting, Eternal....<sup>226</sup>} till the end of *āyat al-kursī* (the verse of the throne.)<sup>227</sup>] Almighty Allāh has informed about Ayyūb, saying: [...The evil one has afflicted me with distress and suffering.<sup>228</sup>]"

204d. Abū Muḥammad said: "As for their saying that the spell which bewitched Mūsā causes him to see things in fantasy and nothing is real, we do not deny or admit it for we certainly know that, if each creature were to be gathered to create a mosquito, they will never be able to do so. We, however, could not be certain whether it was the mercury which was poured into the snake-skin and then claimed that they made it to crawl or it was something else that they used (to make it crawl). It is the witch who knows the truth or whoever that was informed by the witch."

204e. "As for their evidence that based on the saying of Almighty Allāh: [They followed what the evil ones gave out falsely against the power of Sulaymān<sup>229</sup>] and [The evil ones, teaching men magic and such things as they came down<sup>230</sup>], and they interpreted this verse to be: [Nothing was brought down to the two angels of Babylon,] this interpretation is not only abominable but also illogical and the most perverted kind of interpretation! If the revelation was not revealed to the two angels, Hārūt and Mārūt at Babylon, the sentence would have lost its meaning. (Such an interpretation) could be acceptable if someone claimed that witchcraft was revealed to the two angels as

---

<sup>226</sup> *Sūrah al-Baqarah*, 2:255.

<sup>227</sup> *Al-Durr al-Manthūr*, 1:327.

<sup>228</sup> *Sūrah Ṣād*, 38:41.

<sup>229</sup> *Sūrah al-Baqarah*, 2:102.

<sup>230</sup> *Sūrah al-Baqarah*, 2:102.

mentioned earlier, but then Almighty will have to say: [They allowed this....] and continued with the following sentence; as suggested by them) but it was not revealed to the two angels.”

Corresponding to the (above idea), if somebody says: [I had taught a man al-Qur’ān and what was revealed to Mūsā], the listener will not doubt (the statement). But you meant to say that al-Qur’ān was not revealed to Mūsā because nobody has been informed earlier that Qur’ān was revealed to Mūsā. But the listener will doubt you if you say that you have taught the man al-Qur’ān and al-Tawrah. These interpretations for us will be clearer with the understanding of the reports of the historical tradition.”

4f. “In short, according to Ibn ‘Abbās, when Sulaymān was overthrown and satan dethroned him, his oratorical platform, his treasures and the remaining satans in his kingdom were buried together through spell-casting, magic and charm. And when Sulaymān died, satans approached the people and said: [Don't you want us to show you the charm which make the wind and genies to submit to Sulaymān as well as (to make) man obey him?] The people answered: [Yes, indeed!] So, they went to (Sulayman's) oratorical place and the place of his throne. (The satans) took it out from these places. The Isra'ilite scholars said: [This was incompatible with the religion of Allāh, and Sulaymān was not a sorcerer.] The laypeople said: [Sulaymān was the most knowledgeable among us and we will follow as he had done!] Then, Almighty Allāh explained: [They allowed what the evil ones gave (falsely) against the power of

Sulaymān....<sup>231</sup>] which means that the Jews followed whatever was reported to them by the satans.”

“As for the (terms) *al-tilāwah* (recitation) and *al-riwāyah* (report, narrative), they are synonymous. Then (Allāh) said: [The blasphemers were not Sulaymān, but the evil ones, teaching men magic and such things as came down to the two angels.<sup>232</sup>] These two angels were sent down to earth when Ādam's descendants disobeyed, so as to render judgment to mankind. The desire for woman was infused into their hearts and they were ordered not to fornicate, kill or drink wine. Then, *al-Zuhrah* (Venus) came to argue with them and both found her attractive and desired her but she refused. (But they tried) and (promised) to inform her of the name, which gave them the power to ascend to heaven. They revealed it to her and at the same time desired her, but she refused. Then, they drank wine and persuaded her to drink and finally got what they wanted. Then they went out and they saw a man and, thinking that he might disclose their (activities), killed him. Later on, Venus pronounced that name and she ascended but declined for Allāh metamorphosised her into a star. Almighty Allāh was angry with the two angels and He called them, Hārūt and Mārūt. He also asked them to choose, whether to be tormented in this world or in the hereafter and they chose the torment in this worldly life. Both of them were the people who taught mankind the differences in them as well as differences between husband and the wife.”

“With regard to the (revelation) revealed by the Almighty Allāh to the two angels and of what the people of *nazar* (perception) believed – Allāh knows best. He is the supreme name (uttered) that enabled

<sup>231</sup> *Sūrah al-Baqarah*, 2:102.

<sup>232</sup> *Sūrah al-Baqarah*, 2:102.





Abū Ḥāhātīm had also narrated from al-Aṣma'ī that Abū 'Amrū ibn al-'Alā' had said: "*Al-ghowl* is the witch of the genie."

"Abū al-Khaṭṭāb had narrated from al-Mu'tamir ibn Sulaymān, who heard that Maṣṣūr had mentioned that according to Rib'ī ibn Khirāsh who then narrated from Ḥudhayfah who informed that the Prophet said: [I know very well (the events) upon the emergence of the *Dajjāl*. He is accompanied with burning fire and river of cold water. Anyone among you, who sees him, may not perish, let's urge him to close his eyes and jump into it! What seems to him like (the burning fire, in reality is a river of cold water.<sup>233</sup>"]

204i. "Abū Ḥātīm had narrated from al-Aṣma'ī who then narrated from Abū al-Zanād who said that a woman came (to see the Prophet for legal advice but the Prophet has passed away. She only met one of his wives, 'Ā'ishah, and said to her: {O mother of the believers! Somebody asked me: {Do you want me to help you so that the attention of your spouse will only be on you?} (In another narration the narrator added saying: {She brought two dogs, and she rode on one of the dogs, then on the other dog saying: {We continue with whatever Allāh wants it!} Then she asked: {Do you know that you are in Babylon?} The woman then entered a man's house, or a reported, two men's house, and they said to her: {Urinate on those ashes!} She said: {I went aside but I did not urinate, then I came back to them.} The two men asked me: {What have you seen? So I told them that I saw nothing.} They said again: {That depends on you!} So I went inside and made some effort to urinate and I succeeded. Then something came out from me like a veiled horse and it then ascended to heaven. I went to see them and they asked me: {Wha

<sup>233</sup> *Al-Musnad*, 9: 80 (No. 23339), 9: 95 (23398); *Al-Durr al-Manthūr*, 5: 354.

you see?} So I told them (about it) and they said: {That is your  
 1 which abandoned you!} Then I went out to join the other  
 nen, saying: {By Allāh! They taught me nothing nor did they  
 rm me what to do!} (A woman) asked: {what did you see?} I  
 : {Such and such!} Then she said: {You are the most talented  
 h among the Arabs, act and make your wish!} (The narrator had  
 ed) that the woman crossed the creek and said again: {Let it be a  
 ll} Then the activity of cultivating started to vibrate. The woman  
 again: {Let it be ripened and the (plants were ready to be  
 rested).} Then the woman took it, rubbed it and gave me some  
 said: {Grind it, make a mush and urge your husband to drink it!}  
 d not do (as the women asked) and things remain as they were.  
 y must I repent?]"

en she met a man from Khuzā'ah who was living in Amaj and  
 : [O Mother of the believers! This man resembles Hārūt and  
 ūt most]. Abū Muḥammad said: [This story was reported by Ibn  
 yj from Ibn Abū Mulaykah who then narrated it from 'Ā'ishah.]"

j. Abū Muḥammad said: "This is something which we do not  
 eve either by virtue of analogy or reasoning. We only believe in it  
 e it was mentioned by the Books and the historical tradition  
 ted to the Prophet as well as the people of all times who believed  
 and excluding those who believe in what their naked eyes had  
 t, supported by perception and analogy."

for the saying of al-Ḥasan: [Indeed, they are the two white slaves  
 ic people of Babylon] and his recitation *al-malikayn* with *kasrah*,  
 or as I know, this is something which is not in agreement with any  
 of the *qurrā'* (experts in the recitation of al-Qur'ān) or with any  
 he interpreters (of al-Qur'ān). (The recitation) is the most

(unfavourable type) and is less likely to be (a form of) the *makh* (articulation of a sound). How could it be revealed to two w slaves enabled them to sparate the husband and wife?"

## XLI. EXAMPLE OF TWO CONTRADICTORY ḤADĪTH

205. They said: "You have reported that the Prophet said: [There no Prophet after me and there is no other *ummah* after my *umm*. The *ḥalāl* (food) is whatever Almighty Allāh has made them licit my tongue until the Day of Judgment and the *ḥarām* (food) whatever Almighty Allāh has made them illicit for my tongue u the Day of Judgment.<sup>234</sup>] You also reported that al-Masīḥ will co down; he will kill the pigs, break the cross and will increase the *ḥa* (things).<sup>235</sup> 'Ā'ishah said: [Say that the Prophet is the seal of Prophet and do not say that there will not be a *nabī* after him.] Hei there are contradictions (between those *aḥādīth*)."

206. Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that there is neit divergence nor contradiction for al-Masīḥ is a Prophet of the p whom Almighty Allāh has elected and who will be brought down the signal of the ending of the time. Almighty Allāh said: [And (Masīḥ) shall be a sign (*la'ilmun*) for the coming of the hour judgment. Therefore, have no doubt about the hour.<sup>236</sup>] Some *qur* recited (*la'ilmun* as in the verse) as *la'alamun*. When al-Masīḥ con down, nothing of what was revealed to the Prophet will be abrogat The *imām* or leader of his *ummah* is not requested to step down |

<sup>234</sup> 'Āridat al-Aḥwadhī, 3: 141 (No. 3724); Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr, 8: 115 (7535), 8: 136 (No. 7617), 8: 138 (No. 7622); Majma' al-Zawā'id, 3: 450 (5647); Kanz al-'Ummāl, 15: 947 (No. 43638).

<sup>235</sup> Al-Musnad, 3: 29 (No. 7273); Al-Durr al-Manthūr, 2: 242.

<sup>236</sup> Sūrah al-Zukhruf, 43:61.

is (honoured as it is) and (al-Masīḥ) will perform his prayer and the *imām*.”

for his expression: [He will increase the number of the *ḥalāl* things], this could be related to the incidence of a man who said to Ḥurayrah: [Nothing will increase except the woman!] (Abū Ḥurayrah) said: [Is it?] Then he broke into laughter.”

a. Abū Muḥammad said: “The expression: [He will increase the number of the *ḥalāl* things] does not mean that he will authorize man marry five or six wives. It means that al-Masīḥ is yet to marry when Almighty Allāh ascended him and when (Allāh) brings him down to the earth, he will marry a woman. This (action) adds the number of *ḥalāl* things for him. (In other words) he will add something out of that (action.) And there is nobody among the people of the Book who does not know that (al-Masīḥ) is a servant of Almighty Allāh and nobody believes that he is not a human being.”

b. “As for the statement of ‘Ā’ishah: [Say that the Prophet is the last of the Prophets and do not say that there will be no *nabī* after him], means that she was thinking of the descent of ‘Īsā. Her statement does not mean to refute the saying of the Prophet: [There is no *nabī* after him]. Indeed, what the Prophet intends to say is that: [There is no *nabī* after me<sup>237</sup>] who will abrogate what was revealed to him just like the previous Prophets who were sent to abrogate the previous texts. (‘Ā’ishah), in fact, means to say: [Do not say that al-Masīḥ will not come after him.]”

---

*Al-Musnad*, 1: 386 (No. 1583), 4: 64 (No. 11272), 8: 326 (No. 22458), 9: 100 (No. 23418).



## XLII. EXAMPLE OF TWO CONTRADICTORY *HADĪTH*

207. They said: “You reported that the Prophet SAAS does perform the burial prayers on the (dead) debtor who left nothing pay back his debt.<sup>238</sup> You also reported that he had said: [Whoever leaves some wealth, it is for his family but whoever leaves so debt, it is my responsibility.<sup>239</sup>] In another *ḥadīth*, (he said) [Whoever leaves a *kall* (trustee), the responsibility goes to Allāh and His Prophet.<sup>240</sup>] This means that somebody (needs to take) charge the poor people and children who are devoid of caretaker. He could the Prophet refuse to perform the burial prayer on the deceased debtor who was indebted for the sake of his son and his family. There is contradiction (in it).”

208. Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that there is no contradiction – Praise be to Almighty Allāh! He refused to perform the burial prayer on the deceased debtor who left insufficient wealth to settle his debt. This event occurred at the beginning of Islam that is, before the *futūḥ* or opening (of other countries) started and wealth could be gathered. He also intended to teach people not to take the issues of debt lightly and not to borrow money unless they were able to pay back. However, when Allāh, the Almighty granted him wealth through the *futūḥ* of other countries, he reserved part of the accumulated wealth for the poor, their descendants and

<sup>238</sup> *Al-Musnad*, 5: 14 (No. 14161); *Al-Muḥannaḥ*, 8: 290 (No. 15257); *Kanz al-Ummāl*, 6: 244 (No. 15533).

<sup>239</sup> *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 3: 137 (No. 2954); *ʿAṣīḍat al-Aḥwadhī*, 8: 182 (No. 2090); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 1: 807 (No. 2416); *Al-Musnad*, 3: 135 (No. 781); *Kanz al-Ummāl*, 11: 14 (No. 30418), *Al-Al-Sunan Kubrā*, 6: 331 (No. 12129), 6: 57 (No. 12999 - 13000).

<sup>240</sup> *Al-Musnad*, 6: 92 (No. 17175), 6: 96-7 (No. 17204).

beneficiaries so that they were able to pay the debt of the deceased Muslim from the fund.”

### III. EXAMPLE OF CONTRADICTORY *HADĪTH*

1. They said: “You have reported that the Prophet SAAS did not lapidate Mā‘īz until he confessed to him for the fourth time for committing adultery. Each time he confessed, the Prophet turned him away but he lapidated him on the fourth confession.<sup>241</sup> Some jurists have adopted this procedure and they said: [We do not lapidate a son unless his confessions are witnessed by a number of people in large.] Such was the opinion of ‘Alī ibn Abū Ṭālib.”

He also reported that two men met the Prophet. One of them said: My son was a servant to a man and (my son) fornicated with the man’s wife. So I paid him a compensation of one hundred sheep and a servant. Then we asked the knowledgeable people and they said: Your son has to be lapidated for one hundred times and be exiled for a year. As for the woman, she has to be lapidated as well.] The Prophet replied: [By the One who holds my soul in His hand! I shall give the judgment to both of you according to the Book of Allāh; one hundred sheep and a servant will be given back to you, your son will be lapidated for one hundred stripes and be exiled for a year. The woman will also be lapidated.<sup>242</sup>] Then, the Prophet gave his

---

*Al-Musnad*, 1: 512 (No. 2129); *Al-Mustadrak*, 4: 361.

*‘Umdat al-Qārī*, 9: 622 (No. 2724-2725) 16: 490 (No. 7260); *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 4: 153 (No. 4445); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 2: 852; *Sunan al-Dārimī*, 2: 177; *Al-Sunan al-Kubrā*, 8: 371 and 382; *Al-Mu‘jam al-Kabīr*, 5: 234 (No. 5189), 5: 238 (No. 5199); *Kanz al-Ummāl*, 5: 334 (No. 13102), 5: 425 (No. 13503).

judgment and said: [Go O Unays to the woman! Lapidate her if she confesses!] The woman confessed and she was lapidated.”

“As for the report that [nobody had ever said that (the Prophet) had added four times on such and such occasions...] this contradicted the *ḥadīth* related to Mā‘iz.”

210. Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that there is neither divergence nor contradiction between them – Praise be to Almighty Allāh. Indeed, the Prophet had turned down Mā‘iz four times in sequence because he disliked him accusing himself of fornication after revealing the veil<sup>243</sup> which, Almighty Allāh granted to him (and all). The Prophet also did not intend to make (Mā‘iz) confess four times in sequence rather to appease (Mā‘iz) in this situation as was to ensure him whether he was (saying) the truth or he was being possessed by the genie. However, it happens that the Prophet allowed him to appease himself four times. If that confession happened to twice or three times or five or six times, these would not show binding proof, but it only stressed that the Prophet disliked Mā‘iz’s self-confession of being a fornicator.”

“There is a *ḥadīth* reported by Mālik from Zayd ibn Aslam indicating the Prophet’s dislike of confession of being guilty of fornication by a man before him, then he ordered him to be lapidated and said: O people! The time has come for you to conclude the legal punishment of Almighty Allāh. Whoever perpetrates this sinful act, may he hide himself with the veil of Almighty Allāh for if someone uncovers it

<sup>243</sup>

Availing the veil in the statement means to disgrace or dishonor oneself by informing others of one’s weaknesses, except in permissible circumstances.



ge' to us, we will apply the punishment as in the Book of mighty Allāh.<sup>244]</sup>"

a. "To prove that a confession could be intervened so that it can be made more than four times or less or should there be an element of doubt in the information — there is a *ḥadīth* narrated by Yaḥyā ibn Ḥadīd from Hishām al-Dustuwā'ī who then narrated it from Yaḥyā Abū Kathīr who narrated from Abū Qilābah and the latter from al-Muhallab that 'Imrān ibn Ḥuṣayn said: [We were (sitting) with the Prophet when a woman from Juhaynah came to see him. She was pregnant out of adultery and said: {O Prophet of Allāh, I deserve legal punishment, perform it on me!} The Prophet then called her to him and ordered him to treat her well and to bring her to him when she had delivered her baby. She was brought to him after her delivery and the Prophet ordered her to suckle her baby. When her baby has been weaned from suckling, her relative brought her to see the Prophet. Then the Prophet 'replaced' her clothing, lapidated and performed the burial prayer on her.<sup>245]</sup>"

Everybody says in the *ḥadīth* that she confessed four times. Therefore, the aforementioned *ḥadīth* proves that the Prophet only said: [Go! Lapidate her if she confesses!]"

b. "Another proof is that, at the time when Mā'iz ibn Mālīk was lapidated, he was depressed and tried to run away. (However), the Prophet lapidated him and reported to the Prophet of Mā'iz's depression the Prophet said: [Why don't you bring him to me, so that I can examine his case?] If the act of confession of four times is the necessary condition for the legal punishment, then the statement of

---

*Muwaffā' Mālīk*, 41:12.

*Al-Musnad*, 7: 215 (No. 19946).



the Prophet (should be): [Why didn't you bring him to me...?] (would be meaningless), for he had already applied the punishment ordained by Almighty Allāh. It is not possible! – (Must it be) after the fourth confession that the Prophet has to admit the eventual retraction? On the other hand, if the confession did not fall during the appointed time (*tawqīf*) it is possible for (Mā'iz) to retract it, if I wanted it and the Prophet would have accepted it. (This, however, did not take place)."

They said: "The (following three chapters) contained the compilation of examples of the legal judgment according to consensus but invalidated by al-Qur'ān, however, they were applied by the Khārijites as their arguments."

#### **XLIV. EXAMPLE OF JUDGEMENT ON *RAJM* OR LAPIDATION REFUTED BY AL-QUR'ĀN**

211. They said: "You reported that the Prophet practiced lapidation and the nations after him followed this practice. Almighty Allāh in relation to slave women said: [If they commit illegal sexual intercourse, their punishment is half that of free women. The permission is for those among you who fear sin.<sup>246</sup>] Lapidation means to redress oneself and not to be shared with other. How could it be that the punishment on a slave woman is half of the free woman? You also said that *al-muḥṣanah* means a free and married woman. They said: "With this (idea), it proves that *al-muḥṣanah* (convicted), the punishment is *jald* or flogging."

<sup>246</sup> *Sūrah al-Nisā'*, 4: 25.

Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that *al-muḥṣanāt* in the above verse of discussion, are married, and thus the judgment (to be judged) is correct, but here we mean the *muḥṣanāt* as free women. We also call *muḥṣanāt* as virgin women for (the term) *al-iḥṣān* or to be chaste, is inherent in them and they will be protected but this privilege is not for slave women. The above verse is tactfully saying: [their punishment is half that of a free woman], meaning (it compares with) the virgin."

In general) the Arabs used to call a cow *al-muthīrah* (the cultivator) though it is not used for cultivating land. Indeed, land cultivation is the fate of other animals except for cows. The Arabs also used to call camels, which are in the grazing land as *hady* (offering) because they represent an offering, which guide (people) to the Ka'bah. They are called by this name even though the camels are not meant for sacrifice."

Another point which testifies our interpretation of *al-muḥṣanāt*, on this topic – as the free and virgin women – is found in the saying of the mighty Allāh: [If any of you have not the means wherewith to wed believing women, they may wed believing girls from among those whom your right hands possess.<sup>247</sup>] *Al-muḥṣanāt* here refers to a free woman or an unmarried woman for a man does not marry to married women."

---

*Sūrah al-Nisā'*, 4: 25.

#### XLV. EXAMPLE OF THE JUDGMENT ON *WAṢIYYAH* OF WILL INJUNCTION REFUTED BY AL-QUR'ĀN

213. They said: "You reported that the Prophet SAAS had said [There is no *waṣiyyah* in favour of the heir.<sup>248</sup>] Almighty Allāh however, said: [It is prescribed for you, when death approaches an of you, if he leaves any goods, that he makes a bequest to parents an next of kin.<sup>249</sup>] The parents in any circumstances will inherit th wealth and nobody could contest the right of the inheritance. Th narration, therefore, contradicts the Book of Almighty Allāh."

214. Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that this verse is abrogated b other verse related to inheritance. If somebody said: [Which part (the other) verse on inheritance abrogates the (former) verse since is obvious for the parents to receive a part of the inheritance as we as to receive the benefits bequeathed to them? We shall reply: [Th is not possible for *al-mīrāth* or the share of the heritage, whic Almighty Allāh has meant for them, is in the quota of the *wirāthah* inheritance.]"

"Almighty Allāh said – the verses related to inheritance: [Those a limits set by Allāh, those who obey Allāh and His Prophet will admitted to gardens with rivers flowing beneath to abide there forever and that will be the supreme achievement. But those w disobey Allāh and His Prophet and transgress His limits will admitted to fire, to abide therein and they shall have a humiliati

<sup>248</sup> *ʿAṣṣat al-Aḥwadhī*, 8: 209-210 (No. 2120-2121); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 2: 906 (No. 2713-2714); *Al-Musnad*, 6: 206 (No. 17679), 6: 207 (No. 17681) 313 (No. 18105); *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 5: 870 (No. 14574), 5: 871 (No. 14576); 105 (No. 15051), 12: 651 (No. 46062); *Al-Muṣannaf*, 4: 147 (No. 8277)

<sup>249</sup> *Sūrah al-Baqarah*, 2:180.

nishment.<sup>250</sup>] Thus, (Allāh) has promised a supreme reward to whoever respects the law of inheritance which He had meant it to be, and at the same time He had threatened whoever disobeys the law with a grievous punishment. Nobody, therefore, can bequeath wealth to an heir more than what had been determined and ordained by the mighty Allāh. Indeed, it is said: [The saying of the Prophet – here is no *waṣīyyah* in favour of the heir} abrogated the (said) verse. We shall explain some cases of abrogation of verses of al-Qur’ān by the Sunnah, if Almighty Allāh wills it!”

#### **LVI. EXAMPLE OF JUDGMENT ON MARRIAGE SAID TO BE REFUTED BY AL-QUR’ĀN**

5. They said: “You reported that the Prophet SAAS said: [Do not marry a woman related either to one’s maternal or paternal aunt.<sup>251</sup>] He also said: [The reason of prohibition of the milk-kinship is similar to the biological (blood) relationship.<sup>252</sup>] Almighty Allāh said: [Prohibited to you (for marriage) are: your mothers, your daughters...<sup>253</sup>] to the end of the verse. The verse neither mentions marriage between (man and) woman (either related to) his paternal or maternal aunt and nor prohibits marriage between people who are related through) milk-kinship. The verse, however, prohibits (a man to marry to) the suckling mothers and the sisters out of suckling. In another verse Almighty Allāh said: [All others are lawful....<sup>254</sup>] Thus, the woman can live together with her paternal and

---

*Sūrah al-Nisā’*, 4: 13-14.

*Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 1: 621 (No. 1921, 1931); *Al-Mu’jam al-Kabīr*, 7: 218 (No. 6908), 11: 302 (No. 11805), 11: 336 (No. 11930), 17: 162 (No. 17).

*Al-Musnad*, 9: 401 (No. 24766); *Kanz al-Ummāl*, 6: 273 (No. 5668).

*Sūrah al-Nisā’*, 4: 23.

*Sūrah al-Nisā’*, 4: 23.



maternal aunt as well as relatives of suckling through milk-kinship whether the mother or the sister, whom Almighty Allāh has made allowable.”

216. Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that Almighty Allāh will test His servants by means of obligations, to know the level of their obedience or disobedience as well as to reward the virtuous and (punish) the vicious among them. He also had determined (things which are acceptable and unacceptable as the causes liable to lawful and unlawful acts. All that is bad is always bad because Almighty Allāh forbids it. What is good is always good because Almighty Allāh recommends it.”

“However, there are exceptions which Allāh had willed in their nature to be bad such as: a lie, sabotage, slander, stinginess, tyranny and the likes. Indeed, it is possible for Almighty Allāh to send a Prophet to reveal a *Sharīʿah* which is to be respected for years to come and practiced by men (as the sign of their) obedience to Him. Later, He sends another Prophet to reveal another *Sharīʿah* which is (also) practiced by men (as the sign of their) obedience to Almighty Allāh and (thus) abrogating the earlier (*Sharīʿah*). For example, the (issue of) the rest day on Saturday revealed to Mūsā (to be practiced) was later abrogated (during the time of) ʿĪsā al-Masīḥ. (Another example is) the circumcision on the seventh day revealed to (Mūsā) but again was abrogated (during the time of) ʿĪsā al-Masīḥ. Hence, it is also possible for Allāh to ordain something on His servant at a certain period of time and to abrogate it at another period of time of the same Prophet. Indeed, Almighty Allāh had said: [None of Our revelations do we abrogate or cause to be forgotten, but We substitute

nothing better or similar...<sup>255</sup>] which means better than before or  
er than before."

a. "If it is acceptable for the Book to be abrogated by other Book,  
ainly it will also be acceptable for the Book to be abrogated by  
Sunnah. This is because the Sunnah is revealed to the Prophet  
ugh Jibrīl from Almighty Allāh. In this way, the word of  
mighty Allāh, which is also al-Qur'ān, can be abrogated by (other)  
elation of Almighty Allāh and hence, it is no more (known as) al-  
'ān. As such the Prophet said: [The book was revealed to me as  
l as other similar things to it<sup>256</sup>] which means that the similar  
g to the Book was the Sunnah, for Almighty Allāh said: [So take  
it the Prophet assigns to you and deny yourselves that which he  
holds from you.<sup>257</sup>] Indeed, Almighty Allāh knew very well that  
would accept easily whatever was informed to us by the Prophet,  
the word of Allāh. The Prophet also knew that Allāh would  
ogate some parts of al-Qur'ān through the revelation revealed to  
l. When this (abrogation) occurred, some hearts will object it and  
ill affect some conscience. This is why Allāh said to us: [So take  
it the Prophet has assigned to you] which means whatever the  
phet has brought to you, accept it even if it was not (mentioned)  
al-Qur'ān or it was abrogated by al-Qur'ān."

b. Abū Muḥammad said: "The *Sunan* to us comprises three parts,  
ely the Sunnah transmitted to (Prophet Muḥammad) through  
īl from Almighty Allāh, for example: A woman cannot be  
ried (to a man) because she is the paternal and maternal aunt (to  
man); a cause of prohibition to the milk-kinship is similar to the

---

*Sūrah al-Baqarah*, 2:106.

*Al-Tamhīd*, 1: 460; *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 4: 200 (No. 4604).

*Sūrah al-Ḥashr*, 59:7.

biological (blood) relationship; one or two sips does not form a cause for prohibition;<sup>258</sup> the price of blood money depends on the spouse ('*āqilah*)<sup>259</sup> and the likes."

216c. "The second form of the Sunnah is the one which Allāh allows the Prophet to establish (a concept) by authorizing him to exercise his own reasoning and he also had been empowered to be tolerant in favour of whom he wishes for a certain valid reason and motive like forbidding the wearing of silk to man but he permitted 'Abd al-Rahmān ibn 'Awf for a certain reason. (Another example) is his statement when he was in Makkah: [Do not cut the grass or the trees!<sup>260</sup>] Then, Al-'Abbās ibn 'Abd al-Muṭṭalib said: [O Prophet of Allāh! (Is it with) exception so as to preserve some of them for our blacksmith?] And the Prophet replied: [Except to preserve (some of them)!] If Almighty Allāh had forbidden all trees (to be grown) in Makkah, the Prophet would have not made any exception as Al-'Abbās wanted. However, Almighty Allāh has given the Prophet the (judgment) ability (so as) to set aside what he considered useful, thus he made an exception (not to cut any tree or grass) except the *idhkhi* due to the service it rendered."

Somebody said: "There is no more migration after the *fath* (opening of Makkah)."<sup>261</sup> But Al-'Abbās interceded in favour of the brother of

<sup>258</sup> *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 2: 224 (No. 2063); *ʿAṣīdat al-Aḥwadhī*, 5: 73 (No. 1150); *Al-Musnad*, 9: 388 (No. 24698), 10: 38 (No. 25870); *Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, 1: 124 (No. 248); *Mawārid*, 1: 540 (No. 1251 and 1252); *Al-Tamhīd*, 3: 62; *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 6: 273 (No. 15671-15672); *Al-Sunan al-Kubrā*, 7: 749 (No. 15625), 7: 750 (No. 15629), 7: 752 (No. 15635).

<sup>259</sup> *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 2: 879 (No. 2633).

<sup>260</sup> *'Umdat al-Qārī*, 6: 221 (No. 1349), 7: 142 (No. 1587), 8: 358 (No. 2090), 9: 168 (No. 2433), 9: 514-515 (No. 1833-1834); *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 2: 216 (No. 2035); *Al-Musnad*, 1: 544 (No. 2279).

<sup>261</sup> *'Umdat al-Qārī*, 10: 410 (No. 3077); *Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, 3: 273 (No. 3390); *Majma' al-Zawā'id*, 5: 324-325 (No. 9275-9279); *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 6: 109 (No. 15054), 16: 654 (No. 46250), 16: 660 (No. 46277).



‘āshī’ ibn Mas‘ūd, (saying) that (the latter) will be considered as *muhājir* (migrant) after the *fath*. The Prophet SAAS said: [I locate my uncle an exception for there is no more migration (after *fath* of Makkah).]”

the judgment (made in this case) is the (topic related to) relation, no intercession is needed and the Prophet would have said: [The ‘*ādī*’ (ancient) land belongs to Allāh and His Prophets and they belong to you through me. And whoever cultivates land, land belongs to him!<sup>262</sup>]”

relation to ‘*umrah*’, the Prophet said: [If I could change thing, I do away with ‘*umrah*.<sup>263</sup>] He also said concerning the ‘*ishā*’ayer: [If it is not difficult for my community to bear, I would have needed for it to be performed now.<sup>264</sup>] (Apart from that) he forbade Muslims) to keep the meat of the *aḍāḥī* (slaughtered animals for sacrifice on the 10 of Dhū al-Ḥijjah) more than three days, visit the graveyard, and drink *nabīdh* on certain occasions<sup>265</sup> by saying: [I bid you to keep the meat of the *aḍāḥī* more than three days and I bid that the people present it to their guests and keep it aside for those who are absent. Eat and keep the amount you want.<sup>266</sup>] [I forbid to visit the graveyard but you may visit them without saying any obscene wōrd, this will soften the hearts.<sup>267</sup>] [I forbid you to drink

---

Al-Albānī, Muḥammad Nāṣir al-Dīn, *Silsilah al-Aḥādīth al-Ḍa‘īfah wa al-Mawḍū‘ah* (Al-Riyāḍ: Maktabah al-Ma‘ārif, 1992), 2: 29, hereafter cited as *Silsilah*.

*Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 2: 156 (No. 1789); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 2: 1023 (No. 3074); *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, 5: 46 (No. 11989-19990).

*Al-Muṣannaf*, 3: 100 (No. 15).

*Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 2: 1055 (No. 3159); *Al-Musnad*, 4: 127 (No. 11627).

*Al-Musnad*, 4: 12 (No. 11606); *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, 5: 107 (No. 12264); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 2: 1055 (No. 3160).

*Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, 15: 646 (No. 42555); *Al-Musnad*, 4: 76 (No. 11329).



*nabīdh* in certain occasions, but you may drink a little but do not drink the intoxicated drink.]"

Abū Muḥammad said: "(The following *ḥadīth*) will enlighten the case further. Muḥammad ibn Khālid ibn Khidāsh said that he narrated from Muslim ibn Qutaybah who narrated from Yūnus al-Ḥakīm the latter from Mudrik ibn 'Imārah, saying that the Prophet SAA had entered the courtyard of an Anṣār and saw him carrying *nabīdh* made from the trunk of a palm-tree, in a container. Then he asked (the Anṣār) to pour it to the ground. But the man asked: [Will you allow me to drink it and I will not repeat?] The Prophet replied: [Drink it! Do not repeat it (in future)!]"

"This shows that Almighty Allāh has empowered the Prophet with the ability to forbid things as well as to grant tolerance to those who wish. If this is not possible, as in the above cases, he will abstain himself from doing so as he had done when he was asked on *kalāla*. (The Prophet) said to a person who asked him: [This is what I have been given and I will not say anything unless I was informed about it.] Another example is that when a woman who was in disagreement with her husband, had asked (the Prophet) on *zihār*,<sup>268</sup> but he did not really answer her, but said: [It is Almighty Allāh Who judged the matter this way.<sup>269</sup>]"

"A Bedouin came to see the Prophet who was in the state of *muḥrim* (sacrosanct) and was covered by a scented, long, woolen outer garment, asked him for a consultation. The Prophet did not answer him but covered himself with his garment (eventually went to sleep

<sup>268</sup> *Zihār* is the pre-Islamic form of divorce, consisting in the words of repudiation: [You are to me like my mother's back!]

<sup>269</sup> *Al-Musnad*, 5: 127 (No. 14804); *Al-Mustadrak*, 4: 334, 342; *Sunan al-Dāraqutnī*, 4: 78, (No. 34); *Al-Al-Sunan al-Kubrā*, 6: 376 (No. 12311).

1 he snored like a horse. When he woke up he gave (the Bedouin) consultation."

5d. "The third form of Sunnah is the Sunnah that (the Prophet) abolished so as to teach us. If we take it into account we will have merit (*faḍīlah*) and if we leave it, it will do us no harm, if Allāh permits. For example: encouraging (people) to wear a turban with its end beneath the chin or prohibiting eating the meat of *al-jallālah*<sup>270</sup> practicing the *kasb al-hajjām*<sup>271</sup> and (eating) the meat of domestic keys. Likewise, (he prohibited eating) all kinds of beasts of prey as well as all types of birds that pounce using the claws. This is in accordance with the saying of Almighty Allāh: [Say I find not in the message received by me by inspiration any meat forbidden to be eaten by one who wishes to eat it, unless it be dead meat, or blood poured forth or the flesh of swine for it is an abomination or what is impious (meat) on which a name has been invoked other than Allāh<sup>272</sup>] which means that he does not realize, upon the revelation of *ṣūrah*, there are more types of meat forbidden to man apart from the ones mentioned in al-Qur'ān. Then, as revealed in *Ṣūrah al-Mā'idah*, whereby certain types of animal meat are forbidden such as that being killed by strangling, killed by a violent blow, killed by a long fall, killed by being gored to death and which has been eaten by a wild animal unless one is able to slaughter it (in the proper form).<sup>273</sup>

---

The word *jallālah* means the animal that feeds itself by eating the dirt or rubbish.

An ancient kind of treatment to release back pain and headache by sucking out blood from a few small cuts made either on the patient's back, waist or back part of the head. Then a cupper, which among the Malays, was made of a buffalo's horn, used to suck out the 'dirty blood.'

*Ṣūrah al-An'ām*, 6: 145.

*Ṣūrah al-Mā'idah*, 4: 4.

“In addition we mention the forbidden animals as Almighty Allāh forbade in the Book, based on the saying of the Prophet like the ferocious animals, birds and domestic animals. Likewise we also will mention the event of shortening the (*raka'āt*) of prayer even during peaceful time, as in the saying of Almighty Allāh: [There is no blame on you if you shorten your prayers for fear the unbelievers may attack you.<sup>274</sup>] Hence, we were informed that there is no harm for us to shorten our prayer when we are in fear and were also informed by the Prophet that it is also possible to shorten the prayer even during peaceful time. (Other example is) to wipe off the shoes as in the saying of Almighty Allāh: [Wash your faces and your hands and arms to the elbow and wash your feet to the ankles.<sup>275</sup>]”

“‘Īsā ibn Yūnus had narrated from al-Auzā‘ī and the latter from Yaḥyā ibn Abū Kathīr saying: [The Sunnah justifies thing according to the Book and not the Book which justifies thing according to the Sunnah] which means that the Sunnah explained the content of the Book as well as the source of information on whatever intended by Almighty Allāh.”

#### **XLVII. EXAMPLE OF TWO CONTRADICTORY ḤADĪTH: ON THE JUDGMENT OF GHUSL ON FRIDAY**

217. They said: “You reported that Mālik has narrated from Ṣafwān ibn Sālim who then narrated from ‘Aṭā’ ibn Yasār and the latter from Abū Sa‘īd al-Khudrī that the Prophet had said: [*Ghusl* (bathing) on

<sup>274</sup> *Sūrah al-Nisā’*, 4: 101.

<sup>275</sup> *Sūrah al-Mā‘idah*, 5:6.

ay is obligatory on all (sexually) mature person.<sup>276]</sup> You also rted from Hammām who narrated from Qatādah, who then ated from al-Ḥasan and the latter had reported from Samurah ng that the Prophet had said: [He who has his *wuḍū'* (ablution) on ay, is an excellent (act) but it would be better for him if he has *ghusl*.<sup>277]</sup> Thus, they said that the (second *ḥadīth*) contradicted irst one."

Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that his saying: [*Ghusl* on ay is obligatory on all (sexually) mature person] does not signify the Prophet had made it strictly obligatory (*farḍ*), but rather a tice which he declared as obligatory for all Muslims just as it is gatory for them to have *ghusl* on the days of (*'īd al-fīṭr* and *'īd dhā*) on the (basis) of virtuous deeds and preferable acts in enting oneself to society, with a clean body free from dirt and ing smell. With this, it is ordained for the Muslims to adorn selves with good smelling perfume, to wash their clothes meant Friday or for working. (From the foregoing discussion, the said tice is an act of free-choice) according to one's interest and the gation (imposed) is by virtue of preference and not by virtue of itual obligation (*farḍ*)."

1. "Later, the Prophet was informed that there were people who : sick, who were busy and who lived in an extremely cold- her country. They were able to have their *ghusl* but with severe culty, then the Prophet said [Whoever have his *wuḍū'*, this is an

'*Umdat al-Qārī*, 5: 12, (No. 879), 9: 538, (No. 880), 5: 47, (No. 895); *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, 2: (No. 7); *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 1: 94 (No. 341); *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 7: 753 (No. 21240 and 21241), 7: 759 (No. 21281).

*Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 1: 97 (No. 354); *Ārīḍat al-Aḥwadhī*, 2: 240, (No. 497); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 1: 347 (No. 1091); *Al-Musnad*, 7: 265 (No. 20197), 7: 279 (No. 20279); *Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, 7: 199 (No. 6817-6920), 7: 223 (No. 6926); *Al-Sunan al-Kubrā*, 3: 270 (No. 5668).



excellent (act)] which means it is allowable (to have *wuḍū'* instead *ghusl*). Later, on he explained that whoever is able to have his *ghu* it is a preferable act. This case is similar to the Prophet's interdiction on keeping the meat of *adāhī* more than three days, to which later said: [I noticed that the people presented it to their guests and kept aside some for those who are absent] and the Prophet's interdiction on visiting the graveyard but later on he said: [I noticed that this would soften the hearts so, visit but do not say an obscene word!]"

#### **XLVIII. EXAMPLE OF ḤADĪTH INVALIDATED BY 'IYA (EXPERIENCE)**

219. They said: "You narrated from Ibn Luhay'ah who narrated from Mishraḥ ibn 'Āhān and the latter from 'Uqbah ibn 'Āmir who said that he heard the Prophet saying: [If al-Qur'ān is (written) on taw raw skin and then thrown into the fire, it will be left unburned <sup>2</sup> They said: [We do not doubt that this news is wrong for we had seen the *maṣāḥif* (copies of al-Qur'ān) were burned and destroyed just like other objects and books.]"

220. Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that this is their interpretation but they do not know the truth and I will explain it, if Almighty Allāh permits. Yazīd ibn 'Amr asked Al-Aṣma'ī about this *ḥadīth* and the latter said: [If al-Qur'ān is memorized by a man and then he is thrown into the fire, he is safe from being burned.] Al-Aṣma'ī intended to explain that whoever among the Muslims is inspired by Almighty Allāh to understand al-Qur'ān (deeply) and memorized it

ses completely, he will not be burned by the hell fire on the Day the Judgment, even if he 'is contaminated' with sins. Abū āmah said: [Memorize al-Qur'ān or recite al-Qur'ān, these *sāḥif* will not beguile you.] Indeed, Almighty Allāh will not nent with hell-fire, the heart that is attentive to al-Qur'ān. The sical (human) body (*jism*) is created as the receptacle of al-Qur'ān like the *ihāb*, and *ihāb* means the skin (hide), which is yet to be ned. If *ihāb* is possible to be tanned, it is also possible to make it allusion to the physical body; as in the phrase of 'Ā'ishah while was describing her father, saying: [He held the animal's head on leash (on the upper part of its back) and (this position) prevented blood from oozing into the skin] that is, to ooze into its body], ch means the physical body."

a. "In another saying, some of them said: [The sign of phethood during the time of the Prophet was proven by al-Qur'ān he Words of Almighty Allāh, which were revealed to the Prophet he eulogized Almighty Allāh with those verses at all times. pite the animosity shown by the polytheists against him, (al-'ān) is continuously eulogized even after (the demise) of the phet. Similarly, the verses (were being eulogized) during the time he previous Prophets, (for examples), the resurrection of the dead s, the wolf talks, the complaint of a camel, dead bodies rejected he earth and later on disappeared."

b. "In another saying that the expression: [the unburned verses of Qur'ān...] until the expression) [...not referred to *ihāb*], it means if al-Qur'ān was written on the skin (hide) and then thrown into fire, the skin and the ink will be burned up but not al-Qur'ān

itself. It is as if Almighty Allāh has elevated it hence preserving it from the fire.”

220c. “For us, we do not doubt whatever that exists in the *maṣāḥif*; be it in its real sense (*ḥaqīqah*) or in its figurative sense (*majāz*). The people of *kalām*, however, held the opinion that whatever is contained in *muṣḥaf* is the evidence (*dalīl*) of al-Qur’ān and not in itself. Almighty Allāh said: [This is indeed al-Qur’ān, most honorable, in a Book well-guarded, which none shall touch but those who are clean.<sup>279</sup>] The Prophet also said: [Do not bring al-Qur’ān if you are traveling to the enemies land.<sup>280</sup>] Here, he means al-Qur’ān as the *muṣḥaf* (text).”

## XLIX. EXAMPLE OF ḤADĪTH INVALIDATED BY AL-QUR’ĀN

221. They said: “You reported that the Prophet said: [The respect of the strength of relationship among the next of kin will add to the zest of life] and Almighty Allāh said: [When their term is reached, not an hour can they cause delay or an hour can they advance it in anticipation.<sup>281</sup>] Then they asked: “What respect of the strength of a relationship can change the time (*ajal*) which could neither be delayed nor advanced?”

222. Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that the expression of the enhancement or zest for life has two meanings. One of them means the abundance and enhancement of material resources (*al-rizq*) and healthy body. It is said that poverty is the supreme death. And as

<sup>279</sup> *Sūrah al-Wāqī’ah*, 56:77-79.

<sup>280</sup> *Mushkīl al-Ḥadīth*, 2: 369; *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, 1: 521 (No. 2336), 1: 620 (No. 2863); *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, 24 (No. 24).

<sup>281</sup> *Sūrah al-A’rāf*, 7:34



ed in a *ḥadīth*: [Indeed, Almighty Allāh has taught Mūsā to kill enemies. Later on, he saw (the said enemies look like) scattered red palm leaves]. He said: [O Lord! You promised me that I would kill them.] His Lord said: [Indeed, I have made them poor.] poet said:

[It is not that death for a man is a restful time

Indeed, the death is the life for the dead.

th here) means poverty. If it is possible to call the poor as the that brings about the reduction in the (zest) for life, it is also able to call the rich as alive. This gives rise to the extension in

i. "The other meaning is: Almighty Allāh has prescribed the time for his slave to be one hundred years. He granted him with physical , composition and environment so as to administer his life for twenty years. If he strengthens his relationship (to others), Almighty h will extend more time in that physical built, composition and onment; thus he will lead his life for another twenty years until reaches one hundred. This (extension of time) is the meaning of time where there is neither delay nor advances."

### EXAMPLE OF ḤADĪTH INVALIDATED BY AL-QUR'ĀN ) CONSENSUS

They said: "You have reported that *ṣadaqah* (charity) shoved fixed decrees and Almighty Allāh said: [For to anything which we have willed, We but say the word, 'Be' and it is.<sup>282</sup>] The

---

*Sūrah al-Naḥl*, 16: 40.



consensus is that nothing can refute His decree or the outcome of His Judgment.”

224. Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that in the interpretation of the (above statements): [A man who committed sins, his decree of punishment and when he gave *ṣadaqah*, the punishment will be shoved off from himself. This is proven in the saying: [The unrevealed *ṣadaqah* will appease the wrath of the Lord.<sup>283</sup>] Don’t you see that when Almighty Allāh is angry at a person, He will execute His punishment but when the person gives *ṣadaqah*, this anger is appeased and His (decree of) Punishment is removed?”

“In a similar case, a person has committed a grievous sin but (later feared His immediate reprimand and he gave a gift (as a form of waiving off His (anger) and (the Prophet) said: [The gift removes the decree of punishment.]”

## LI. EXAMPLE OF AN INCOMPATIBLE ḤADĪTH (IN ITS BEGINNING AND ENDING)

225. They said: “You have reported that there will be leaders among you; if you obey you will be misguided and if you disobey you will be deluded. This is illogical, how could we be misguided if we obey and be deluded if we disobey?<sup>284</sup>”

226. Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that the (meaning of) this *ḥadīth* does not contradict with its interpretation. Accordingly, those who obeyed them in the act of disobeying Almighty Allāh and

<sup>283</sup> *Majma' al-Zuwā'id*, 3: 320 -1 (No. 4638); *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 6: 352 (No. 16026), 6: 399 (No. 16244), 6: 406 (No. 16285).

<sup>284</sup> *ʿAridat al-Aḥwadhī*, 9: 86, (2265); *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 3: 68 (No. 5530), 6: 76 (No. 14904).

ressed people as well as shed innocent blood would mean obeying (the leaders). As for those who disobeyed (the leaders) by regating from them and severing the relationship between the slims, like the Khārijites, this would mean disobeying (the lers). Some interpreted this *ḥadīth* as neither doing anything nor elling against them. It is possible to resist what they have ordered do even on the basis of virtuous deed. If (the leaders) are guided in performing the order, one will also be misguided by r misdeed. And by not performing what they have been ordered to this would mean disobeying them.”

## EXAMPLE OF *HADĪTH* INVALIDATED BY AL-R’ĀN AND REASONING

. They said: “You have reported that the Prophet said: [You will your Lord on the Day of Resurrection just as you are seeing the moon. You will not crowd together in seeing it.<sup>285</sup>] And mighty Allāh said: [No vision can grasp Him, but His grasp is r all vision<sup>286</sup>] and [There is nothing whatever like unto Him<sup>287</sup>]. y said: [Logically, it is impossible for the Creator to resemble His tion in whatever Attributes of Him. Indeed, Mūsā said: [O my d! Show Yourself to me that I may look upon You! God said: By means can you see Me (direct)<sup>288</sup>]. They said: “If this *ḥadīth* is ientific, the meaning of vision is indeed, to know (on the basis of)

---

<sup>1</sup>*Umdat al-Qārī*, 16: 63, (No. 7434); *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, 37(No. 221); *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 4: 233 (No. 4729); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 1: 63 (No. 177); *Al-Al-Mu’jam al-Kabīr*, 2: 294 (No.2224), 2: 295 (No. 2226, 2229), 2: 296 (No. 2232, 2233, 2234), 2: 297 (No. 2236).

*Sūrah al-An’ām*, 6: 103.

*Sūrah al-Shūrā* 42: 11.

*Sūrah al-A’rāf*, 7: 143.

the saying of Almighty Allāh: [Have you not turned your vision to your Lord? How does He prolong the shadow!<sup>289</sup>] and [I know that God has power over all things.<sup>290</sup>]

228. Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that the *ḥadīth* is authentic. It is not possible for it to be untrue. This is because it is narrated by trustworthy narrators but in various forms of narration. If there is a possibility for such *ḥadīth* to be untruth, it is lawful to be accused of untruth of all aspects of our religion such as *tashahhud*<sup>291</sup> which we do not know except through (*ḥadīth*) narration, the legal alms on animals, the *zakāh* paid in cash, divorce, freeing of slaves and other related issues which we have learned through *ḥadīth* narration of which the Book does not explain.”

228a. “As for the saying of Almighty Allāh: [No vision can grasp Him but His grasp is all vision] and the phrase of Mūsā: [O! My Lord! Show Yourself to me that I may look upon You] and He said: [By no means you can see Me (direct)]; these (two verses) do not invalidate the saying of the Prophet: [You will see your Lord on the Day of Resurrection]. This is because (Allāh) meant to say to (Mūsā) that the vision can never grasp Him on earth, for Almighty Allāh can never be seen by all earthly creatures but He will reveal Himself on the Day of Resurrection, the Day of Reward and Punishment. The believers will see Him just as they are seeing the moon at night when it is (at the stage of) full moon. They will not contradict each other on seeing the moon. The comparison, however, does not apply in

<sup>289</sup> *Sūrah al-Furqān*, 25: 45.

<sup>290</sup> *Sūrah al-Baqarah*, 2: 259.

<sup>291</sup> It means to testify, to bear witness, to certify and to affirm that there is no other God worthy to be worshipped except Allāh and that Muḥammad is the Messenger of Allāh, whole heartedly, affirmed by heart and tongue and practice as well as internalize in all aspect of life.

y circumstances to the moon, such as its roundness, its movement, boundary and the like. It only applies (in the action of seeing) that when we look at the Almighty, it is (similar to the action of us (ing) the full moon. Nobody will disagree about Him just as body disagrees about the full moon.”

he Arabs used to state a parable related to the new moon (crescent) d its appearance, by saying: [This is clearer than the sun and the y/break and renowned more than the moon].”

ū al-Rummah said:

“Indeed it glittered and was not hidden from anybody

Except to anyone who knows not the moon.”

3b. “The expression of the *ḥadīth*: [You do not have to crowd ether to see Him] proves that people used to gather at the ginning of the month (the first quarter of the month) to see the scent and one of them will say: [Here it is!], [There it is!] The er will say: [Such is not the case when the moon is at its fullest e); everybody could see it wherever they are and need not crowd ether to see the moon.]”

3c. “The *ḥadīth* of the Prophet (in fact) acts upon and explains the lings stipulated) in the Book. For example, the saying of nighty Allah: [No vision can grasp Him<sup>292</sup>] and its explanation s given by the authentic narration given by the Prophet that [You l see your Supreme Lord on the Day of Resurrection] which eans that the vision) will not escape any perceptive, reasonable l intelligent man and that this is the time he yearns for! – *waqt ia waqt* (time without time).

---

*Sūrah al-An‘ām*, 6: 103.



228d. "And the saying of Mūsā: [O! My Lord! Show Yourself to me so that I may look upon You<sup>293</sup>] is the most obvious proof that (Allāh) will be seen on the Day of Resurrection. If Almighty Allāh could not be seen in any circumstances neither not be able to contemplate on, He will never manifest Himself to Mūsā which people know well about."

"And for those<sup>294</sup> who said that Almighty Allāh could be seen with their naked eyes on the Day of Resurrection, this means that they have delineated Him (to certain specification) and for those who believed that Almighty Allāh could be delineated to certain specifications have, indeed assimilated Him to His creations. And those who assimilated Him to His creations are indeed infidels.<sup>295</sup>"

"In the event of what they have said and during the events of Mūsā upon which Almighty Allāh has explained to him of His Message, and spoken to him from (within the shrubs or) the trees up to the moment of which (Mūsā) said to his Lord: [O My Lord! Show Yourself to me so that I may look upon You!], can they concede that (Mūsā) has assimilated Allāh to certain specification? Certainly no! It is impossible for Mūsā to display such ignorance concerning Almighty Allāh. On the contrary, Mūsā knew that Almighty Allāh could only be seen on the Day of Resurrection. He has asked Almighty Allāh to realize it for him on this earth (though he knew Allāh) has postponed it to the Day of Resurrection for him, His Messengers and His sages. But (Allāh) said to him: [By no means you can see Me direct...]<sup>296</sup> on this earth [But look upon the mount, if

<sup>293</sup> *Sūrah al-A'rāf*, 7: 143.

<sup>294</sup> Ibn Qutaybah is referring to the people of *kalām*.

<sup>295</sup> Ibn Qutaybah is referring to the ideas propounded by the people of *kalām*, known also as the Mu'tazilites.

<sup>296</sup> *Sūrah al-A'rāf*, 7: 143.

sides in its place, then you shall see Me.]<sup>297</sup> (This event is indeed) make him understand that the mount is unable to resist His endor to the point that it crumbles to dust. If the mountain is ble to bear that demeanor, what more the progeny of Ādam! But the Day of Resurrection, Almighty Allāh will give them the ngth to bear the vision, and the veil which concealed the Vision him (on this earthly life) will be revealed.”

e term *tajallī* means *al-zuhūr* (splendor) and from it one (derives) *awtu al-‘arūs* (I unveiled the bride) when she was presented (to husband) and *‘jalawtu al-mir’ah wa al-sayf* (I revealed the ror and the sword) when they were outshone off the rust.”

e. “As for their statement that *al-ru’yah* as stated in the saying (of Prophet): [You will sees your Lord on the Day of Resurrection] uns to know as stated by Almighty Allāh: [Don’t you know (*alam* r) that Allāh has power over all things?]<sup>298</sup> which means *alam am* (don’t you know?); (the meaning) is absurd for we also know 1 in this world – what is the benefit of this tradition, if events on Day of Resurrection and in this world are identical?”

f. “I have read in al-Injīl that al-Masīḥ has proclaimed the elation which says: [Blessed are the merciful ones and they shall ain mercy for themselves. Blessed are those who are sincere in r hearts and they shall see Almighty Allāh.<sup>299</sup>] And Almighty ḥ says: [Some faces, on that day will beam (in brightness and

---

*Sūrah al-A‘rāf*, 7: 143.

Refer to *Sūrah al-Baqarah*, 2: 106 – in this verse it reads – *alam ta’lam* and not *alam tara* as found in *Ta’wil Mukhtalif al-Hadūth*, page 207, line 2, paragraph 1. This is purely a typing error.

Cf. *Mathew*:VII, 7-8.

beauty) looking towards their Lord!<sup>300</sup>] He also says to people who are embittered with themselves: [Verily from (the light of) their Lord on that day, will they be veiled further, they will enter the fires of hell.<sup>301</sup>] Is it not that these verses ascertain the proof that the beaming faces, who shall look at their Lord, are devoid of any veil?

228f. "If they said to us: [How could this vision and the object of the vision take place?] We will say: [We do not claim that we have reached to (the height of) His Attribute – His Great Sublimity except to the point which the Prophet has acquired, nor do we reject the authenticated words of the Prophet because they are not conjectures though they are not accessible to our perception (*naẓarinā*). Indeed, we (certainly) believe in them without questioning its mode or definition and without analogizing what it is and what is not! – We hope that tomorrow (and in future) this way of saying and believing will be the way of revival (*najāt*) and devoid of all caprices – if Almighty Allāh pleases!<sup>302</sup>"]

### LIII. EXAMPLE OF ANTHROPOMORPHIC ḤADĪTH INVALIDATED BY AL-QUR'ĀN AND REASONING

229. They said: "You have narrated that the heart of a believer lies between the two fingers of Almighty Allāh. If you reinstate the (term) fingers here as grace (favour), then the ḥadīth is authentic and it is an ideology. But if you reinstate the fingers in its specific meaning, then it is absurd for one can never ascribe an organ (body) to Almighty Allāh or assimilate Him with other creatures."

<sup>300</sup> *Sūrah al-Qiyāmah*, 75: 22-23.

<sup>301</sup> *Sūrah al-Muṭaffifīn*, 84: 15-16.

<sup>302</sup> This affirmation is known as taking the position of *bilā-kayfiyyah* or *bilā ka* on eschatological issues. Ibn Qutaybah's thought on this issue is in line with the Sunni scholars.

they have also interpreted fingers as grace based on the saying of the Arabs: [What a good finger so and so has on the wealth he possesses!], which means the person's influence (on others). To describe the camel, al-Rā'ī said:

The skinny heel tendon, the plain veins, you will see,

It has a hand in it when people are starving.

(The poem) means: [You will see it has good influence on others.]”

0. Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that this *ḥadīth* is authentic and their interpretation on the fingers is incompatible to the spirit of this *ḥadīth*. Indeed, the Prophet, in his invocation said: [O! You who are over the heart! Strengthen my heart (inclining) towards Your Religion!<sup>303</sup>] One of his wives said to him: [Do you fear for yourself Prophet?] He said: [Indeed, the heart of a believer lies between the two fingers of Almighty Allāh]. If the heart, as they suggested is between the two (kinds of) grace of Almighty Allāh and He (is ever) protecting His grace, why would (the Prophet) have to ask (Allāh) to strengthen his heart (inclining towards His Religion)? And why would his wife need to ask him: [Do you fear for yourself?] By this, the statement affirmed that he has nothing to fear if the heart is guarded by the two (kinds of) grace.”

0a. “If they ask us: What is your opinion on the (term) finger, we? We shall reply by referring to another *ḥadīth* (which said) that

---

<sup>303</sup> *ʿAridat al-Aḥwadhī*, 8: 232, (No. 2140), 13: 45 (No. 3522); *Al-Musnad*, 4: 226 (No. 12108), 4:511 (No. 13697), 9:380 (No. 24657), 10: 101 (No. 26193), 10: 179 (No. 26581), 10:214 (No.26741); *Al-Mustadrak*, 2:288-289; *Al-Al-Muʿjam al-Kabīr*, 1: 261 (No. 759), 7:313 (No. 7232).



He carried the earth with His one finger and in another (*ḥadīth*), with His two fingers. It is not possible to accept the (term) fingers here as a grace for in the saying of the Almighty: [No just estimate have they made of Allāh, such as is due to Him, on the Day of Judgment, the whole of the earth will be but His Handful and the heavens will be rolled up in His Right Hand.<sup>304</sup>] Hence it is impossible (to accept the term finger as grace)."

"For us, the (term) finger does not mean it is like our fingers. And the hand does not look like our hands and similarly the handful does not look like our handful. This is because everything that is applicable to Him, the Almighty, does not resemble us at all.<sup>305</sup>"

#### LIV. EXAMPLE OF ANTHROPOMORPHIC ḤADĪTH

231. They said: You have said: [Both of His hands are the right hand]. It is impossible if you conceive the two hands with other organs. How can you discern two hands be a right hand?"

232. Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that this *ḥadīth* is authentic and nothing is impossible (for Allāh). And (the Prophet) intended to express this (saying) to indicate the meaning of achievement and perfection, for in everything, the left side is inferior to the right side in the forms of strength, courage and perfection."

"The Arabs love to begin work with the right hand and dislike to begin it with the left hand due to the inherent perfection in the right hand and inherent imperfection in the left hand. This led them to say [*al-yumn* (favourable sign) and *al-shu'm* (bad sign)]. *Al-yumn* of the

<sup>304</sup> *Sūrah al-Zumar*, 39:67.

<sup>305</sup> Cf. *Sūrah al-Shūrā*, 42:11. Here again Ibn Qutaybah establishes his concept of *bila kayfiyyah*.

nd is derived from *al-yumnā* (the right side) while *al-shu'm* of the nd is derived from *al-shu'mā* which means the left hand. So this is clear explanation.<sup>306</sup>

It is also possible that (the Prophet) intended to explain (the expression of): [The gift from both of the hands] for the right hand is the 'giving' hand. If the two hands were qualified as two right hands, then the reason is purely that both hands are the 'giving' hands. Indeed, in another *ḥadīth*, the Prophet said: [The Right (Hand of) Allāh is the eternal giving one, nothing will diminish irrespective of day and night.<sup>307</sup>] This means that (the act of) giving (from Allāh) is continuous and never depletes. It is also in this sense that al-Marrārīd:

[Indeed al-Awānah of 'Aqīl

A youth, whose two hands are the right hand.]”

## V. EXAMPLE OF ANTHROPOMORPHIC ḤADĪTH

3. They said: “You have reported that the Prophet said: [Your Lord amazes in your mourn and despair and He will hasten to answer your prayer] and [He laughs due to this or that.] Indeed, a man will be amazed of something he does not know and when he knows that thing he will be amazed of it and will laugh at it.”

4. Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that ‘amaze’ and ‘laugh’ do not really mean as perceived. In fact, such and such a thing may amaze him or make him laugh, for one laugh at things, which amazes

---

Ibn Qutaybah is applying a semantic usage of *al-yad* (hand), *al-yumn* (the right) and *al-shu'm* (the left).  
*ʿAridat al-Aḥwadhī*, 5:11 (No. 3045); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 1: 71 (No. 197); *Kanz al-ʿUmmāl*, 1: 232 (No. 1163).

him. That is the reason why the Prophet said to an Anṣārīte, who accommodated a guest but he himself did not have sufficient food for his (families). Then he asked his wife to turn off the light so that the guest will not notice that his host is not eating: [Indeed, Almighty Allāh was amazed with your action yesterday.] This means that the action will amaze people. And Almighty Allāh said to His Prophet: [If you marvel (at their want of faith) strange is their saying.<sup>308</sup>] (In this verse Allāh) is not amaze (in what some people said) but He intended to inform that others would be amazed of what they had heard (those people said)."

#### LVI. EXAMPLE OF ANTHROPOMORPHIC ḤADĪTH

235. They said: "You have reported that the Prophet has said: [Do not call names to the wind for it is the breathing of the Merciful One.<sup>309</sup>] This implies that the wind, in your opinion, is an uncreated creation. Nothing that comes from The Merciful One, the Great and Sublime, is created."

236. Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that whatever (the Prophet) meant by the 'breathing', (it has nothing in common) with whatever they believed. He meant to say that the wind was the comfort and serenity of the Merciful One. Somebody said: [O! Lord! Put me away from the evil deed] and Allāh sent the wind to ease His Prophet on the day of al-Aḥzāb. The Almighty Allāh also said: [We sent against them a hurricane and forces that you saw not<sup>310</sup>] and the

<sup>308</sup> *Sūrah al-Ra'd*, 13:5.

<sup>309</sup> *Al-Mustadrak*, 2: 272.

<sup>310</sup> *Sūrah al-Aḥzāb*, 33: 9.



ing of (the Prophet): [I found that the breathing of your Lord came from al-Yaman.<sup>311</sup>]

Muḥammad said: "This is a metaphor for (the Prophet) had said: as severely tormented and distressed by the people of Makkah Allāh comforted me with the Anṣārites, which means that he had comfort in (the support) of the Anṣārite tribe who came from al-Yaman. Therefore, the wind is the emanation of comfort and support from Almighty Allāh just like the Anṣarites are the (source) of comfort from Almighty Allāh."

Muḥammad said: "I have given a longer explanation on this matter in my book, *Gharīb al-Ḥadīth*. And I find that it is necessary for me to mention it again, here, so that the present book is a complete artistic work which it is intended to be."

## I. EXAMPLE OF ANTHROPOMORPHIC ḤADĪTH

They said: "You have reported that the Prophet has said to one of the sons of his daughter: [By Allāh! They will love you and will support you. You are the perfume of Allāh and the last step that Allah (made on earth) is at Wajj.<sup>312</sup>]"

Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that this ḥadīth comes from a good source and is accepted by some people of speculation and some people of ḥadīth. They interpreted that Almighty Allāh had created the last defeat on the polytheists at Ṭā'if and the last expedition undertaken by the Prophet was at Wajj, a valley situated by Ṭā'if. Sufyān ibn 'Uyaynah who believed in this opinion

---

*Kaṣḥf al-Khaṣā'ir*, 1: 251.

*Al-Musnad*, 10: 370 (No. 27383).



said: [This event is similar to the Prophet's invocation: {O! Lord Reinforce Your oppression against Muḍar and sent them to the time just like that of Yūsuf!<sup>313</sup>}] Then, (the people have been) inflicted with famine for seven years, to the point that they had to eat the skin and bone of sheep. Some said: [The oppression of the leader on his people is so severe that he 'treads heavily' on them, as the treads of a shackle-man."

The poet said:

"You tread on us, a tread of fury,

Like the tread of a shackle-man, firm *al-harm*."

Indeed, the shackle-man has a great difficulty to take a step since his two feet are bound to his shackle. The term *al-harm* is a fragile plan and if it is stepped on, it will split into pieces."

238 a. "This opinion seems pleasant for it flatters the heart but would not dare to state that (the interpretation) is in accord with what (the Prophet) had intended to say. I have read the authentic *al-Injī* that al-Masih said to al-Ḥawāriyyūn: [Have you not heard that it is said to those of ancient times do not swear falsely in the name of Almighty Allāh but they never tell the truth. But I said to you: {Do not swear at all, either by heaven for it is the Throne of Almighty Allāh or by earth, for it is His footstool or by Jerusalem (Bait al Maqdis), for it is the city of the great King. And do not swear by your head, for you cannot make one hair turn white or black. Let your word be yes; yes or no, no; anything more than this comes from satan.}<sup>314</sup>]

<sup>313</sup> *Sunan Al-Darāqutnī*, 2: 38, (No. 7); *Mushkil al- Āthār*, 1: 236.

<sup>314</sup> Cf. *Mathew*, 5: 33-37.

b. Abū Muḥammad said: "This *ḥadīth* was also narrated by ʿĪd ibn ʿAmr who narrated from ʿAbd Allāh ibn al-Zubayr al-kkī, who then narrated from ʿAbd Allāh ibn al-Ḥārith, who narrated from Abū Bakr ibn ʿAbd al-Raḥmān and the latter from b who said: [Wajj is a sacred (place), from which the Lord ascends to heaven on the Day of Decree (*Yaum al-Qaḍāʾ*), the day when He created the earth.]"<sup>315</sup>

### III. EXAMPLE OF ANTHROPOMORPHIC ḤADĪTH

. They said: "You have reported that the Prophet had said: [The height of an unbeliever in hell is as big as Mount Uḥud and the thickness of his skin is the span of forty outstretched arms.<sup>315</sup>]"

. Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that this *ḥadīth* comes from a good source. If the Prophet had intended to mean it, the word *al-dhīr* here would mean the king, for Almighty Allāh said: [And you are not the one to overawe them by force<sup>316</sup>] which means the ruling king, while the term *al-jabābirah* means the kings. Likewise, some people said: [This (area) measure so and so many outstretched arms of the king (*dhīrāʾ al-malik*) which also means a big stretch of the land. I believe that the measure is of the outstretched arms of the Iranian King, who was known for his long arms."

---

*Majmaʾ al-Zawāʾid*, 10: 519 (No. 18607); *Al-Targhib*, 4:483; *Kanz al-Ummāl*, 14: 529 (No. 39520), 14: 530 (No. 29523); *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, 13,(No. 44.)

*Sūrah Qāf*, 50: 45.

**LIX. EXAMPLE OF ANTROPOMORPHIC ḤADĪTH**

241. They said: “You have reported that Ibn ‘Abbās has said: [The black stone is the right hand of Almighty Allāh on earth, He glide His Hand (pardons) to anybody He wishes, among His creations.]”<sup>317</sup>

242. Abū Muḥammad: “We affirm that this (expression) is an allegory or a figurative language. Originally, there was a king who used to shake hands with a man and the man will kiss the hand of the king. It is as if that the black stone is the Hand of Allāh, like the king’s hand, which you touch and kiss. I was informed that ‘Ā’ishah said: [When Almighty Allāh drew forth the covenant from the progeny of Ādam and made them testify (saying): {Am I not your Lord?} They said: {Yea! We do testify!}]”<sup>318</sup> – He (glides His Hand on the black stone and said: [Don’t you hear that when they raise their hands saying: {We have faith in You and we honour Your Pact}]. This means that we respect Your Pact because You are our Lord. Likewise, people of the Jāhiliyyah era also kissed (the black stone) even though they were polytheists. However, they kissed the stone, not the real cause since they were unbelievers.”

**LX. EXAMPLE OF ANTHROPOMORPHIC ḤADĪTH**

243. They said: “You have reported that the Prophet said: [I saw my Lord in the most magnificent figure and He laid His palm between

<sup>317</sup> *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 12: 215 (No. 34728), 12: 217 (No. 34744); *Kashf al-Kafā* 1: 417; *Al-Turghīb*, 2: 194; *Al-Durr al-Manthūr*, 1: 135.

<sup>318</sup> Cf. *Sūrah al-A'rāf*, 7:172.

two shoulder bones to the point that I felt (the numb of) coldness [is fingers in my chest.<sup>319</sup>]

Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that Allāh could never be perceived by any vision in earthly (life) but His grasp is over all vision. On the Day of Resurrection, the believers will see Him just as though they are looking at the full moon. Indeed, Mūsā has asked: My Lord! Show Yourself to me so that I may look upon You]; which means to postpone the vision that Allāh has destined for him the likes among His sages. But (Allāh) said: [By no means can I be seen by any vision (direct)]; this is the reason why some people said that our Prophet never see Him except in his dream and (so also) during the occurrence of the divine revelation as well as during the night of ascension (*laylat al-isrā'*) in his spiritual form without his physical body. Don't you hear the saying of Almighty Allāh: [We granted the vision on which We have shown you but as a trial for men – as also the red tree (mentioned) in al-Qur'ān.<sup>320</sup>] *Al-ru'yah* means whatever was shown to (the Prophet) on the night of ascension, but when (this Prophet) was informed to the people, they rejected it and said: [How could he travel to Bayt al-Maqdis and then ascend to heaven and later descend back to earth in one night?] They also accused him of (the falsity) of the claim that the ascension was performed in physical body. However, Abū Bakr was among those who believed the Prophet and (ardently) supported him. This is why he is known as the truthful one. They said: "Indeed, during the night of ascension, one of

---

*Majma' al-Zawā'id*, 1: 328 (No. 1222), 7: 262 (No. 11739); *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 1: 228 (No. 1101); *Mishkāt al-Mayābīh*, 1: 25 (No. 725); *Al-Durr al-Manthūr*, 3: 24, 5: 320, 6: 124. *Sūrah al-Isrā'*, 17:60.



the wives of the Prophet said: [We were not bereaved of his physical body.]”

244a. Abū al-Khaṭṭāb had narrated from Mālik ibn Sa‘īd who narrated from al-A‘mash saying that he heard from al-Walīd ibn al-‘Ayzār and the latter from Abū Al-Aḥwas that in the saying of Almighty Allāh: [And without doubt he saw him in the clear horizon.]<sup>321</sup> The Prophet had said: “I have seen Jibrīl in his form and he has seven hundred wings.”<sup>322</sup>

They said: “To proof the above event, there is also a *ḥadīth* narrated by ‘Abd Allāh who narrated from ‘Amr ibn al-Ḥārith, who narrated from Sa‘īd ibn Abū Hilāl, who narrated from Marwān ibn ‘Uthmān, who narrated from ‘Imārah ibn ‘Āmir and the latter from Umm al-Ṭufayl, the wife of Ubay ibn Ka‘b that she heard the Prophet said that in his dream, he saw his Lord in the form of a young man with thick hair (illuminated) by a green light, sitting on His golden bed and wearing golden sandals.”<sup>323</sup>

244b. Abū Muḥammad said: “We will not say that the (above) interpretation of the *ḥadīth* is correct. We only mentioned the interpretation to inform others that there are people who interpreted these *aḥādīth* this way and supported their argument using these *aḥādīth*. How can we accept that interpretation for Almighty Allāh says: “Glory to (Allāh) who did take His servant for a journey by night.”<sup>324</sup> Indeed, the interpretation should not be done in this manner and these *aḥādīth* cannot be applied to support their interpretations. We seek forgiveness from Allāh and we interpreted (that the

<sup>321</sup> *Sūrah al-Takwīr*, 81: 23.

<sup>322</sup> *Al-Musnad*, 2: 186 (No. 4396); *Al-Durr al-Manthūr*, 6: 123; *Al-Al-Mu‘jam al-Kabīr*, 10: 190 (No. 10423).

<sup>323</sup> *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, 1: 228 (No. 1152).

<sup>324</sup> *Sūrah al-Isrā’*, 17:1.

lation is to sanctify) the virtue of Prophet Muḥammad. We apt this *ḥadīth* and we convey the meaning of the Book in its parent meaning.”

## 1. EXAMPLE OF ANTHROPOMORPHIC *ḤADĪTH*

. They said: “You have-narrated from the Prophet who said that mighty Allāh has created Ādam in His image. But Allāh the mighty, by His Majesty, could not have any image or the like.”

. Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm what they have said: [Indeed mighty Allāh, Praise be to Him, by His Majesty, could not have image or the like. However, it is often that men tend to associate to Him something they know well but will be silenced or reject thing resembling Him. Don’t you realize that Almighty Allāh has cribed Himself in His saying: [There is nothing whatever that is : Him and He is the One that hears and sees all things.<sup>325</sup>] From e it is apparent that whatever that (seems) similar to Him is leed) not similar (at all). (The analogy) of a thing to another is t they are distinct from each other. Literally, it means that (Allāh) embles something. (In an analogy) if He stands therefore, He is ilar to something, but He stands by His Own Self. Somebody d: [A man like me will not say that word to him] or [A man like cannot refute him]. (In these statements) it does not mean to say t I myself do not say to him or I cannot refute him but (those tences) intend to say that I myself do not say such and such! ewise, in the saying: [There is nothing whatever that is like Him]

---

*Sūrah al-Shūrā*, 42:11.

means that nothing resembles Him and this corresponds to the Arabic expression.”

“It is possible for one to consider an addition of *al-kāf* (like) in the expression: [He spoke to me like (*kamithli*) the sword] or [She has fingers like (*kamithli*) okra.] Al-Rājiz said: [Everything burned just like (*kakuma*)<sup>326</sup> the stone tripod is burned (out of constant use).] Here, the terms *al-kāf* ‘*alā al-kāf* are synonymous to *mithl* (similar).”

246a. “People, however, are perplexed with the interpretation of the words of the Prophet which said: [He created Ādam in His image]. Some people of *kalām* said that (the Prophet) meant to say (that Allāh) has created Ādam in the image of Ādam, and nothing else! – If this meaning is accepted then, it is meaningless for anyone to doubt that Almighty Allāh has created man in his image, the ferocious animals in its image and the domestic animal in its image. Others said that Almighty Allāh has created Ādam according to the image (as seen) in front of Him. This opinion is not acceptable because Almighty Allāh has created Ādam in his image, which means that He created Ādam in the image of the face. [Do not disfigure the face. Indeed, Almighty Allāh created Ādam in his image<sup>327</sup>], which means that Allāh – the Glory and Exalted, created Ādam in his own face. This interpretation like the first, is meaningless. (Generally) people know that Almighty Allāh created Ādam in the same manner that He created his sons and his face is similar to their faces.”

<sup>326</sup> *Kakumā* refers to the double usage of *kamā*, which means just like.

<sup>327</sup> *Al-Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, 12: 430 (13580); *Majma' al-Zawā'id*, 8: 135 (No. 13220); *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 1: 228 (No. 1148-1149); *Al-Mustadrak*, 2: 319; *Al-Tamhīd*, 7: 147, 3: 353.

ic. Some people added to the (said) *ḥadīth* saying that when the prophet was passing by a man who struck another man's face, he said: [Do not strike him for Almighty Allāh has created Ādam in his image<sup>328</sup>], referring to the image of the man who was struck by the other. This opinion contains the same flaw like the previous ones."

In the present of those awful interpretations and various disputes that had resulted from the (interpretations), some people have obviously forged something to the *ḥadīth*. Then, they (offensively) said that Ibn 'Umar had narrated from the Prophet who said: [Indeed Almighty Allāh has created Ādam in the image (*ṣūrat*) of the Merciful One (*Inna Allāh 'azza wa jallā khalaqa Ādam 'alā ṣūrat al-raḥmān*)]. (The reason is) they intended to suffix *hā'* to the term *at*, thus becoming *ṣūratihī* (His image). And by (virtue of) replacing the terms *Allāh 'azza wa jallā*, they will later on explain that the sentence will be clearer by replacing the suffix *hā'* with (the noun) *al-Raḥmān* (the Merciful One). This then will be: [The Merciful One created Ādam in His Image] which means they have committed a hideous error."

It is equally impossible for us to say: [Indeed, Almighty Allāh created the heaven by the wish of the Merciful One (*Inna Allāh laqa al-samā' bi mashī'ati al-raḥmān*)] and not on the will power of the Merciful One. However, it is allowable (for us to develop a sentence using) the second noun as an object which is distinct from the first noun such as in the narration: [Do not make your face (look) ugly, for it was created in the image of the Merciful One (...*innahu laqa 'alā ṣūrat al-raḥmān*.)] In fact (in their hideous version, the meaning of) the Merciful One (*al-raḥmān*) is distinct from Almighty

---

*Al-Musnad*, 3: 210 (No. 8298).



Allāh or Allāh is not the Merciful One. If the version (said to be) narrated by Ibn 'Umar is virtually corrected (as shown), then it will be as what the Prophet had intended to mean and hence, it needs neither interpretation nor dispute."

246d. Abū Muḥammad said: "I have not seen any interpretation which more hideous and awful than the one interpreted by the people of *nazar* (speculation). They said: [Indeed, Almighty Allāh intended to create Ādam in paradise in his own image on earth.]<sup>329</sup> It seems that they meant to say that Ādam, while in paradise was such and such height, of such ornament, of such radiance and of such pleasant odor so as to distinguish between (Ādam's) features in paradise and what he would be on earth."

"The Prophet, however, said: [Indeed, Almighty Allāh has created Ādam], he meant it in paradise and [...in His image] he meant it as what (Ādam) is on earth. I do not intend to impose this interpretation of the *ḥadīth* (on others) or proclaim that this is (the right meaning) meaning intended by the Prophet for I have read in al-Tawrah: [When Almighty Allāh has created the heaven and earth, He said: {Let us make humankind in our image}, He then created Ādam from the innermost layer of the earth and He blew his face the breath of life.<sup>330</sup>] Therefore, this will not authorize that particular interpretation."

246e. "Likewise, the *ḥadīth* narrated by Ibn 'Abbās that when Mūsā struck the stone for the Israelites and (water) gushed out from it<sup>331</sup> and he then said: [Drink O Donkeys!] Almighty Allāh revealed to him: [You intentionally (called men) of My creations whom I had

<sup>329</sup> *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, 11 (No. 28), 32 (No. 115); *Al-Musnad*, 3: 210 (No. 8298).

<sup>330</sup> Cf. *Genesis*, I: 26; II: 4-7.

<sup>331</sup> Part of the story was quoted from *Exodus*, XVII: 2-7.

ated in My image but you assimilate them with donkeys. (Mūsā) never, continued (to call them with that name) until he was finished. Hence, this (expressions confirms the previous discussion) he *ḥadīth*.”

f. Abū Muḥammad said: “To my mind, Almighty Allāh knows t. The term *ṣūrah* (image) is nothing unusual for (it is just like or terms such as) the hands, the fingers or the eyes. Those terms familiar (to us) for they appear in al-Qur’ān. For us, we believe n without questioning its nature or limit.”

## II. EXAMPLE OF ANTHROPOMORPHIC *ḤADĪTH*

. They said: “You have reported that a *ḥadīth* narrated by Abū ḥn al-‘Aqīlī who narrated it from Ḥammād ibn Salamah who ed the Prophet: [Where was our Lord before He created the vens and the earth?] He replied: [He was in the darkness *nā’*), surrounded by air above and below Him.]<sup>332</sup> They said: is is sheer delimitation and anthropomorphism.]”

. Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that the *ḥadīth* narrated Abū Razīn contradicts with other sources for its wording is ilusive and the transmitter is a Bedouin. The name such as Wakī’ Ḥudus from whom Ḥammād ibn Salamah narrated from is nown. However, there is an interpretation of this *ḥadīth* by Abū ayd al-Qāsīm ibn Salām who narrated from Aḥmad ibn Sa’īd al-yānī saying that *al-‘amā’* - العماء (the darkness) means the cloud. s is (the meaning) in Arabic language for it ends with *alif*

<sup>332</sup> *‘Ārīḍat al-Aḥwadhī*, 11: 194-5 (No. 3109); *Al-Musnad*, 5: 469 (No. 16188); *Al-Al-Mu’jam al-Kabīr*, 19: 207 (No. 468); *Al-Durr al-Manthūr*, 3: 322; *Mishkāt al-Maṣābīḥ*, 3: 118 (No. 5725).

*mamdūdah*. If (the term *عماء*) ends with *alif maqṣūrah*, it forms 'am – *عمى* (blindness, blind, obscure), then the meaning is as if [he was obscured by the knowledge of people]. This is also true if you have said: [I was obscured (*عميت*) by the matter] or [Indeed, I am terribly obscured of him (*عمى , اعمى*).] If you conjugate (the term) further, it means: [You do not know him; you do not know his direction] and everything that is hidden from you means that you are obscure by it.'

"As for the expression: [He was surrounded by air above and below Him] some people suffixed a negation (*ما*) to (the expression) and they said: [He was not surrounded by air above or below Him]. Obviously, He was in the midst of the air, as explained in the first narration. The skeptical part is that (the meaning) will be unchanged even with the suffix (*ما*), then the terms above (*فوق*) and below (*تحت*) will still remain (unclear). Allāh knows best."

### LXIII. EXAMPLE OF ANTHROPOMORPHIC *HADĪTH*

249. They said: "You have reported that the Prophet said: [Do not insult the time (*الدهر*) for Almighty Allāh, Himself is the time].<sup>33</sup> Thus, with this narration you are in congruent with *al-Dahriyyah*."

250. Abu Muḥammad said: "We affirm that during the *Jāhiliyya* era, the Arabs used to say: [The time has struck in my wealth with such and such way!] Or [I am the victim of the calamity, punishment and the misfortune of time]. And the old man used to say: [The time has mercy on me!]. This led (the Arabs) to correlate everything that occurred in (their life) to the decree of Almighty Allāh such as death

<sup>333</sup> *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, 1: (No. 4, 5); *Al-Musnad*, 8: 366 (No. 22615), 8: 547 (No. 10471); *Majma' al-Zawā'id*, 8: 86 (No. 12998); *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 3: 60 (No. 8137).

kness, mourning over loss of loved ones and old age. They used say: [May Allāh curse the time!]. They also called it as *al-manūn* (the time that summoned death. *Al-manūn* is synonymous to *al-maniyyah* (the time of death)).”

Abū Dhu’ayb said:

“Are you suffering from the death (*manūn*) and for its uncertainties

The time (*dahr*) appeases not who worries.”

Abū Muḥammad said: “This is the form of anthem, which I have learned from al-Riyāshī who narrated from al-Aṣma’ī, who narrated from Ibn Abū Ṭarfah al-Hudhalī and the latter from Abū Dhu’ayb.”

Some people transmitted it as: [And suffering from uncertainty] and placed *al-manūn* with *al-maniyyah*. This is an erroneous structure) and is proven by the statement (which is in masculine structure): [The destiny appeases not who worries].” And Almighty Allāh said: [we await for him some calamity (hatched) by *al-manūn*<sup>334</sup>], which means the uncertainty of death and its event. The Prophet also said: [Let the last calamity (*ākhir al-manūn*) not meet you] which means the last time (*ākhir al-dahr*). Almighty Allāh has mentioned about the *Jāhiliyyah* people who used to correlate the power and the acts of Almighty Allāh to the time, saying: [And they said: What is there but our life in this world? We die and we live, nothing but the time can destroy us. But of that they have no knowledge, they merely conjecture.<sup>335</sup>] The Prophet said: [Do not grieve the time when you are suffering from misfortunes, do not relate

---

*Sūrah al-Ṭūr*, 52: 30.

*Sūrah al-Jāthiyah*, 45: 24.



them to it for Almighty Allāh is the One Who inflicted them on you and not the time. If you insult the doer it is Almighty Allāh, Whom you have (insulted).] Don't you realize that when one of them has been struck by calamity or misfortune related to wealth or children or he himself and later he insulted the doer because of that misfortune, then he is insulting Almighty Allāh, Who planned the time."

250a. "I will give an example related to this word so that it will be more accessible to you of its interpretation and if it is (clear) – Praise be to Almighty Allāh. Suppose a man by the name of Zayd, ordered a slave, named as Fath to murder somebody. He then murdered the person and people insulted and cursed Fath. Somebody said to them: [Do not insult Fath but Fath is Zayd!] which means that Zayd is the murderer since he is the one who ordered (the killing). It is as if that the person is saying: [The murderer is Zayd and not Fath]. Likewise, the decreed time or destiny of misfortune and calamity is by the will power of Almighty Allah. A man who insults the decreed time or destiny of misfortune and calamity (is incorrect) since the time or destiny is not the doer. So, (there goes the saying:) [Do not insult the time for Allāh is the time!]"

#### **LXIV. EXAMPLE OF ANTHROPOMORPHIC *HADĪTH***

251. They said: "You have narrated from Abū Dharr and Abū Hurayrah that according to the Prophet SAAS: [Whoever comes close to Me by a span of the hand, I will come closer to him by the forearm length. Whoever comes to Me by the forearm length, I will come closer to him by the span of the outstretched arms. Whoever comes to me walking, I will come to him running.]"

2. Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that this (expression) is an allegory or a figurative language. It is intended to mean that whoever says Me immediately; I will reward him more swiftly than his next move. This analogy can be alluded to the act of walking and brisk walking. This is also true, when somebody says that so and so is in a state of ignorance. The term الإيضاع means rapid movement but he does not mean to say that (the person) is walking or moving briskly in the real sense rather (he meant it as) rushed into ignorance figuratively). The term وضع therefore, is alluded to إسرَاع (swift, speed). Another example is in His saying: [But those who strive against Our Signs to frustrate them...<sup>336</sup>], the term السعي (the strive) is synonymous to الإسرَاع في المشي (brisk or fast walking) and this does not mean they are continuously walking but that they are active in their intention and action. Allāh Knows best!"

## V. EXAMPLE OF HADĪTH INVALIDATED BY CONSENSUS AND THE BOOK

1. They said that you have narrated that Ibn Umm Maktūm sought permission (to meet) the Prophet when he was with his two wives and that the Prophet requested them to put on their ḥijāb (veil). They replied: [O Prophet of Allāh, indeed he is blind!] He replied: [Are any of you blind?<sup>337</sup>] Unanimously people agree that it is lawful for a covered woman to look at man. Indeed, during the Prophet's time they used to go to the mosque and performed their prayers with men. And you also said that in interpreting the saying of Almighty Allāh: [...they should not display their beauty and

---

*Sūrah al-Ḥajj*, 22: 51.

*ʿAḥdāt al-Aḥwadhī*, 10: 170 (No. 2778); *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 4: 63 (No. 4112); *Al-Mawārid*, 2: 876 (No. 1968); *Kanz al-ʿUmmāl*, 5: 328 (No. 13066).

ornaments except what (must ordinarily) appear thereof....<sup>338</sup>] it means *al-kuhl* (antimony used for darkening the edge of the eyelids) and the ring.”

254. Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that Almighty Allāh has commanded the wives of the Prophet to put on their *ḥijāb*<sup>339</sup> and He imposed us not to talk to them except with their *ḥijāb*. (Allāh) said: [And when you ask (his ladies) for anything you want, ask them before a screen<sup>340</sup>] Hence, whether he is a blind man or a normal one who comes in (to visit them, and without a screen (to separate) between the man and the woman, (this means) both of them are disobeying (the order of) Almighty Allāh and also the Prophet since he allowed the man to visit the woman.”

“This privilege is granted to the wives of the Prophet and they are forbidden to marry other Muslim man. If they went out of their house such as to perform *ḥajj* or any other ritual obligation or needs that compelled them to leave their house, the obligation to put on their *ḥijāb* is abated for nobody would come to see them. However, they are obliged to put on their *ḥijāb* if they were to travel (and expose themselves to others), as well as (when) they stopped (to rest) at (somebody's) house.”

<sup>338</sup> *Sūrah al-Nūr*, 24: 31.

<sup>339</sup> *Ḥijāb* means cover, screen, conceal, veil etc. *Ḥijāb* is also known as *chador* or *bulkha*. In countries like, Saudi Arabia, Pakistan, Iran etc, this practice of covering, concealing of the whole body of ladies is still on going. However, in Malaysian context, *ḥijāb* is understood as *tudung* or headgear. Women in Malaysia, put on their *tudung* with their long dress, whereby their face, hands and feet are still visible.

<sup>340</sup> *Sūrah al-Aḥzāb*, 33: 53.

## VI. EXAMPLE OF TWO CONTRADICTORY ḤADĪTH

They said: "You have narrated that the Prophet has authorized tax as insurance."<sup>341</sup> This means that a person had bought a slave and employed him for a certain period. Then he noticed that the slave had shown (a bad habit), then he sent the slave back due to bad habit. However, he gained (some) profit from this, (known as) the land tax for he is responsible for the slave, even if the slave died or lost his wealth out of this death. You also narrated that the Prophet said: [Whoever buys (a piece of) land should keep the option for three days. If he wishes he can return it and need not give in one *ṣā'* (a cubic measure of varying magnitude) of food.<sup>342</sup>] You said that this statement contradicts the first verdict for the milk taken from a farm and that the buyer is responsible for the land, even if the sheep died there and he suffered loss out of that death. This event is identical to the land tax as the insurance and as such there is no difference between them."

Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that between the two cases there is a clear divergence. The grazing land for sheep or the land to assemble sheep is the same thing. The sheep accumulate their milk in their udder and (the farmer) does not milk the sheep daily except when the udder grows big. (The farmer) will then milk the sheep. If anybody buys the land (and the sheep), then he milks the sheep in one or two milking. When the milk ceases (from the udder of the sheep) the buyer notices that the land is meant for assembling the sheep, he returns the land back with a certain measure (*ṣā'*) of food

---

*Al-Musnad*, 10: 25 (No. 25803).

*Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, 7 (No. 25); *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 3: 270 (No. 3444); *Al-Musnad*, 3: 105 (No. 7702), 3: 333 (9016); *Mishkāt al-Maṣābiḥ*, 2: 94 (No. 2847); *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 4: 53 (No. 9462).



for the milk he had gathered from the udder of the sheep, which is the property of the seller and not the buyer. He, therefore, needs to return anything (if he decides to return the slave back.)”

## LXVII. EXAMPLE OF TWO CONTRADICTORY *HADĪTH*

257. They said: You have narrated that ‘Amr ibn al-Sharīd heard from Abū Rafī’, who heard the Prophet said: [The neighbour has the right to the adjoining (properties).<sup>343</sup>] Another narration from Qatādah who narrated from al-Ḥasan and the latter from Samura that the Prophet has said: [The neighbour has the right on the house of (his) neighbour or the land.<sup>344</sup>] You also narrated from al-Zuhri who narrated from Abū Salamah ibn ‘Abd al-Raḥmān who narrated from al-Jābir that the Prophet has the right to intercede on all undivided properties.<sup>345</sup> If there exists a boundary, and the passageway is accessible, there is no need for intercession. They said that this (statement) contradicts the first one.”

258. Abū Muḥammad said that: “We affirm that there is nothing to prove that Jābir has heard from the Prophet, as mentioned in the second *ḥadīth*. Don’t you realize that (Jābir) has said that the Prophet has the right to intercede on all undivided properties? That may be his verdict, his perception or even the words that he has heard from others who narrated from (the Prophet.)”

<sup>343</sup> *‘Umdat al-Qārī*, 16: 256 (No. 6977), 16: 258 (No. 6978), 16: 260 (No. 6980), 16: 261 (No. 6981); *Al-Tamhīd*, 3: 275; *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, 7: 7 (No. 1770), 7: 9 (No. 17715); *Al-Al-Mu’jam al-Kabīr*, 1: 327 (No. 976), 1: 328 (No. 977), 1: 328 (No. 978); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 2: 833 (No. 2495), 2: 834 (No. 2496).

<sup>344</sup> *Sunan al-Dāraqutnī*, 4: 223 (No. 70, 71, 72), 4: 324 (No. 74, 77); *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, 7: 6 (No. 17697).

<sup>345</sup> *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 3: 286 (No. 3517); *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, 7: 6 (No. 17698); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 2: 834 (No. 2497), 2: 835 (No. 2499).

the first two *ḥadīth* are inter-related for they have the same (basis) interpretation. The first relates to: [The neighbour has the right to adjoining land of his neighbour's house. The term *ṣaqab* means proximity due to the adjoin property. The poet said:

[A Kūfī lady and her faraway land.

Whose house is neither facing nor adjoining.]

When the poet said: [whose house is neither facing], he meant it as near (to anything) and [nor adjoining], he meant it as lack of proximity."

As for the second *ḥadīth*, it relates to the right of the Prophet to intercede on all undivided properties. If there exists a boundary and passageway is accessible, there is no need for intercession. Suppose there are ten families and their houses are adjoined to each other. If one of them sells one part of the houses, all of them have right to intercede on it and each of them has the right of one-ninth (of the sale). However, if the houses are divided (or allotted to its owner), and one of the owners sells it, the others have no right to intercede except the immediate neighbour who will have some benefits. The *ḥadīth* aims to show that when allotment (of properties) have been done, the rule of joint tenancy ceased to exist."

## VIII. EXAMPLE OF *HADĪTH* INVALIDATED BY *NAZAR*

1). They said: "You have narrated that the Prophet SAAS said: [If a housefly falls into a container drown it for one of its wings contains the poison and the other its antidote. And it (usually) spurts

the poison first and later its antidote.] They said: [How could it be, one is poison and the other antidote? How can the housefly know that it is poison and it spurts it and later on spurts the antidote?]

260. Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that this *ḥadīth* is authentic and it has also been narrated in other wordings. Abū al-Khaṭṭāb has narrated this *ḥadīth* from Abū ‘Itāb who narrated from ‘Abd Allāh ibn al-Muthannā and the latter from Thumāmah: [A housefly fell into a container, and Anas caught and placed it in the water, saying: {In the name of Allāh}. He did that action three times and then he said that the Prophet asked them to do as such and then he said: {In one of its wings, there is the poison and the other is the antidote}].

260a. Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that people who construe religious matter based on senses only and deny that animals can speak, deny the bird can swim, deny some patches of land complaint to its sister, deny that a housefly knows the ducts for its poison and antidote, refute what has been established by the *ḥadīth* which they do not understand saying: [how could a mince (small pieces of thing) be equal to the other piece?], [how can Bayt al-Maqdis talks?], [how can Satan eat and drink using its left (hand)?], [where is its left side?], [how could Ādam meet Mūsā to the point that they are in dispute on predestination, even though many generations separate them?] And [where is the meeting place for that dispute?] Indeed, those skeptical about Islām will never misdrawing from the arson similar sentences related to controversies, foolish talk, and anecdotes but (at the same time) rejecting *ḥadīth* narrations and traditions and opposing what the Prophet has taught and resisting the best course taken by his companions and their followers.”

b. "And whoever misleads some portions of what have been taught by the Prophet is as if misleads the whole (teachings). Even if he wants to leave Islām and (intends to choose) another religion that (naturally) he does not believe or (to choose other) related religion, he will not be able to (choose) for the Jews, Christians, Magians, Zoroastrians and Manicheans believe in it and is mentioned in their scriptures."

Now not anybody who denies this except some people among *al-wirīyyah* and their followers are among the people of *kalām* and *al-miyyah*"

c. "In short, all this does not prove that the housefly contains poison and antidote even if we put aside the religious aspect and refer to philosophy. Where do we see the difference between the housefly and the snake? Indeed, the medical practitioner said that the flesh (of a snake) constitutes the antidote against its poison. If one (extracts it from) it, it becomes a great therapy and efficient against the bite of a scorpion, the bite of a dog affected with rabies, fever, facial semi-paralysis, trembling and epilepsy."

Similarly, (the medical practitioners) also said the same thing about scorpion: [if one were to dissect the stomach of a scorpion and take some bits out of it and) rub it onto the bitten part, the wound would heal. If one were to burn it to ashes and (put some water in it) and drink (the brew), it would have a soothing effect for a person (who suffered from) gallstone. It is also effective for semi-paralyzed people. We can also marinate it with fat for a moment and this (mixture) would help to reduce the swelling ulcer. The ancient medical practitioner also claimed that if a housefly is thrown into honey and crushes it to be (a mixture), it is useful to increase the



sharpness of the eyesight as well to strengthen the roots of the eyebrow.”

“It has been related by the scholar of logic (Aristotle) that there were people who used to eat houseflies and they never suffered from ayesore. They said: [when the crushed housefly is pasted on the place stung by the scorpion, the wound will heal.] They also said: [Whoever is bitten by a dog, he must cover his face, to prevent from the reach of the housefly or the person will die of it.] All this proves that the housefly is of a healing and venomous nature.<sup>346</sup>”

260d. “Abū Muḥammad said: “Why should we deny that animals and insects do have some intellectual acumen? Leaving aside religious angle and looking from the philosophical perspective and with what the eyes can perceive, we see ants gathering grains during summer prepare for winter. If they feel the grains rotting they will bring them out to the surface of the ground and spread them in (the light of) the full moon. If the grains (are about to) germinate, the ants will make a hole in the middle of the grains to prevent them from sprouting.”

Ibn ‘Uyaynah said: “It is only man, ants and mice that stock (in) provisions). The crow takes no interest in the palm tree loaded with fruits. But when all of its branches are cut off, the crows will peck the palm pith that is the part which has been cut off.” The philosopher said: “When a camel is bitten by a snake it eats crab.” Ibn Māsawayh said: “This is why we think that the crabs are effective against snake bite.”

<sup>346</sup> Lecomte in his translation – *Le Traite*, page 256, line 14 from top of the page said: [All this proves that housefly is of a pernicious healer and of venomous nature.

y also said: "When a tortoise has eaten a viper it eats wild thyme. When a weasel has fought with a snake it eats rue (a kind of rue). When a dog is affected with worms, it eats wheat."

e. Abū Muḥammad said: "I observed that even the philosopher observed that animals have some intelligence and therapeutic acumen. I am amazed in the knowledge of the poison and antidote of the scorpion found in its wings. And why are they not amazed by the fact that magnetic stone attracts iron from far and makes it move either from left to right? How can they believe in the word of Aristotle related to the sinfil stone, saying: [When it is tied to the navel of a hydropic patient, it absorbs the water]? What proof is there that the weight of the stone has increased after it has been tied to the stomach of the patient? This (report) was informed to me by Ḥunayn or Ḥunayn, a medical practitioner. He told me that the stone mentioned in al-Tawrāt and other revealed books of Almighty Allah."

How can they believe in the word of Aristotle that a stone swims in the sea as if it is a fish? A stone, if it abides in the loin of a woman, prevents her from conceiving; a stone, if it is placed by the side of an oven, the whole furnace will fall; a stone, if it is pinched with the hand by a person, it will make the person vomit everything in his stomach; a stone, if it is placed on a sword and the sword is flashed, ending to cut, in front of an acacia tree, found in Egypt, the tree wilt."

f. One of my masters has narrated to me that he has narrated it from 'Alī ibn 'Āṣim who also narrated it from Khālīd al-Ḥadhadhā' the latter from Muḥammad ibn Sīrīn saying: "Two men were sitting in front of Shurayḥ. One of them (A) said: [I entrusted a

sharpness of the eyesight as well to strengthen the roots of the eyebrow.”

“It has been related by the scholar of logic (Aristotle) that there were people who used to eat houseflies and they never suffered from ayesore. They said: [when the crushed housefly is pasted on the part stung by the scorpion, the wound will heal.] They also said: [Whoever is bitten by a dog, he must cover his face, to prevent from the reach of the housefly or the person will die of it.] All this proves that the housefly is of a healing and venomous nature.<sup>346</sup>”

260d. “Abū Muḥammad said: “Why should we deny that animals and insects do have some intellectual acumen? Leaving aside religious angle and looking from the philosophical perspective and with what the eyes can perceive, we see ants gathering grains during summer to prepare for winter. If they feel the grains rotting they will bring them out to the surface of the ground and spread them in (the light of) the full moon. If the grains (are about to) germinate, the ants will make a hole in the middle of the grains to prevent them from sprouting.”

Ibn ‘Uyaynah said: “It is only man, ants and mice that stock (up provisions). The crow takes no interest in the palm tree loaded with fruits. But when all of its branches are cut off, the crows will peck at the palm pith that is the part which has been cut off.” The philosopher said: “When a camel is bitten by a snake it eats crabs.” Ibn Māsawayh said: “This is why we think that the crabs are effective against snake bite.”

<sup>346</sup>

Lecomte in his translation – *Le Traite*, page 256, line 14 from top of the page said: [All this proves that housefly is of a pernicious healer and of venomous in nature.

y also said: "When a tortoise has eaten a viper it eats wild thyme. when a weasel has fought with a snake it eats rue (a kind of ts). When a dog is affected with worms, it eats wheat."

3. Abū Muḥammad said: "I observed that even the philosopher eved that animals have some intelligence and therapeutic acumen I am amazed in the knowledge of the poison and antidote of the sefly found in its wings. And why are they not amazed by the that magnetic stone attracts iron from far and makes it move ther from left to right? How can they believe in the word of otile related to the sinḥil stone, saying: [When it is tied to the ach of a hydropic patient, it absorbs the water]? What proof is e that the weight of the stone has increased after it has been tied e stomach of the patient? This (report) was informed to me by ūb or Ḥunayn, a medical practitioner. He told me that the stone mentioned in al-Tawrāt and other revealed books of Almighty ih."

ow can they believe in the word of Aristotle that a stone swims in egar as if it is a fish? A stone, if it abides in the loin of a woman, vents her from conceiving; a stone, if it is placed by the side of an n, the whole furnace will fall; a stone, if it is pinched with the d by a person, it will make the person vomit everything in his nach; a stone, if it is placed on a sword and the sword is flashed, ending to cut, in front of an acacia tree, found in Egypt, the tree [wilt."

f. One of my masters has narrated to me that he has narrated it n 'Alī ibn 'Āṣim who also narrated it from Khālīd al-Ḥadhdhā' the latter from Muḥammad ibn Sīrīn saying: "Two man were uing in front of Shurayḥ. One of them (A) said: [I entrusted a



deposit to a man, but now he refused to return it to me]. Shurayḥ said to the other man (B): [Return the deposit to the (owner)!] An (B) said: [O! Abū Umayyah! It is a stone, if a conceiving woman sees it, she will lose her baby. If it falls into vinegar, it will boil and if it is placed in the oven, it cools off.] Shurayḥ was silenced by this (information) and both (A and B) left.”

“All this, May Allah bless you!, is not conceivable by the mind; these are unknown and unacceptable by analogy. If we were to enumerate all the wondrous things ever created, it will be too many and too long (for us).”

#### LXIX. EXAMPLE OF ḤADĪTH APPLIED BY THE RĀFIḌITES TO ACCUSE THE COMPANIONS OF MUḤAMMAD SAAS AS INFIDELS

261. They said: “You have narrated that the Prophet said: [In truth people will come with me to the pool, then they will go away from me and I said: {O! Lord! My companions! (أصحابي) My companions (أصحابي)} He replied: {Indeed, you do not know what they have invented after you? They will continue to denounce (Islam) after they leave you.}] They said: This is the evidence applied by the Rāfiḍite to accuse the companions of the Prophet of infidelity except ‘Alī Abū Dharr, al-Miqdād, Sulaymān, ‘Ammār ibn Yāsir and Hudhayfah.”

262. Abū Muḥammad said: We affirm that if they examine the ḥadīth and understand the wordings, they will find that he only referred to this (expression) to a small number of people. This is proven as (found) in his saying: [Some people will meet at the water basin], if he meant it to be for all, he would have said: [You will meet

at the water basin and then you will depart from me.] Don't you  
 that if a person says: [One day some people among Banī Tamīm  
 Kūfah came to see me!], he meant to say some people among  
 anī Tamīm of Kūfah)? If he meant to say that all of them came to  
 him, except for one, he will say: [The Banī Tamīm came to see  
 me!] Or [People Kūfah came to see me!]. He will not use the term  
*awm* for this term means some people who came (to me)."

he other proof is as in his saying: [O Lord! My companions!  
 (أصحابي)] in diminutive form, which means that he is referring to a  
 small group of people. Likewise, you will say: [I passed by various  
 types of houses] or [I passed by an assembly (of people).]"

We know that (the companions of the Prophet) witnessed the events  
 with the Prophet, participated with him in battles and were aware of  
 the presence of hypocrites who sought the riches, the nominal  
 believers), the opportunists and the skeptical ones. Indeed, some of  
 them have become apostates and they were 'Uyaynah ibn Ḥiṣn who  
 accepted and believed in Ṭulayḥah ibn Khuwaylid. Ṭulayḥah was  
 defeated in battle and was captured by Khālīd ibn al-Walīd who sent  
 him former in shackle to Abū Bakr. Then (Ṭulayḥah) was sent to  
 Madīnah and the children spiked him with sharpened palm branches,  
 beat and said to him: [Which one? O Enemy of Allāh! An infidel or  
 your acceptance of faith?] And (Ṭulayḥah) said: [By Allāh! I swear I  
 am not an unbeliever!]. When he spoke with Abū Bakr he reaccepted  
 Islam and (the latter) accepted his confession and wrote it down as a  
 safeguard, but later he remained a nominal believer until the end of  
 his life. He was also the person who attacked the camel of the  
 Prophet at Ghāba. Al-Ḥarīth ibn 'Aūf said to him: [You are  
 grateful to Muḥammad! You fattened your flocks on his land, and

then you attacked him!] He replied: [This is what you see!]. On this event the Prophet said: [This is foolhardy obedience!]"

262b. "During the rebellion of the Arabs, 'Uyaynah ibn Ḥiṣn and his followers became apostates. Some reconverted to Islām and became good Muslims. But some were obstinate in their hypocrisy. And Almighty Allāh said: [Certain desert Arabs around you are hypocrites, as well as the desert Arabs among the Madīnites folks, they are obstinate in hypocrisy, you know them not but We know them<sup>347</sup>], those were the people who would depart from (the Prophet)."<sup>348</sup>

"The other companions (of the Prophet) with the exceptions of six people, whom we have mentioned earlier, how could they be drawn elsewhere? Indeed, Almighty Allāh said about them: [Muḥammad is the Apostle of Allāh and those who are with him are strong against the unbelievers but compassionate of each other<sup>349</sup>] until the end of the *sūrah*. And Almighty Allāh also said: [God good's pleasure was on the believers when they swore fealty to you under the tree.<sup>350</sup>]"

262c. Abu Muḥammad said: "Zayd ibn Akhzam al-Ṭā'ī had narrated from Abū Dāwūd who narrated from Qurrah ibn Khālīd who then narrated from Qatādah who asked Sa'īd ibn Musayyab: [How many men participated in the Bay'at al-Riḍwān?] He said: [1500 people] (Qatādah) replied: [But Jābir ibn 'Abd Allāh said that they were 1400 people.] The other person declared that (Jābir's information) was incorrect – May Allāh has mercy on him, and then he said: [He was the one who told me that they were 1500 people.]"

<sup>347</sup> *Sūrah al-Tawbah*, 9: 101.

<sup>348</sup> As noted in the *ḥadīth*, see no. 261.

<sup>349</sup> *Sūrah al-Fath*, 48: 29.

<sup>350</sup> *Sūrah al-Fath*, 48: 18.

w could Almighty Allāh be pleased with certain people that He sed them and mentioned them as exemplars in al-Tawrāt and al- while knowing that they were apostates after the era of the shet? (To answer this) they said: He does not know! But this wer) is the worst kind of unfaithfulness!”

## K. EXAMPLE OF ḤADĪTH ON PREDESTINATION

They said: “You have narrated that Mūsā was a Qadarite and he was arguing with Ādam and (the former managed to spite m) and that Abū Bakr was a Qadarite and he was arguing with iar and managed to spite ‘Umar.”

Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that this narration is sheer mny and a lie. We are not aware that this ḥadīth ever existed and neither Mūsā nor Abū Bakr was a Qadarite.”

al-Khaṭṭāb said that he narrated from Bishr ibn al-Mufaḍḍal who ated from Dāwūd ibn Abū Hind who narrated from ‘Āmir and the r from Abū Hurayrah that the Prophet said: “Mūsā met Ādam said: [Are you Ādam, father of humankind, a misfortune for ple that you were pulled out from paradise?] (Ādam) : [Yes!] (Ādam) said: [Are you Mūsā whom Allāh elected among to transmit to them His Message and His words?] (Mūsā) said: leed I am!] (Ādam) said: [Don’t you see in the revelation given to that He will bring me out of paradise even before bringing me (Mūsā) said: [Indeed I am!] (The Prophet) said: [Then Ādam smitten Mūsā.<sup>351</sup>]

---

*Al-Musnad*, 3: 346 (No. 9106), 3: 492 (No. 9996, 9997); *Al-Al-Maṭālib al-‘Āliyah*, 3: 85 (No. 2949); *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, 1: 129 – 130 (No. 611).



264a. Abū Muḥammad said: "There is nothing in those words that indicate Mūsā was a Qadarite. We know well that everything takes place due to predestination and decreed by Allāh. However, this does not prevent us from attributing acts to the doer, to praise anyone who does good deed, to condemn anyone who does evil and to be hostile to the sinner due to his sinful acts. As for their saying: [Abū Bakr was a Qadarite], it is also an act of distortion of meaning and forgery to the *ḥadīth*. And the dispute (between Abū Bakr and 'Umar) on predestination is because they do not know about it. When they learned the truth about it, they agreed upon the same doctrine. Likewise, in many religious issues, which they know not such as *al-tawḥīd* (oneness of God) until the Prophet had taught them, and (al-Qur'ān) was revealed and the Sunnah was established. Both of them know it after (these events)."

"And the *ḥadīth* said to be narrated by Abū Bakr and 'Umar, according to the people of *ḥadīth*, is indeed *ḍa'īf* (weak),<sup>352</sup> for it was narrated by Ismā'īl ibn 'Abd al-Salām who narrated from Zayd ibn 'Abd al-Raḥmān, who narrated from 'Amr ibn Shu'ayb, who then narrated from his father and the latter from his father. And (it was also) narrated by a person from Khurasān who then narrated it from Muqātil ibn Ḥayyān and the latter from 'Amr ibn Shu'ayb – most of the narrators were unknown (to the *muḥaddithūn*)."

<sup>352</sup> The *ḥadīth* is weak in terms of its chain of narrators – either only a person who narrated it or many unknown narrators found in its chain.

## XI. EXAMPLE OF ḤADĪTH INVALIDATED BY NAẒAR

. They said: "You narrated that the Prophet said: [Modesty (*vā'*) is part of faith (*īmān*).<sup>353</sup>]" They said: [*īmān* is acquired but *vā'* is one's innate character. How can innate character be uired?]

. Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that a modest person keeps away from committing sinful acts just like his faith will prevent him from so doing. Thus it is as if modesty is part of faith. The Arabs used to apply metonymy (to verify) a word which has various but related meanings to cause and effect. Don't you see that they called *ruku'* (bowing) and *sujūd* (prostration) as (positions) found in *ṣalāh* (prayer) and that *ṣalāh* is originally a form of *du'ā* (invocation)? They also called *du'ā* as *ṣalāh*, as found in the saying of Almighty Allāh: [And pray on their behalf<sup>354</sup>] which means pray for them. And in another saying, Almighty Allāh said: [if you call not Him<sup>355</sup>] meaning, without your prayer. Ibn 'Umar said: [When

the Prophet was invited to a marriage ceremony and if he was fasting his fast he would eat, and if he were fasting he would perform his prayer], which means an invocation. Thus the basis for *ṣalāh* is invocation and Almighty Allāh said: [And pray on their behalf. Verily your prayers are a source of security for them<sup>356</sup>], which means doing an invocation in their favour. And Almighty Allāh said: [God and His Angels send blessings on the Prophet. O you who believe! Send your blessings on him and salute him with all

---

*Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, 12 (57,58); *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 4: 219 (No. 4676); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 1: 22 (No. 57); *Al-Musnad*, 3: 447 (No. 9716); *Al-Tamhīd*, 4: 204, 8: 474, 9: 8; *ʿAridat al-Aḥwadhī*, 10: 63 (No. 2615).

*Sūrah al-Tawbah*, 9: 103.

*Sūrah al-Ghurafān*, 25: 77.

*Sūrah al-Tawbah*, 9: 103.

respect<sup>357</sup>], which means invoke to God in his favour – a lot of explanation about this have been said.”

266b. “When *du‘ā*’ is considered as part of *ṣalāh*, it is called *du‘ā*. Likewise, the *zakāt* is an act of purification as well as the growth of wealth. And if this growth (in terms of its size) connected to the act of *ṣadaqah* (charity), it will be known as *zakāt* – there are numerous examples on this fact.”

“Abū al-Khaṭṭāb has narrated from al-Mu‘tamir ibn Sulaymān who heard from al-Layth ibn Abū Wāṣil ibn Ḥayyān who narrated from Abū Wā’il and the latter from Ibn Mas‘ūd who said that the last word that has been preserved for the term prophecy was: [If you have no modesty, do what you want<sup>358</sup>] which means that whoever possesses no modesty is perverse and will commit any kinds of scandal and guilty of any kinds of sin for there is nothing to stop him, neither religion nor modesty. Don’t you see that modesty and faith have the same influence as if they are one and the same thing?”

## LXXII. EXAMPLES OF CONTRADICTORY *AḤĀDĪTH* THAT ARE RELATED TO PRAYER

267. They said: “You have narrated from Shu‘bah who also narrated from YA‘lā ibn ‘Aṭā’ and who narrated from Jābir ibn Yazīd ibn al-Aswad and the latter from his father informing that he was performing his prayer with the Prophet and then two men who did not perform their prayer but were merely standing nearby the mosque anxiously came in. The Prophet said to them: [What prevented both of you from performing the prayer with us?] They responded: [We

<sup>357</sup> *Sūrah al-Aḥzāb*, 33: 56.

<sup>358</sup> *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, 3: 122 (No. 5780).



l our prayer on our journey (here)!] The Prophet said: [Both of you ed not perform (the prayer). However, while on the journey, if one you have performed the prayer and later meets an *imām* who has t to perform his prayer and you join with him in the prayer, it is nsidered as a supererogatory (*nāfilah*) prayer for you.<sup>359]</sup>

ou narrated from Ma'n ibn 'Īsā who narrated from Sa'īd ibn al-'ib al-Ṭā'ifī who then narrated from Nūḥ ibn Ṣa'sa'ah and the ter from Yazīd ibn 'Āmir saying that when he arrived (at a osque), he saw the Prophet SAAS and others were performing their ayer and I sat down without joining his group. Then the Prophet med and said: [Don't you give your *salām* O Yazīd?] I said: ideed O Prophet!] He said: [What prevented you from joining us perform your prayer?] I said: [Indeed, I have performed the prayer my house and I thought you have finished yours.] Then (the ophet SAAS) said: [If you come during prayer time and you saw a oup of people praying, you should join them, even if you have rformed yours and it will be counted as supererogatory prayer for ou and for (others) as the prescribed prayer.<sup>360]</sup>

ou also narrated from Yazīd ibn Zuray', who narrated from usayn who narrated from 'Amr ibn Shu'ayb and the latter from alaymān, the patron (*mawlā*) of Maymūnah saying: [I was passing / Ibn 'Umar who was standing on the pavement while others were aying and I asked him: {Are you not praying with others?} He id: {Indeed I have prayed and didn't you hear the Prophet said that e should not perform a prayer twice on the same day?} They said:

<sup>359</sup> *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 1: 157 (No. 575); *'Aḥidat al-Aḥwadhī*, 2: 18 (No. 219); *Al-Musnad*, 6: 154 (No. 17482); *Al-Mustadrak*, 1: 244-245; *Al-Mawāriḍ*, 1: 198 (No. 434); *Al-Muṣannaf*, 2: 421 (No. 3934); *Sunan al-Dāraqūnī*, 1: 413, (No. 1), 1: 414, (No. 2,5); *Musnad al-Ṭayālīsī*, 175 (No. 1247).

<sup>360</sup> *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 1: 157 (No. 57); *Mishkāt al-Maṣābiḥ* 1: 364 (No. 1155).



[These are contradiction and divergences. Each of the *ḥadīth* refers to its own issue and not to others.”

268. Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that all of the *aḥādīth* hardly contradict or diverge from each other. As for the first *ḥadīth* which says [While on journey, if one of you have performed the prayer and later meets an *imām* who has yet to perform his prayer and you join him in the prayer, it is considered as supererogatory (*nāfilah*) prayer for you]. Here it means that the prayer done with the *imām* will be considered as supererogatory prayer and it would be better (if you perform with the *imām*) the prescribed (*al-faḍīlah*) prayer. This is because the intention of performing a prayer is accomplished if it is completely performed. Thus, the intention is related to its action.”

268a. “As for the second *ḥadīth* which says: [If you come during prayer time and you see a group of people praying, you should join them, even if you have performed yours and it will be counted as a supererogatory prayer for you and for (the other one) as the prescribed prayer]; it is as if the Prophet intended to say: [The prayer which you have accomplished with the *imām* is considered a supererogatory prayer and the other prayer which you performed at home is considered as the prescribed prayer]. If word هذه (this) or ك (that) was written (in the *ḥadīth*), the meaning will be clearer and thus there will be a distinction between the two (kinds of prayer). It is probable that one of the narrators has omitted (the demonstrative term) هذه in the first sentence (of the *ḥadīth*) and omitted (the demonstrative term) تلك in the second part of the sentence. Indeed, we have mentioned to you the example where the narrators negligently have omitted the word, though this is simplistic, it (impacted a great deal by) changing the meaning.”

. “As for the third *ḥadīth* which was narrated by Ibn ‘Umar<sup>361</sup> the Prophet SAAS said: [One should not perform a prayer twice the same day],<sup>362</sup> (it is as if the Prophet SAAS is saying that) you performed your *Zuhr* prayer at your house once and then performed it in the mosque or performed the prayer with one *imām* and then performed it with another *imām*.

such there is an incorrect application of the circumstances mentioned) in the said *ḥadīth* whereby the Prophet SAAS had urged the man to repeat the prayer, but it is to be considered as supererogatory prayer. It is likely that (Ibn ‘Umar) does not hear this *ḥadīth* or probably it did not reach (to his knowledge). If a man performs his obligatory prayer at home and repeats it with an *imām*, (in the mosque) that prayer is considered as supererogatory prayer. It does not mean that the man has performed the same prayer for twice the same day. This is because they are essentially different, one is the obligatory prayer and the other the supererogatory prayer.”

### III. EXAMPLE OF CONTRADICTORY AḤĀDĪTH THAT ARE RELATED TO ABLUTION

They said: “You have narrated from Sufyān who then narrated from al-Zuhri, who narrated from Abū Salamah and the latter from al-Bukhari who said that the Prophet was in the state of *junub* (major

---

The *ḥadīth* was narrated by Sulaymān and not Ibn ‘Umar as mentioned by Ibn Qutaybah.

*Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 1: 158 (No. 579); *Al-Musnad*, 2: 239 (No. 4689); *Sunan al-Dāraqutnī*, 1: 415 (No. 3); *Al-Tamḥīd*, 2: 382 and 384; *Mishkāt al-Maṣābiḥ*, 1: 364 (No. 1157).

ritual impurity) and intended to sleep, but instead he took his *wu* (ablution) which was similar to the one meant for *ṣalāh*.<sup>363</sup>

They said: "You also narrated from Shu'bah who then narrated from al-Ḥakam who narrated from Ibrāhīm and who narrated from Aswad and the latter from 'Ā'ishah saying that when the Prophet SAAS intended to eat or sleep, though he was in the state of *junub* he would take his *wuḍū'*."<sup>364</sup>

They also said: "You have narrated from Sufyān who narrated from Abū Ishāq who narrated from al-Aswad and the latter from 'Ā'ishah who says: [The Prophet was sleeping though he was in the state *junub* and did not come in contact with water.<sup>365</sup>]

270. Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that all of those behaviors are lawful. (It is allowable) for anyone before his sleep upon having sexual relationship, to have his *wuḍū'* for *ṣalāh*. Or he may wash hands and penis before his sleep. Or he may sleep without coming in contact with water, however, it is preferable for him to have *wuḍū'*. The Prophet had practiced this (act of having *wuḍū'*) several times to indicate that this action is preferable. And on other occasions, (he has chosen) another way so as to show that there exists a concession (for not taking *wuḍū'* after *junub*). People can follow either or the other method. That is, one is free to adopt the best method and one is also free to enjoy the concession."

<sup>363</sup> *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, 6 (No. 21); *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 1: 57 (No. 222, 223); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 1: 193 (No. 584); *Majma' al-Zawā'id*, 1: 382 (No. 1490); *Sunan al-Dāraqutnī*, 1: 126, (No. 2, 3); *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 7: 114 (No. 18218239), 9: 564 (No. 27438, 27441).

<sup>364</sup> *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 1: 575 (No. 224); *Sunan al-Nasā'i*, 1: 166 (No. 255), 167 (No. 256, 258).

<sup>365</sup> *Al-Muṣannaf*, 1: 281 (No. 1084).



#### IXIV. EXAMPLE OF CONTRADICTIONARY ḤADĪTH

1. They said: “You have narrated from Sufyān who narrated from Zuhri who narrated from Sa‘īd ibn al-Musayyab and the latter from Abū Hurayrah that a Bedouin has urinated in the mosque and the Prophet said: [Let someone pour on it a pail (سجل) of water] or he reported (using the term): [(Let someone clear) the misdeed (ذنو) with water]”

They said: “You also reported from Jarīr ibn Ḥāzim who said that he heard from ‘Abd al-Malik ibn ‘Umayr who narrated from ‘Abd Allāh ibn Ma‘qil ibn Muqarrin that (the Prophet SAAS) said on that occasion: [Let’s throw away the soil on which he urinated and pour some water in the (dug area)<sup>366</sup>]. They said that this ḥadīth contradicts the earlier one.”

2. Abū Muḥammad said: We affirm that the contradiction is attributed to the narrators and the ḥadīth of Abū Hurayrah is more authentic for he was present there and was the witness. As for ‘Abd Allāh ibn Ma‘qil ibn Muqarrin, he was neither (one of) the companions and nor a contemporary of Prophet Muḥammad. We could not take his words as compared to eyewitness. Though his father Ma‘qil ibn Muqarrin or Abū ‘Amrah al-Muzanī had narrated from the Prophet SAAS (himself) but of his son, ‘Abd Allāh, we know nothing.”

---

*Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 1: 104 (No. 381); *Sunan al-Dāraquṭnī*, 1: 132, (No.4).



## LXXV. EXAMPLE OF CONTRADICTORY *HADĪTH* OF FASTING

273. They said: "You have narrated a *ḥadīth* in various narration that the Prophet when asked about fasting while traveling had said [Fast if you want, eat if you want!]<sup>367</sup> You also narrated from 'Alī Allāh ibn Mūsā who narrated from Usāmah ibn Zayd who narrate from Ibn Shihāb who narrated from Abū Salamah and the latter from his father saying that the Prophet SAAS had said: [Fasting in Ramaḍān while traveling is similar to daily eating.<sup>368</sup>"]

274. Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that the saying of the Prophet SAAS is meant for people who dislike the concession from Almighty Allāh and the comfort extended during traveling for the used to impose on themselves the hardship and misery. They understood that they were as guilty to fast during traveling as to eat in daily life. As such, in context of the *ḥadīth*, they were disobedient people for they refused to accept the concession and comfort granted by Almighty Allāh to them. Whoever rejects the comfort granted by Almighty Allāh is similar to the one who is indolence in doing His Prescriptions. That is the reason why the Prophet, in relation to person who continuously fasts, is (indeed) neither fasting nor eating.<sup>369</sup> He also said: [Whoever continuously fasts, the burning

<sup>367</sup> *Sahīh Muslim*, 17 (No.103); *Sunan al-Nasā'i*, 4: 189 (No. 2290-2293), 4: 19 (No. 2294-2298); *ʿAridat al-Aḥwadhī*, 3: 185 (No.711); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 1: 531 (No. 1662); *Al-Musnad*, 7: 299 (No. 24251), 9: 567 (No. 25664), 10: 1 (No. 25723); *Sunan al-Dārimī*, 2: 9; *Al-Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, 2: 154 (No. 2968-2972), 3: 152 (No. 2962), 3: 153 (No. 2964-2966); *Al-Muṣannaf*, 2: 571 (No. 4502, 4503); *Al-Tamhīd*, 4: 84, 9: 135, 136; *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 8: 504 (No. 23849), 8: 609 (No. 24376), 8: 612 (No. 24387).

<sup>368</sup> *Sunan Al-Nasā'i*, 4: 187 (No. 2281, 2282).

<sup>369</sup> *Sahīh Muslim*, 36 (No. 196, 197); *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 2: 321 (No. 2425), *ʿAridat al-Aḥwadhī*, 3: 234 (No. 767); *Sunan al-Nasā'i*, 4: 213 (No. 2375, 2377), 4: 213 (No. 2378-2379); *Al-Musnad*, 5: 497 (No. 16304), 5: 498 (No. 16308), 5: 500 (No. 16308); *Sunan al-Dārimī*, 2: 18; *Al-Mustadrak*, 1: 435

of hell will torment him.<sup>370</sup>] As for a traveler who fasts during winter time when the days are short or (fasting but resting at) a big place with assistance provided for, his fasting is an easy task for him. As the Prophet has given the choice to (this type of people) either continue fasting or to eat.”

## XVI. EXAMPLE OF CONTRADICTORY ḤADĪTH ON FASTING

5. They said: “You have reported in more than one narration that Prophet SAAS had kissed his wife while he was fasting.<sup>371</sup> You also narrated from Abū Nu‘aym who narrated from Isrā’īl, who narrated from Zayd ibn Jubayr, who narrated from Abū Yazīd al-abbī and the latter from Maymūnah bint Sa’d, the patron of the prophet saying that the Prophet was asked by a man who used to kiss his wife while he was fasting, and the Prophet said: [Indeed, he invalidated his fasting<sup>372</sup>]”

5. Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that kissing given by a fasting man will invalidate his fasting for it excites the desire and evokes ejaculation and similarly we agree with (the act of) adultery. As for the Prophet SAAS, he is infallible and his act of kissing of his wife while he was fasting is as if the kiss (that takes place) between father and son or between brothers. The saying of

---

*Al-Mawārid*, 2: 408 (No. 937); *Al-Al-Mu‘jam al-Kabīr*, 8: 116 (No. 227), 8: 113 (No. 216-218); *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, 8: 618 (No. 24414), 8: 624 (No. 24437), 8: 649 (No. 24565).

*Al-Musnad*, 7: 168 (No. 19733).

*Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, 12 (No. 65-73); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 1: 538 (No. 1684, 1685); *Al-Musnad*, 10: 153 (No. 26452), 10: 165 (No. 26508, 26510); *Kanz al-Ummāl*, 7: 85 (No. 18082), 8: 616 (No. 24403); *Sunan al-Dāraquṭnī*, 1: 135, (No. 7), 1: 136, (9, 10).

*Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 1: 538 (No. 1686); *Al-Musnad*, 10: 448 (No. 27696); *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 2: 311 (No. 2382).

‘Ā’ishah proves this: [Who among us can control our desire as the Prophet who can control his?<sup>373</sup>] Likewise, we affirm that (the act of sleeping of the Prophet, which requires him not to take his *wuḍū* based on his saying: [My eyes did sleep but not my heart.<sup>374</sup> Similarly, in another instance where so deep was his slumber that one could hear the Prophet SAAS snoring, and when he woke up he performed his prayer without taking his *wuḍū*]. The rules meant for the Prophet are different from the rules meant for his community.

## LXXVII. EXAMPLE OF ḤADĪTH INVALIDATED BY NAẒAR

277. They said: “You narrated that the Prophet SAAS has recommended that the goat is a gentle animal for it comes from paradise. They said: [How could it be from paradise, for it breeds here within us? If the goat is from paradise, then paradise also consists of the cow, camel, donkey and horse.<sup>375</sup>]”

278. Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that (the Prophet SAAS) does not mean that the goat of this world is from paradise. How could it be there for it is among us? Indeed, he intended to say that in paradise, there are goats. Allāh created it in this world with the same image. Similarly, with sheep, camel and horse, all of which exist in paradise with the exception of vicious animals like the monkey, pig, snake and scorpion. If it is possible to have meat in paradise, then it is also possible to have goat and sheep in it. And if it is possible for

<sup>373</sup> *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, 1 (No. 64, 65, 68); *Al-Musnad*, 9: 288 (No. 24185); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 1: 538 (No. 1684).

<sup>374</sup> *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, 17 (No. 125); *Sunan al-Nasā’ī*, 3: 233 (No. 1693); *‘Aṣṣaḥīḥ al-Aḥwadhī*, 2: 194 (No. 439); *Al-Musnad*, 9: 405 (No. 24786); *Al-Tamḥīd*, 2: 563, 564, 3: 177.

<sup>375</sup> *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, 12: 326 (No. 35235); *Majma’ al-Zawā’id*, 4: 76 (No. 6257); *Al-Al-Mu’jam al-Kabīr*, 11: 109 (No. 11201); *Kashf al-Khafā’*, 1: 132.

have birds meant for eating, then it is also possible to have cattle  
it for eating there. Almighty Allāh said: [With flesh of bird with  
h they desire<sup>376</sup>]

.. Abū Muḥammad said: “Aḥmad ibn Khalīl has narrated from al-  
a‘ī who narrated from al-Abū Hilāl al-Rāsibī who narrated from  
l Allāh ibn Buraydah and the latter from his father, Buraydah al-  
mī that the Prophet SAAS said: [The best food for man in this  
d and in the next world is meat and the best perfume for man in  
world and in the next world is *fāghiyah* (a type of scent known as  
a blossom).<sup>377</sup>] The following *ḥadīth* proved what I have said is  
[Wipe out the mucus from the nostril for it is one of the animals  
paradise<sup>378</sup>], here it means one of the animals created in  
tise.”

## VIII. EXAMPLE OF *HADĪTH* INVALIDATED BY AL- PĀN FROM TWO PERSPECTIVES

They said: “You have narrated that the Prophet SAAS had said:  
dead will be tormented by the weeping of the living ones.<sup>379</sup>  
(statement) is invalidated from two perspectives. One of them is  
d on the saying of Almighty Allāh: [No soul will bear the burden  
nother soul.<sup>380</sup>] And the other is also based on the saying of  
ighty Allāh: [Say Allāh gives you life then He makes you lifeless

---

*Sūrah al-Wāqī‘ah*, 56: 21.

*Majma‘ al-Zawā‘id*, 5: 29 (No. 7983); *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, 15: 281 (No. 41000), 15: 282 (No. 41007).

*Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, 7: 340 (No. 19178).

*Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, 9 (No. 16-19, 22-24); *Al-Muṣannaf*, 3: 554 (No. 6675), 3: 560-1 (No. 6692); *Al-Targhīb*, 4: 349; *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, 15: 610 (No. 42426), 15: 611 (No. 42428); *Al-Mu‘jam al-Kabīr*, 12: 272 (No. 13087, 13088), 12: 304 (No. 13186), 12: 330 (No. 13262), 12: 344 (No. 13299).

*Sūrah al-An‘ām*, 6: 164.



and then He gathers you for the Day of Resurrection.<sup>381</sup>] The Almighty Allāh will mention the conditions of the creature since [he] was in the state of clay until the day of his resurrection: [We did create man from a quintessence (of clay). Then We placed him as drop of) sperm in a place of rest firmly fixed. Then We made [the] sperm into a clot of congealed blood; then of that clot We made (fetus) lump; then We made out of that lump bones and clothed [the] bones with flesh; then We developed out of it another creature. Blessed be God, the best to create. After that, at length you will die. Again, on the Day of Judgment, you will be raised up.<sup>382</sup>] They say [Almighty Allāh does not mention that He will revive (man's life) between the (duration of his) death and his resurrection nor did He mention that the man will be tormented or rewarded when he is gathered (with others) or separated (from others)."]

280. Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that the Book of Almighty Allāh (was revealed in various forms such as) metaphor, abbreviation and indication. It also came (in the form of describing) the attributes of (things) in one topic but silence in another topic. This explains why (certain parts) are omitted in one place but appeared in another. And the *ḥadīth* of the Prophet will explain (the contents of) the Book of what (the latter) indicated and intended to say. As for the omitted part in the Book of Almighty Allāh, in His saying: [Among you who are sick or traveling, replace it on another days<sup>383</sup>], the apparent meaning of this passage is that whoever is sick or on a journey should substitute the equal number of days of his fasting (which he missed) on other days. What is intended (by this verse) is

<sup>381</sup> *Sūrah al-Jāthiyah*, 45: 26.

<sup>382</sup> *Sūrah al-Mu'minūn*, 23: 12-16.

<sup>383</sup> *Sūrah al-Baqarah*, 2: 185.

ryone among you who is sick or on a journey should not fast but he ould substitute his fasting (which he missed) on other days. The rm which has been omitted (in this verse) is فاطر (fast breaking).”

Likewise, in His saying: [And if any of you is ill or has an ailment his scalp, (necessitating shaving, he should) in compensation either st or feed the poor or sacrifice<sup>384</sup>], the apparent meaning of this ying is that the sick person or one whose head is infested with lice obliged to pay *fidyah*.<sup>385</sup> What is intended (by this verse) is that hoever among you is sick or suffers from ailment affecting his head id had to shave his hair, is obliged to pay *fidyah* such as fasting or ving charity or ritual sacrifice and the likes; its similarities are umerous.”

30a. “(In this Qur’ānic verse), it indicates the characteristics (of the lness and types of *fidyah*) and this is not mentioned in another verse), which thus proves that the earlier verse serves as the ference for the (second) verse. (Another example is in) His saying: And take for witness two person from among you endued with stice (عدل)<sup>386</sup>] and in another saying: [And get two witnesses out of our own men<sup>387</sup>], (in the latter verse) the term (عدلين) is not entioned but is described in brief in the former verse. In one stance, He says: [...should free a believing slave (مؤمنة)<sup>388</sup>] and in other instance, [...should free a slave before they touch each her<sup>389</sup>], (in the second verse) the term مؤمنة is not mentioned.”

---

*Sūrah al-Baqarah*, 2: 196.

*Fidyah* is an act of redemption from the omission of certain religious duties, (in the context of this discussion, it is fasting) by a material donation such as staple food or cash money

*Sūrah al-Talāq*, 65: 2.

*Sūrah al-Baqarah*, 2:282.

*Sūrah al-Nisā’*, 4: 92.

*Sūrah al-Mujādalah*, 58: 3.

280b. "As for the explanation of (the content of al-Qur'ān) by the *ḥadīth* of the Prophet SAAS (there are numerous examples, such as) the description of prayers, the nature of *rukū'* (bowing), *sujūd* (prostration), *tashahhud* (attestation), the number and amount of wealth for charity, *zakāt*, the amount of theft leading to amputation, prohibitive acts (like marriage) related to suckling and the likes; it is numerous."

280c. "Almighty Allāh has informed us in His Book that He will torment a group of people, before the Day of Resurrection by saying: [In front of the fire, they will be brought, morning and evening. And (the sentence will be) on the day that judgment will be established: {Cast you the people of Fir'aūn into the severest penalty}.<sup>390</sup>] It is impossible that these people will be exposed to fire in this world or the Day of Resurrection, day and night based on His saying: [On that day, judgment will be established: {Cast you the people of Fir'aūn into the severest penalty}]. (The reason is) that during the Day of Resurrection, there is no day or night time except by metaphor, which is also based on His saying: [They will be there in their subsistence, morning and evening.<sup>391</sup>] (This metaphor) is suitable for this (verse 19 of *Sūrah Maryam*) and not for (verse 46 of *Sūrat Fāṭir*). I have spoken about this issue in my book, *Ta'wīl Mushkil al-Qur'ān*. (Allāh) said elsewhere on the torment during the Day of Resurrection: [And verily, for those who do wrong, there is another punishment besides this. But most of them understand not.<sup>392</sup>]"

280d. "There are numerous narrations coming from the Prophet which were transmitted by trustworthy narrators that he used to seek

<sup>390</sup> *Sūrah Fāṭir*, 40: 46.

<sup>391</sup> *Sūrah Maryam*, 19: 62.

<sup>392</sup> *Sūrah al-Tūr*, 52: 47.

ge from Allāh from the torment of the tomb. Among them is, a *ḥadīth* narrated by Mālik who narrated it from Abū al-Zubayr who related it from Ṭāwūs and the latter from Ibn ‘Abbās who reported the Prophet said: [O My Lord! I seek refuge from You against temptation of *al-dajjāl* (swindler, cheat or imposter), I seek refuge from You against the temptation of life and death and the torment of the grave.] Another example is a *ḥadīth* narrated by ‘Abū ‘Abd Allāh ibn Shaqīq and the latter from Abū Hurayrah that the Prophet SAAS had said: [O My Lord! I seek refuge from You against the temptation and the torment of the grave and the temptation of *al-dajjāl*.<sup>393</sup>] Another is a *ḥadīth* narrated by Hishām who narrated it from Qatādah and the latter from Anas that the Prophet SAAS had said: [O My Lord! I seek refuge from You against temptation of life and against the temptation of death and the torment of the grave.]”

e. “There are various narrations on Munkar and Nakīr and their interrogations. One of the examples is a *ḥadīth* narrated by Ḥammād Salamah who narrated from ‘Āṣim who then narrated from Zirr the latter from ‘Abd Allāh ibn ‘Abbās saying: “One of you will be asked to sit in (your) grave and then it is said to (you): [Who are you?] (You) answered: [I am the slave of Allāh, alive and dead. I testify that there is no God worthy to be worshipped except Allāh and I testify that Muḥammad is His slave and His Messenger]. And it is said to (you): [You are right!] Then a space is extended before (you) your grave and with the Grace of Allāh, you are made to see your grave, meant for (you), in paradise. In a different (narration), it said

---

*Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, 25 (No. 128-131); *Sunan al-Nasā’i*, 8: 279 (No. 5478), *Al-Muṣannaf*, 10: 438 (No. 1).



to (you): "[Who are you?] And (you) said: [I do not know!] And it is said to (you): [You will not know!] Then the space of the grave is made to shrink to the point that (your) chest ruptures. These are the things that only the Prophet is informed of (by Allāh). 'Abd Allāh never knew the precise (events) except what he had heard from the Prophet SAAS (himself)."

280f. 'Abbād ibn Rāshid had narrated from Dāwūd ibn Abū Hind who narrated from Abū Naḍrah who had it from Abū Sa'īd al-Khudrī and the latter from the Prophet saying: "The angel will come to a servant (of Allāh) when he is placed in his grave. If he is an unbeliever or a hypocrite, the angel referring to Muḥammad, will say to him: [What do you think of this man?] The man said: [I know not! I heard people saying something about him and I reiterated (them).] The angel said: [You will not know! You are not concerned! You are not being better guided!] This narration proves that there is torment of the grave for the unbelievers."

"As for their saying: [The dead will be tormented by the weeping of the living ones] and the saying of Allāh: [No soul will bear the burden of another soul], we believe that (a dead) unbeliever will be tormented in his grave due to the weeping of the living members of his family. Similarly, the saying of Ibn 'Abbās that he passed by the grave of a Jew and (the Prophet) informed (Ibn 'Abbās) that (the dead Jew) will be tormented due to the weeping of the living members of his family. If this is way that thing goes, there is nothing unusual here for unbelievers will be tormented in all conditions. However, if this concerns the nominal Muslim, as mentioned by (the Prophet) that (the former) is punished for being calumnious and the way he urinated and also the saying of Almighty Allāh: [No soul will

the burden of another soul], the verdict is applicable in this  
ldly (affair).”

g. “The people of *Jāhiliyyah* used to pursue their vengeance  
nst the murderer (of their family members) and they will murder  
of his brothers or his father or his other relatives. If they could  
murder (one of) his paternal relatives or his close relatives, they  
kill a man from his tribe. Thus, (in relation to this), Almighty  
h reveals: [No soul will bear the burden of another soul]. And  
were also informed that (this verse) was revealed to Ibrāhīm.<sup>394</sup>  
this is why the Prophet said to a man and his son, whom he saw:  
not commit crime against him and he will not commit crime  
nst you!<sup>395]</sup>”

1. “As for the punishment of Almighty Allāh, it will adversely  
t good and bad. Almighty Allāh said: [And fear tumult or  
ression that affected not in particular (only) those of you who do  
ig. And know that God is strict in punishment.<sup>396]</sup> This means  
the oppression will affect the bad and the others. The Almighty  
said: [Mischievous has appeared on land and sea because of (the  
) that the hands of men have earned that (God) may give them a  
of some of their deeds.<sup>397]</sup> And Umm Salamah said: [O  
senger of Allāh! Are we going to perish even if there are (many)  
eous people among us?] He said: [Yes! When evil  
ferates!<sup>398]</sup> The Prophet has explained that Almighty Allāh has

---

*Genesis*, 41: 18-19.

*Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 4: 86 (No. 4208); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 2: 890 (No. 2671);

*Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, 4: 217 (No. 4177).

*Sūrah al-Anfāl*, 8: 26.

*Sūrah al-Rūm*, 30: 41.

*ʿAridat al-Ahwadhī*, 9: 26-7 (No. 2186); *Majmaʿ al-Zawāʿid*, 7: 376 (No. 12149); *Al-Tamhīd*, 10: 507.

caused the people of Nūḥ<sup>399</sup> to drown including children and animals due to the sins of the wrongdoers. Likewise, the people of 'Ād were destroyed by the devastating wind,<sup>400</sup> the people of Thamūd were destroyed by lightning,<sup>401</sup> the people of Lūṭ were destroyed by tornadoes of stones<sup>402</sup> and the people of Sabbath were transformed into monkeys and pigs, affecting the children with the same punishment. I was informed by a Kūfī man that he had read in one of the ancient revealed books and found a saying: [I am a jealous Lord. I take away children due to the sins of their fathers.<sup>403</sup>] Ibn 'Abbā reported that Dāniyāl said: [The people of Isrā'īlites deserved to be punished for their sins] and Anas ibn Mālik said: [The lizard in the hole dies of extinction due to the sins of the progeny of Ādam.]

280i. "The Prophet SAAS has made a supplication on Muḍar saying [O Lord! Reinforce Your oppression against Muḍar and inflict on them (the difficult) years like the (difficult) years of Yūsuf.<sup>404</sup>] The drought afflicted them continuously for seven years to the point that they have to eat skins, bones and 'ilḥiz.<sup>405</sup> This starvation affected the Prophet and his companions who were punished due to his supplication. The Muslims had to tie stone on their stomach (to lessen the feeling) of hunger."

280j. Abū Muḥammad said: "We have seen with our eyes and heard information about how many countries resided by the righteous, the virtuous and the children of all ages were affected by earthquakes

<sup>399</sup> Refer to *Sūrah al-Nūḥ*, 71: 1-28; *Sūrah al-Qamar*, 54: 9-16.

<sup>400</sup> Refer to *Sūrah al-Dhāriyāt*, 51: 41-42.

<sup>401</sup> Refer to *Sūrah al-Qamar*, 54: 23-31.

<sup>402</sup> Refer to *Sūrah al-Qamar*, 54: 34.

<sup>403</sup> Refer to *Exodus*, 10: 5; 34: 7.

<sup>404</sup> Refer to *Sūrah Yūsuf*, 12: 48; *Genesis*, 41: 27; *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, 54 (No. 294 295); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 1: 394 (1442); *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 8: 83 (No. 21997).

<sup>405</sup> 'Ilḥiz refers to a kind of 'food' made up of cooked blood mixed with animal hairs.

ere the virtuous and evil men perished, the sinners, the pious, children and the olds were not excluded. Likewise, (many perished) cities like Qūmas, Mihrijān, Qadhaq, Rayy and other numerous cities in Syria and Yaman. This is the point in which all people who know Almighty Allāh agreed upon and this includes people of other religions with whatever differences they have.”

Ok. Abū Muḥammad said: “A historian narrated to me that, during a pleasant conversation, Al-Manṣūr had mentioned about Umayyad Caliphates and their way of life. They declared that they practiced the right path and as long as authority did not pass into the hands of their descendants corrupted by luxuries (they will be saved). However, the only ambitions of those people were to (hold) onto a royal greatness and majesty, laced themselves with pleasures and passion leading them to their downfall and thus they disobeyed mighty Allāh. They then were afflicted by the wrath of Almighty Allāh for ignoring (the warning) against their lost and believing that they were protected from His anger. They were deprived of their authority and His grace was taken away from them. (At this point of conversation) Ṣāliḥ ibn ‘Alī said to (Al-Manṣūr): [O Leader of the believers! When ‘Ubayd Allāh ibn Marwān, a runaway entered the kingdom of Nūbah, with his supporters, the King of Nūbah asked about them. When he was informed, he rode a horse and met ‘Ubayd Allāh and said to him a few wonderful words. (Unfortunately) I could not remember the words! Then (‘Ubayd Allāh) was asked to go away from the kingdom. Then the Leader of the believers thought of visiting (‘Ubayd Allāh) from the prison, in our presence, so as to ask him the story.”



“Al-Manṣūr then ordered (‘Ubayd) to be brought to him and he was asked about the story. He said: [O Leader of the believers! I entered the Kingdom of Nūbah with some amenities that I have saved and I installed them and settled there for three days. Then the King of Nūbah came to see me and I informed him of our doing: Later on, a tall man with an aquiline nose and a handsome face came in to see me and he sat on the floor regardless of the dirt. I asked him: [Why don’t you sit on our (rug)?] He replied: [I am a king. It is proper for any king to be humble before the Supremacy of Almighty Allāh since it is Allāh Who exalts his (position).] Then he turned to me saying: [Why do you drink an alcoholic drink since your Book prohibited you from it?] I replied: [It is our slaves and foolish people among us who did that!] He said: [Why do you allow your horse to canter on the cultivated field since your Book prohibited you from evil deed?] I replied: [It is the ignorant ones among us who did that!] He said: [Why do you dress yourself with brocade and silk and wear gold and silver which are prohibited on you?] I replied: [Our authorities have abated. Our supporters have declined in numbers. Then we called upon the assistance from people abroad who (unwillingly) accepted our religion and they practiced (such evil deeds) despite our disapproval. Then the King bent his head (to the ground) and twisted his hand and started to write something on the ground and said: [Nothing that you have said to me is true! It is indeed you yourselves, who have considered as lawful the things that have been made unlawful to you. (It is you), who have committed reprehensible acts. (It is you), who were unjust on your possessions. Then Almighty Allāh wrested away from you the strength and engulfed you with humiliation due to your sins and He afflicted you His punishment which has yet (to begin.) I fear that this wrath will be afflicted on

while you are in my country and it will affect me as well. We extend our hospitality to you for three days only and then equip myself with your needs and leave my country!] Then I did (what he requested of me to do).”

l. “Indeed, Almighty Allāh has informed us in His Book that He protect the sons in consideration of their fathers. Almighty Allāh said: [As for the wall, it belonged to two youths, orphans in the town. There was beneath it, a buried treasure, to which they were entitled; their father had been a righteous man. So your Lord desired that they should attain their age and strength and get their treasure out, a mercy from your Lord.<sup>406</sup>] And during the day he made a supplication for Abbās, ‘Umar in his sermon has said: [O Lord! Indeed, we get closer to You in the name of the uncle of Your Prophet and of his great ancestors and companions and You said: {As for the wall, it belonged to two youths, orphans in the town. There was beneath it, a buried treasure, to which they were entitled; their father had been a righteous man. So your Lord desired that they should attain their age and full strength and dig out the treasure} and since You protected them due to the virtuous deeds of their fathers, O Lord! Protect Your Prophet in the name of his uncle for we take him as a mediator with You, asking for intercession and forgiveness.] Since it is possible for (Allāh) to protect the children in consideration of their righteous parents, it is therefore possible for Him not to protect the children due to their wicked fathers. He will do what He wishes.”

m. “ ‘Ā’ishah, however, rejected the (above) *ḥadīth* and she said: (I will never accept it he is an insolent (person).] Indeed, this was the assumption and interpretation made by ‘Ā’ishah. One should not

---

*Sūrah al-Kahf*, 18: 82.

reject the *ḥadīth* of the Prophet just because of her presumption. she had narrated from the Prophet SAAS something that contradicts this *ḥadīth* we could have considered her words. Even if 'Abd Allāh ibn 'Umar were the only person who had narrated it we could have doubted it – as she claimed – but there was a mistake. (This *ḥadīth*, however,) has been transmitted by a whole series of companions such as 'Umar, 'Imrān ibn Ḥuṣayn, Ibn 'Umar, and Abū Mūsā and Ash'arī. If they said: [This is unjust!] and (one should know that the Almighty Allāh is free from being unjust for He said: [I do not do the least injustice.<sup>407</sup>] We will answer them by referring to the saying of Iyās ibn Mu'āwiyah: [I said to a person: {What is (the meaning of) injustice in Arabic?} He replied: {It means taking things which do not belong to you.} And I said to him: {But everything belongs to the Almighty Allāh!}]"]

#### LXXIX. EXAMPLE OF *ḤADĪTH* INVALIDATED BY *NAẒAR*

281. They said: "You have narrated that Abū Zhar has asked the Prophet about the conduct of a man with his wife: [O Prophet! He takes the pleasure and will he be rewarded?] (The Prophet) replied [In your opinion, if you accomplish an act in an unlawful manner would you be guilty of it?] He said: [Yes!] (The Prophet) said [Similarly, if you accomplish it in a lawful manner, you will be rewarded for it.<sup>408</sup>] They said: [An act that is accomplished in an unlawful manner is sinful, while an act that is accomplished in a lawful manner is acceptable. How could it be possible for an act that is accomplished in an acceptable manner be rewarded? If this is

<sup>407</sup> *Sūrah Qāf*, 50: 29.

<sup>408</sup> *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, 16 (No. 53); *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 4: 362 (No. 5243); *Aḥmad Musnad*, 8: 110 (No. 21529).

ible then it is also possible (for us) to be rewarded for eating when (we) are hungry or drinking water when (we) are thirsty. Could the Prophet SAAS have said that? He, out of all creatures, is best about the subtleties of language, be it acceptable or not?”

Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that (in this case) the man is married to an old or ugly wife but desiring another one who is beautiful for him (and at the same time) she also offers herself to (That man) by his will can reject (the unlawful offer) out of his obedience to Almighty Allāh. And he will be rewarded for choosing lawful (choice) although he does not have any desire for (his wife).”

that man may have two wives, one being dark and ugly and the other fair and pretty. If he treats them equally, although he desires the pretty one only but has to force himself to come to the other, he will be rewarded for that act.”

that man eats lawful barley bread but is prevented from eating lawful white bread although he has the power to do so, therefore, he will be rewarded for that act. In the eyes of people, he deserves to be rewarded for eating the barley bread. Someone said: [The believer will be rewarded for eating (food) or drinking (water) or even having a lawful relationship.] This is based on the saying of the Prophet: [The believer will be rewarded for everything (that he has done) even for giving a mouthful (of food) to his lips.<sup>409</sup>] To me, it hits the mark!”

---

*Al-Durr al-Manthūr*, 2: 227.



**LXXX. EXAMPLE OF ḤADĪTH INVALIDATED BY NAZAR**

283. They said: "You have narrated that monkeys lapidated a female monkey for adultery. If monkeys lapidate female monkeys which are in a state of *iḥṣān* (married or well protected) the *ḥadīth* will be more laudable. Analogically, as implied in (the *ḥadīth*) you know not that the monkeys may observe a great number of regulations from al-Tawrāt and their religion may be Judaism. If monkeys were Jewish, pigs might be Christians."

284. Abū Muḥammad said: "To answer those mockeries, we affirm that the *ḥadīth* related to monkeys is not narrated from the Prophet SAAS or his companions. It is cited by 'Amr ibn Maymūn. Muḥammad ibn Khālid ibn Khidash said that he had narrated from Muslim ibn Qutaybah, who narrated from Hashīm ibn Ḥuṣayn and the latter from 'Amr ibn Maymūn who said: [In the *Jāhiliyyah* (era), a female monkey was guilty of adultery and the other monkeys lapidated it and I imitated them.]"

Abū Muḥammad said: "Probably ('Amr) may have seen some monkeys lapidating a female monkey and presumed that the female monkey was lapidated because it was (guilty) of adultery. However, nobody knows except by presumption because monkeys say nothing about themselves. It is the person who saw the female monkey fornicate (with others?) and then making presumption even though he was not sure whether the monkey fornicated or not? Maybe the shaykh knows that the monkey fornicated based on evidences which we know not. Indeed, monkeys are the animals most inclined to fornicate."

nd the Arabs used to make a proverb out of it by saying: [More literers than the monkey.] If (the monkey's) tendency to fornicate not a despicable (act) they will not make a proverb out of it. In addition to passion and partner, there are no other animals that resemble man most than the monkey. Animals fight among themselves by challenging and punishing each other. Some bite each other, some scratch others and some break and stampede others (to pieces). Monkeys lapidate others with their hands which Allāh has created for, and which are similar to man. In (these circumstances), it is possible that (monkeys) lapidate each other for any other reason than adultery and that the shaykh erroneously claimed that it was adultery. However, it is also possible that the shaykh had evidence of adultery in the female monkey for – as I have said to you earlier – an animal is the most passionate and resembles most to the progeny of Adam in its intelligence.”

a. Abū Muḥammad said: “I presume that monkeys are amorphosed and that they grew and multiplied (in numbers). I have evidence on that based on the saying of Almighty Allāh: {Shall I point out to you something much worse than this (as judged) by the treatment it received from Allāh? Those who incurred the curse of Allāh and His wrath, those of whom He transformed into monkeys and pigs.}<sup>410</sup>] The presence of the definite article (ال) which suffix to the term monkey (القردة) and the term pigs (الخنزير) indicates the sign of the definite (noun) and that it concerns the monkey which we see with our (naked) eyes. If (the verse) were to discuss the previous incident, it will say: [He transformed into

---

*Sūrah al-Mā'idah*, 5: 60.

monkey and pigs] and this is authenticated by the *ḥadīth* of Uḥayyir b. Ḥabībah on metamorphosis as mentioned by the Prophet.”

284b. “However, we do not say that (the monkey) acted in manner to conform to the description of al-Tawrāt as mentioned the agitator. But we affirm that the monkey being lapidated ei due to adultery or any other reasons as other animals used their ha to scratch, bite or break because they have hands similar to progeny of Ādam. But the progeny of Ādam have no means to l others except to lapidate. This confirms further that monkeys wh we are now seeing are being metamorphosised. Apart from the B or tradition, there are unanimous consensuses that (monkey’s) fles as unlawful as the human’s flesh.”

#### LXXXI. EXAMPLE OF ḤADĪTH VINDICATING TI CREATEDNESS OF AL-QUR’ĀN

285. They said: “You have narrated that [The heart of al-Qur’ān *Yāsīn*<sup>411</sup>] and [The hump of al-Qur’ān is *al-Baqarah* (cow)] and t [On the Day of Resurrection, both (*sūrat*) *al-Baqarah* and *Āli ‘Imr* will come as if they were two clouds or two shadows or two flights birds with outspread wings] and that [Al-Qur’ān will come to a m in his grave and inform him such and such a thing] All of the abo prove that al-Qur’ān is created. It is not possible for it to have heart, hump, shadow or cloud (except) it is uncreated.”

286. Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that it would be proper these people – people of *kalām* and *qiyās*, realized that al-Qur’ān not composed of body, limit and region. What is intended with t

<sup>411</sup> *Al-Durr al-Manthūr*, 1: 20.



ing: [The hump of al-Qur'ān is *al-Baqarah* (cow)] is to indicate highest point just like the hump is the highest point of an animal. d what is intended with the saying: [The heart of al-Qur'ān is *sūrah*] is to inform that *sūrah* is (the central) of al-Qur'ān just like a rt to the body. As for the intended meaning of (the expression): th (*sūrat*) *al-Baqarah* and *Āli 'Imrān* will come as if they were o clouds or two shadows] as the reward meant for the reciter in the m of shade on the Day of Resurrection, (reward) meant for a son in his grave and (reward) to a person as his 'attorney' on the y of Resurrection. (As a reward) it is possible for Almighty Allāh be incarnate for him, who will justify him and safe him."

5a. Abū Muḥammad said: "Abū al-Khaṭṭāb had narrated from /ād ibn Yaḥyā who also narrated from 'Abd al-A'lā who then rated from Muḥammad ibn Ishāq, who also narrated from 'Amr i Shu'ayb and the latter from his father and his grandfather that the ophet said: [On the Day of Resurrection, al-Qur'ān will be sonified as a man. (This man or al-Qur'ān) will approach a son who had neglected his (essential) responsibilities which were ovided for in (al-Qur'ān), who transgressed its limit, who opposed d disobeyed them and who perpetuated in evil doing. (Al-Qur'ān) ll 'litigate' that person by saying: {O Lord! You gave me to an evil arer who transgressed my limit, who neglected my (essential) onsibilities, who refused to obey me and who were against me by petuating in evil doing!} (Al-Qur'ān) will continuously be igating' against that person until it is said to (the latter): {Do unto n whatever you want!} (Al-Qur'ān) will seize the person's hand d never let him go until (the person) falls headlong into the hellfire. l-Qur'ān) will also approach a person who respected the laws, who



accomplished the (essential) obligations, who accepted to obey (the laws), who averted from evil doings. (Al-Qur'ān) will 'litigate' that man by saying: {O Lord! You have given me to a pious bearer who respected my laws, who accomplished my (essential) responsibilities who accepted to obey me and who obeyed me by averting (himself from evil doing!)} (Al-Qur'ān) will continuously be 'litigating' that person until it is said to (the latter): {Do unto him what you want} (Al-Qur'ān) will take that person by his arm and continuously hold him until he has taken a sip (of drink) from (a glass) shrouded with gold, followed by a royal crown to wear on his head and then to drink from a cup of eternity.]"

286b. "Is it not found in (the Prophet's) saying: [Al-Qur'ān will be personified] as evidence that (Al-Qur'ān) will be personified. (The personified form) will explain that the person who respects and follows (its teachings) is saved by al-Qur'ān. And al-Qur'ān is not a man or a body or even a talking (object) but it is the word (of Allāh). If those people carefully observe and derive benefit from the divine succor, they will know that it is impossible to say that al-Qur'ān was created for it is the word of Almighty Allāh. The Word of Allāh is from Allāh and what is from Almighty Allāh can never be created. This issue can be construed in our humanly language. Our word is not an act. It is a sound and a ruptured word. Both sound and word can never be (construed) as acts for both of them are created by Allāh. The only part that we contributed is to put in (our effort) which merits the reward from His Almighty."

286c. "Likewise, this can be seen in a case of a man, to whom we entrusted some wealth. Later, (the owner) reclaimed from him and he returned to (the owner a property) by his own means or effort

ivalent to the entrusted wealth). (Here, it means) that it is not the perty or the man's effort that merited the reward (from Allāh) but reward is due to (the act of) restitution of the entrusted wealth. ilarily, reward is due to you for your effort in 'reciting' al-Qur'ān the form of (your) voice and (reinstate) its ruptured word. Al-r'ān, in its structure and composition – is certainly the Word of āh and it comes from Him. Whoever 'recites' (al-Qur'ān), that he n 'reinstating' the Word of Almighty Allāh. And this (act of stitution) does not mean (to say that) he is the owner (of the rd) because of his recitation. (In other words), if a man writes a ech or composes a poem and then another person distributes the m (to others), (this obviously means) that the distributor is not the ner of the poem, but the composer is the real owner. What the ributor is doing is only 'reinstating' the wording of the nposer."

## XXII. EXAMPLE OF *HADĪTH* INVALIDATED BY NSENSUS

' They said: "You have narrated from Ayyūb who narrated from Sirīn and who narrated from 'Amr ibn Wahb al-Thaqafī and the er from al-Mughīrah who said that when the Prophet SAAS ended) to satisfy his call for nature, he used running water (to n himself) and then he took his ablution, wiped off his turban th little water) and then performs his morning prayer. You also rated from Abū Mu'awiyah and who narrated from al-A'mash, o narrated from al-Ḥakam, who narrated from 'Abd al-Raḥmān Abū Laylā who narrated from Ka'b ibn 'Aḥrah and the latter from il that the Prophet SAAS used to wipe off (a little water) on his

veil that covers his head.<sup>412</sup> You also narrated from al-Walid Muslim who then narrated from al-Awzā'i, who narrated from Yal'ibn Abū Kathīr, who also narrated from Abū Salamah ibn 'Abd Raḥmān and the latter from 'Amr ibn Umayyah al-Ḍamrī saying that he saw the Prophet taking his ablution and then wiping off (a little water) on his turban.<sup>413</sup> They said: [This chain of narrators is noble in your (estimation), but you refuse to apply (its teaching) and there is no other saying of the Prophet which abrogated (the teaching).]"

288. Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that the truth for us is confirmed by consensus and it is worthier than the narration *ḥadīth*.<sup>414</sup> This is because *ḥadīth* is subjected to issues like negligence and omission or affected by obscurity, (various) interpretations and abrogation (due to) procurement of narration from the trustworthy narrators from the untrustworthy ones. It is also (affected) by the diverging orders but is lawful such as (pronouncing) one *taslīm* (salutation) or twice. (In another instance), a narrator might have been present when the Prophet SAAS was giving an order or (it could be) that the narrator was not at hand when a contrary order was given (by the Prophet) and thus he narrated the first order to us and not the second for he had no knowledge of it. The (mode of) consensus (*ijmā'*) is protected against all of the above reasons. This is what Mālik, whenever he narrated a *ḥadīth* from the Prophet SAAS, would say: [In our country the practice is such and such!] if the local practice differs from the (order) of the *ḥadīth*, albeit his country is also the country of the Prophet. If a practice of an order (on the basis

<sup>412</sup> *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, 23 (No. 84); *ʿAḥḍat al-Aḥwadhī*, 1: 126 (No. 101); *Sunan Nasā'i*, 1: 96 (No. 104, 106); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 1: 186 (No. 561, 563).

<sup>413</sup> *ʿUmdat al-Qārī*, 2: 572 (No. 205); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 1: 186 (No. 562).

<sup>414</sup> This idea indicates Ibn Qutaybah's inclination to Ḥanbālites' position on *ijmā'*.

consensus) during (the Prophet's time) was such and such, it will of the same practice during the second, the third and centuries after it. It is not possible for people to abandon a (well accepted) practice in their life time in their country just to adopt another practice). But a practice transmitted from a person to another may change)."

a. "People may narrate *aḥādīth* using the mode of unbroken chains of narrators but they may not necessarily conform to the practice stipulated (in the said *aḥādīth*). One of the examples – a *ḥadīth* of Sufyān and Ḥammād ibn Zayd, who narrated from 'Amr Dīnār, who then narrated from Jābir and the latter from Ibn ḥāṣ that the Prophet SAAS used to perform *jam'* (combined) prayers between *al-zuḥr* and *al-'aṣr* or between *al-maghrib*<sup>415</sup> and *al-ṭā'*, even though it was during a peaceful time.<sup>416</sup> However, the jurists have unanimously abandoned the practice either because (the *ḥadīth*) was abrogated or (the Prophet) was doing that out of necessity – due to heavy rain or busy (with some work)."

Another example, a *ḥadīth* from Sufyān who narrated from 'Amr Dīnār who narrated from 'Awsajah and the latter from Ibn ḥāṣ informing that a man, in the era of the Prophet SAAS died out leaving any heir except his master, who had liberated the slave. The Prophet SAAS bequeathed the heritage to the master (of the man).<sup>417</sup> The jurists, however, opposed this act either because (1) they doubted 'Awsajah's ability to certify whether the order is an obligatory or supererogatory act; (2) or because the interpretation

<sup>415</sup> *ʿAṣīdat al-Aḥwadhī*, 8: 202 (No. 2114); *Al-Musnad*, 1: 105 (No. 324); *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 10: 324 (No. 29630); *Mishkāt al-Maṣābīh*, 2: 153 (No. 3066).

*Al-Tamhīd*, 5: 44.

<sup>417</sup> *ʿAṣīdat al-Aḥwadhī*, 8: 202 (No. 2114); *Al-Musnad*, 1: 105 (No. 324); *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 10: 324 (No. 29630); *Mishkāt al-Maṣābīh*, 2: 153 (No. 3066).



has been altered and rendered as: [he does not leave any except his master, who has liberated the man.] Indeed, the interpretation should be as follows: [He has the right to the heritage because he is the master of the dead man; (3) or in virtue of abrogation.”

“Another example is a *ḥadīth* from Shu‘bah, who narrated from ‘Amr ibn Murrah who narrated from ‘Abd al-Raḥmān ibn Abū Laylā and the latter from al-Barā’ who informed that the Prophet SAAS recited the *qunūt* during the prayers of *al-ṣubḥ* and *al-maghrib*.<sup>418</sup> However, people agreed with each other on *qunūt* recitation during *al-ṣubḥ* prayer, but to abandon (*qunūt* recitation) during *al-maghrib* prayer.”

288b. “The examples of this type of (contention) are numerous such as the practice to wipe off (a little water in his ablution) on the turban or the veil covering the head: (1) the jurists have agreed to abandon that practice; (2) they, however, did not come to a consensus on the position of the chain of narrators (who narrated the said *ḥadīth*) for they did not doubt (the trustworthy narrators); (3) except that (the *ḥadīth*) being abrogated; or (4) because they saw (at one time) the Prophet SAAS had wiped off (a little water) on his turban and (at another time) he had wiped off (a little water) on his head (while wearing) his turban. (Probably), the narrator had transmitted slightly odd information, for wiping off (a little water) on the head is neither a reprehensible or obscure practice for everybody does it. And indeed wiping off (a little water) on the veil covering the head is an obscure practice. (The jurists), therefore, searched for other testimony, that is, from a *ḥadīth* narrated by al-Mughīrah. (The chain of narrators is as follows :) Al-Walīd ibn Muslim narrated from

<sup>418</sup> *‘Aṣīḍat al-Aḥwadhī*, 2: 162 (No. 401).

awr who narrated from Rajā' ibn Ḥaywah, who narrated from urrād and the latter from al- Mughīrah, who said that the Prophet AS had wiped off (a little water) on the front part of his head (نصف) and his turban. The practice of wiping off (a little water) on fore part of the head, however, is an obligatory act stipulated in Book.<sup>419</sup> Hence one should not reject a *ḥadīth* due to a slight difference in its wording. Similarly, there are some narrations forming that the Prophet used to wipe off (a little water) on his sandals – and in another he used to wipe off (a little water) on his socks. And indeed he wiped off (a little water) on his socks but he is wearing his sandals. This shows that (in one narration) the narrators transmitted one part (of the whole information) and (in another narration), the narrators transmitted another part (from the whole information).<sup>420</sup>

### XXXIII. EXAMPLE OF TWO CONTRADICTORY *HADĪTH* RELATED TO THE CHILDREN OF THE POLYTHEIST

9. They said: "You narrated that al-Ṣa'b ibn Juthāmah said: [O Prophet! During the incursion and in the darkness of the night our horses have galloped on the children of the polytheists! He replied: They are among their fathers!]<sup>421</sup> They also said: [You also narrated that the Prophet had sent a troupe of army and they killed the woman and children but he severely reproved this act. They said: {O

---

Refer to *Sūrah al-Mā'idah*, 5: 6.

In other words, Ibn Qutaybah intends to say that the narrators only transmitted half of the information found in the *ḥadīth*.

*Umdat al-Qārī*, 1: 328 (No. 3012, 3013); *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, 9 (No. 28); *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 4: 229 (No. 4712); *ʿArīḍat al-Aḥwadhī*, 7: 50 (No. 1570); *Al-Musnad*, 5: 529 (No. 16424), 5: 597 (No. 16669), 5: 597 (No. 16670); *Al-Mustadrak*, 3: 625; *Al-Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, 8: 87 (No. 8448-8450).

Prophet! They are the children of the polytheists!} He replied: {Is not that the best among you is the children of the polytheist?}}

290. Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that there is hardly a contradiction between the two *ḥadīth*. This is because al-Ṣa'b al Juthāmah has informed (the Prophet) that during the incursion and the darkness of the night, the horses of the Muslims have galloped (the children of the polytheists) and (the Prophet SAAS) had replied that they were among their fathers. This means that in this world life, they are of the same status of their fathers. If the incursion is night time, (the army) should not abstain themselves from (aggression) against the polytheist simply because of the presence children for they are of the same status as their father, however, they should not be deliberately massacred. As for the rebuke of (the Prophet SAAS) against the army, mentioned in the second *ḥadīth*, for killing women and the children because their fathers were polytheists; the act was done deliberately. That is why (the Prophet) said: [Is it not that the best among you is the child of the polytheist? In this (remark), he meant to say that there were among them, who will be good Muslims when they reach adulthood."

#### LXXXIV. EXAMPLE OF CONTRADICTORY ḤADĪTH

291. He said: "You have narrated that the Prophet SAAS in relation to Sa'd ibn Mu'ādh has said: [The throne was shaken by his death and seventy thousand angels rushed to wash him and I have to exempt my way to his burial procession.<sup>422</sup>] In another narration he said: [anybody who can get away from the torment of the grave, it is Sa

<sup>422</sup>

'Umdat al-Qārī, 11: 514 (No. 3803); Sunan Ibn Mājah, 1: 56 (No. 158); Mustadrak, 3: 207, 289; Kanz al-'Ummāl, 11: 685 (No. 33312).



n Mu'ādh, he will feel the pressure that could burst his ribs.<sup>423</sup>] They said: [How can the throne of Almighty Allāh move due the demise of a person? If (this movement) is possible, then it could only mean for the Prophets!] Indeed, you have narrated from the Prophet that there is no eclipse of the sun and the moon when a person dies or lives.<sup>424</sup> If this is true for the sun and the moon as you have narrated, became two bulls of fire, what will happen to the glorious throne? If the throne moves, it will lead to the movement of the heaven and earth, how could the throne move due to the demise of a person, who will be tormented by Almighty Allāh and be compressed in his grave until his ribs burst? How could a person be tormented when seventy thousand angels rushed to wash his body and the Prophet could not perform prayer for the deceased due to the multitude of angels surrounding the body?"

2. Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that some people have (literally) interpreted the *ḥadīth* and they thought that the tremor of the throne is a real movement like the blowing of the wind and the movement of the tree due to its blowing. If this is the way of interpreting thing, atrocity will erupt for (the contenders) will find the answer against us with (this kind of interpretation)."

2a. "The people interpreted that العرش or the throne, here, as السرير the stretcher or bed that carried Sa'd ibn Mu'ādh, moved. If this interpretation is acceptable, in this saying, it is not meant for Sa'd ibn Mu'ādh at the same time the wording is of no value for any stretcher

*Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 15: 639 (No. 42515); *Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, 12: 232 (No. 12975).

*Sunan al-Nasā'ī*, 3: 126 (No. 1457), 3: 126 (No. 1458), and 3: 127 (No. 1459); *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 1: 306 (No. 1177); *Al-Musnad*, 2: 441 (No. 5889); *Al-Mustadrak*, 1: 332; *Majma' al-Zawā'id*, 2: 372 (No. 3270), 2: 373 (No. 3272), 2: 374-5 (No. 3274); *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 7: 821 (No. 21551), 7: 823 (No. 21555), 7: 827 (No. 21570, 21571, 21575), and 8: 427 (No. 23521).



which carried the deceased body will move when people carried. Then, how could it possible for the term throne to refer to a stretcher that carried the deceased body of Sa'd ibn Mu'adh for another *ḥadīth* it said: [The throne of the Merciful One is shaken at his demise]. The term "shaken" could not represent the movement of the throne which some people thought it to be. Indeed, the term "shaken" also means rejoice and happiness. It is said: [So and so is shaken because of the good deed!] which means rejoice at happiness. And in another (remark): [When we traced him, so and so was shaken!] it means delighted and relieve. In another example [When we call him, so and so is shaken and when he is asked, he is shaken!] And the word of Abū al-Aswad al-Du'ālī: [When he was invited to eat the food he trembled!], thus refers to delightedness or happiness. (In another remark): [When something is asked from him he shook!] it means that he does not budge and is not happy. These are the meanings of the term "shaken" (as perceived from) the *ḥadīth*."

"As for (the meaning of) the throne, it does refer to the throne of the Merciful and the Almighty One as stipulated in the *ḥadīth*. And the meaning of (the throne is) shaken, (here it) refers to the happiness of the angels who carried (Sa'd's body) and surrounded him due to the (arrival) of his soul. (The Prophet SAAS) used the term "throne" (to explain the situation of) the angels who carried and surrounded his (body). Likewise, as (explained) in the saying of Almighty Allāh [And neither heaven nor earth shed a tear over them.<sup>425</sup>] This (verse intends to explain) that neither the inhabitants of the heavens nor the earth cried over them. The usage of (the terms) "heaven" and "earth

<sup>425</sup> *Sūrah al-Dukhān*, 44: 29.

indicate the situation of its inhabitants. And in another saying: ask at the town<sup>426</sup>], means ask the people of the town. Similarly, in relation to Mount Uḥud the Prophet SAAS said: [This mount! It is as us (يحبنا) and we love it! (نحبه)<sup>427</sup>] He intended to say يحبنا أهله to refer to al-Anṣār and using نحبه to refer to the love we have for it. As such, (when the Prophet SAAS) used the term “throne”, he intended to refer to the situation of the angels who carried and surrounded (the deceased body of Sa’d).”

In fact, in (another) ḥadīth, it is said that the angels rejoiced with the (arrival) of the soul of a believer and that each believer has an throne in heaven by which all his deeds ascend through and by which his sustenance descends through and also by which his spirit ascends through upon his death and then it is sent back!<sup>428</sup>] This interpretation is further proven by the saying of the Prophet SAAS: Indeed, seventy thousands angels rushed to wash his deceased body]. This interpretation, praise be to Almighty Allāh, is easily understood! It is as if (the Prophet) is saying: [The bearer of the throne with its angels surrounding him is shaken with (the arrival) of the soul of Sa’d.]”

b. “As for their saying: [How could he be tormented when seventy thousand angels rushed to wash his deceased body?] Indeed, death, resurrection, judgment are followed by severe convulsions by which hardly neither a Prophet nor a sage could get away. A proof

---

*Sūrah Yūsuf*, 12: 82.

*Umdat al-Qārī*, 12: 122 (No. 4083, 4084), 16: 545 (No. 7333); *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, 85 (No.462); *ʿAṣīdat al-Aḥwadhī*, 13: 221 (No. 3922); *Al-Musnad*, 4: 300 (No. 12512), 4: 479 (No. 13525), 4: 483 (No. 13548); *Al-Muʿjam al-Kabīr*, 6: 124-5 (No. 5720); *Kanz al-ʿUmmāl*, 12: 269 (No. 34993), 12: 269 (No. 34993), 14: 142 (No. 38182, 38183), 14: 143 (No. 38184). *ʿAṣīdat al-Aḥwadhī*, 12: 97 (No. 3255); *Mishkāt al-Maṣābiḥ*, 1: 545 (No. 1734); *Kanz al-ʿUmmāl*, 15: 681 (No. 42718)

for you is that the Prophet used to seek refuge from Allāh against the torment of the grave.<sup>429</sup> If it is impossible, he would have not sought refuge from Him because he dreaded what Almighty Allāh has decreed upon all man. He feared all of them and in this state of uncertainty, he could not provide safety or tranquility for them.”

“(Another) proof for you (can be seen in) the saying of all Prophets on the Day of Judgment: [O Lord! My soul! My soul!] And the saying of our Prophet: [O Lord! My people! My people!]<sup>430</sup> Another proof for you (can be seen) in the saying of Almighty Allāh: [Not one of you but will pass over it. This is, with your Lord, a decree which must be accomplished.]<sup>431</sup> (Here) we were taught that everybody will come near to the fire of hell except saved by Allāh those who are pious and He leaves behind those who are unjust therein (humbled to their knees).<sup>432</sup> And ‘Umar ibn al-Khaṭṭab said: [If I have gold as big as the earth, I will redeem myself from the terror of the hereafter.] In relation to the saying of Almighty Allāh: [One day Allāh will gather the apostles together and ask: {What was the response you received (from men to your teaching)?} They will say {We have no knowledge: it is You, Who know in full all that is hidden!}]<sup>433</sup> Ibn ‘Abbās said that they will be stupefied by the terror of the Day of Resurrection.”

<sup>429</sup> *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, 25 (No. 128-134); *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 4: 324 (No. 5090); *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, 2: 180-1 (No. 3637), 2: 181 (No. 3642), 2: 190 (No. 3690), 2: 263 (No. 3976).

<sup>430</sup> *‘Aṣṣaḥīḥ al-Aḥwadhī*, 9: 194 (No. 2434).

<sup>431</sup> *Sūrah Maryam*, 19: 71.

<sup>432</sup> Refer to *Sūrah Maryam*, 19: 72.

<sup>433</sup> *Sūrah al-Mā'idah*, 5: 106.



## XXV. EXAMPLE OF *HADĪTH* INVALIDATED BY *NAẒAR*

They said: "You have narrated from 'Abd Allāh ibn Numayr then narrated from 'Ubayd Allāh who also narrated from Nāfi' the latter from Ibn 'Umar that the Prophet SAAS, in relation to lizard (الضبيب) said: [I do not eat it but I will not prevent you from and declare it neither lawful nor unlawful.<sup>434</sup>] They said: [If he does not eat it and neither forbid nor declare it as lawful or unlawful, to whom (can we) refer to on its legitimacy and its interdiction?] Bedouins love to eat lizards and they marvel at it. And Abū Wā'il said: [I love to eat a lizard which is bursting with eggs more than a fat chicken!] Indeed, Khālīd ibn al-Walīd used to eat with Abū Wā'il) as well as 'Umar, it is not possible for them to indulge in such a dubious act."

Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that there is an error in this *ḥadīth* committed by some of the narrators for (the Prophet) said: [I do not eat it and I will not prevent you from eating it] and nothing more. The narrators presumed that since, he did not declare it as lawful or unlawful and (at the same time) he did not eat it or prevent others from eating it, he therefore avoided and preferred to restrain himself from it. There is a difference between abstaining from eating due to its interdiction and that of abstaining from eating to preference. Similarly, when somebody offered a lizard to him, he placed his hand on its neck and said: [The Prophet does

---

*Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, 7 (No. 40, 41); *ʿAṣṣat al-Aḥwadhī*, 7: 209 (No. 1790); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 2: 1081 (No. 3240); *Al-Musnad*, 2: 218 (No. 4562), 2: 220 (No. 4573), 2: 299 (No. 5058), 2: 301 (No. 5068), 2: 332 (No. 5255), 2: 378 (No. 5531), 2: 455 (No. 5969), 2: 290 (No. 5004); *Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, 4: 102 (3796, 3797); *Al-Tamhīd*, 1: 130; *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 15: 449 (No. 41783), 15: 451 (No. 41790).



not prohibit it but he dislikes it.] Another point to enlighten you is that Wahb ibn Jarīr narrated from Shu'bah, who also narrated from Tawbah al-'Anbarī who then narrated from Al-Sha'bī and the latter from Ibn 'Umar who had said that a group of people among the companions of the Prophet, including Sa'd ibn Mālik were eating something, one of the wives of the Prophet exclaimed at them: [It is a lizard!] and they stopped (eating). But the Prophet said to them: [Eat! It is lawful and there is no harm in it! But this is not the (choice of food) of my people!<sup>435</sup>] This *ḥadīth* proves that the mistake was committed by a narrator who narrated from Ibn 'Umar for he should not report the two *ḥadīth* together since they contradicted each other."

294a. "As for the refusal of (the Prophet) to eat (a lizard) although it is lawful, (can be explained in the fact that) not all lawful food are medically suitable for one self or proper for one to take it. Indeed, Almighty Allāh has permitted us to eat sheep except of (the parts which) the blood pours forth (as opposed to blood adhering to flesh).<sup>436</sup> The Prophet disliked eating its bladder, brain, intestines, testicles and spleen. It is reported that the fetus of a sheep is considered slaughtered when its mother is being slaughtered<sup>437</sup> and (this fetus) is medically unfit to be eaten. Among the unlawful foods which are not revealed (by Allāh) or by the Sunnah but being instinctively and naturally rejected by man are the flesh of man, flesh of monkeys, snakes, geckos, lizards, mice and the like. These

<sup>435</sup> *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, 7 (No. 42); *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 15: 451 (No. 41789), 15: 451-2 (No. 41791).

<sup>436</sup> In other words it refers to the organ like the liver or other internal organs that purify the blood. Refer to *Sūrah al-An'ām*, 6: 145-146.

<sup>437</sup> *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 3: 104 (No. 2828); *ʿAṣṣat al-Aḥwadhī*, 6: 213 (No. 1476); *Sunan al-Dārimī*, 2: 84; *Al-Musnad*, 4: 78 (No. 11343); *Al-Mustadrak*, 4: 114; *Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, 4: 162 (No. 4010), 8: 103 (No. 7489).

als are, by nature, disliked by man. Indeed, Almighty Allāh has  
ht us and as stipulated in His Book that the Prophet prohibited us  
i filthy things<sup>438</sup> and all (of the animals mentioned above) by  
re, are filthy.”

b. “As for the (actions) though lawful, but are unlikely proper to  
lone are: a middle-aged person running in the street, except for  
rgency purpose, debating about the dowry of the mother,  
arding off the coat from the shoulder, kneading cotton on the  
et, exposing woman’s jewelries and eating at the street-market.”

i Muḥammad said: “Abū al-Khaṭṭāb has narrated from Abū ‘Atiāb  
narrated from Muḥammad ibn al-Furāt, who also narrated from  
d ibn Luqmān, who narrated from ‘Abd al-Raḥman al-Anṣārī and  
latter from Abū Hurayrah informing that he heard the Prophet  
: [Eating at the street-market is infamy.<sup>439</sup>] In some *ḥadīth*:  
leed, Almighty Allāh loves noble actions and dislikes the vile  
s.<sup>440</sup>”

## XXVI. EXAMPLE OF ANTHROPORMORPHIC *HADĪTH* /ALIDATED BY AL-QUR’ĀN AND CONSENSUS

. They said: “You have narrated that Allāh, the Blessed and  
lime ascends to the lower heaven during the last third of the night  
He says: [Is there anybody who invoked me and I will answer

---

Refer to *Sūrah al-A‘rāf*, 7: 157.

*Al-Mu‘jam al-Kabīr*, 8: 249 (No. 7977); *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, 15: 260 (No. 40865).

*Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, 15: 770 (No. 43021).

him? Or is there anybody who repented and I will forgive him?<sup>441</sup> And He ascends on the night of 'Arafah so as to be among the pilgrims and He ascends on the (fifteenth) night of Sha'bān. All these (remarks) are in contradiction with the saying of His Almighty [There is no secret consultation among three, but He makes four among them, none among five but He makes the sixth; nor among fewer or more. But He is in their midst, wheresoever they be.<sup>442</sup> And He, the Exalted and the Mighty said: [It is He Who is God in heaven and God on earth.<sup>443</sup>]"

296. Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that in His expression [There is no secret consultation among three, but He makes four among them, not among five but He makes the sixth – nor among fewer or more. But He is in their midst, wheresoever they may be] means that through knowledge (all knows that) He is with them wherever they are. It is just like a man whom you sent to a far away country and entrusted him your dealings, saying: [Be aware! Do not be neglectful and absent-minded with the dealing that I have entrusted you for I am always with you!] This means that you intend (to remind him) whether he is neglectful or hardworking, you will know for you are (closely) observing him and mindful of your dealing. If this is possible for His creature who knows not of the invisible things, than it is effortless for Him, the Creator Who knows the invisible things."

"Similarly, (the meaning of the remark): [He is everywhere!] is that He knows the occurrence of everything everywhere for He governs

<sup>441</sup> 'Umdat al-Qārī, 5: 484 (No. 1145), 15: 428 (No. 6321); Sunan Abū Dāwūd 4: 234 (No. 4733); 'Aḥdāt al-Aḥwadhī, 13: 29 (No. 3498); Al-Musnad, 1: 123 (No. 7797), 3: 538-9 (No. 10317).

<sup>442</sup> Sūrah al-Mujādalah, 58:7.

<sup>443</sup> Sūrah al-Zukhruf, 43: 84.

knowledge of everything. And how could one justify if he says: is in all places through incarnation!] based on His saying: [(God) st Gracious is firmly established on the throne (of authority)<sup>444</sup>]? is is justified in the verse), which means the dwelling and (further ified) in His saying: [And when you have embarked on the ark, and those with you<sup>445</sup>], which means that you shall dwell.”

id in His saying: [To Him mount.(up) all words of purity and it is Who exalts each deed of righteousness<sup>446</sup>] – how could ething mounts up to Him when He is with (us)? Or how could 1 deed mounts up to Him when it is within Him? And how could angels and the souls ascend to Him on the Day of Resurrection?”

e term عرج (ascend) is synonymous to صعد (ascend or mount up) and it is said:

إذا صعد (When ascended or mounted up) and Allāh Almighty is ذو المعارج (the sessor of the degrees or levels) and المعارج means الدرج (degree, c). What would this level refer to? Towards whom do the angels ge the deeds of man when His higher dwelling is similar to that of lower one?”

a. “If those people retrospect into their natural disposition and r instinctive knowledge of the Creator, integral to their creation, (certainly) will know that Almighty Allāh is the Exalted, lime and Dwells in His Supreme place. And the hearts upon its (remembrance) are inclined towards Him with the hands raised vocation to Him and it is from above that men hope for solace,

*Sūrah Tāhā*, 20:5.

*Sūrah al-Mu'minūn*, 23: 28.

*Sūrah Fāfir*, 37: 10.



provider of assistance and granter of sustenance. And there exists the *kursī*, the throne, the *ḥijāb* (veil) and the angels. Allāh, the Bless and Sublime said: [Indeed those who are in His (Very) presence are not too proud to serve Him, nor are they (ever) weary of His service. They celebrate His praises night and day, and never do they flag.<sup>447</sup> In relation to الشهداء (the martyrs), He said: [They live finding the sustenance in the presence of their Lord<sup>448</sup>]. They are called martyrs because they witnessed the Majestic (Sovereign) of Almighty Allāh. The singular form for martyrs is شهيد (martyr) just like the singular form of عليم (scholar) is علماء (scholars) and for كفيل (surety) is كفيل. And His Almighty said: [If it had been Our wish to take (just) pastime, We should surely have taken it from the things nearest Us, if We would do (such a thing).<sup>449</sup>] This means that if We were to take the wife and children only, We would have taken them with Us and not from you for the wife and the children of a man are near him, within his presence and not with others. All people, Arabs and non-Arabs, say that Almighty Allāh is in heaven. And as long as they are on their natural disposition (the belief remains), and nothing will take this away even knowledge.”

296b. “In a *ḥadīth* (which relates) that a man with his non-Arab (lady) servant approached the Prophet SAAS in order to liberate her. The Prophet SAAS asked her: [Where is Almighty Allāh?] She replied: [In heaven!] And he asked her again: [Who am I?] She replied: [You are the Messenger of Allāh!] He said: [She is a believer!] and requested her master to liberate her.<sup>450</sup> – The

<sup>447</sup> *Sūrah al-Anbiyā*, 21: 19-20.

<sup>448</sup> *Sūrah Āli ‘Imrān*, 3: 169.

<sup>449</sup> *Sūrah al-Anbiyā*, 21: 17.

<sup>450</sup> *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, 7 (No. 33); *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 3: 231 (3284); *Kanz al-Ummāl*, 1: 411 (No. 1744); *Al-Muṣannaf*, 9: 182 (No. 16851).

ending of the narration) is (estimated) as such. And Umayyah ibn bū al-Ṣalt said:

[Glorify Allāh for He is worthy to be glorified

Our Lord in heaven is Great

With the Sublime building that preceded man

He established a throne above the heaven

An immense throne that eyes cannot perceive

You see below it the angels bowing (صوراً)

The plural form of صور is أصور means 'the bending neck.' Likewise, it is said in the ḥadīth: [The carrier of the throne is bent] and whoever carries a heavy thing on his shoulders or hips will have bend his neck (in order to bear the weight). In the authentic al-jīl, al-Masīḥ said: [Do not swear in the name of heaven for it is the throne of Almighty Allāh.<sup>451</sup>] He also said to al-Ḥawāriyyūn: [If you forgive men to mend their offences, your father who is in heaven will so forgive your offences. Look at the birds in the sky for they sow neither harvest (the plant) nor gather (the plant) in the air. It is your heavenly father who feeds them. Are you not worth more than them?<sup>452</sup>] There are numerous similar quotations to quote but this will strengthen the (present) book."

26c. "As for His saying: [It is He Who is God in heaven and God on earth], there is no evidence in (the verse) to prove the idea of incarnation. What (the verse) intends to explain is that (Allāh) is the God in heaven and its inhabitants as well as the God on earth and its

Matthew, 5: 34.

Matthew, 6: 14, 26.

inhabitants. A similar example in the common language is: [He is leader in Khurasān and Miṣr]. This means that his administrat governs both provinces. He stays in one place or the other – this clear and obvious. And if it is said to us: [How (to describe) coming down of Him, the Exalted and Glory?] We said: [We c never define in any way the act of coming down when it conce Him but we can explain the action of coming down when it conce man. Whatever He meant in the expression of this language, it is . Who knows best.”

296d. “The term ‘coming down’ for us has two meanings. One them is to move from one place to another just as if you a ascending from the mountain to the valley or from the rooftop in the house. And the other meaning is to assent something in thought and intentions. Similarly, the related terms (to ‘coming down’) a الهبوط (the descent), الارتقاء (the ascension), البلوغ (the arrival) at المصير (the progress or to become) and the likes.”

“(In relation to) this also, if somebody were to ask you of the locali of the Bedouin without intending to be there, you will say to him [When you arrive (صرت) at such and such a mountain, you descen (انزل) from it, and then turn right and you will come (صرت) to suc and such a valley. You descent (اهبط) towards it and then you tur left. When you arrive (صرت) at such and such a land, mount up th plateau and there, you will find the place.] Here, what you have sai to him is (virtually) in accordance with (your) intention and thought and not through (your) physical (strength). And if somebody said [You avoid from (بلغت) insulting the free man! You were amon (صرت) the Caliph (during) the attack! You came to know (جئت) about the knowledge by (sheer chance)! You sink from (نزلت) being

orally upright to being heinous level.] All of (these remarks) do not indicate bodily movements but intend to achieve something through will power, determination and intention. Similarly, in the saying of His Exalted and Glory: [For God is with those who restrain themselves and those who do good deeds.<sup>453</sup>] (In the verse) He does not intend to mean that He will be with them through incarnation but through His assistance, succor and protection. Likewise, in the saying of Almighty Allāh: [Whoever comes close to Me by a span of an arm, I will come to him by the span of outspread arms and whoever comes to Me walking, I will come to him running.]”

6e. Abū Muḥammad said: “ ‘Abd al-Mun‘im narrated from his father and the latter from Wahb ibn Munabbih that Mūsā heard his name being called from within the bushes: [Take off your sandals!] and he quickly responded (to the order) and remained attentive. He wanted to familiarize himself with the voice and said: [I hear your voice and I feel your whisper but I do not see you! Where are you?] He responded: [I am above you, in front of you, behind you, around you and I am closer to you than yourself.] This means: [I know you better than you know yourself for if you look in front of you, you cannot see what is at your back. If you avert your eyes above, you will lose the knowledge of what is beneath you. But nothing is hidden from me of what you conceal in any circumstances.]”

6e. “In this context, Rābi‘ah al-‘Ābidah said: [Their hearts are distracted from (remembering) Almighty Allāh due to their love of worldly life. If they refrain (themselves) from it, (Allāh) will disclose the Majestic Sovereign and they will receive a (remarkable) benefit (from it).] She does not mean by this (remarks) that their



bodies and their hearts ascend to heaven in an incarnated form but ascend there (to receive the benefits) in the forms of (remarkable ideas, aspiration and attention. Likewise, in the saying of At Maḥdiyyah al-A'rābī: [I looked into the hellfire but I saw the poet vigorously (in the state of) seizure], which means (in the state of) contortion and he said: [The crickets lay vigorously in (the state of) seizure], which means in the state of contortion. Somebody said about the saying of the Prophet: [I looked into paradise and I saw most of its inhabitants were simple people and when I looked into the hellfire, I saw most of its inhabitants were women.<sup>454</sup>] The good interpretation of the term ascension is that it occurs in thought and attention."

## LXXXVII. EXAMPLE OF ḤADĪTH INVALIDATED BY NAZAR

297. They said: "You have narrated from Ḥammād ibn Salamah who narrated from 'Ammār ibn Abū 'Ammār who narrated from Ab Hurayrah and the latter from the Prophet saying that Mūsā has a brawl with the angel of death and blinded one of (the latter's) eyes.<sup>45</sup> If it is possible for the angel of death to be blinded with one eye, it is possible for him to be fully blind. Indeed, 'Īsā ibn Maryam has probably stricken the other eye (of the angel) for he hated death so severely even more so than Mūsā. And ('Īsā) said: [O Lord! If You

<sup>454</sup> *Umdat al-Qārī*, 10: 599 (No. 3241), 14: 171 (No. 5198), 15: 532 (No. 6449), 15: 617 (No. 6546); *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, 26 (No. 94); *Arīḍat al-Aḥwadhī*, 10: 4 (No. 2602), 10: 47 (No. 2603); *Mishkāt al-Maṣābīḥ*, 2: 663 (No. 5234); *Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, 12: 162 (No. 12766), 12: 163 (No. 12767, 12768, 12769), 18: 111 (No. 210), 18: 132 (No. 275), 18: 134 (No. 278).

<sup>455</sup> *Al-Musnad*, 3: 95 (No. 7650).

uld disregard this pouch for one of the people, disregard it for  
[<sup>456</sup>]

8. Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that the chain of narrators of s *ḥadīth* is acceptable to the people of *ḥadīth*. I believe that (this *dūh*) draws its origin from ancient traditions. The interpretation is hentic and no *nazar* could refute it. Our opinion on (this matter) is t the angels are spiritual beings (روحانيون) and الروحاني is linked to r (soul or spirit) and is also allied to disposition (الخلقة). (The gels) exist as spirits (أرواح) without body, invisible to (the naked) es like ours and do not possess humanly bodies like ours. We do t know how Almighty Allāh shaped them for we know the things icht we have seen ourselves and (things which are) visible. ewise, the genie, *shayṭān* and the ghouls are spirits, of which we not know their forms. As of their attributes, we only know what s been described to us by Allāh, the Exalted and Glory and His ophet. Allāh, the Exalted and Glory said: [He, Who made the gels as messengers with wings, two or three or four<sup>457</sup>] and He also d: [He adds to creation as He pleases<sup>458</sup>] which means that He adds the number of wings as He wishes and the like. The Arabs used to l angels as genies for they are not visible to the eyes. In relation to laymān ibn Dāwūd, al-A'shā said:

[He has given a task to a genie among the angels, the ninth number;

Standing (faithfully) before him knowing (they are) without salary.]”

---

*Mathew*, 27: 39; *Luke*, 22: 42.

*Sūrah Fāfir*, 35: 1.

*Sūrah Fāfir*, 35: 1.

298a. "Indeed, Almighty Allāh has endowed the angels the ability to disguise themselves in various forms. The Prophet was visited by Jibrayl under the guise of Dihyah al-Kalbi<sup>459</sup> and a Bedouin. He also saw (the angel in his real form) once, with two wings blocking the horizon. Equally, He created the genie with the ability to disguise itself in various forms as He has done for the angels. Almighty Allāh said: [Then We sent to her Our angel, and he appeared before her as a man in all respects.<sup>460</sup>] It does not mean that (the angel) changes (completely as an ordinary man) as stated (in the verse) but in truth this is only a guise or an appearance to enable them to be perceived by the eyes. In reality, their created natures are of subtle spirits

(أرواح لطيفة) and they are (able to) move through the blood flow and make their way to the hearts. And they may also enter the moist earth and enable themselves to be perceived or not.<sup>461</sup> In relation to Iblīs, Almighty Allāh said: [He and his tribe watch you from a position where you cannot see them<sup>462</sup>], meaning that we cannot see them in their real nature. He also said: [They said: {Why is not an angel sent down to him?} If We did send down an angel the matter would be settled at once and no respite would be granted to them. If We had made it an angel, We should have sent him as a man.<sup>463</sup>] This means: [If We had sent an angel, their senses will not perceive him for they could not perceive the true nature of the angel and therefore, We create him as a man like them so that they are able to see him and understand his words."

<sup>459</sup> *Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, 1: 261 (No. 758).

<sup>460</sup> *Sūrah Maryam*, 19: 17.

<sup>461</sup> See no. 163 of this write up.

<sup>462</sup> *Sūrah al-A'rāf*, 7: 27.

<sup>463</sup> *Sūrah al-An'ām*, 6: 8-9



3b. Ibn ‘Abbās, in relation to the story of *al-Zuhrah* (Venus), mentioned that Almighty Allāh upon the coming down of the two angels to the earth to judge among men, has transformed them into mortal men and instilled in them the desire (for women). Indeed, it is not possible for them to judge men unless they are seen and their words are audible to people as well as they resemble or appear like the latter. As for (the issue of) the angel of death disguising himself as Mūsā – one as an angel of Allāh and the other as the Prophet of Allāh – and that they had a brawl and Mūsā blinded one of (the angel’s) eyes. This eye, however, in truth is sheer resemblance and imagination. The angel of death then reverts to his real spiritual being as if nothing has happened.”

## XXVIII. EXAMPLE OF ḤADĪTH INVALIDATED BY ZAR

1. They said: “You have narrated that ‘Ūj has uprooted a mountain, his strength was of one *parasang*<sup>464</sup> to other *parasang* which was (equivalent to) the armies of Mūsā and (‘Ūj) carried it on his head and threw it on them and it transformed into a necklace and remained so on him until he died. And if he dove into the sea, the water would reach up to his knees. He used to catch fish from the sea and roasted it in the hot sun. When he died, he fell into the river Nile in Egypt and (his body) became the bridge for people for a year (that is for them to walk from one side to the other). And the height of Mūsā was ten forearms and the height of his walking stick was also ten forearms. If one were to leap from the ground to beat him, he could not even reach up to his ankle. They said: [All this is a tall

---

In Arabic – فرسخ or *parasang* refers to a measure of length.



story and not even a reasonable or ignorant person will make mistake about it. How could there be in the day of Mūsā a man who is so different from others? How could it be among the descendents of Ādam, a man of such a contrast to Ādam? How could a human being carry on his head a mountain and his strength is of or *parasang* to other *parasang*?"

300. Abū Muḥammad said: We affirm that this *ḥadīth* is unlikely to have originated from the Prophet SAAS or his companions. It is a narration among the ancient tradition narrated by People of the Book (*ahl al-kitāb*). Some of them heard it from a long time ago and discussed it."

300a. The *ḥadīth* is tarnished and corrupted (which can be seen) from three perspectives. One of them is that the Zanādiqah with the hatred against Islam have fabricated the religion with repulsive and dubious *aḥādīth*, like the *ḥadīth* which we have mentioned earlier related to the sweat of the horse; the visit of the angels; the golden cage on a grey camel with hairy chest; the light of the two forearms and other numerous nonsensical examples, which the people of *ḥadīth* knew very well. Among the (Zanādiqah) were Ibn Abū al-ʿAujāʾ al-Zindīq and Ṣāliḥ ibn ʿAbd al-Quddūs al-Dahrī."

300b. "The second perspective is the (role) of story tellers of the ancient times. They used to attract the attention of the public with reprehensible, peculiar and fictitious *aḥādīth*. The more peculiar (the content was) the bigger the audience the storytellers could attract even if (the content) were illogical. Or the more heartbreaking or tear-jerking (the content could be) the bigger audience would be attracted. If (the story tellers) were to mention paradise, they would (exaggerate their story) saying that there existed virgins, (who see

musk and saffron and (added) that their buttocks (were so big that / extend) from one to another mile. And Almighty Allāh will accommodate His sages palaces made of white pearls. The palace comprises seventy thousands<sup>465</sup> bedrooms and in each bedroom there are seventy thousands domes and in each dome there exists twenty thousand beds and on each bed there exists such and such (a thing). (The story tellers) continuously used seventy thousands (to note) such and such a thing as if they know not of other numbers which are lower and bigger than (seventy thousands). They also said: the least favourite one in the sight of Allāh but occupied in paradise is the one whom Allāh Almighty granted many times over of the life of this worldly life.] The more (frivolous the story was) the more attention (the story tellers) would get and the bigger the circle around them, the more giving hands they would get."

Allāh, the Blessed and the Sublime, has informed us most convincingly about paradise in His Book than any of those storytellers. The truth about paradise is that (the span of) paradise is between the earth and heaven,<sup>466</sup> which means its width. The Arabs use the term السعة (extensive or spacious) to الأرض (the earth) for a thing is اتسع (vast) it becomes عرض (broad or extensive) and they also allude to the term دق (thin) and استطال (long) it becomes ضاق (narrow). And when it is said ضاقت على الأرض العريضة (the vast land has been narrowed), it means the vastness (of the land) or العريضة مذهب في الأرض (there is a passage (snaking) the vast land),

---

Lecomte in his translation said it is sixty thousand (*soixante-dix*) instead of seventy thousand. See *Le Traite*, page 310, number 300b, lines 1, 2, 3 and 4 from the bottom of the page. To my mind this figure is trivial, but for the sake of comparison, it is important.

For example, refer to *Sūrah Āli 'Imrān*, 3: 133.

it means the vastness (of the land). The Prophet said to the defeated armies during the battle of Uḥud: [Indeed, you have left in it a bro<sup>467</sup> (chance), which means its extensiveness (of the chance). At Almighty Allāh said: [...he comes full of دعاء عريض (prolonged prayer)<sup>468</sup>], which means numerous (prayers). When paradise is vast as the span between the earth and heaven, how could Almighty Allāh grant to the least favourite ones many times over the value of their worldly life?"

"To induce the yearning for paradise His Almighty said: [There will be all that the souls could desire, all that the eyes could delight in.<sup>469</sup> And speaking of the ones near to Him, He said: [They will be on thrones encrusted with gold and precious stones, reclining on them facing each other. All around them will be youths of perpetual freshness serving them, with goblets, shining beakers and cups filled with clear-flowing fountains. No aches will they receive there from nor will they suffer intoxication. And with fruits, that they may select, and the flesh of fowls, that they may desire. And there will be companions with beautiful, big and lustrous eyes, like unto pearls well guarded.<sup>470</sup>] As for أصحاب اليمين (the Right Hand Companions) He said: [They will be among lote-tree without thorns, among *ta* trees with flowers or fruits piled one above the other – in a shallow long-extended, by water flowing constantly and fruit in abundance whose season is neither limited nor supply forbidden.<sup>471</sup>] And I said: [Adorned therein with bracelets of gold and pearls and the

<sup>467</sup> *Al-Durr al-Manthūr*, 2: 89; *Al-Maṭālib al-ʿĀliyah*, 4: 218 (No. 4314).

<sup>468</sup> *Sūrah Fuṣṣilat*, 41: 51.

<sup>469</sup> *Sūrah al-Zukhruf*, 43: 71.

<sup>470</sup> *Sūrah al-Wāqīʿah*, 56: 15-23.

<sup>471</sup> *Sūrah al-Wāqīʿah*, 56: 28-33.

ments will be of silk.<sup>472]</sup> There are numerous passages of this ure in the Glorious al-Qur'ān. There is nothing in those passages entioned) in particular that are related to favours granted by Allāh paradise as well as of its eternity, comparable to what man has perienced) in this worldly life and not even by which the rich have oyed.”

describing Ādam (the story tellers) said: [His head reaches the ud or the sky and that is why he suffers from baldness. When he nes down to the earth, he misses (life in) paradise and cries. His s form the sea where ships could navigate through.] As for wūd, (the storytellers) said: [He prostrates to Almighty Allāh for y nights and cries (continuously) until his tears made the grass to w. He then sighs deeply and (this causes) the crops to blaze in .] And speaking of the rod of Mūsā (the story tellers) said: [Its od looks like a palm tree, its peak is as devastating as lightning its holder is such and such!] And Almighty Allāh said: [As if it been a حَيَّة (snake)<sup>473]</sup>, which means an alive snake. In another ance He said: [It was a serpent, plain (for all to see).<sup>474]</sup> In tion to devout people who met Yūnus at Mount Lubnān (the ytellers) said: [One of them performs *rak'ah* (bowing) for a year prostrātes (for a year). He does not eat except during such and a time.] Indeed, in relation to people of the past, Allāh the ssed and the Sublime said: [They were mightier than you in ver and more flourishing in wealth and children<sup>475]</sup> and in (other e), His Almighty said: [And has given him abundantly with

---

*Sūrah al-Hajj*, 22: 23.

*Sūrah al-Naml*, 27: 10.

*Sūrah al-Shu'arā'*, 26: 32.

*Sūrah al-Tawbah*, 9: 69.



knowledge and bodily prowess<sup>476</sup>] and [Did you build a landmark every high place to amuse yourselves? And did you get yourselves fine buildings in the hope of living therein (forever)? And when you exert your strong hand, did you do it like a man of absolute power?<sup>477</sup>] There is nothing in the descriptions of Almighty Allāh about the people of the past that resemble (the storyteller's) exaggerations. We know that they were, indeed, physically taller and stronger than us. However, but the gap between us and them which Allāh has created is not that great for it suits our life spans well as theirs. Ādam, the father of human kind, lived for a thousand years. This was recognized by the historical traditions and found it (stipulated) in al-Tawrāt.<sup>478</sup> Nūḥ subsisted among his people for nine hundreds and fifty years. After Nūḥ the life span of man was shortened except for the one that historical traditions have attributed to Luqmān, the Eagle Man. They said that he lived for seven eagle years. The years are equivalent to two thousand and four hundred years or almost five hundred years. This however, is an ancient story that is unlikely revealed, verified or vindicated by a chain of narrators. This (information) is related by 'Ubayd ibn Shurayyah : Jurhumī and genealogists of his kind. Similarly, (it is said that both the ancient kings of Yamān and Persia have a long life span. Indeed the life span of man contemporary to us is not of great difference from the one between Nūḥ and Ādam, as (exaggerated) by (the storytellers)."

"Abū Ḥātim has narrated from al-Aṣma'ī and the latter from Al-'Amr ibn al-'Alā' stating that al-Mustawghir ibn Rabī'ah and al-

<sup>476</sup> *Sūrah al-Baqarah*, 2: 247.

<sup>477</sup> *Sūrah al-Shu'arā'*, 26: 128-130.

<sup>478</sup> *Genesis*, 5: 5 – Here it informs that Ādam lives for nine hundreds and fifty years.

ndson were chatting when they passed by the market of 'Ukāz. somebody said to Mustawghir: [O Man! Treat him well and he will o treat you well for a long time!] He replied: [Who is he? Is he ur father or your grandfather?] Al-Mustawghir replied: [He – by lāh – is my grandson!] The person said: [By Allāh! I have never n such a man like today and (you are not) Mustawghir ibn bī'ah, aren't you?] He-replied: [Yes! I am Mustawghir!] Abū mr said: [Mustawghir lived for three hundred and twenty years!]"

ū Muḥammad said: "Indeed, Almighty Allāh granted us the sdom to reflect the ancient relics on earth such as buildings istricted in cities and fortresses, passages dug in the heart of the ountain and the flight of steps designed (by the ancient people). As h there is not much disparity between them and us in terms of life n and bodily physique. I have never known a great disparity of dily physique except a story related to me by al-Riyāshī who rated it from Muslim ibn Ibrāhīm who narrated from Nūḥ ibn ys, who then narrated from 'Abd al-Wāḥid ibn Nāfi' saying: [I ve authorized the administrative right to Khālīd ibn 'Abd Allāh to a tax agent and (the latter) came to me with a man (holding) a slar tooth weighing nine pounds. We are unsure whether this tooth longs to a man or camel or elephant]. (In another story) al-Riyāshī d narrated from 'Abd Allāh ibn Muslim who narrated from Anas 1 'Īyād and the latter from Zayd ibn Aslam saying: [A man found a ull of an 'Amāliq hyena and it is rather small (to attribute to man).] omebody) said: [It could be the skull of a camel or other animals t the man who found it presumed that it was a man's skull]. If this ull belongs to a man, the disparity will not be there. This is cause the size of the human skull with other related parts, when it

is empty is rather broad and – it is undeniable – the dimension of the physique of our ancestors (are similar to us) – (probably it is sensible of) what have been said, it could be that the animal skull had lain inside the human skull.”

300c. “The third perspective that leads to a perverted *ḥadīth* is (the role of) the ancient legends which the people of Jāhiliyyah used to narrate. (The legends) resembled (in terms of its content to) the *ḥadīth* related to superstition such as their sayings: [The lizard was a Jew who was ungrateful to his parents and Almighty Allāh transformed him into a lizard]. This is the reason why people used to say: [More ungrateful than the lizard!] The Arabs, however, do not refer (to the remark): [More ungrateful than the lizard!] to mean as (ungrateful to parents) but they refer to it as (ungrateful) because it devours its small ones when it is hungry. The poet said:

[You ate your son just like the lizard so much so that

You left behind a small of your son]

They also said about a hoopoe: [When its mother died, it buried its mother on its own head] and that is why it emits a repulsive smell. Umayyah ibn Abū al-Ṣalt referred to it by saying:

[Mist, darkness and again clouds

The day the hoopoe buried (its mother) and returned

Searching for a place to bury its mother

It erected a grave in its neck and flattened the ground

Cease to bend while walking with the bier ]

They also said that both the rooster and the crow were companions of pleasure. When their drinks had depleted, the crow pawned the

er to the shopkeeper and left and never came back, leaving the  
er as a safe keeping to the shopkeeper. Umayyah ibn Abū al-Ṣalt

[By miracle everything goes up and speaks

The crow betrays the trust of the rooster]

also said that the cat was the result of the sneeze of the lion and  
ig was the result of the sneeze of the elephant and that the prawn  
a tailor who stole thread and was transformed (to prawn).  
larly, the *jirri* (a kind of fish) was a transformed Jew. The  
rk on 'Awj, in our opinion is one of the superstitious *ḥadīth*.  
t is strange about 'Awj is that he is of an extraordinarily height  
lived during the time of Mūsā. And Fir'awn who lived during  
same time, on the contrary, according to al-Ḥasan, was of a  
ler size. Abū Ḥātim or a man near him had narrated from Abū  
l al-Anṣārī al-Naḥwī who narrated from 'Amr ibn 'Ubayd and  
atter from al-Ḥasan saying: [The height of Fir'awn was one yaḥd  
his beard measured (up to) one yard.]”

## **CXIX. EXAMPLE OF CONTRADICTIONARY ḤADĪTH**

They said: “You have narrated from Hammām, who also  
ated from Zayd ibn Aslam, who had narrated from ‘Aṭā’ ibn  
ār and the latter from Sa‘īd al-Khudrī saying that the Prophet  
Ṣ had said: [Do not write anything about me other than al-  
‘ān. Whoever writes anything about me let him delete it.<sup>479</sup>] You

---

*Al-Musnad*, 4: 26 (No. 11085), 4: 43 (No. 11158), 4: 79 (No. 11344), 4: 26  
(No. 11087); *Al-Mustadrak*, 1: 127; *Sunan al-Dārimī*, 1: 119; *Kanz al-  
‘Ummāl*, 10: 221 (No. 29168).



also narrated from Ibn Jurayj who then narrated from 'Aṭā' and the latter from Ibn 'Amr saying: [O Prophet! Should I write down knowledge? He said: {Yes!}<sup>480</sup>] It is said to (the Prophet): [It is necessary to write it down? He replied: {Write it!}] You also narrated from Ḥammad ibn Salamah who narrated from Muḥammad ibn Ishāq who narrated it from 'Amr ibn Shu'ayb and the latter from his father and from his grandfather saying: [O Prophet! Should I write down all that I have heard from you? He replied: {Yes!}. I asked: {Even in the state of consent and anger?} He replied: {Yes! Indeed, in all (situations) I will not say anything except for the truth!}<sup>481</sup>] They said: [There (exist in them) imperfection and contradiction.]”

302. Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that there are two meanings in (the above case). Firstly, it relates to an abrogation of a Sunnah by another Sunnah. It seems that in the beginning, the Prophet had restrained others from writing down his sayings but later upon his observation that the *Sunan* has become too many to be remembered – (it is appropriate) for (the *Sunan*) to be written and documented. Secondly, it relates to the privilege that (the Prophet) intended for 'Abd Allāh ibn 'Amr who reads the ancient books and able to write in Syrian and Arabic. And except for him, the other companions of the Prophet are illiterate. Perhaps, one or two of them are able to write but often with imperfect and incorrect spelling. And fearing that they may commit mistakes in what they write, the Prophet SAAS had restrained them from writing. But when he is assured of (the competency) of 'Abd Allāh ibn 'Amr, he authorized him (to write).”

<sup>480</sup> *Al-Mustadrak*, 1: 106.

<sup>481</sup> *Al-Musnad*, 2: 655 (No. 6947)

ū Muḥammad said: “Ishāq ibn Rāhawayh has narrated from Wahb  
 1 Jarīr who narrated from his father who then narrated from Yūnus  
 1 ‘Ubayd who narrated from al-Ḥasan and the latter from ‘Amr ibn  
 ghlib that the Prophet SAAS said: [Among the several signs of the  
 ur (of the Doomsday) are that wealth will be abundant, calamities  
 1 appear and merchants will gain ground.<sup>482</sup>] ‘Amr said: [If we  
 re to search (and to ask) for a writer in a big city where the  
 rchants are trading (merchandises), (a person) will say: {Wait  
 il I consult the merchant of Banū so and so!}]”

## 2. EXAMPLE OF TWO CONTRADICTORY ḤADĪTH

3. They said: “You have narrated from Ḥammād ibn Salamah who  
 rated from ‘Aṭā’ ibn al-Sā’ib who then narrated from Sa’id ibn  
 ayr and the latter from Ibn ‘Abbās saying: [The *ḥajar al-aswad*  
 ack stone) is from paradise<sup>483</sup> and it was whiter than the snow but  
 sins of the polytheists have blackened it.] They also said that  
 en Ibn al-Ḥanafīyyah was asked about the black stone, he said:  
 deed, it comes from one of our valleys.] They said: [There is a  
 tradition (in these statements). In addition, how could it be  
 ssible for Almighty Allāh to bring down a stone from paradise? Is  
 re such a stone in paradise? If the sins (of the people) that  
 ckened the stone, then it should be whitened by the acceptance of  
 um by people (and thus it should) return to its original state!])”

---

‘The merchants will gain ground’ may be seen in today’s context as globalization of trade. See also *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, 14: 231 (No. 38520); *Al-Durr al-Manthūr*, 2: 144.

*Al-Musnad*, 1: 657 (No. 2796), 1: 705 (No. 3047); *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, 12: 214 (No. 34726); *Kashf al-Khafā*, 1: 417.

304. Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that there is nothing wrong in it if Ibn Ḥanafiyyah disagreed with Ibn ‘Abbās or ‘Alī disagree with ‘Umar, Zayd ibn Thābit and Ibn Mas‘ūd in the (Qur’ānic) exegesis and legal judgments. But it is an abominable act if or narrates wrongly from the Prophet two diverging *ḥadīth* without looking for their interpretations. As for the divergences between such people, there are numerous. Among them are: some practice things according to what they have heard, some follow their own presumption; some strive for their own reasoning. As such, that why they differ in (understanding) the Qur’ānic exegesis and most of the legal judgments. Nevertheless, Ibn ‘Abbās could only report of the black stone based on what he has heard and nothing else is more acceptable than that. It is ludicrous for him to speak of his reasoning that it was formerly white and that it came from paradise. As for Ibn al-Ḥanafiyyah, he had said it based on his presumption. He viewed it as it was (one of the) parts of the groundwork of al-Bayt (the Ka‘bal) and judged that (the black stone) had been taken (from the same place) just like other parts that (came from the same place).”

304a. “The narration (of the *ḥadīth*) confirms the saying of Ibn ‘Abbās that the black stone is from paradise. There are numerous (*ḥadīth* related to it) and among them are: [It will come on the Day of Resurrection], [It is the tongue and two lips], [It will sincerely testify in favour of those who kiss it], [It is the right (side) of Almighty Allāh on earth] and [with which (Allāh) greets to whom He wishes among His creatures.] Indeed, we have mentioned this (*ḥadīth*), for example: the remarks of Wahb ibn Munabbih: [It was a white pebble but was blackened by the polytheists].”



4b. "As for their saying: [Is there such a stone in paradise?] Why could one deny that there is such a stone in paradise when in it, there are rubies, which are stones, emeralds also stone and gold and silver, which are (minerals consist of) stones? Why should one deny that (there is such a stone) preferred by Almighty Allāh so that it will be touched and kissed (by people)? Indeed, Almighty Allāh has rewarded His servants with all the deeds and (all the) words (of oration) that please Him. He also gave preference to certain things that He has created, over the others. For example the night of *qadr* is better than a thousand months, when there is no such thing as the night of *qadr*,<sup>484</sup> the heaven is better than the earth, the *kursī* is better than the heaven, the *'arsh* (the throne) is better than the *kursī*, al-Masjid al-Haram is better than al-Masjid al-Aqṣā and al-Shām (Syria) is better than al-'Irāq. All these are plain examples of preferences and not due to a particular fact that is inherent in a deed or not due to a particular act of submission. Similarly, (they also said that) the black stone is better than the *al-rukn al-yamānī* (the angle of the yamānī of the Ka'bah). And *al-rukn al-yamānī* is better than the other angles in the House (of Allāh). The Masjid al-Haram is better than other sacred places and those sacred places are better than the Ṭamāh hills."

4c. "And as for their remarks: [If the sins (of people) blackened the black stone, then it should be whitened by the acceptance of Islam by people], why should one compel that it must be whitened because of

---

This remark should not be misconstrued. What Ibn Qutaybah is highlighting is the issue of time that is the "one moment of enlightenment" granted to anybody Allāh wishes. Indeed, this moment of enlightenment worth more than one thousand months. Refer to *Surāt al-Qadr*, 97: 1-5.



people's acceptance of Islam? If Almighty Allāh had wanted it, He would have done it without any compulsion."

"In brief, these people are among the proponents of *qiyās* (analogy and *falsafah* (philosophy). How could they overlook the fact that the black colour can stain others but it cannot be stained by others and that white color can be stained but it cannot stain others?"

### **XCI. EXAMPLE OF CONTRADICTORY ḤADĪTH**

305. They said: "You have narrated that the Prophet said: [I have nothing to do with jester and jester has nothing to do with me!] And 'Abd Allāh ibn 'Amr said to him: [Should I write everything that I have heard from you, whether you are content or angry?] He replied [Yes! Indeed, in all (situations) I will not say anything except the truth!] They also said: [You have narrated that (the Prophet) loved to joke! Indeed, he leaped on a man from behind and placed his hands on the man's eyes and (jokingly) said: {Who wants to buy this slave from me?}<sup>485</sup> (In one instance), he stood in front of an Abyssinian delegation and watched them dancing and he also watched the people of *Diraklah* playing (games). And often times he competed in (horse riding) with 'Ā'ishah and at one time she arrived first and at other times he was the first.]"

306. Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that Almighty Allāh sends His Prophet SAAS with the true and tolerant religion. He liberated him and his *ummah* from the covenant and responsibilities that paralyzed the progeny of Isrā'īl in (realizing) their religion. This is the grace that He granted to (Prophet Muḥammad and his *ummah*) for

<sup>485</sup> *Mawārid*, 2: 1027 (No. 2276).

ich they must be grateful. There is no man who has a similar character except that it is opposite to each other. Some people are idle and some are impulsive, some are coward and some are brave, some are modest and some are pompous, some are cheerful and some gloomy.”

5a. “In al-Tawrāt Almighty Allāh says: [When I created Ādam, I created his body the humidity, dryness, heat and coldness. Indeed, I created him from earth and water. Then, I infused in him the self or *al-nafs* (النفس) and spirit (*al-ruh*) (الروح). The dryness of any created body comes from the earth, the humidity from the water, the heat from the soul and the coldness from the spirit. From the soul (it generates) diversity, deftness, passion, pleasure, sport, amusement, impudence, deception, harshness and violation. From the spirit (it generates) gentleness, dignity, kindness, humbleness, intelligence, generosity, modesty and patience. Don’t you see that sport and pleasure are parts of man’s natural disposition? Can this disposition be controlled? If a man controls it by dominating the self and suppresses its emergence, it will not be long before he returns to his own nature. It is said that nature is the supreme ruler and the poet said:

[Whoever undertakes what is not in the nature of his soul

Will have to give up for the nature of his soul will take over]

The other poet said:

[O you who embellish yourself in your non-innate nature

When in your temperament there are hypocrisy and flattery

Return to your character familiar and innate to you

Indeed the character refused to be reformed.]

Another poet said:

[Every man will one day come back to his innate nature  
Even if he creates himself a particular behavior at one time]

Al-Riyāshī said:

[Do not befriend a man due to his noble ancestry  
I noted that noble ancestry is indeed extraneous  
What is the gain when it is said that  
He has a noble father in the past generation  
But befriend a man for his innate quality  
For all soul will leave according to their innate nature.]”

306b. “Allāh the Glory and Exalted said: [Truly man was created very impatient, fretful when evil touches him and niggardly when good reaches<sup>486</sup>], and His Almighty also said: [Man is a creature of haste.<sup>487</sup>]”

“People used to emulate the Prophet’s conduct and behaviour for Almighty Allāh said: [We have indeed in the Prophet of Allāh a beautiful pattern (of conduct).<sup>488</sup>] If the Prophet has abandoned the means of gaiety, kindness and serenity but adopted frown, austerity and sternness, people will emulate the same conduct themselves. They are thus, going against their own nature that is full of miseries and difficulties. But if the Prophet SAAS (loved to) joke, they will do the same. He also stopped nearby the people of *diraklah* while they were playing (a game) and said: [Go ahead O Son of

<sup>486</sup> *Sūrah al-Ma‘ārīj*, 70: 19-21.

<sup>487</sup> *Sūrah al-Anbiyā’*, 21: 37.

<sup>488</sup> *Sūrah al-Aḥzāb*, 33: 21.

radah!<sup>489</sup>] This is for (the purpose) of informing the Jews that our religion is of a wider scope for action. He also (encouraged us to st) wedding ceremonies and banquets (for the purpose) of forming the public of the marriage as well as expressing happiness.”

5c. “As for the remarks: [I have nothing to do with الله (jester) and ter has nothing to do with me!] The term الله is synonymous to الله (measure) and الباطل (falsehood). Although (the Prophet SAAS used joke but he would never say anything except the truth. If he said truth even in jest, then the joke would hardly be a jest or a falsehood. (For example), he said to an old lady: [Indeed, paradise is not welcome old ladies.<sup>490</sup>] He intended to say that the old ladies could be young again. He also said to the other (lady): [Your spouse I have white spots in his.] He intended to mean that the white part of the eyes around the iris but she thought that it was above the white part in the iris. And when he surprised a man from behind saying: [Who wants to buy this slave from me?] he meant (the person) as the slave of Allāh. Praise be to Almighty Allāh for His grace – the religion of Allāh is easy, free from restriction and (it advocates) the right action is the one that is lasting even though it is done in parts (not consistently).”

5d. Abū Muḥammad said: “Al-Ziyādī narrated from ‘Abd al-‘Azīz Durrāwardī who narrated from Muḥammad ibn Ṭaḥlā who narrated from Abū Salamah ibn ‘Abd al-Raḥmān and the latter from ‘Ishah informing that the Prophet SAAS said: [Take upon yourself

*Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, 14: 215 (No. 40617); *Al-Maṭālib al-‘Āliyah*, 3: 30 (No. 2793); Abū Muḥammad ‘Abd al-Raḥmān al-Rāzī ibn Ḥātim al-Rāzī, *‘Ilal al-Ḥadīth*, (Bayrūt, 1985), 2: 297 (No. 2400), hereafter cited as *‘Ilal al-Ḥadīth*. *Majma’ al-Zawā’id*, 10: 560 (No. 18764).



the work which you are capable of (doing it) for Allāh never become weary before you become weary yourself and indeed the best of work is the one which is most lasting even though it is done in parts (but consistently).<sup>491</sup>] And Muḥammad ibn Yaḥyā al-Qaṭ'ī said that he narrated from 'Umar ibn 'Alī ibn Muqaddam who had narrated from Ma'n al-Ghifārī who narrated from al-Maqbārī and the latter from Abū Hurayrah informing that the Prophet SAAS said: [Indeed, the religion is easy, nobody can attack it without being defeated; therefore lead others, be kind and rejoice (in good news).<sup>492</sup> Muḥammad ibn 'Ubayd has narrated from Mu'āwiyah ibn 'Amr who narrated from Abū Ishāq who narrated from Khālīd al-Ḥadhdhā' who narrated from Abū Qilābah and the latter from Muslim ibn Yazīr informing that a group of Ash'arite were on their journey and upon their arrival, (they met) the Prophet SAAS and said: [O Prophet (of Allāh! Apart from the Prophet of Allāh, we have never seen an outstanding man more than so and so who, fast the whole day. When we arrive (here, we saw him) performing prayer and even when we resume our journey (he was still in his prayer). (The Prophet SAAS said: [Who feeds him? Who supports his needs? Who works for him?] They (answered): [We do!]) (The Prophet) said: [All of you are far better than him!]]"

306e. "Indeed, the sages and the pious lived in accordance to the behaviour of the Prophet SAAS like smiling, being jovial, and joking with words that are far from malicious gossip, insult or lies. Indeed 'Alī took pleasure in many jokes and Ibn Sīrīn used to laugh to the point of crying. Jarīr said about al-Farazdaq (in a poem):

<sup>491</sup> *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 2: 1417 (No. 3240); *Al-Musnad*, 9: 326 (No. 2437 25529).

<sup>492</sup> *Umdat al-Qārī*, 1: 349 (No. 39); *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 3: 35 (No. 5343).

[Indeed, the wife of al-Farazdaq rebelled against him

If she is satisfied with his (lovmaking) she will calm down!]

Farazdaq responded to the poem of Ibn Jarīr:

[I learned that the young lady whom I married

Her leg is like a long fasting month

Her teeth are one hundred or extra one

The rest of her body is worthless.]

an asked (the Prophet SAAS) about Hishām ibn Ḥasan and he  
ed: [He passed away, don't you know?] The man felt sad and  
t (the Prophet) saw that he was sad he recited: [It is Allāh, Who  
the souls (of men) at death and those that die not (He takes),  
g their sleep.<sup>493</sup>] Zayd ibn Thābit was a serious man when he

outside his house but the funniest man in private. Abū al-Dardā'

[I will never repose my soul in futility for fear of sapping it by  
ng it with serious things. Shurayḥ used to joke in the court of  
udge. Al-Sha'bī was a humorous man and so was Ṣuhayb and  
al-'Alīyah. All of these men, when joking will never create any  
lal. They would neither insult others nor create ill feeling or  
t others. The only reprehensible jokes (done by them) were  
t related to certain defects about themselves."

"As for entertainment, there is nothing unusual during banquet  
ions). The Prophet said: [Publicize the marriage ceremony and  
the play of *ghirbāl* (tambourine).<sup>494</sup>]"

---

*Sūrah al-Zumar*, 39: 42.

*ʿAridat al-Aḥwadhī*, 4: 246 (No. 1089); *Sunqn al-Bayhaqī*, 7: 473 (No. 14698, 14699); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 1: 611 (No. 1895).

Abū Muḥammad said: "Abū al-Khaṭṭāb has narrated from Muslin ibn Qutaybah who narrated from Shurayk who narrated from Jābi and the latter from 'Ikrimah who informed that Ibn 'Abbās on the occasion of the circumcision of his son, has sent me ('Ikrimah) to search for musicians. They played (the music) and he gave them four *dirham*. Abū Ḥātim has narrated from al-Aṣma'ī who narrated from Ibn Abū al-Zunnād and the latter from his father saying: [I said to Khārijah ibn Zayd: Could you sing for wedding ceremonies?] - He replied: [This happens but the song was not devoid of excessiveness (behaviour) like today!] Our uncles of Banū Nabīṭ invited us to their house for an (ceremonial) occasion and Ḥassān ibn Thābit and his son, 'Abd al-Raḥmān were also present. Then two female slave started to sing:

[Look O my friend at the door of Giliq!

Is she having other companion apart from al-Balqā']

Then Ḥassān, a blind man started to cry and 'Abd al-Raḥman showed them the sign to continue. I am unsure of what had amazed him so much that made him be in tears."

"Abū Ḥātim had narrated from al-Aṣma'ī saying that Ṭuways was singing in a wedding ceremony. When the bridegroom, al-Nu'mān ibn Bashīr entered Ṭuways said:

[Is the disdain of 'Amrah so serious that

She is avoiding us or is her problem our problem too?]

And 'Amrah was the mother of al-Nu'mān and somebody said to (Ṭuways): [Shut up!] But al-Nu'mān replied: [He means no harm. Indeed, the (poet) said:

[‘Amrah is of noble ladies

Her sleeves emit a smell of musk.]”

## II. EXAMPLE OF CONTRADICTIONARY ḤADĪTH

1. They said: “The Prophet SAAS said: [Indeed, Allāh loves the modest, shy and chaste people and He loathes a man who frequently) exaggerates.<sup>495</sup>] They also said that al-‘Abbās had asked the Prophet SAAS: [What is beauty?] He said: [It (resides in) the face.] He added: [Verily, some explanation/speech (*bayān*) is needed, a magic!<sup>496</sup>] Indeed, Allāh the Exalted and Glory said: [He created man. He has taught him *bayān* (speech and intelligence).<sup>497</sup>] He, therefore, conceded *bayān* as favour enumerated to man). He also attributed less eloquent (in language) to women saying: [Is then one brought up among trinkets and unable to give a clear account in a dispute (to be associated with Allāh).<sup>498</sup>] This passage proved that women are less proficient (than man) because of their unclear *bayān* (explanation). All of these passages are contradictory (to each other).”

2. Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that – by the grace of Almighty Allāh – there is no contradiction (among the passages). Each of (the passage) has its own setting. If it is applied according to its own setting, there will be no contradiction. As for (the Prophet’s) saying: [Indeed, Allāh loves the modest, shy and chaste people], he means to refer to a good-natured person who speaks (when

---

*Al-Muʿjam al-Kabīr*, 10: 196 (No. 10442).

*Al-Muʿjam al-Kabīr*, 10: 196 (No. 10442).

*Sūrah al-Raḥmān*, 55: 3-4.

*Sūrah al-Zukhruf*, 43: 18.



necessary) and is satisfied with a few needs due to great self-control. This is proven for the statements, which ensued later that He disliked the impudent, gossippu and over-ambitious person. All of these (characters) are contrary to the earlier (remarks). And praised be to Allāh for He loathes His servant, who takes pleasure in violent disputes, who is a big mouth and who deceives others by his pretenses. However, in certain circumstances, (these characters) can be of beneficial and brilliant façades.”

“In a *ḥadīth*: [Most of the inhabitants of paradise are simple people<sup>499</sup>] meaning the kind of people whose hearts are pure and honest. We recite a song of al-Namir ibn Tawlab:

[I took advantage of an innocent young girl

Who allows me to guess her secret.]”

308a. “In relation to our time, ‘Alī said: [The best of people during that time are the *nūmah* (sleep) meaning people who are unable to do any harm (*māyit al-dā*). Those are the leaders to the straight path, who enlighten the knowledge and are not impulsive to spread seed (of sin) everywhere. Mu‘ādh ibn Jabal has narrated from the Prophet SAAS who said: [Indeed, Allāh loves discreet, pious and righteous people whom nobody realizes when absent and nobody knows when at hand.<sup>500</sup>] In his sermon, ‘Alī said: [In truth Allāh has servants of whom (we could say that they have) the vision of men who enjoy eternally (life) in paradise and men who are tortured in hell fire. Those people are spared from mischief, their hearts are grieve-stricken, their souls are pure, their needs are modest, their patience

<sup>499</sup> *Majma’ al-Zawā’id*, 10: 335 (No. 17914), 10: 536 (No. 18674); *Kashf al-Khufā*, 1: 186; *Kanz al-’Ummāl*, 14: 467 (No. 39283).

<sup>500</sup> *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 2: 1321 (No. 3989); *Al-Targhīb*, 1: 68.

ified day by day (hopeful) for a long rest. At night time, their feet in row and their tears freely flow on the cheeks due to their best prayer to their Lord (saying): [Our Lord! Our Lord!] During day they are great scholars, righteous and strong as if they are (flying) arrows. When a person looks at them, he will say: [They are sick! But they are not sick! They are worried with the great (pressing) problems of the masses.]”

b. “In relation to a young man who spoke to Prophet Ayyūb during his trial, Ibn ‘Abbās reported: [O Ayyūb! Don’t you know that Allāh has servants who remain silent out of fear to Allāh? It is not that they are unable to speak or are dumb, but they are noble people, eloquent and are knowledgeable in Allāh, the Glorious and Exalted, and the Most Gracious. When they speak of the majesty of the Almighty Allāh, their hearts are deeply affected, their tongues speechless and their limbs numb out of fear and respect of Allāh, the Glorious and Exalted.]”

c. “Such are the virtues that Allāh, the Glorious and Exalted, loves and these constitute success in the hereafter. Nobody denies – in this world that there may be beauty in language or that there may be a sense of eloquence or in (giving) clear explanations or that there may be one of the ornaments in earthly life or beauty among the splendid (things). However, as long as (those words appear) in moderation, vindicated by reason, (they are acceptable) for the ability to speak does not constitute denouncing what is great in the view of Almighty Allāh or condemning what is petty or defending a wrong cause as practiced by the irreligious people. Such are (the examples) of an exaggerated (praise) loathed by Allāh, the Glorious and Exalted and about whom the Prophet said in his (*ḥadīth*): [Those among you whom I dislike most

are the big mouth, chatterer and loud-mouthed.<sup>501</sup> And the people whom Almighty Allāh dislikes most are those whom other people dread due their (hurtful) language.] (When the Prophet said): [Expressive language comes from magic], he means to say that (magic) is able to bring closer what is far apart or otherwise, to embellish what is ugly and to extol what is petty. Whatever related to magic or similar to it or resulted from it is a reprehensible (act) for magic is forbidden.”

308d. Abū Muḥammad said that Ḥusayn ibn al-Ḥasan al-Marwazī had narrated from ‘Abd Allāh ibn al-Mubārak who narrated from Mu‘ammar from Yaḥyā ibn al-Mukhtār and the latter from al-Ḥasan saying: “If you wish to find (a man of) clear and pure skin but sharp eyes, callous heart and (evil) act, you are able to see him better than himself. You will see a body without a heart and you will hear only the voice. There is no kindness that the tongue can express and there is only a barren heart.”

### **XCIII. EXAMPLE OF *HADĪTH* INVALIDATED BY AL-QUR’ĀN**

309. They said: “You have narrated that the Prophet SAAS said: [We – the Prophets – do not bequest any inheritance.<sup>502</sup> ] This, however, contradicts the saying of Allāh, the Exalted and Glory, that relates to the story of Zakariyyā: [Now, I fear (what) my relatives (and colleagues will do) after me; but my wife is barren, so give me an heir as from Yourself (one who) will (truly) represent me and represent the posterity of Ya‘qūb and make him, O my Lord! One

<sup>501</sup> *Mawārid*, 2: 857 (No. 1917).

<sup>502</sup> *Al-Musnad*, 3: 490 (No. 9979).

whom You are well-pleased! (His prayer was answered): {O *riyyā*! We give you good news of a son, his name shall be *yā*, on none by that name have We conferred distinction re.} <sup>503</sup>] (The above *ḥadīth* also) contradicts the saying of His ted and Glory: [And Sulaymān was *Dāwūd*'s heir. <sup>504</sup>] They also [Indeed, Fāṭimah claimed from Abū Bakr her inheritance of her r, the Prophet SAAS. When he did not grant her, she swore that will never speak to him forever and (upon her death) she ested to be buried at night so that he will not attend her ral. <sup>505</sup>] This (request finally) became a reality. (Indeed), both and al-'Abbās, in relation to that inheritance also disagreed with Bakr."

Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that the saying of the het SAAS: [We – the Prophets – do not bequest any inheritance] not contradict the verses related to Zakariyyā: [So give me an as from Yourself (one who) will (truly) represent me and esent the posterity of Ya'qūb]. This is because Zakariyyā does equest (from Allāh a son) who will inherit his properties, (or else would have) justified the allegation of (the oppositionists). What erty does Zakariyyā own for him to spare on to the point that he ested from Almighty Allāh to grant him a son so as to inherit ething) from him? If he owned properties and with his itual) intensity, would all those properties be highly appreciated him? Would he pursue properties (acquisition) like any other nary people who work hard for it? Indeed, Zakariyyā ibn Ādhān a carpenter (but at the same time) a learned religious scholar.

---

*Sūrah Maryam*, 19: 5-7.

*Sūrah al-Naml*, 27: 16.

*Umdat al-Qārī*, 11: 542 (No. 3711).



Wahb ibn Munabbih said that these qualities prove that he owned no wealth. Likewise, it was widely known that Zakariyyā did not bequest any properties to both Yaḥyā and ʿĪsā. There was no house for them to seek shelter and indeed both of them were vagabonds. Another proof that (Zakariyyā) does not bequest any property to Yaḥyā is that the latter arrived in Bayt al-Maqdis when he was merely a small boy and served there (for his living). Then finding himself in a great danger, he wandered around and settled in an inaccessible cave at the peak of a mountain.”

310a. Abū Muḥammad stated that al-Layth ibn Sa’d had narrated from Ibn Luhay’ah who narrated from Abū Qubayl and the latter from ‘Abd Allāh ibn ‘Amr ibn al-ʿĀṣ said: “Yaḥyā ibn Zakariyyā arrived at Bayt al-Maqdis at the age of eight. There he saw the idolaters wearing chemise made of bristles with woolen hooded cloak. He also saw people who spent the night in prayer and have themselves tied to the chains that were attached to the arcs of (the temple). Fear overcame him and he ran to his parents. When he passed by (a group of) small children who were playing, they said (to him): [O Yaḥyā! Let’s play!] And he replied: [Indeed, I am not created to play!] And the saying of the Almighty (proved this): [And We gave him wisdom even as a youth.<sup>506</sup>] He then returned to his parents and requested them to put on him chemise made of bristles and they did for him. Subsequently he went back to Bayt al-Maqdis where he worked during the day and prayed during the night until he reached the age of fifteen. It was at this time that finding himself in a great danger he wandered around and settled in an inaccessible cave at the peak of a mountain. His parents searched for him and they

nd him while they were descending from Mount al-Bathanīyyah  
r Jordan Lake. He was sitting at the bank of the lake, soaking his  
s in the water and was almost dying from thirst. He then said: [By  
ur majesty! I shall not taste any cold drink unless I know where I  
ad in your (estimation)!] His parents asked him to eat pancake  
de from barley that they have with them and to drink some water.

then complied but broke his oath. Despite that Allāh the  
nighty, praised him for his righteousness, saying: [And kind to his  
ents and he was not overbearing or rebellious.<sup>507</sup>] Then his parents  
ught him back to Bayt al-Maqdis. Whenever he performed his  
yer, he would cry and Zakariyyā would cry with him until he  
ame unconscious. He was continuously behaving as such until  
tears looked like lines on his cheeks. His mother said to him: [O  
hyā, if you allow me, I will put powder to cover the lines on your  
eks!] He agreed and (his mother) took two pieces of soft cotton  
l pasted on his cheeks. When he cried the tears will flow on the  
ton pieces and his mother would come and squeeze off the tear.  
d the time he saw the tears dripping on the arms of his mother, he  
d: [Lord! Here are my tears! Here is my mother! I am your servant  
d You are the Merciful One!]"

0b. "As such, which properties that you have heard Yaḥyā has  
erited from? Which property does Zakariyyā bequeathed to him?  
leed, he was a carpenter (but at the same time) a learned religious  
olar. In relation to the saying of The Exalted and the Glory: [So  
ve me an heir as from Yourself (one who) will (truly) represent  
:], Ibn 'Abbās said in a report of which Abū Ṣāliḥ had narrated  
m him, that (the term) inherited here means inherited the (spirit) of

---

*Sūrah Maryam*, 19: 14.

the learned religious scholar since his father was a learned religious scholar. And (the verse): [And represent the posterity of Ya'qūb] (Ibr 'Abbās said it) means inherited the noble (position) since he was the descendent of Dāwūd who was also the descendent of Yahūdḥā ibn Ya'qūb ibn Iṣḥāq ibn Ibrāhīm. And Allāh, the Exalted and Glory has answered his prayer related to (his posterity) to inherit the role of a learned religious scholar and not concern about the inheritance of the nobility. Zakariyyā disliked his male relatives to inherit that role and prayed to Almighty Allāh to grant him a son to resume his role and inherit his knowledge. Allāh, the Exalted and Glory said: [And (remember) Zakariyyā when he cried to his Lord: {O my Lord! Leave me not without offspring for You are the best inheritors.} So We listened to him and We granted him Yahyā. We cured his wife's (barrenness) for him.<sup>508</sup>"]

310c. "As for His saying: [And Sulaymān was *Dāwūd's* heir], He meant it as the nobility, prophecy and knowledge. And both of them were Prophets and kings. (The term) nobility means sovereign justice, government and not properties (or wealth). If He were to refer to inheritance of properties, this new would render it meaningless for people know well that sons will inherit the properties of their fathers. However, they do not know whether all sons are worthy of their fathers' knowledge, nobility and prophecy. This also proves that the Prophet could not bequeath (anything) for he himself does not enjoy any inheritance after the revelation from Almighty Allāh as his forefathers had enjoyed their inheritance before the revelation."

<sup>508</sup> *Sūrah al-Anbiyā'*, 21: 89-90.

Id. "Abū Muḥammad said that Zayd ibn Akhzam al-Ṭā'ī has rated from 'Abd Allāh ibn Dāwūd saying that Umm Aymān was one of (the inheritors including) the Prophet SAAS from his maternal side as well as one of (the inheritors including) Shuqrān from his paternal side. How could the Prophet SAAS have his inheritance when he heard Allāh the Exalted and Glory accused people, as in the saying: [Nay! Nay! But you honour not the orphans, nor do you encourage one another to feed the poor and you devour inheritance with greed and you love wealth with inordinate love.<sup>509</sup>] According to Iṣḥāq ibn Rāhawayh, Wakī' has narrated from Mis'ar bin Mardiyah who narrated from 'Abd al-Raḥman ibn al-Aṣḥabānī who narrated from Mujāhid ibn Wirdān who narrated from 'Urwah ibn al-Zubayr and the latter from 'Ā'ishah saying that the Prophet intervened in the distribution of the inheritance of the then master (of a freed slave) who fell from a palm (tree and died). The Prophet SAAS asked: [Does he have a son?] They replied: [No!] He asked: [Does he have next of kin?] They replied: [No!] He said: [Then give to a man of his village.<sup>510</sup>] Here, it seems that the Prophet SAAS is evading from the inheritance but giving preference to a man of (the deceased) village."

As for the disagreement between Fāṭimah and Abū Bakr concerning the inheritance of the Prophet SAAS, it is not objectionable. This is because she does not know what her father had said and she thought that she would inherit from him just like any other children who inherit from their fathers. But when (Abū Bakr) informed her of the saying of (the Prophet) she renounced (her claim)."

<sup>509</sup> *Sūrah al-Fajr*, 88: 17-20.

<sup>510</sup> *Al-Musnad*, 9: 533 (No. 25475); *Mushkil al-Āḥādīth*, 1: 426



310e. "How can one imagine that Abū Bakr could have deprived Fāṭimah of her right of inheritance from her father when he always granted the rights of the Arab and the non-Arab. What would be his purpose of depriving her (of her right) when he does not even have it for himself or for his children or his next of kin? What he did was to give it as alms for granting the rights to the beholders became his priority. How could he have committed mistakes such as depriving the right of Fāṭimah, when he returned the surplus properties that remained in his hands to the Muslims, since he held the (reign of) office? He only took a (portion of the properties) as his salary and considered their maintenance as (part of) alms that were due to him. He said to 'Ā'ishah: [Look O my daughter! Where is the surplus from the property of Abū Bakr since he holds office and he (never fails) to grant the rights of the Muslims? By Allāh! We barely take from those properties for our necessities that are coarsely ground cereals, and our clothing is among the coarse ones.] She looked (around) and found an old blanket that was hardly worth five *dirham*. When a messenger met 'Umar, he said: [May Allāh has mercy on Abū Bakr! Indeed, he has entrusted (numerous tasks) on his successors.] If the decision made by Abū Bakr (related to the inheritance) of Fāṭimah was unjust, 'Alī has made preparation to return to the children of Fāṭimah when he assumed office."

310f. "As for the (so called) dispute between Abū Bakr and both 'Alī and al-'Abbās concerning the inheritance of the Prophet, there is doubt in it. Why would they dispute on a thing which is unbeneficial to them or demanding the right to a thing which is forbidden to them? If the inheritance is bequeathed, both of them will not be denied for they have some rights to that inheritance upon (the allotment) of one-eighth portion to (the Prophet's) wives. 'Alī would have received a

portion (of the inheritance) due to the rights of Fāṭimah, al-  
 ḥās would have received another half portion while Fāṭimah  
 ld have received the other half portion. Therefore, on what basis  
 ld both of them dispute? If they were to dispute with Abū Bakr  
 , they would have to dispute with ‘Umar as well as (Abū Bakr)  
 entrusted (‘Umar the management of that) inheritance and so also  
 on, with ‘Uthmān. (One has to properly study) this polemic  
 i its own perspectives and reasons. May Allāh have mercy on all  
 em!”

## V. EXAMPLE OF CONTRADICTIONARY *HADĪTH*

They said: “You have narrated from the Prophet that he has  
 : [There is no suckling after weaning.<sup>511</sup>] He also said: [Look out  
 your brothers! Indeed suckling can only be established for  
 tious (purpose).<sup>512</sup>] This means that (the reason behind) the  
 ling of a child is to keep him from hunger. You also reported  
 Ibn ‘Uyaynah has narrated from ‘Abd al-Raḥman ibn al-Qāsim  
 narrated from his father and the latter from ‘Ā’ishah that Sahlah  
 Suhayl ibn ‘Amr met the Prophet SAAS and said: [I saw  
 tempt’ on the face of Abū Ḥudhayfah when Sālim entered my  
 e.] He replied: [Suckle him!] She (exclaimed): [Suckle him? He  
 matured man!] He laughed and then said: [Am I not the one who

---

*Sunan al-Bayhaqī*, 7: 524 (No. 14881), 7: 759 (No. 15657); *Al-Maṭālib al-*  
*‘Āliyah*, 2: 79 (No. 1707); *Al-Muṣannaf*, 4: 465 (No. 13908), 6: 416 (No.  
 11450), 7: 464 (No. 13897, 13898, 13900-13901); *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, 6: 109  
 (No. 15054), 6: 274 (No. 15679).

*‘Umdat al-Qārī*, 47: 14 (No. 5102); *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, 8 (No. 32); *Sunan Abū*  
*Dāwūd*, 2: 222 (No. 3058); *Al-Musnad*, 9: 386 (No. 24686), 9: 532 (No.  
 25473), 10: 34 (No. 25838); *Sunan al-Dārimī*, 2: 158; *Mishkāt al-Maṣābiḥ*,  
 2: 177 (No. 3168); *Sunan al-Bayhaqī*, 7: 752 (No. 15633).

knows most that he is a matured man?<sup>513</sup>] They also said that Mālik has narrated from al-Zuhri that 'Ā'ishah has given a legal opinion on suckling that it was forbidden upon (the age of) weaning. She concluded (this opinion) based on the *ḥadīth* of Sālim. They said: [For you, this (chain of narrators) is authentic, and could not be refuted or rejected.]”

312. Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that the *ḥadīth* is authentic. And indeed Umm Salamah and the other wives of the Prophet said that the Prophet SAAS has a soft spot for Sālim. However, they do not explain in which part the Prophet has granted that favour on Sālim. We will explain the story between Abū Ḥudhayfah and Sālim as well as the link between them, if Allāh permits. Abū Ḥudhayfah was the son of 'Utbah ibn Rabī'ah ibn 'Abd Shams ibn 'Abd Manāf and he emigrated to Abyssinia during the two emigrations. He has a son, Muḥammad ibn Abū Ḥudhayfah who was killed in the battle of al-Yamāmah, during the reign of Abū Bakr. He had no other descendant. As for Sālim, he was the slave of Abū Ḥudhayfah. He was in Badr and befriended the Prophet and Abū Bakr. He was a good and virtuous man. That was the reason why 'Umar, upon his deathbed said: [If Sālim was alive, I would have no doubt whatsoever against him!] Here, ('Umar) meant to say: [I would have him to lead the prayer for the masses until the advisory councils have elected a person among them] and later they elected Ṣuhayb. Sālim was once a slave of the Anṣarite wife of Abū Ḥudhayfah. There were some disputes on her name. Some of them said that she was Salmā from Banū Khaṭmah and others said that she was Thubaytah. They, however, agreed that she was an Anṣarite. She then freed (Sālim)

513

*Al-Musnad*, 9: 285 (No. 24163).

o became the *mawlā* of Abū Ḥudhayfah who adopted him as a son. Later, he was connected to (Abū Ḥudhayfah) genealogically by the status of *mawlā*. Sālim was a martyr in the battle of al-māmah. (Thubaytah) who freed him has inherited (his properties) and he has neither descendant nor heir except her.”

What I have just said proved that both Abū Ḥudhayfah and Sālim occupied a privilege place in Islam such as their prominence and honour granted to them by the Prophet. As for the remarks of Sahlah bint Suhayl, she had seen (contempt) on the face of Abū Ḥudhayfah when he saw Sālim entered her house. Indeed, he entered (the house) his *mawlāt* who had freed him. (In other words, Sālim) as a slave who has been raised in the house of his master, entered to meet her. And later, when he was freed he continued to visit his *mawlāt* out of habit because he was raised there. As such, nobody should blame him or even if he is not Sālim for that matter. This is because Allāh, the Exalted and Glory, has permitted women to receive (the visiting of) her slave man, incapacitated man such as an old man, blind, eunuch, emasculate, effeminate and the likes. (Allāh) also simulated this group of people as *maḥārim* or unmarriageable and said: [They should not display their beauty and ornaments except at (must ordinarily) appear thereof; that they should draw their veils over their bosoms and not display their beauty except to their husbands, their fathers, their husbands' fathers, their sons, their husbands' sons, their brothers or their brothers' sons, or their sisters' sons, or their women, (Muslims) or the slaves whom their right hands possess (male slave), or male servants free of physical needs<sup>514</sup>] and

---

*Sūrah al-Nūr*, 24: 31.



other related persons such as the worker, *mawlā*, friends and the likes.”

“As for Sālim, he can be considered as a male servant who has no desire for he has no descendant. He was granted by Allāh to be devoted, religious and virtuous and that due to those privileges, the Prophet SAAS saw him worthy to make friends with and so did Abū Bakr. (Sālim) also seemed to be indifferent to women and their affection. In addition (Allāh) also permitted women to unveil themselves for identification such as in front of the judge or to be a witness or to socialize with neighbours. (Allāh) also allowed women who are in their old ages and devoid of any charm to unveil them.”

312a. “As for (the remarks of Sahlah) that she saw the contempt on the face of Abū Ḥudhayfah (upon seeing) Sālim entering (the house) to meet his *mawlāt*; even if the visit is allowable, (Sālim) will not do so because Abū Ḥudhayfah will prevent him. And to placate the situations – the relationship between (Sahlah) and Sālim, to avoid enmities between them and to pacify the anger of Abū Ḥudhayfah against Sālim due to his visit, the Prophet (jokingly) said to (Sahlah): [Suckle him!] Here he does not mean to say that she has to put her breast in his mouth like suckling babies. But he intends to say that she should extract some milk (from her breast) and gave him to drink. There is no other method suitable than (that mentioned earlier) for it is forbidden for Sālim to see her breast. But, how could (the Prophet) have allowed him an unlawful practice that could instigate in him the desire?”

312b. “As such, all these prove that this interpretation is (logical) for (Sahlah) would have not exclaimed: [O Prophet! Suckle him? He is a matured man!] And the Prophet laughed and said: [Am I not the one

knows most that he is a matured man?]. The fact that (the het) laughed on this occasion indicates that he favoured (this of) suckling so that he could overcome the enmity. This also (does not mean) that the visit of Sālim is forbidden and (does not intend) to allow (this kind of) suckling to be a precedent by making it unlawful, something which is unlawful through allowing Sālim *ipso facto* to be the son of (Sahlah)."

"A similar example of the kindness of the Prophet SAAS is the one reported by 'Abd al-Wāḥid ibn Ziyād who narrated from 'Āṣim ibn al-Zu'ayr and the latter from al-Ḥasan that a man showed (al-Ḥasan) a son who had killed one of his parents. (The Prophet) asked him: 'Are you asking for *diyyah* (blood money)?' The man replied: [No!] (The Prophet) asked him again: [Do you forgive him?] He replied: [Yes.] (The Prophet) said again: [Then, go and kill him!] (The man) said that when the man passed by (the Prophet) said: [If he kills the man, he is just like the (convict)!]. The man however was informed of what the Prophet had said and he (changed his mind) and (like the convict) and returned (to the Prophet) with a belt tied at his waist. Indeed (the Prophet) does not mean to say that if the man kills (his convict), his action is of a similar crime (that was done by a convict) and thus be condemned to hell fire. How could (the Prophet) intend (to say that the man is the same as the convict) for he has permitted killing in the case of *qisās* (retaliation)? It is clear that (the Prophet) disfavours the man to seek retaliation but encourages the man to forgive (the convict). Thus, to incite the man to kill (the Prophet) leads the man to believe that if he kills the convict then the man is the same as the convict. In truth, he meant

(to say) both men will kill a man and both will be murderers. But if a man is unjustly killed, then the other one can apply retaliation.”

#### XCV. EXAMPLE OF *HADĪTH* INVALIDATED BY AL-QUR'ĀN AND REASON

313. They said: “You have narrated from Muḥammad ibn Iṣḥāq who narrated from ‘Abd Allāh ibn Abū Bakr who narrated from ‘Umara and the latter from ‘Ā’ishah saying: [The revelation of the verses on lapidation and on suckling of the adult was ten times. They were (written) in a *ṣaḥīfah* (notebook) located under my bed upon the demise of the Prophet. When we were busied with that demise, a sheep from the surrounding area came in and ate the *ṣaḥīfah*.] They said that this contradicted with the saying of Allāh, the Blessed and Sublime: [And indeed it is a Book of exalted power. No falsehood can approach it from before or behind it.<sup>515</sup>] How could it be powerful when a sheep ate it and thus destroying His ordain and proof? Can anybody destroy it when the sheep has done it? And what about His saying: [This day I have perfected your religion for you<sup>516</sup>] when He had sent an animal to eat it? How could He expose the revelation without ordaining it to be protected and be conserved but allow it to be eaten up by a sheep? What is the purpose of Him revealing that (passage) if He does not want man to conform to it?”

314. Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that what they were amazed at (for us) was nothing extraordinary. And what they found to be so serious (for us), was trivial. If they were amazed at the existence of the *ṣaḥīfah* (they shouldn’t be!) for this notebook during the time of

<sup>515</sup> *Sūrah Fuṣṣilat*, 41: 41- 42.

<sup>516</sup> *Sūrah al-Mā'idah*, 5: 3.

Prophet was the best method to write down the (verses of) al-Qur'ān. Indeed, they used to write down (the verses) on the stalk of palm leaf, stones and earthenware and the likes. Zayd ibn Thābit said: [Abū Bakr requested me to compile all (of these inscriptions)

I started to do so and found (the inscriptions) were written on pieces of cloth, stalks of the palm leaf and flat stones.] The terms اللخاف and its singular form, عسيب النخل, means 'palm stalk'; and, اللخاف and its singular form, لخرة, means 'flat stones'."

Zuhri said that the Prophet SAAS possessed (a collection of the verses of) al-Qur'ān written on palm stalk, leather and palm stump. The term القضم and its singular form, قضيم, means 'leather' and الكرائيف and its singular form كرنافة means 'palm stump'. Indeed, (inscriptions of) al-Qur'ān were in the hands of the Muslims although they did not possess the book or tools (for writing). This proves that the Prophet SAAS does write (letters) to kings of (many countries) on pieces of paper."

a. "(As for the remarks): If they were amazed at (the action of) writing (the inscriptions) under the bed, (they should realize) that ordinary people are not kings who have wardrobe, locker, chests, safe and the likes. When they wished to keep and secure a thing, they used to place it under their bed and avoided from stepping on it. At the same time (by so doing) they prevented the children or servants from touching it. How could it be possible for these people to have no safety chest locker nor wardrobe in their house to guard their properties except by the simple means that they have? The Prophecy itself does not call for this (triviality.) Indeed, the



Prophet SAAS used to mend his cloth, repair his sandals and boots,<sup>517</sup> serve his families and eat on the floor.<sup>518</sup> He said: [I am a slave and I eat like a slave!<sup>519</sup>] And so did other Prophets such as Sulaymān who was granted by Allāh a kingdom which had never been given to anybody before or after him – (but) he only be clothed in woolen (garment) and used to eat barley bread even though he gave others all kinds of food. Likewise, when Mūsā spoke to Allāh, he was wearing a (mere) chemise made of hair or wool and a pair of sandal made from skin of a dead donkey. It is said to him: [Put off your shoes, you are in the sacred valley Ṭuwā.<sup>520</sup>] While Yaḥyā used to tie himself with fiber made from palm tree. There are numerous and famous examples (of the Prophets) which will be too long (for us) to write in this book.”

314b. “(The remarks) about the sheep of which they were amazed, (they should know) that the sheep is the finest animal. I have read (about) the prayers of ‘Uzayr to his Lord that said: [O Lord! Out of all animals, You have chosen the cattle and sheep; among the birds the pigeon; among the plants the *ḥublah* (thorny plants); among the cities Bakkah and Ayliyā’ and among Ayliyā’ Bayt al-Maqdis. Wakī’ had narrated from al-Aswad ibn ‘Abd al-Raḥman and the latter from his father and grandfather stating that the Prophet SAAS had said: [Allāh does not create any animals that are dearer to Him than the sheep.] And (the remarks) of their amazement at the sheep that ate the *ṣaḥīfah* (they should know) that the mouse is the worst animal on earth, which bit the *ṣaḥīfah* and urinated on it and (later) termites

<sup>517</sup> *Al-Musnad*, 9: 519 (No. 25396); *Al-Muṣannaḥ*, 11: 260 (No. 20492); *Mishkāt al-Maṣābiḥ*, 3: 142 (No. 5822).

<sup>518</sup> *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, 7: 211 (No. 18665).

<sup>519</sup> *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, 15: 232 (No. 40708), 15: 248 (No. 40793).

<sup>520</sup> *Sūrah Ṭāhā*, 22: 12.

them all. If the *ṣaḥīfah* were to be burnt by fire or snatched by hypocrites it would be lesser amazement for them. And if mighty Allāh intends to destroy a thing He will destroy the small big mean (related to the thing). Indeed, He had people perished by y particles and likewise people perished by hurricane. He nished people with (the attack of) frogs just like He punished ers with stones. He had Namrod perished by mosquito and troyed Yaman by (the attack of) mice.”

1c. “As for their remarks: How could a religion be complete when revealed (a verse) and later annulled it? Indeed, that verse was ealed on the day of farewell pilgrimage wherein Allāh the mighty has strengthen Islām, condemned polytheism and thus, led out the polytheists from Makkah. And during that year, there re only believers who performed the pilgrimage. This was the y in which Almighty Allāh completes the religion and grantes the ours to Muslims. (The remarks of:) the completion of religion ans (to indicate) the Glory, the Splendor of (Allāh) and (to mark) ending of polytheism. However, this completion does not mean conclusion of the legal obligations and their supererogatory ctices. This is because the revelation on (these two aspects) tinued until the Prophet has (fully) understood them. Such were opinion of al-Sha‘bī on this verse. It is also possible that the npletion of the religion means that upon (the revelation of the se), the discontinuity of the principle of abrogation began.”

1d. “As for the destruction of (the *ṣaḥīfah*), it is possible that lāh) revealed it as an integral part of al-Qur’ān and then exempted n from reciting it but maintained obligation to practice it cording to the text). Such was the opinion of ‘Umar concerning

the verse related to lapidation. And the other opinions said that some texts were part of al-Qur'ān and were inscribed between two pieces of wood but were not found. If it is acceptable that the text meant for recitation still remained (to be recited) and that prescription to practice it was nullified, then it is also possible the text is nullified but the practice remaining compulsory.”

“It is also possible that these (verses) were revealed to (the Prophet) just like other (prescriptions) related to the affairs of religion. But (these affairs) may not appear in al-Qur'ān such as the prohibition of the marriage between a man and the daughter of his brother or between a man and the daughter of his sister; prohibition of amputation of hands for (stealing) less than a quarter *dīnār*; prohibition of retaliation to the father and the master or prohibition of saying: [No inheritance for the murderer!] Similarly, the saying of the Prophet that Almighty Allāh said (to inspire him): [I created all my servants as *ḥanīf* (true believer)]; the saying of the Prophet that Almighty Allāh said (to inspire him): [Whoever comes close to Me by the span of an arm, I come to him by a span of forearm] and the likes. The Prophet also said: [I was brought the Book and other similarity with it] which means the *Sunan* which Jibrīl transmitted to him. The Prophet also applied lapidation and later the Muslims practiced it and the jurists rectified its practice.”

314e. “As for the principle of suckling of adults ten times, we notice there is a mistake and it is due to Muḥammad ibn Iṣḥāq. It is unlikely that the text related to lapidation, which was mentioned in the *ṣaḥīfah*, is false for the Prophet has lapidated Mā'iz ibn Mālik and others before the time (the *ṣaḥīfah* was destroyed). How could this (verse) be revealed to (the Prophet) for the second time? In another

ance, Mālik ibn Anas had narrated the same *ḥadīth* from ‘Abd h ibn Abū Bakr who narrated from ‘Amrah and the latter from shah who said in relation to the revelation of al-Qur’ān: [Ten s of known acts of suckling constitute the prohibition.] This e was then abrogated to be: [five times of known acts of suckling stitutes the prohibition.] When the Prophet died, this prescription ains (as it is) and became part of the recitation of al-Qur’ān. This *ḥ*th was applied by some of the jurists such as al-Shāfi‘ī and q. They adopted the five times (suckling) as the limit to xentiate the prohibited and non-prohibited (to be married). wise, they also considered the value of two *qullah* (highest t) as the limit to differentiate the quantity of water as pure or re. The terms (used) in the *ḥadīth* (narrated by) Mālik were rent from the (one narrated by) Muḥammad ibn Iṣḥāq. And ng the people of *ḥadīth*, Mālik commands more weight than ammad ibn Iṣḥāq.”

Muḥammad said that Abū Ḥātim had narrated from al-Aṣmā‘ī had narrated from Mu‘ammar who said: “My father said to me: not narrate anything from Muḥammad ibn Iṣḥāq for he is a liar!], ed, he had narrated from Fāṭimah bint al-Mundhir ibn al-Zubayr, wife of Hishām ibn ‘Urwah. Then Hishām was informed of this ration) and he protested and said: [Was it he or I who used to r that woman’s house?]”

∴ “As for the saying of Allāh the Sublime and Glory: [No hood can approach it from before or behind it], (Allāh) does not n that the copies of the book are unlikely to meet the same dent as other furniture or objects. Indeed, He means to say that



the devil cannot add in what is not part of (al-Qur'ān) before or after the revelation."

## CVI. EXAMPLE OF ḤADĪTH INVALIDATED BY AL-QUR'ĀN AND REASON

315. They said: "You have narrated that Yūsuf have been granted half (of the share) of beauty and Allāh Almighty said: [The (brothers) sold him for a miserable price of a few *dirham* counted out in such low estimation did they hold him.<sup>521</sup>] It is inconceivable that if someone who has been granted half (of the share) of beauty was sold at a low price of a few *dirham*, they could count on the (dirty work done). But the buyer in that condition – for the little price that he has to pay, gave no attention (to Yūsuf). When his brothers returned to (Yūsuf) several times, (as stipulated in al-Qur'ān): [And he knew them but they knew him not.<sup>522</sup>] How could they not recognize him, whom (Allāh) granted half (of the share of) beauty and nobody looks like him? It is more logical for them to recognize him rather than he recognizes them!"

316. Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that the common opinion on half (of the share of) the beauty is that Almighty Allāh granted to Yūsuf half (of the share of) the beauty and the other half, He granted to all humankind.<sup>523</sup> This is a glaring mistake for anybody who contemplates and understands what we have said. To my mind, the Almighty Allāh has determined the limit of the beauty of a being and that He granted (beauty) to anybody He wishes among His creatures,

<sup>521</sup> *Sūrah Yūsuf*, 21: 20.

<sup>522</sup> *Sūrah Yūsuf*, 21: 58.

<sup>523</sup> *Al-Musnad*, 4: 57 (No. 14052); *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 11: 514 (No. 32400); *Al-Mustadrak*, 2: 570.

it the angels or *al-hūr al-'īn*. Yūsuf was granted half of the beauty and the other the perfection. It is possible for Him to grant to certain things one third (of the share of the beauty) and the others one-fourth one-tenth to another person. It is also possible for Him not to grant any (beauty) to other (group of people)."

likewise, if somebody said that he has been granted half (of the share) of courage, it is inconceivable that he has been granted half of the courage and the other half to be granted to all mankind. If such were the meaning, it would be proper for that individual who has been granted half (of the share) of courage to individually stand up to the rest of mankind. But (in truth the expression) means that the individual courage has a certain limits, known to Almighty Allāh. He may grant half (of the share) to anyone he wishes among His creatures and the other half (of the share) to others and one-third or one-fourth or one-tenth to other people and so likes."

6a. "As for their expression: [How could he be sold for such a large price despite his beauty and also (the buyers) were heedless of him?] (They should know) that the beauty of Yūsuf is not as extraordinary as we presumed but must be similar to other beautiful persons. Indeed, Wahb ibn Munabbih has mentioned that Yūsuf (has a quality that) resembled Sārah in (describing) the beauty. This is evidence that confirm our interpretation of the (remarks: Yūsuf being granted) half (a share of) the beauty."

6b. "They also argued based on the saying of Almighty Allāh: When she heard of their malicious talk, she send for them and prepared a banquet for them. She gave each of them a knife, and she said to Yūsuf: {Come out before them!} When they saw him, they

did extol him and (in their amazement) cut their hands, they said: {Preserve us Allāh! No mortal is this! This is none other than the noble angel!}<sup>524</sup>] They also said: [If they cut their hands upon seeing him and exclaimed that he was a noble angel, then this was due to the extreme beauty of (Yūsuf) which no ordinary people (had been granted). To interpret this verse, we must recall (what precedes the above verse): [The women said in the city: {The wife of the great 'Azīz is seeking to seduce her slave from his (true) self: Truly he has inspired her with violent love and we see she is evidently going astray.}<sup>525</sup>] Here, she wanted to demonstrate so that she will not be rebuked for that temptation. So she prepared them a meal (*muttaka'an*). Some read it as *mutkan*, which means food that needs to be cut off by a knife. And it is said in some exegesis (of al-Qur'ān) it is referred to as *al-utrujj* and in other as *al-zumāward*. Whatever food could it was, it could never be eaten without cutting it. The root word for (the terms) *البتك* and *الملك* are of the same (origin) and are synonyms. The alternate usage of (the alphabets) *ب* and *م* in (the above terms) are frequent due to the similarity of the articulation (or the phonetics) of the alphabets themselves.”

“Then she said to Yūsuf: [Come out before them] and when they saw him, they found him most remarkable and admirable and that their hearts were filled with love for him. They were stupefied and they could not take their eyes from him and cut their hands with the knives that they used to cut their food. They then exclaimed: [No mortal is this! This is none other than a noble angel!] They do not mean by this (expression) that he was an angel, but (inferring it) as a metaphor. Likewise, one can say to a man to describe his good looks

<sup>524</sup> *Sūrah Yūsuf*, 21: 31.

<sup>525</sup> *Sūrah Yūsuf*, 21: 30.

saying: [he is like the sun!] or [he is like the moon!] And in ther (expression) to describe courage: [he is a real lion!] How ld they have said that he was a man and an angel at the same time e they desired him just like the wife of al-‘Azīz and were anding to imprison him? Angels do not (marry) or be risoned. It is not surprising that they cut their hands on seeing a utiful face for passion and love (play an important role) and sed them to be dazed or stupefied. Indeed, many people have erienched such a feeling.”

c. “ ‘Urwah ibn Ḥizām said:

[On remembering you I am shivering  
It runs through my skin and my bones  
If I suddenly saw her  
I will be in daze and I am not able to utter (any word)  
I could not think straight like before  
I forget the speeches that I have prepared when she  
Was away]

as ibn al-Mulawwah also known as al-Majnūn became crazy, me and wandered among the wild animals. He knew nothing ept when somebody mentioned Laylā, (he regained his true self). poet) said:

[Be aware of him, a man whose reason has gone away  
He found himself wandering into the unknown  
When someone mentioned Laylā I gained reason and  
returned



The wondering spirit and regained the versatile passion]

Then his parents took him to Makkah to seek refuge from (the House of Allāh) so as to cure him. When in Minā he heard somebody said: [O Laylā!] he fell unconscious. When he regained his consciousness, he said:

[Somebody called when we were at the hill in Minā

It revived the sorrow of my soul without me knowing it

He called Laylā but she was somebody else and it is as if

He made Laylā as a bird that was in my heart flew away]

Indeed, some people have died because of emotional sorrow such as 'Urwah ibn Ḥizām and 'Abd Allāh ibn 'Ajlān al-Nahdī."

Abū Muḥammad said: "'Abd al-Raḥman ibn 'Abd Allāh ibn Qurayb reported according to al-Aṣma'ī who was his uncle, that 'Abd Allāh ibn 'Ajlān was one of the famous Arab love-poets who died because of his (being engrossed in) love. Some poets mentioned about him saying:

[If I die due to love

Indeed, Ibn 'Ajlān died before me]

Abū al-Ḥātim said that he had narrated from al-Aṣma'ī who narrated from 'Abd al-'Azīz ibn Abū Salamah who narrated from Ayyūb and the latter from Muḥammad ibn Sīrīn stating that 'Abd Allāh ibn 'Ajlān, who was (in love with) Hind said:

[In truth Hind became unlawful to you

I became one of her closest relatives

I became like (a man) whose weapon was in its sheath

And holding in his hands a bow without an arrow].

the narrators) added that he in his last voice has (repeated) the last verse and then he fell and died. The narrators have reported by this narration. And (upon informing) 'Amr ibn Hind, al-Hārith ibn al-Yashkurī has improvised the poem that began with: [Asmā' upon his leaving]. And this poem was (as if) a sermon that came from the spear on which (al-Hārith) leaned on to speak, piercing the chest without him realizing it. (For Ibn Qutaybah), this (issue) is more amazing than (the issue of) the women cutting their hands. This is because the motive for which the women had cut their hands was more inferior to the issue of the spear piercing the chest of al-Hārith ibn Hilzab."

1. "As for the idea that the travelers who had sold (Yūsuf) for a low price, this is due to the fact they valued him not. Indeed, they sold him as a runaway slave without remorse on the pretext that they saved him from disgrace and saved him from the well where his vicious masters had thrown him accusing him of wrongdoings and so on. As such, they also ordered the buyers to shackle him until they reached Miṣr. This action therefore reduced the price (of Yūsuf) and such that the buyers paid no attention to their merchandise. The nature of (Yūsuf) has been mentioned in al-Tawrāt."<sup>526</sup>

2. "As for their expression: [How could his brothers not recognize (Yūsuf) despite the beauty that was granted to him?] Indeed, I have mentioned to you that the beauty granted to Yūsuf was superior to the average man, was hardly different from others. Even if he had been granted half of the (share) of the beauty and

---

*Genesis*, 37: 12-36.

others granted one third, one fourth or almost half of (the share), the difference is not that big. They left him when he was a small child, and met him again as an adult. They left him as a miserable captive and they met him again as a powerful and great king. As such, in this case it took time and different circumstances to change the external and physical outlooks.”

## **XCVII. EXAMPLE OF ḤADĪTH INVALIDATED BY NAẒAR**

317. They said that you have narrated from Shu‘bah who narrated from Muḥammad ibn Juḥādah who narrated from Abū Ḥāzim and the latter from Abū Hurayrah saying: “The Prophet SAAS forbade taking the acquisition of servants.”<sup>527</sup> They also said that taking the gain of the servant was lawful; [If a man remunerates from the work of his female slave or manservant, the acquisition is not unlawful and is known to all. How could the Prophet have forbidden it?]

318. Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that the acquisition forbidden by the Prophet SAAS was related to the gain through prostitution. People of *Jāhiliyyah* commanded their servants to prostitute themselves and then confiscate their gain. ‘Abd Allāh ibn Jud‘ān was the leader of the people of the *Jāhiliyyah* era and he owned slaves who used to prostitute themselves. Then Almighty Allāh revealed: [But force not your female slaves into prostitution when they desire chastity in order that you may make a gain in the goods of this life.<sup>528</sup>] The Prophet SAAS also forbade the acquisition

<sup>527</sup> *Al-Musnad*, 3: 133 (No. 7856), 3: 471 (No. 9865), 3: 526 (No. 10232); *Sunan al-Dārimī*, 2: 272; *Al-Tamḥīd*, 9: 152.

<sup>528</sup> *Sūrah al-Nūr*, 24: 33.

m *al-zammārah* or *al-zāniyah* (woman prostitute), who was exploited by her master.”

ū Muḥammad said: “Abū al-Khaṭṭāb said that he has narrated from ū Baḥr, who narrated from Hishām ibn Ḥassān who narrated from ḥammad ibn Sirīn and the latter from Abū Hurayrah saying that sale of dogs and the salary of *al-zammārah* (prostitute) constitute unlawful profits.<sup>529</sup>

### VIII. EXAMPLE OF TWO CONTRADICTORY *HADĪTH*

2. They said that you have reported from Mālik who narrated from him Abū al-Naḍr and who also narrated from Ibn Jurhud and the other from his father saying that the Prophet SAAS passed by and his bare thigh was seen (by the Prophet). And he said: [Cover it for the thigh is one part of the '*aurah* (nudity)']<sup>530</sup> You also narrated from Ḥa'ṭal ibn Ja'far who narrated from Muḥammad ibn Abū Ḥarmalah al-Baḥrī who narrated from 'Aṭā' Ibn Yasār and Abū Salamah ibn 'Abd Raḥman and the latter from 'Ā'ishah saying that the Prophet SAAS was lying down in his bedroom with his thigh bare. Abū Bakr announced himself and was welcomed by the Prophet in that posture. Then 'Umar announced himself and was welcomed in the same manner and so also 'Uthmān who was welcomed in the same state. Then (the Prophet) rearranged his clothing. When he came out, 'Ā'ishah said to him about (the manner) and he replied: [Should not I

---

*Al-Musnad*, 6: 113 (No. 17271); *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, 9 (No. 41); *ʿAṣṣat al-Aḥwadhī*, 5: 221 (No. 1275); *Sunan al-Dārimī*, 2: 272; *Mishkāt al-Maṣābiḥ*, 2: 74 (No. 2763); *Kanz al-Ummāl*, 4: 80 (No. 9624); *Al-Mustadrak*, 2: 42. *ʿAṣṣat al-Aḥwadhī*, 10: 179 (No. 2798); *Sunan al-Bayhaqī*, 12: 322 (No. 3229); *Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, 3: 271 (No. 2138); *Al-Muṣannaf*, 1: 290 (No. 1115).



feel ashamed of man when the angel also feels ashamed of him?<sup>531</sup>]  
They said: [This (*ḥadīth*) contradicts the first *ḥadīth*.]"

320. Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that there is no contradiction. Each of those *aḥādīth* has its own usage. If it is placed in its proper perspective, the accusation of contradiction will cease off. As for the *ḥadīth* (narrated by) Jurhud that the Prophet SAAS passed by him and his thigh was bared to others in public area and that the Prophet said to him: [Cover your thigh for it is one parts of the '*aurah*!]] In this context, he did not say: [It is '*aurah* (shameful part)] for *al-'aurah* is something else. And *al-'aurah* is of two types. One of them is the genital parts, which (includes) the anus of men and women. These parts are the real shameful parts that need to be covered in any circumstances. The other type is the organ located near to (the first type) like the thigh and the lower part of the abdomen. Those parts are known as '*aurah* for they are located near to the shameful parts. These parts can be revealed when one is in the washroom, in deserted areas, in one's home and when one is with his wife. It will be indecent if these parts are revealed to public, assemblies or market places. Likewise, it is lawful to eat in the street but indecent. It is lawful for a man to have a relationship with his female slave, but it is indecent to show it to the eyes of the public."

"They also disapproved of the (sexual) moans out of sexual intimacy between a man and his female slave. The Prophet was in his private room and was with his wife when his thigh was bared. When (his friend) entered he did not cover it but when it came to the third one

<sup>531</sup> *Al-Musnad*, 10: 169 (No. 26529); *Sunan al-Bayhaqī*, 2: 326 (No. 3242), 2: 327 (No. 3244); *Al-Mustadrak*, 3: 95; *Majma' al-Zawā'id*, 9: 59 (No. 14503); *Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, 12: 227 (No. 13253); *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 11: 586 (No. 32799), 11: 47 (No. 36215), 11: 49 (No. 36219); *Mushkil al-Āthār*, 2: 284, 293.

(covered himself). He feared that (by this action one) could milate it to the attitude of Jurhud who revealed his thigh in lic."

## IX. EXAMPLE OF ḤADĪTH INVALIDATED BY THE NSENSUS AND THE BOOK

They said that you have reported that al-Ḥajjāj al-Ṣawwāf had ated from Yaḥyā ibn Abū Kathīr who narrated from 'Ikrimah and latter from Ḥajjāj ibn 'Amr al-Anṣārī stating that the Prophet \S said: "Whoever breaks one of his (legs) or is cripple, it is wable for him (to annul his present *hajj*) and performs it in the : *hajj*."<sup>532</sup> (The narrator also said) the same (*ḥadīth*) was narrated 1 Ibn 'Abbās and Abū Hurayrah. Both of them affirmed its truth. y also said that the masses disputed this because of the saying of Almighty Allāh: [And complete the *hajj* or 'umrah in the service \llāh. But if you are prevented (from completing it) send an ring for sacrifice. Such as you may find, and do not shave your ls until the offering reaches the place of sacrifice.<sup>533</sup>] Here, there 3 possibility of annulling the *hajj* before the offering reaches the e for offering and (completed the act of) sacrifice."

Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that the Prophet specified act for the people of Makkah to pronounce the *ihlāl* (initiation of ), to perform *tawāf*, *sa'y* and then annul it due to injury or illness nable to perform the other (*hajj*) practices. It is allowable for the

---

'*Arīḍat al-Aḥwadhī*, 4: 133 (No. 940); *Al-Musnad*, 5: 335 (No. 15730); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 2: 1028 (No. 3077, 3078); *Sunan al-Bayhaqī*, 5: 360 (No. 10099); *Al-Mustadrak*, 1: 483, 470; *Sunan al-Dārimī*, 2: 61; *Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, 3: 224 (No. 3211, 3212); *Mishkāt al-Maṣābīh*, 2: 60 (No. 2713).  
*Sūrah al-Baqarah*, 2: 196.

man to do so and he needs to perform the *hajj* later and offers the sacrifice. Likewise, if the man arrives in Makkah upon completing his *'umrah* during the month of *hajj*, and pronounces *ihlāl* there (in Makkah) but later annuls it due to injury or accident, this prevents him from fulfilling other practices in *hajj* with others, then it is allowable for him to perform the *hajj* later and offers the sacrifice.”

“As for those whom Almighty Allāh has ordained to restrain themselves from (performing *hajj* that year), it is preferable for them to offer sacrifice and they need not shave their hair before their offerings reach the place of sacrifice. This (ordain was intended) for people, who have entered Makkah but have been prevented from (performing *hajj*). The juridical judgments for this group of people differ from that of the people of Makkah and people who pronounce *ihlāl* at Makkah. Indeed, the judgment for people who injure themselves or suffer from illness that prevented them from traveling or pronouncing their *ihlāl* should annul their *hajj* at Makkah and they must perform their *hajj* (immediately), the following year. As for those who suffer from a broken leg and have pronounced *hajj al-tamattu'* and reside in Makkah, near the Ka'bah, they can annul (their *hajj*) but they must perform their *hajj* in future.”

### C. EXAMPLE OF *HADĪTH* INVALIDATED BY REASON

323. They said that you have narrated that the Prophet had said to a man: “Eat with your right hand for the satan eats with its left (hand).”<sup>534</sup> They also said that satan is a spiritual (being) just like the

<sup>534</sup> *Al-Musnad*, 5: 545 (No. 16493), 5: 546 (No. 16499); *Sunan al-Bayhaqī*, 7: 452 (No. 14610); *Al-Tamhīd*, 4: 502; *Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, 7: 14 (No. 7235, 7236); *Mushkil al-Āihār*, 3: 180 (No. 5904).

els, how could it eat and drink? What kind of hand does it have how does it hold (things)?

. Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that Allāh the Exalted and ry never create things except to have its opposite. For examples: t and darkness, black and white, submission and disobedience, d and bad, perfection and imperfection, left and right, justice and stice. Everything that is good, perfect, justice and light must be buted to Allāh, the Exalted and Glory for He loves (these butes) and rules (by these attributes). And everything that is evil, erfect, and injustice must be attributed to satan for it manifests se behaviors) and is responsible for all of (them). Indeed, ighty Allāh has created the right side for perfection and lesome. He created (the right hand) for eating, drinking, greeting striking. And He created the left side for weakness and erfection. He created (the left hand) for cleaning one's excretion n one's bowel - *istinjā'*) and (from one's nose - *istinshār*) as well leaning all the dirty and filthy things. He also created the way to dise meant for the right way and the people of paradise are the panions of the right (*aṣḥāb al-yamīn*). While the way to hell is nt for the wrong (left) way and the people of hell are the panions of the left (*aṣḥāb al-shimāl*). He created good fortunes nnection to the right and misfortune in connection to the left that e left hand. And they said: [So and so is lucky (*maymūn*) and cky (*mash'ūm*) and these two words are in relation to the right the left."



324a. "As for the (expression that) satan eats with its left hand, this can be explained based on one of the following two meanings (of *shimāl*). First, either satan eats in the real form of eating or that it eats through a sense of smell and not by chewing and swallowing. And this is reported in some *aḥādīth* that its food is (known as) *al-rimmah*, a kind of (decomposed) bone and its drink is *al-jadaf*, a kind of foam or froth. And (satan) could only sense the smell which replaces the act of chewing and swallowing as done by beings of flesh (and blood). (Satan) could smell from the left side and this is how it associates itself to those who do not pronounce in the name of Allāh upon eating their meal or who do not wash their hands or serve uncovered food that caused its beneficial feat to dissipate. Similarly, (satan can be) associated to men (acquiring) wealth in the form of unlawful things and (to men) in procreation indulging in adultery."

"Second, (satan) metaphorically eats with its left hand. If a man has the ability to eat with his left hand, this symbolizes the intention of the satan on this man and the seduction that it exercises on him. It is said that a man who eats with his left hand eats like a satan. It does not mean that the satan eats (as such) but it means that this is the way of eating preferred by satan. Similarly, when it is said that red is the ornament of satan, it does not mean that satan wears red outfits but it means that this is the ornament inspired by satan. Likewise, on the narration on *al-iqti'āṭ*, that is the act wearing of a turban, one should not pull it over the cheeks for it is the turban of satan. It does not mean that satan wears a turban but it means that this is the style preferred and recognized by satan."

b. "Similarly, the saying on *al-mustaḥāḍah* (unordinary menstruation) as: [It is *raḳḍah* or the impulsion of satan!<sup>535</sup>] *Al-lah* is synonymous to *al-duḥḥah* (push or impel). It can be interpreted as one of two meanings as follows. First, satan is (the spirit) that pushes through the vein and provokes the blood forming unordinary menstruation thus nullifying a woman's ablution and invalidating her prayer. It is not surprising that (satan) is able to make the blood to ooze out for it moves through the blood stream of progeny of Ādam. Second, this impulsion is something (logically) natural which is ascribed to satan for it nullifies the prayer just as one ascribed to satan the act of eating with the left hand wearing turban and pulling it over the cheeks or the red apparel."

c. Abū Muḥammad said: "Ziyād ibn Yaḥyā had narrated from his father ibn al-Mufaḍḍal who also narrated from Yūnus and the latter from al-Ḥasan informing that the Prophet SAAS said: [The red apparel constitutes the ornaments of satan and satan prefers red.<sup>536</sup>] In such, the Prophet disliked the clothing for men to be tinted with colour.<sup>537</sup> Ibrāhīm said: [I wear a red outfit although I know that it constitutes the ornament of satan and I wear an iron ring although I know that it is a jewel of people of hell.] He considered that iron as a jewel of the people of hell although the people of hell wear no jewels. What he intended to mean is that instead of jewel, they wear chains and (for him) iron is the jewel for them. Ibrāhīm acted in this manner to control his passion and his act."

---

*Al-Musnad*, 10: 414 (No. 27544); *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 1: 86 (No. 287); *ʿAridat al-Aḥwadhī*, 1: 163 (No. 128); *Al-Muṣannaf*, 1: 307 (No. 1174); *Kanz al-ʿUmmāl*, 9: 630 (No. 27741); *Mishkāt al-Maṣābīḥ*, 1: 177 (No. 561); *Mushkil al-Āthār*, 3: 300.

*Al-Muṣannaf*, 11: 80 (No. 19975).

*Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 2: 119 (No. 3602); *Al-Musnad*, 1: 226 (No. 83), 1: 243 (No. 924), 1: 261 (No. 1004).

## CI. EXAMPLE OF TWO CONTRADICTORY *HADĪTH*

325. They said that you have narrated from the Prophet saying: “Anyone who applies cautery and sorcery does not place his trust in Allāh.”<sup>538</sup> You also reported that he has applied cautery on As‘ad ibn Zurārah and said: “If there is something beneficial in ancient medicine, it is the *bazghah*<sup>539</sup> or cautery.”<sup>540</sup> They said that this *ḥadīth* contradicts the first one.”

326. Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that here – there is no contradiction. (One has to see) each *ḥadīth* from its own perspective. If it is placed in its own perspective, there is no contradiction. There are two types of cautery. The first is the healthy cautery, where the healthy tissue is cauterized so as to immunize it. The non-Arabs practiced this cautery on their children although they were not ill. They considered that cauterization preserved their health and (protected them) from other infirmities.”

Abū Muḥammad said: “I saw in Khurāsān a famous Turkish doctor who used to treat his patients by cauterization. Through an interpreter, he informed me that through cauterization he has cured many ailments like fever, pleurisy, worms, tuberculosis, hemiplegia and other serious diseases. He used to treat patients by tightly covering them with (a blanket) so that he may focus on the sick part of the body. Then, he applied cautery in that area. He also applied healthy cautery on (other people) to preserve their health and thus stay healthy for a longer period of time. He also claimed that he has

<sup>538</sup> *Al-Musnad*, 6: 344 (No. 18243); *Al-Mustadrak*, 4: 415; *Al-Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 3: 103 (No. 5697); *Mishkāt al-Maṣābīḥ*, 2: 516 (No. 4555).

<sup>539</sup> In traditional Malay medicine, this *bazghah* could probably be associated with *bekam*.

<sup>540</sup> *Al-Musnad*, 3: 248 (No. 8521); *Al-Targhīb*, 4: 312.

e many things such as to induce raining, to clear the clouds out of season, to induce wind and other obvious lies and nonsensical gs. However, his friends have full trust in him and affirmed the ability of his words. Indeed, we have tested him on certain things he has claimed (to be true) but he refused to budge (even if ven otherwise).”

e Arabs have the same practice since the *Jāhiliyyah* era. They d to apply cautery on camels that suffered from mangy or *al-bah*), which is synonymous to *al-jarab*, or ulcers, on its face or . They cauterized in the area (that was affected with) mangy or r and left it to heal. Al-Nābighah said to Nu‘mān:

[You loaded me with the sins of others and let him scooted  
Like a camel suffering from an ulcer but they cauterized  
the other camel that graze the land.]

s was the kind of action that the Prophet SAAS had censured and commented: [Anyone who applies cautery does not place his trust Allāh] for the person assumed that by applying cautery and nding the healthy skin with fire (is as if) renounced the decree of ighty Allāh. If the person has placed his trust in (Allāh) and was vanced that he can never defy the divine decree, he will never it a healthy camel or cauterize a healthy person so as to heal the er sick person.”

ia. “The second type of cautery refers to the act of cauterizing on infected injury or to (prevent) the continuous blood flow or the red parts of the body or injured veins related to hydrophesia. To lain (his experience) of curing himself (from a disease), Ibn mar said:



[I drank some *shukā'*<sup>541</sup> and I endured swallowing worm

I gave the end of my veins to the cautery]

This is the type of cautery that the Prophet praised: [In it there is remedy]<sup>542</sup> and he applied cautery on As'ad ibn Zurārah who was suffering from neck pain. And this has nothing to do with the first type of cautery. If anyone takes good care of himself when he is ill, it does not mean that he does not place his trust in Allāh. That is why the Prophet advocated man to treat (his illness) saying: [There is a remedy for each type of sickness.<sup>543</sup>]. However, it does not mean that the remedy can cure the sickness at all time; rather we take the remedy hoping for the restoration of healthy the Almighty Allāh for in every thing that He has created has its own cause."

326b. "The example can be seen in the sustenance that Almighty Allāh has granted on His servants: [There is no moving creature on earth but its sustenance depends on Allāh.<sup>544</sup>] But the Prophet has advocated us to search and acquire by practicing trade. And Almighty Allāh said: [Eat of the good things that We have provided for you.<sup>545</sup>] Similarly, this can be seen in the precautions that man takes to protect himself from danger although he knows well that those precautions can never defy the decree of Almighty Allāh. And (other example is) the preservation of properties safely locked in the coffer although he knows well that what Allāh, Praised be to Him, has preserved can never be lost and whatever Almighty Allāh does not preserve can never be kept. There are numerous examples on this

<sup>541</sup> It is a kind of thorny plant.

<sup>542</sup> *Al-Musnad*, 5: 94 (No. 14604).

<sup>543</sup> *Sunan al-Bayhaqī*, 9: 577 (No. 9558); *Al-Mustadrak*, 4: 199; *Mushkil al-Āthār*, 2: 509 (No. 4515).

<sup>544</sup> *Sūrah Hūd*, 11: 6.

<sup>545</sup> *Sūrah al-Baqarah*, 2: 57.

ue) and it is incumbent on us not to examine the elements that are known to us but we must strive (in our daily activities) with a solution for the Prophet has said: [Be wise and put your trust in Allāh].<sup>546</sup>] He also said to a man whom he heard saying that Allāh is sufficient for him: [What an excuse! If you are unable to do anything just say – Allāh is sufficient for me!]"

c. "Indeed, *al-tiryāq* (purifier or filtrate) is of similar (standing) authority in two situations. The Prophet SAAS said: [I do not want to know what will happen to me if I were to drink the *tiryāq* or if I were to carry a child or I were to say the poem which I have imposed.<sup>547</sup>] The Arabs came to know about *al-tiryāq* as the cures of the kings of Persians and Rome and it constituted as one of the most efficient remedies for serious illness. They then decided that it was a valuable remedy and attributed to it virtues such as to delay death to a certain time, to prolong life span and to protect from misfortunes. A poet described wine, saying:

[She poured me a clear wine, the *diryāq* (wine)

It softened my joints.]

therefore, symbolizes *diryāq* as a remedy, which is as if saying: she poured me (a glass of) wine which is able to cure all of my ailments; that is *diryāq*. Lovers associate the saliva of woman with *diryāq* and they meant it as (the source) of curing the lovesick just as the (function of) *diryāq*. This proves the character of *diryāq* (the prophet) assimilated drinking *diryāq* with the usage of amulet, which is made of multicoloured pearls. The *Jāhiliyyah* people used to wear

---

*Mawārid*, 2: 1150 (No. 2549); *Kashf al-Khaṣāʾ*, 1: 161; *Kanz al-ʿUmmāl*, 3: 101 (No. 5687).

*Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 4: 6 (No. 3869); *Sunan al-Bayhaqī*, 9: 597 (No. 19633); *Mushkil al-Āthār*, 2: 516 (No. 4554); *Al-Durr al-Manthūr*, 5: 269.

an amulet round their neck and upper arm, attributing to it the magical power. They believed that it could protect them from misfortunes and prolong their life span. A poet said:

[If he dies Muzaynah leaves no successor

Put on him O Muzayn! The amulets.]

This means that by wearing the pearls (amulet) around his neck, it keeps him from dying.

‘Urwah ibn Ḥizām said:

[I commended a fortuneteller from Yamāmah

And a fortuneteller of Najd for that they do not cure me

They do not neglect any prayers that they knew

And of all medicines (*salwah*) that they poured on me

They said: [May Allāh cures you! By Allāh we are armless

Before the burdens that your ribs must carry!]

According to them, the term *salwah* refers to the remedy by which a stone that has been plunged into (a pot of water) and that water (can be used) to console and cure the (pain of affection between) lovers. Such (a remedy) is the type of *tiryāq* that the Prophet reproved of if it is used for that intention even if one is granted with that ability. However, if one drinks it (for medicinal purposes) and hoping for a cure from Almighty Allāh then, there is no harm in it. (In addition), *tiryāq* should not consist of snake flesh. And Ibn Sīrīn reproved of (*tiryāq*) which consists of *al-ḥumah*, that is the venom found in the snake flesh.”

id. "Indeed, anything that promotes (magic incantation) is roved and (especially) that which is in non-Arab wordings as well are devoid of mentioning the name of Almighty Allāh or His rds, as found in His Book of which are embedded with benefits. s is the real meaning intended of the saying of (the Prophet): yone who resorts to witchcraft has not placed his trust in (Allāh).] d nothing is reprehensible if anyone who seeks refuge in Allāh or h the Beautiful Names of Allāh, the Exalted and Glory. This is reason why the Prophet SAAS has said to one of his companions, relation to a group of people who used to practice incantations ig (the verses) of al-Qur'ān and received some remunerations out hat practices: [Some people received remunerations through false antations but you received the remuneration through true antations.]"

## EXAMPLE OF CONTRADICTORY *HADĪTH* ON THE INKING OF WATER

. They said: "You have narrated from Ibn al-Mubārak who ated from Qatādah and the latter from Anas that the Prophet AS forbade a man from drinking while he was standing and as) asked him in relation to eating and he said: [Even much more eating!<sup>548</sup>] They also said that you have narrated from 'Abd al-zāq who narrated from Mu'ammār, who narrated from Ayyūb , narrated from Nāfi' and the latter from Ibn 'Umar that the

---

<sup>548</sup> *Ārīḍat al-Aḥwadhī*, 8: 57 (No. 1881); *Al-Musnad*, 4: 363 (No. 12870); *Mushkil al-Āthār*, 3: 18.



Prophet used to drink while he was standing.<sup>549</sup> Thus, there is contradiction (in it)!”

328. Abū Muḥammad said: “We affirm that there is no contradiction in (those sayings) for in the first *ḥadīth* the Prophet SAAS forbade the man from drinking and eating while he was walking. In other words, it is proper for him to eat and drink placidly and not to drink hurriedly especially when he is on retreat or while walking for he will suffer from suffocation or coagulation in his chest due to (the liquid). The Arabs said: [Stand up for our needs!] and this does not mean that one should be standing *per se* but it includes: [Be quick for our needs! Or be attentive to our needs!] As such, al-A'shā said:

[He stands for the justice of his tribe

And forgives or avenges if he wants]

The expression: [He stands for the justice] means he avenges and goes all out until he achieves what he wants. It does not mean that he stands still *per se*. And the expression is (explained) in the saying of Allāh, the Exalted and Glory: [Others, who, if entrusted with a single silver coin will not repay it unless you constantly stood demanding.<sup>550</sup>] This (verse) does not mean that you should remain standing *per se*.”

“As for the second *ḥadīth*: [He used to drink while he was standing] which means that he was not walking or running. There is no harm in it for he has done it placidly just like when he was in the state of sitting.”

<sup>549</sup> *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 15: 458 (41826, 41827).

<sup>550</sup> *Sūrah Āli 'Imrān*, 3: 75.

## II. EXAMPLE OF CONTRADICTORY ḤADĪTH ON IMPURE WATER

9. They said that you have narrated from the Prophet SAAS who declared in more than one ḥadīth saying: "Nothing could impure the water!"<sup>551</sup> Then, you also narrated that he said: "When the quantity of water reaches two *qullah* (pitcher), it is not (considered) impure."<sup>552</sup> This indicates that if the quantity of water is less than two *qullah* then it is impure. Thus, this contradicts the first ḥadīth."

10. Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that it does not contradict the first ḥadīth. Indeed, when the Prophet SAAS said: [Nothing could impure the water] he meant it in general (sense) and in most cases he referred to the wells and lakes where there is abundant of water and expressed this (sentence to include both) in general and particular cases. It is similar when somebody says: [Nothing stops the torrential falls but the wall halted some of them], he meant it as an abundance of water and not otherwise. Similarly, if somebody says: [Nothing resists the fire!], he does not mean it as the fire of a lamp that goes off by a wind blow, not even the sparkles. But he is referring to the burning inferno. Then it is explained to us about the two *qullah* that is the quantity of water for us to differentiate between the pure and impure water."

---

*Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 1: 17 (No. 66); *Al-Musnad*, 1: 507 (No. 2100, 2102), 1: 608 (No. 2566), 1: 660 (No. 2806, 2807); *Al-Mustadrak*, 1: 159; *Mawārid*, 1: 81 (No. 116); *Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, 8: 104 (No. 7503); *Sunan al-Dāraqutnī*, 1: 224 (No. 45).

*Sunan al-Dāraqutnī*, 1: 16 (No. 15); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 1: 172 (No. 517); *Sunan al-Dārimī*, 1: 187.

## CIV. EXAMPLE OF CONTRADICTIONARY ḤADĪTH ON ḤAJJ

331. They said: "You have narrated from Ismā'īl ibn 'Ulayyah who narrated from Ayyūb who said to him that 'Abd Allāh ibn Abū Mulaykah has narrated from al-Qāsim and the latter from 'Ā'ishah saying: [I pronounced the *ihlāl* for *ḥajj*!]<sup>553</sup> And 'Abd Allāh informed that he has narrated from 'Urwah that she said: [I pronounced the *ihlāl* for *'umrah*!]"

332. Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that each of the two *ḥadīth* has its own explanation and there are no mistakes attributed either to al-Qāsim or 'Urwah. Indeed, the companions of the Prophet were on their way to Makkah upon their *talbiyah* (observance) for *ḥajj* and the Prophet requested them to perform *ṭawaf* (circumambulation), *sa'ī* and pronounce their *taḥallul* (break up from *ḥajj*). Then, they were to continue to perform *'umrah* and all of them (pronounced) their *ihlāl* (annul the *ḥajj*) and they were to be in the state of *tamaṭṭu'* (rest, enjoyment). The Prophet said: [If I do not have the offering with me, I will pronounce the *ihlāl* myself.<sup>554</sup>] And then Abū Dharr said: [This constitutes the disjunction of *ḥajj*, meant for them, in particular!] This (opinion) is accepted by most of the jurists. Indeed, 'Ā'ishah has to first, pronounce the *ihlāl* for *ḥajj* and informed al-Qāsim saying: [I pronounced the *ihlāl* for *ḥajj*] and later annulled it in order to perform *'umrah*. And (that is the reason as to why) she informed 'Urwah, saying: [I pronounced the *ihlāl* for *'umrah*]. In both contexts, she is correct for she pronounced the *ihlāl* for *ḥajj* and later for *'umrah* upon the request of the Prophet."

<sup>553</sup> *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 5: 122 (No. 12327); *Al-Musnad*, 10: 186 (No. 26610); *Sunan al-Bayhaqī*, 4: 579 (No. 8786).

<sup>554</sup> *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, 34 (No. 213); *Ārīdat al-Aḥwadhī*, 4: 142 (No. 906); *Al-Musnad*, 5: 33 (No. 4283).

## V. EXAMPLE OF *HADĪTH* INVALIDATED BY REASON

3. They said: "You have narrated that the Prophet SAAS said: he evil eyes almost precede the divine decree.<sup>555</sup>] The two sickly sons of Ja'far ibn Abū Ṭālib were brought to (the Prophet) and he asked: [Why are they so sick?] They replied: [The evil eyes have icken them!] He said: [Chant them!] Indeed, in more than one *dīth* he has forbidden witchcraft. They said: [How could the evil eyes act from a distance and able to make people sick. This is conceivable and illogical.]"

4. Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that this is inconceivable and illogical from the perspectives of religion and philosophy of which they ascribed to and of which they referred to in all action (of theirs). And indeed people are different in their dispositions. Some of them possess evil eyes to strike upon and some do not have. There are people whose bites are as harmful as the bites of the dogs with their bites or the bites of the snakes that are fatal. And some people are affected by the bite of the scorpion and instead the scorpion dies of that bite."

5a. "A black man was brought to al-Mutawakkil. This man came from a faraway desert and used to eat living snakes and weasels by cutting their heads. Another man was also brought to (al-Mutawakkil) and that man used to eat burning ashes, just like eating a male scorpion, without being burned off or hurt by it. The poor Bedouins who live far from cultivated lands eat snakes and all kinds of animals that crawl. Some eat geckoes of which flesh are more harmful than snakes and *tinnīn* (a poisonous plant). Abū Zayd said in his song:

---

*Al-Musnad*, 10: 413 (No. 2754).



[By Allāh! If I submit sincerely to Him

I would be a devoted slave who eats geckoes].

Here, it informs you that devoted slaves eat geckoes. Who then could deny that there exist amongst men who have in (their genes) venom or harmful character? And (who could deny that there exist) people who, when they look at an object that they like can carry in their eyes the virtuous (deeds) or even the venom that can inflict illness on others? A scholar of logic claims that a man, who had hit a snake with his stick, died (because of it) and that there are some snakes which kill human beings by staring at them or with their sounds. Such are the opinions of the philosophers. It is said that al-Naḍr ibn Shumayl had narrated from Abū Khayrah, who said: [*Al-abtar* is a kind of snake that is light blue in color and has a twisted tail. If it moves in front of human being and nobody will be alive if it sees him, and any conceiving mothers, who look at it will loose their babies – indeed, it is the evil among the snakes!] This is the description that is in agreement with the scholar of logic (like Aristotle). From here it is said that a snake could kill people from a distance because its eyes could emit venom into the air and target the object it sees. Similarly, (a snake that produces a fatal vibration) which penetrates through the ear of a person could prove to be fatal.”

334b. “There is a similar case related to the evil eyes and was mentioned by al-Aṣma’ī. He informed me: [I saw a man who has evil eyes and I seek refuge (from Allāh) against him and (by His grace) that man became a one-eyed man. That (one-eyed man) said: [When I see a thing, which I am amazed of, I feel the heat radiating from my eye!] Similarly, (in a case whereby) a woman, who had frowned while shaking a container containing milk, the milk turned

despite her hands and clothing being clean. This is well known it can be explained that her odor reaches the milk (and causes it to turn sour). And when she enters an orchard (her odor) causes the plants to wilt even though she does not touch them. Likewise, a cake (made of flour) at home can be spoilt due to the presence of a small piece of watermelon. (An act of) peeling off the colocynth can evoke tears (to one's eyes) and so also would the act of pounding the mustard seeds or slicing the onions (can evoke tears). It also seems that a man was looking at a red eyed man, and it evokes tears in his eyes until they turn red. This can be attributed to heat radiating from the sick eyes. If a person yawns, others will also start yawning. And the Arabs said: [It is faster than the epidemic of yawning!] Often that a sorcerer can influence the audiences through yawning. When one starts yawning, the others will do so and this is a sort of trickery! The sorcerer also hypnotises patient through the act of chanting as if this frees (the patient) from his ailment."

Indeed, if there are several children living in a house and one of them suffers from smallpox, others will later be infected. The explanation is that the patient exhales (the virus) into the air and will infect the one who has yet to be infected. This has nothing to do with contagious eyes but it is the infection of the virus from one to the other."

As for the claim made by the Bedouins that the evil-eyed man kills whom he wants or incapacitates anyone with his eyes or that when he passes in the pathway where animals used to go for their drink, and passes at any animals, he could kill them; certainly, this is false. Al-Ḥāfiẓ said, in relation to the saying of Almighty Allāh: [And the unbelievers would almost trip you up with their eyes when they hear

the message.<sup>556</sup>] it means throwing the evil eyes that are striking at you just like some people who strike the camel which comes from the water (basin). For us, this interpretation is incorrect. The meaning is that they will stare at you with hostility that will almost make you falter. This is proven from the expression of the poet:

[They advance (others) when they meet in camp

Their glances make the feet falter.]

This means that their harsh and evil (glances) cause the feet to slip over. These are (expressed by) the enemies' eyes, which are full of hatred. And people said: [He gave a distrustful glance!] or [He stared at him!] or [I gave him a sharp glance!] and in relation to this the saying of Almighty Allāh explained: [Looking at you with a look of one swoon in at the approach of death.<sup>557</sup>] This means that the dead one has a fixed eye and never blinks. And Allāh, The Exalted and Glory said: [At length when the sight is dazed<sup>558</sup>] and if the term *baraqa* is read in (*mansūb* form), it means that the eye is sparkling. And if the claim of the Bedouins is true, then (the evil eyed men) could kill whoever they want or incapacitate whoever they wish, but Allāh, Praised be to Him, has never given this (ability) to anybody."

334c. "To my mind, an individual who has evil eyes but he fears that he might inflict (pain) on whom he likes, must immediately invoke a *du'ā'* (prayer) and glorify (Allāh) for His blessing just as the Prophet SAAS had said: [If you are amaze with one of your brethrens let him invoke a prayer on him!] Indeed, if it is true that the man of evil eye has the ability to inflict pain on the object that amazes and attracts

<sup>556</sup> *Sūrah al-Qalam*, 68: 51.

<sup>557</sup> *Sūrah Muḥammad*, 47: 20.

<sup>558</sup> *Sūrah al-Qiyāmah*, 75: 7.

1, he will go all out to get it himself. As such this type of eye is known as the carnal soul of the eye for it works according to the of the carnal soul. There is a *ḥadīth* that says: [There is no chant cept against the evil eye or the deadly animals or ulcers or the nal soul.<sup>559</sup>] The term *al-naḥs* (carnal soul) here is synonymous to evil eye and *al-ḥumrah* means snakes, scorpions and other deadly mals. And the term *al-namlah* means ulcer that comes from hin (the body). And to seek the remedy, the Prophet SAAS said: ach Ḥaḥṣah the chant against ulcers, carnal soul and evil eyes!<sup>560</sup>] relation to dogs, Ibn ‘Abbās said: [They are of *hins*, an inferior up of genie.<sup>561</sup> If it comes to you during your meal, give it nothing to eat for it has a soul!] Here, he means to say that dogs ve eyes and its presence can inflict pain on people who are eating.”

## **II. EXAMPLE OF TWO INCONTRADICTORY ḤADĪTH TRANSACTION**

3. They said: “You have narrated from Ḥammād who narrated m Qatādah who narrated from al-Ḥasan and the latter from nurah that the Prophet SAAS forbade forward selling of animals other animals.<sup>562</sup> You also narrated from Muḥammad ibn Ishāq o narrated from Yazīd ibn Abū Ḥabīb who narrated from Muslim

---

*Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 4: 10 (No. 3884), 4: 11 (3889); *‘Aṣīḍat al-Aḥwadhī*, 8: 162 (No. 2057); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 2: 1161 (No. 3513); *Al-Musnad*, 7: 212 (No. 19929), 7: 216 (No. 19950), 7: 230 (No. 20030); *Al-Mustadrak*, 4: 413; *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, 10: 62 (No. 28371); *Mushkil al-Āthār*, 2: 516 (No. 4557, 4558, 4559).

*Al-Mustadrak*, 4: 414; *Kanz al-‘Ummāl*, 10: 62 (No. 28368), 12: 138 (No. 34381).

Refer to no. 172a.

*‘Aṣīḍat al-Aḥwadhī*, 5: 196 (No. 1237); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 2: 763 (No. 2270); *Al-Musnad*, 5: 43 (No. 14336), 7: 258 (No. 20163), 7: 275 (No. 20258), 7: 279 (No. 20284), 7: 430 (No. 20996); *Sunan al-Dāraquṭnī*, 3: 59.



Ibn Jubayr who narrated from Abū Sufyān who narrated from 'Amr ibn Ḥuraysh and the latter from 'Abd Allāh ibn 'Amr that the Prophet SAAS commanded him to form a troop of soldiers and when the consumption of the camels (out of charity) has depleted (the Prophet) commanded him to replace the (consumed) camel with (the ratio of) one to two animals.<sup>563</sup> This therefore contradicts the first *ḥadīth*."

336. Abū Muḥammad said: We affirm that there is no contradiction between the two *ḥadīth*, praised be to Almighty Allāh! This is because the first *ḥadīth* forbids the sale of an animal for another one. It is unlawful to buy an object that is not in the hands of the seller. Hence, the Prophet SAAS forbade it. This (type of sale) is also known as the sale of description. Likewise, if you sell an animal for another one, you pay for the price of an object that is not in the hand of the other party. Thus, this is unlawful."

336a. "In the second *ḥadīth*: [I commanded you to replace the camels out of charity by (the ratio of) one to two animals.] Here, it concerns the loan that is related to the advanced payment in cash or gold or animals as opposed to loans on foods or dates or animals in a particular condition within a stipulated period. Here, the amount of the payment is not precisely in the hands of the borrower who needs to pay it during the stipulated period. As such the juridical judgment in law is different from that of the judgment on sale. Indeed, during a transaction, it is unlawful to buy a thing that is not in the hands of the other party. But in relation to loans, it is lawful for the borrower to pay the amount of loan although (the property) is not yet in the hands of (the borrower) at the moment of the (signing of) the loan."

---

<sup>563</sup> *Al-Musnad*, 2: 578 (No. 6604).

3 for the depleting (resources for consumption related to) the  
 nels, out of charity, the Prophet SAAS commanded the  
 placement (through loan) a camel, either young or tall or strong or  
 ing (four years) and unfit for war or traveling with two camels.  
 re, it is possible to say that one young and strong camel (out of  
 rity) is worth two or three or four (ordinary) camels.”

## II. EXAMPLE OF TWO CONTRADICTORY ḤADITH ON INSTRUCTION

7. They said: “You have narrated from Jarīr who narrated from  
 Shaybānī, who narrated from ‘Abd al-Raḥman ibn al-Aswad, who  
 rated from his father and the latter from ‘Ā’ishah saying that  
 ing menstruation cycle, the Prophet SAAS requested us to put on  
 r (feminine towel or pad) and then enjoyed intimate (relationships)  
 h us. Beware that (not many) among us who are able to control  
 passion as the Prophet did for himself.<sup>564</sup> You also reported that  
 ad al-‘Azīz ibn Muḥammad had narrated from Abū al-Yamān and  
 latter from Umm Dhurrah saying that ‘Ā’ishah informed her:  
 hen I have my menses, I did not sleep on my bed but on the  
 pet.<sup>565</sup> And the Prophet does not have any (intimate relationship)  
 h me until I am free from my menses.] They said that this *ḥadīth*  
 tradicts the first one.”

8. Abū Muḥammad said: We affirm that the first *ḥadīth* is an  
 hentic *ḥadīth*. Indeed, it was also narrated by Shu‘bah who  
 rated it from Manṣūr who narrated from Ibrāhīm who then  
 rated form al-Aswad and the latter from ‘Ā’ishah. And she said

---

*Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 1: 71 (No. 273).

*Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 1: 70 (No. 271).

that the Prophet SAAS requested (his wives), upon their menses to put on *izār* and then have (intimate relationship) with her.<sup>566</sup> This chain of narrators is slightly different from that of Abū al-Yamān who has narrated from Umm Dhurrah and the latter from 'Ā'ishah. It is not possible for 'Ā'ishah to say: [I enjoyed intimate relationships with him during my menses] and at other times [I do not have any relationship with him during my menses, and I do not sleep on my bed but on the carpet. And the Prophet does not come near me until I am free from my menses]. One of these narrators must be a liar for the liar does not lie to himself. How could one ascertain who are sincere, good and pious persons? In fact, there is no Sunnah or a verse from the Book that prevents a person from having intimate relationships with his wife, who is on her menses and she puts on her *izār*. It is only among the scholars of Magian who reprove having intimate relationships with their menstruating wives."

#### CVIII. EXAMPLE OF *HADĪTH* INVALIDATED BY REASON

339. They said: "You have narrated that the Prophet SAAS has said: [A dream remains on the leg of a bird as long as it is not interpreted. When it is interpreted, it becomes reality!]<sup>567</sup> They asked: [How can a dream remain on the leg of a bird? Can you delay the event of happiness or misery by delaying the act of interpreting it for if you interpret it, it becomes a reality? Then, this proves that if one does not interpret it, it will not take place."

<sup>566</sup> *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 1: 70 (No. 268); *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 9: 625 (No. 27713).

<sup>567</sup> *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 4: 305 (No. 5020); *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 2: 1388 (No. 3914); *Al-Musnad*, 5: 467 (No. 16182); *Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, 19: 206 (464); *Mushkil al-Āthār*, 1: 295; *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, 14: 364 (No. 41390).

Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that these wordings originate in the Arabs. To explain of uncertain things, they will say: [He is the leg of a bird or between the claws of a bird or on the horn of a gazelle!] meaning that he is uncertain or unstable. Speaking of al-jāj ibn Yūsuf, a man said:

[It seems that my heart is between the claws of a bird

Fearfully gliding high in the sky

To avoid a man of whom I knew

When he returns he will inflict evil and it is true!]

explain about a person's fear of the desert, al-Marrār said:

[It seems that her heart is at the desert

Tied to the horns of gazelle.]

This means that she is jumpy (out of nervousness) as if tied to the horns of a gazelle, for the gazelle (by nature) is jumpy and the same is for whatever that is placed on the horn. Umru' al-Qays said:

[In truth it is the day that I live in *Qidār*

As if I and my companions are on the horn of a brown gazelle.]

This means that we are unsafe and unstable and it is as if we are on the horns of a gazelle."

Da. "Similarly, in the dream related to the leg of a bird – it glides in the atmosphere and as soon as it is interpreted, it will take place. This does not mean that it takes place according to the interpretation of anyone, but it has to be done by a rightly guided and wise man. Then, how could a layman who makes mistakes, shuns virtues and



gives erroneous interpretations but is considered as a dream interpreter? Indeed, a good interpreter is the one who never commits mistake as Allāh, the Exalted and Glory says: [If it be that you can interpret visions<sup>568</sup>], meaning: if you are able to interpret them. It does not mean that all kinds of dreams can be interpreted for many of the dreams are hallucination. Some are (related to) temperaments or inner thinking or inspired by satan. The only authentic dream is the one brought by the angel of vision related to the Book several times.”

340b. Abū Muḥammad said: “Yazīd ibn ‘Amr ibn al-Barā’ said that ‘Ubayd Allāh ibn ‘Abd al-Majīd al-Ḥanafī had narrated from Qurrah ibn Khālīd who said that he heard Muḥammad ibn Sīrīn had narrated from Abū Hurayrah that the Prophet said: [Dreams are of three kinds; the euphoric dream that comes from Almighty Allāh, the nightmare that comes from satan and the dream where a man sees himself talking to his own self during sleep.<sup>569</sup> Sahl ibn Muḥammad said that he had narrated from al-Aṣma‘ī who narrated from Abū al-Miqdām or Qurrah ibn Khālīd saying that he was in the company of Ibn Sīrīn when somebody was questioning him about a dream. (Qurrah) said: [I estimated that (Ibn Sīrīn) has interpreted one out of forty dreams or he would say: {I assume that...!}]. This is the authentic dream or vision that glides (in the atmosphere) As soon as it is interpreted by a knowledgeable man who is an expert in analogical reasoning and knows well the methodological principles in interpreting dreams and also receives divine succor, the event would take place according to his interpretation.”

<sup>568</sup> *Sūrah Yūsuf*, 12: 43.

<sup>569</sup> *Sunan al-Dārimī*, 2: 125; *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, 4: 305 (No. 5019); *‘Aṣṣaḥīḥ al-Muwattā’*, 9: 90; *Al-Durr al-Manthūr*, 14: 363 (No. 41385).

#### VIV. EXAMPLE OF *HADĪTH* INVALIDATED BY *NAẒAR*

1. They said: "You have narrated from the Prophet SAAS that he said: [Undertake the work which you are capable of doing for mighty Allāh never tires until you are tired (of it)<sup>570</sup>] Here, you id that Almighty Allāh feels tired when you are tired of it – and mighty Allāh never feels tired in any condition!"

2. Abū Muḥammad said: "We affirm that if the interpretation that ey have suggested be accepted, then it is a grievous and pernicious ror. For (the Prophet) meant to say that Allāh, Praised be to Him, ver feels tired as long as you do not feel tired of it. The example n be seen in the ordinary expression. This horse does not feel tired long as the horseman does not feel tired. Here, it does not mean to y that it feels tired at the same time as the horseman. If such were be the meaning, than the horse is powerless as compared (to other rses) for it becomes weak just like other (horses). In reality, this rse does not get tired even though the horseman feels tired."

ikewise, we can also say that an eloquent man or a talkative man : [So and so never stop talking even if his opponent stops!] Here, it eans that the man never stops talking even though his opponent ay stop. If one means for him to stop then this expression will not ant him a particular merit above his opponent and he deserves no aises (from others). An exact expression can be seen in a poem tributed to the nephew of Ta'abbata Sharran, but some attributed it Khalaf al-Aḥmar:

---

*Al-Musnad*, 3: 544 (No. 8608), 9: 544 (No. 25529), 9: 326 (No. 24376).

[Hudhayl endures to be a brave man.

He never feels tired being hurt as long as others do not tired]

Here, it means that he does not feel tired of being hurt if others feel so. If it means otherwise, then he deserves no merits since he will be at the same level as others – indeed, it means that they feel tired of being hurt but he is not affected by it.”

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

- bduh, Muḥammad, *ʿIlm al-Tawḥīd*, tr. Musaʿad and Craig, *The Theology of Unity*, (London: Luzac Company, 1960).
- bū Ḥanīfah, Al-Nuʿmān ibn Thābit, *Musnad li al-Imām Abū Ḥanīfah*, ed. by Ṣafwah al-Saqā, (n.p: n.pb., nd.)
- bū Zahrah, Muḥammad, *Tārīkh al-Madhāhib al-Islāmiyyah fī al-Siyāsah wa al-Qawāʿid*, (Al-Qāhirah: Maṭbaʿah al-Madanī, n.d.).
- l-Āmidī, ʿAlī ibn Abī ʿAlī, *Ghāyat al-Marām fī ʿIlm al-Kalām*, ed. by Ḥasan Maḥmūd, (Al-Qāhirah: Al-Majlis al-Aʿlā al-Shuʿūn al-Islāmiyyah, 1971).
- l-Ashʿarī, ʿAlī b. Ismāʿīl, *Kitāb al-Lumaʿ fī al-Radd ʿalā ahl al-Zaygh wa al-Bidaʿ*, ed. by Richard McCarthy, (Beirut: n.p., 1952).
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Risālah Istiḥsān al-Khawḍ fī ʿIlm al-Kalām*, trans. by Richard McCarthy, *The Theology of al-Ashʿarī*, (Beyrouth: Imprimerie Catholique, 1953).
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Al-Ibānah ʿAn Uṣūl al-Diyānah*, trans. by Klein, W.C., *The Elucidation of Islam's Foundation*, (New Haven, American Oriental Society, 1940).
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Maqālāt al-Islāmiyyīn wa Ikhtilāf al-Muṣallīn*, 2 vols., ed. by Hellmut Ritter, (Weisbaden: n.pb., 1963).



Al-'Asqalānī, Ibn Ḥajar, *Fath al-Bārī bi-sharḥ Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī*, 13 vols., (Bayrūt: Dār al-Ma'rifah, 1970).

\_\_\_\_\_, *Lisān al-Mizān*, 7 vols., (Bayrūt: Mu'assasah al-'Alamī, 1986).

Al-Attas, Syed Muḥammad Naquib, *Prolegomena to the Metaphysics of Islam*, (Kuala Lumpur: ISTAC, 1995).

Al-'Aynī, Badr al-Dīn Abū Muḥammad Maḥmūd ibn Aḥmad (d. 855H), *'Umdat al-Qārī Sharḥ Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī*, ed. by 'Abd al-Allāh Maḥmūd Muḥammad 'Umar (Bayrūt: Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyyah, 2001).

Al-Azdī, Abū Sulaymān ibn al-Ash'ath al-Sijistānī, *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, edited and commented by Muḥammad Muḥy al-Dīn 'Abd al-Ḥamīd, (Bayrūt: Dār al-Fikr, nd.).

Al-Baghdādī, 'Abd al-Qāhir, *Kifāyah fī 'Ilm al-Ḥadīth*, (Hydrabad: n.pb., 1357).

\_\_\_\_\_, *Kitāb al-Farq Bayn al-Firaq wa Bayān al-Firqaḥ al-Nājiyah Minhum*, ed. by Muḥammad Badr, (Al-Qāhirah: n.pb., 1910).

\_\_\_\_\_, *Kitāb Uṣūl al-Dīn*, (Istanbul: n.pb., 1928).

Al-Bāqillānī, Muḥammad ibn 'Abd al-Ṭayyib, *Kitāb al-Tamhīd fī al-Radd 'alā al-Mulḥidah al-Mu'aṭṭilah wa al-Rāfiḍah wa al-Khawārij wa al-Mu'tazilah*, (Al-Qāhirah: n.pb., 1947).

Al-Baṭalyūsi, *Kitāb al-Iqtiḍāb fī Sharḥ Adab al-Kuttāb*, (Bayrūt: n.pb., 1901).

- Bayādī, Kamāl al-Dīn, *Ishārāt al-Marām min 'Ibārāt al-Imām*, (Istanbul: Dār al-Kitāb al-Islāmī, 1949).
- Bayhaqī, Abū Bakr Aḥmad ibn al-Ḥusayn ibn 'Alī, *Al-Sunan al-Kubrā*, ed. by Muḥammad 'Abd al-Qādir 'Aṭā', (Bayrūt: Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyyah, 1999).
- Bukhārī, Muḥammad ibn Ismā'īl, *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī*, 8 vols. (Istanbul: Al-Maktabah al-Islāmiyyah, 1315).
- Burhānfūrī, 'Alā' al-Dīn 'Alī al-Muttaqī ibn Ḥussām al-Dīn al-Hindī (d. 975 A.H.), *Kanz al-'Ummāl fī Sunan al-Aqwāl wa al-Af'āl*, ed. by Shaykh Bakrī Ḥayānī, corrected and indexed by al-Shaykh Ṣafwah al-Saqā, (Bayrūt: Mu'assasah al-Risālah, 5<sup>th</sup> edition, 1405AH/1985).
- Dārimī, Abū Muḥammad 'Abd Allāh ibn. 'Abd al-Raḥmān ibn Faḍl ibn Bahrām (d. 255 AH), *Sunan Al-Dārimī*, (Dār Iḥyā' al-Sunnah al-Nabawiyyah, nd.)
- Dhahabī, Abū 'Abd Allāh Muḥammad ibn Aḥmad ibn 'Uthmān (d. 748AH); *Mizān al-'Iṭidāl fī Naqd al-Rijāl*, ed. 'Alī Muḥammad al-Bijāwī, Bayrūt: Dār al-Ma'rifah, 1963.
- Dimashqī, Ibn Abī al-'Izz 'Alī ibn 'Alī, *Sharḥ al-'Aqīdah al-Taḥāwiyyah*, 2 vols., (Bayrūt: Mu'assasah al-Risālah, 1987).
- Fārābī, Muḥammad ibn Turkhān, *Iḥṣā' al-'Ulūm*, ed. by 'Uthmān Amīn, (Al-Qāhirah: n.pb., 1968).
- Ghazzālī, 'Abū Ḥamid, *Al-Munqidh min al-Ḍalāl*, ed. by Farīd Jabr, (Bayrūt: n.p., 1959).
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Maqāṣid al-Falāsifah*, (Al-Qāhirah: Dār al-Ma'ārif, 1961).

\_\_\_\_\_, *Fayṣal al-Tafrīqah Bayna al-Islām wa al-Zandaqah*, trans. by McCarthy, *Freedom and Fulfillment*, (Boston: G.K. Hall & Co., 1980).

\_\_\_\_\_, *Tahāfut al-Falāsifah*, ed. by Sulaymān Dunyā, (Bayrūt, Dār al-Mashriq, 1990).

Al-Ḥamawī, Yāqūt ibn 'Abd Allāh, *Irshād al-'Ārif*, ed. by Margoliuth, (London: Luzac Company, 1908-27).

Al-Haythamī, Al-Ḥāfiẓ Nūr al-Dīn 'Alī ibn Abī Bakr Sulaymān (d.807 A.H.), *Majma' al-Zawā'id wa Manba' al-Fawā'id*, ed. Muḥammad 'Abd al-Qādir Aḥmad 'Aṭā', (Bayrūt: Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyyah, 2001).

\_\_\_\_\_, Al-Ḥāfiẓ Nūr al-Dīn 'Alī ibn Abī Bakr (d. 807AH), *Mawārid al-Zamān ilā Zawā'id Ibn Ḥibbān*, edited and commented by Shu'ayb al-Arnā'ūṭ and Muḥammad Ridwān al-'Arqasūsī (Bayrūt: Mu'assasah al-Risālah, 1414AH/1993).

Al-Ḥujwārī, 'Alī ibn 'Uthmān, *Kashf al-Maḥjūb*, trans. by Richard Nicholson, *The Unveiling of the Unveiled*, (Lahore: Islamic Book Foundation, 1980).

Al-Ḥusaynī, Iṣḥāq Mūsā, *The Life and Works of Ibn Qutaybah*, (Bayrūt: n.pb., 1950).

Al-Jāhīẓ, 'Amr ibn Baḥr, *Kitāb al-Tarbī' wa al-Tadwīr*, ed. by Pellat, (Damas: Editions d'Amérique et d'Orient, 1955).

\_\_\_\_\_, *Kitāb al-Ḥayawān*, 8 vols., (Dimashq: Maktabah al-Nūrī, n.d.)

- Jarrāhī, Ismā'īl ibn Muḥammad al-'Ajlūnī (d. 1162 AH), *Kashf al-Khafā' wa Muzīl al-Ilbās*, corrected, and commented by Aḥmad al-Qalāsh (Bayrūt: Mu'assasah al-Risālah, 1985).
- Jawālīqī, Mawhub ibn Aḥmad, *Sharḥ Adab al-Kātib*, (Al-Qāhirah: n.pb., 1350).
- Jurjānī, 'Alī ibn Muḥammad, *Sharḥ al-Mawāqif*, 8 vols. in 4, (Qūm: Manshūrāt al-Sharīf al-Riḍā, 1907).
- Khaṭīb, Muḥammad 'Ajjāj, *Al-Sunnah Qabla al-Tadwīn*, (Bayrūt: Dār al-Fikr, 1971).
- Khayyāṭ, 'Abd al-Raḥīm ibn Muḥammad, *Al-Intiṣār wa al-Radd 'alā Ibn al-Rawandī al-Mulḥid*, ed. by Nyberg, *Le Livre Du Triomphe et De La Réfutation D'Ibn Er-Rawandī L'Hérétique*, (Al-Qāhirah: Dār al-Kutub al-Miṣriyyah, 1925).
- Kindī, Ya'qūb ibn Iṣḥāq, *Rasā'il al-Kindī al-Falsafīyyah*, ed. by Abū Raydah, (Al-Qāhirah: n.pb., 1950).
- Makkā'ī, Ibn al-Bazazāt, *Manāqib al-Imām*, (Haydrabād: Dār al-Ma'ārif, 1321).
- Malī, Abū al-Ḥasan Muḥammad ibn Aḥmad, *Al-Tanbīh wa al-Radd 'alā Ahl al-Ahwā' wa al-Bida'*, ed. by Sven Dederling, (Istanbul: n.pb., 1936).
- Mas'ūdī, 'Alī ibn al-Ḥusayn, *Kitāb al-Tanbīh wa al-Isrāf*, ed. by M.J. Goeje, (Leiden: n.pb., 1894).
- Mundhirī, Zakiyy al-Dīn 'Abd al-'Azīm ibn 'Abd al-Qawī (d. 656AH), *Al-Targhīb wa al-Tarhīb*, commented by Mustafā



Muḥammad 'Imārah (Bayrūt: Dār Ihyā' al-Turāth al-'Arabī, 1388AH/1968).

Al-Nasafī, Muḥammad ibn 'Umar, *Al-'Aqā'id al-Nasafiyyah fī Uṣūl al-Dīn wa 'Ilm al-Kalām*, ed. by Salamah, (Karachi: n.pb., 1912).

Al-Nīsābūrī, Abū 'Abd al-Allāh Muḥammad al-Ḥākīm, *Al-Mustadrak 'alā al-Ṣaḥīḥayn*, ed. by Yūsuf 'Abd al-Raḥmān al-Mar'ashlī, (Bayrūt: Dār al-Ma'rifah, 1986).

Al-Nīsābūrī, Abū al-Ḥusayn Muslim ibn al-Ḥajjāj al-Qushayrī (d. 261AH), *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, ed. by Muḥammad Fu'ād 'Abd al-Bāqī, (Istanbul, Turkiyyah: Al-Maktabah al-Islāmiyyah, 1950).

Al-Qazwīnī, Abū 'Abd Allāh Muḥammad ibn Yazīd, *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, ed. by Muḥammad Fu'ād 'Abd al-Bāqī, (Bayrūt: Al-Maktabah al-'Ilmiyyah, nd.)

Al-Qurṭubī, 'Abd Allāh ibn Muḥammad ibn 'Abd al-Barr (d. 463 AH), *Al-Tamḥīd limā fī al-Muwāṭṭa' min Ma'ānī wa al-Masānīd*, ed. by Muḥammad 'Abd al-Qādir 'Aṭā', (Bayrūt: Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyyah, 1999).

Al-Rāzī, Fakhr al-Dīn Muḥammad ibn 'Umar, *Al-Tafsīr al-Kabīr*, 8 vols., (Al-Qāhirah: al-Maṭba'ah Ilāhiyyah al-Miṣriyyah, n.d.)

\_\_\_\_\_, *Asās al-Taqdīs fī 'Ilm al-Kalām*, (Al-Qāhirah: n.pb., 1935).

- Rāziq, Muḥammad, *Tamḥīd li Tārīkh al-Falsafah al-Islāmiyyah*, (Al-Qāhirah: n.pb., 1966).
- Şan'ānī, Abū Bakr 'Abd al-Razzāq ibn al-Hammām (d. 211 AH), *Al-Muşannaḥ*, ed. by Ḥabīb al-Raḥmān al-A'zamī, (Bayrūt: Al-Maktab al-Islāmī, 1983).
- Shāfi'ī, Ḥasan Maḥmūd, *Madkhal ilā Dirāsah 'Ilm al-Kalām*, (Karachi: Idārah al-Qur'ān, 1988).
- Shāfi'ī, Muḥammad ibn Idrīs, *Al-Risālah*, ed. by Aḥmad Muḥammad Shākīr, (Al-Qāhirah: Ṭab'ah al-Ḥalabī, 1940).
- Shahrastānī, Muḥammad ibn 'Abd al-Karīm, *Nihāyat al-Iqdām fī 'Ilm al-Kalām*, trans. by Gauillaume, *The Summa Philosophia of al-Shahrastānī*, (London: n.pb., 1934).
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Kitāb al-Milal wa al-Nihāl*, 2 vols, (Bayrūt: Dār al-Ma'ārif, 1975).
- Shawkānī, Muḥammad ibn 'Alī, *Faṭḥ al-Qadīr, Al-Jāmi' Bayna Fannay al-Riwāyah wa al-Dirāyah min 'Ilm al-Tafsīr*, 5 vols., (Al-Qāhirah: Muṣṭafā al-Bābī al-Ḥalabī, 1964).
- Suyūṭī, Jalāl al-Dīn 'Abd al-Raḥmān, *Al-Itqān fī 'Ulūm al-Qur'ān*, 2 vols. in 1, ed. by Abū Bakr al-Bāqillānī, (Bayrūt: Maktabah al-Thaqāfah, 1973).
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Şawn al-Manṭiq wa al-Kalām 'an Qānūn al-Manṭiq wa al-Kalām*, (Bayrūt: Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyyah, n.d.)
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Sunan al-Nasā'ī bi-Sharḥ Jalāl al-Dīn al-Suyūṭī* (Bayrūt: Dār Ihya' al-Turāth al-'Arabī, n.d.).

Al-Ṭabarī, Abū Ja'far Muḥammad ibn Jarīr, *Jāmi' al-Bayān fī Tafsīr al-Qur'ān*, 20 vols. in 12, (Bayrūt: Dār al-Ma'rifah, 1970).

\_\_\_\_\_, *Tārīkh al-Umam wa al-Mulūk*, 6 vols., (Bayrūt: Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyyah, 1988).

Al-Ṭabarsī, Abū 'Alī al-Faḍl ibn al-Ḥasan, *Majma' al-Bayān*, 10 vols. in 5, (Bayrūt: Dār al-Ma'rifah, 1986).

Al-Ṭabrānī, Abū al-Qāsim Sulaymān ibn Aḥmad ibn Ayyūb (d. 360AH), *Al-Mu'jam al-Saghīr lī al-Ṭabrānī*, (Bayrūt: Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyyah, 1403AH/1983).

\_\_\_\_\_, *Al-Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, ed. by Ḥamdī 'Abd al-Mājid al-Salafī, (n.p.: Maṭba'ah al-Waṭan al-'Arabī, 1984).

\_\_\_\_\_, *Al-Ḥadīth wa al-Muḥaddith*, (Al-Qāhirah: Dār al-Fikr, n.d.)

Al-Ṭabrīzī, Al-Shaykh Waliyy al-Dīn Muḥammad ibn 'Abd Allāh al-Khaṭīb al-'Āmirī, *Mishkāt al-Maṣābīḥ*, ed. by Muḥammad Nāṣir al-Dīn al-Albānī (Al-Maktab al-Islāmī lī al-Ṭibā'ah wa al-Nashr, 1961).

Al-Taftāzānī, Sa'd al-Dīn, *Sharḥ al-'Aqā'id al-Nasafyyah fī Uṣūl al-Dīn wa 'Ilm al-Kalām*, trans. by Earl Elder, *A Commentary on the Creed of Islam*, (New York: Columbia University Press, 1950).

\_\_\_\_\_, *Sharḥ al-Maqāṣid*, 5 vols., ed. by 'Abd al-Raḥmān 'Umayrah, (Bayrūt: 'Ālam al-Kutub, 1989).

- \_\_\_\_\_, *Al-Ḥāshiyah 'alā Tahdhīb al-Manṭiq li Shihāb al-Dīn al-Yazdī*, (Qum: Mu'assasah al-Nashr al-Islāmī, n.d.)
- [aḥāwī, Aḥmad Muḥammad, *Ikhtilāf al-Fuqahā'*, (Islamabād: Maṭba'ah Ma'had al-Buḥūth al-Islāmiyyah, 1971).
- Abdullah Yusuf, *The Holy Qur'ān, Translation and Commentary*, (Maryland: Amana Corporation, 1983).
- mi, Muḥammad, *Studies in Ḥadūth Methodology and Literature*, (Indiana: American Trust Publication, 1977).
- \_\_\_\_\_, *On Schacht's Origins of Muhammadan Jurisprudence*, (Riyad: King Saud University, 1977).
- awī, 'Abd al-Raḥmān, *Al-Aflāḥiyyah al-Muḥdathah 'inda al-'Arab*, (Al-Qāhirah: n.pb., 1955).
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Madhāhib al-Islāmiyyīn*, (Bayrūt: Dār al-'Ilm lī al-Malāyīn, 1983).
- raer, *The Arab Caliphate*, (London: Pall Mall Press, 1969).
- worth, C.E., *The Islamic Dynasties*, (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1967).
- ç, Mustafa, *Roots of Synthetic Theology in Islam*, (Kuala Lumpur: ISTAC, 1995).
- bin, Henri, *History of Islamic Philosophy*, (London: Kegan Paul International, 1993).
- g, William Lane, *The Kalām Cosmological Argument*, (London: The Macmillan Press, 1979).
- ary, Majid, *A History of Philosophy in Islam*, (New York: Columbia University Press, 1983).



Farghal, Y.H., *Nash'at al-Ārā' wa al-Madhāhib wa al-Firaq al-Kalāmiyyah*, (Al-Qāhirah: Dār al-Ma'rifah, 1972).

Golziher, Ignaz. *Muhammedanische Studien*, (Paris: n.pb., 1952).

\_\_\_\_\_, *Introduction to Islamic Theology and Law*, trans. by Andras, Ruth Hamori, (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1981).

Hasan, Ahmad, *The Early Development of Islamic Jurisprudence*, (Islamabad: Islamic Research Institute, 1994).

Hourani, George, *Reason and Tradition in Islamic Ethics*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1985).

Ibn Abī Uṣaybi'ah, Aḥmad ibn al-Qāsim, '*Uyūn al-Anbā' fī Ṭabaqāt al-Aṭibbā'*', 2 vols., (Al-Qāhirah: n.pb., 1882).

Ibn al-'Arabī, Abū Bakr Muḥammad ibn 'Abd Allāh ibn Muḥammad ibn 'Abd Allāh (d. 543AH), '*Ārīdat al-Aḥwadhī bi-Sharḥ Ṣaḥīḥ al-Tirmidhī*', (Bayrūt: Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyyah, 1997).

Ibn al-Athīr, 'Izz al-Dīn 'Alī ibn Muḥammad, *Al-Kāmil fī al-Tārīkh*, 9 vols., (Leiden: n.pb., 1853-1870).

Ibn al-Faradī, 'Abd Allāh ibn Muḥammad, *Tārīkh 'Ulamā' al-Andalus*, 3 vols., ed. by Ibrāhīm al-Abyārī, (Al-Qāhirah: Dār al-Miṣrī, 1989).

Ibn Asākir, Abu al-Qāsim 'Alī, *Tabyīn Kidhb al-Muftarī fī mā Nusiba ilā al-Imām Abū al-Ḥasan al-Ash'arī*, (Dimashq: Ṭab'ah Dimashq, 1347).

- on Balbān Al-Amīr 'Alā' al-Dīn 'Alī (d. 739 AH), *Ṣaḥīḥ Ibn Ḥibbān bi-Tartīb Ibn Balbān*, edited and commented by Shu'ayb al-Arnā'ūṭ (Bayrūt: Mu'assasah al-Risālah, 1993).
- on Ḥanbal, Aḥmad ibn Muḥammad, *Musnad al-Imām Aḥmad ibn Ḥanbal wa biḥāmishihī Muntakhab Kanz al-'Ummāl fī Sunan al-Aqwāl wa al-Af'āl*, 6 vols., (Bayrūt: Dār al-Fikr, n.d.)
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Al-Musnad*, examined, commented, indexed by Ṣidqī Muḥammad Jamīl al-'Aṭṭār, (Bayrūt: Dar al-Fikr, 1994).
- on al-Jārūd, Sulaymān ibn Dāwūd (d. 204AH), *Musnad al-Ṭayālīsī*, Haydarabad, Hind: Dār al-Kitāb al-Lubnānī wa Dār al-Tawfīq, 1321.
- on al-Jawzī, 'Abd al-Raḥmān, *Manāqib al-Imām Aḥmad ibn Ḥanbal*, ed. by 'Alī Muḥammad 'Umar, (Al-Qāhirah, Maktabah al-Khanjī, 1979).
- on Kathīr, Ismā'īl ibn 'Umar, *Al-Bidāyah wa al-Nihāyah*, 14 vols. in 7, (Al-Qāhirah: Dār al-Ḥadīth, 1922).
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Tafsīr al-Qur'ān al-'Azīm*, 4 vols., (Bayrūt: Dār al-Fikr, 1986).
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Al-Sīrah al-Nabawiyyah*, 2 vols., ed. by Aḥmad 'Abd al-Shāfi, (Bayrūt: Dār al-Kutub, n.d.)
- bn Khaldūn, 'Abd al-Raḥmān ibn Muḥammad, *Muqaddimah Ibn Khaldūn*, trans. by Franz Rosenthal, *The Muqaddimah: An Introduction to History*, 3 vols., (New York: Albany State University, 1958).

Ibn Khallikān, Aḥmad ibn Muḥammad, *Wafayāt al-A'yān wa Anbā' Abnā' al-Zamān*, 8 vols., (Qūm: Manshūrāt al-Sharīf al-Riḍā, 1322).

Ibn Mājah, Muḥammad ibn Yazīd al-Qazwīnī. *Sunan Ibn Mājah*, 2 vols., ed. by Muḥammad Fū'ād al-Bāqī, (Bayrūt: Al-Maktabah al-Islāmiyyah, n.d.)

Ibn Manẓūr, Jamāl a-Dān Muḥammad, *Lisān al-'Arab*, 8 vols., ed. by Yūsuf al-Khayyāt, (Bayrūt: Dār al-Jīl, 1985).

Ibn al-Muqaffa', 'Abd Allāh, *Kalīlah wa Dimnah*, (Bayrūt: Dār al-Āfāq al-Jadīdah, 1986).

Ibn Murṭaḍā, Aḥmad ibn Yaḥyā, *Ṭabaqāt al-Mu'tazilah*, ed. by Susanna Diwald-Wilzer, (Bayrūt: Dār al-Fikr, 1961).

\_\_\_\_\_, *Al-Munyah wa al-Amal fī Sharḥ al-Milal wa al-Niḥal*, ed. by Muḥammad Jawwād Mashkūr, (Bayrūt: Dār al-Fikr, 1979).

Ibn Muṭarrif, Muḥammad ibn Muḥammad al-Kinānī, *Kitāb al-Qurṭayn*, (Bayrūt: Dār al-Ma'rifah, n.d.)

Ibn al-Nadīm, Muḥammad ibn Iṣḥāq, *Kitāb al-Fihrist li ibn al-Nadīm*, trans. by Bayard Dodge, *The Fihrist of al-Nadīm*, 2 vols., (New York: Columbia University Press, 1970).

Ibn Qudāmah, Muwaffaq al-Dīn 'Abd Allāh ibn Muḥammad, *Taḥrīm al-Nazar fī Kutub ahl al-Kalām*, trans. by George Makdisi, (London, Kegan Paul Publication, 1962).

- Qutaybah, 'Abd Allāh ibn Muslim, *Kitāb al-Ma'ārif*, ed. by Wustenfield, (Faranfūrāt: Ma'had Tārīkh al-'Ulūm al-'Arabiyyah, 1850).
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Kitāb 'Uyūn al-Akhhbār*, 4 vols., (Al-Qāhirah: Dār al-Kitāb al-Miṣriyyah, 1349).
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Kitāb al-Radd 'alā al-Mushabbihah*, ed. by Muḥammad Zāhid al-Kawtharī, (Al-Qāhirah: Maṭba'ah al-Sa'ādah, 1349).
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Kitāb Masā'il wa al-Jawābāt*, (Al-Qāhirah: n.pb., 1349).
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Kitāb al-Ma'ānī al-Kabīr*, 2 vols., (Hydrabād: Dā'irat al-Ma'ārif al-'Uthmāniyyah, 1949).
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Ta'wīl Mukhtalif al-Ḥadīth*, ed. Muḥammad al-Zuhrī al-Najjār, (Bayrūt: Dār al-Jīl, 1983).
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Kitāb Ta'wīl Mushkil al-Qur'ān*, ed. by Aḥmad Saqr, (Bayrūt: Dār Iḥyā' al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyyah, 1954).
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Kitāb al-Anwā'*, ed. by Pellat and Hamidullah, (Hydrabād: Dā'irat al-Ma'ārif al-'Uthmāniyyah, 1956).
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Kitāb Tafsīr Gharīb al-Qur'ān*, ed. by Aḥmad Saqr, (Al-Qāhirah: 'Īsā al-Ḥalabī, 1958).
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Kitāb Adab al-Kātib*, (Bayrūt: Dār al-Kutub al-Islāmiyyah, 1988).
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Kitāb al-Ashribah*, (Al-Dimashq: Dār al-Kutub, n.d.)
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Kitāb al-Shi'r wa Shu'arā'*, 2 vols., (Al-Qāhirah: Dār al-Ma'ārif, n.d.)
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Kitāb al-Ma'ārif*, (Bayrūt, Dār al-Kutub, n.d.)



- \_\_\_\_\_, *Kitāb al-Maysir wa al-Qidāh*, (Al-Qāhirah: Dār al-Kutub al-Miṣriyyah, n.d.)
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Kiṭ āb Taswiyah Bayna al-‘Arab wa al-‘Ajam*, (Al-Qāhirah: Dār al-Kutub al-Miṣriyyah, n.d.)
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Kitāb Gharīb al-Ḥadīth*, 2 vols., (Bayrūt: Dār al-Kutub al-‘Ilmiyyah, 1988).
- \_\_\_\_\_, (ascribed) *Kitāb al-Imāmah wa al-Siyāsah*, 2 vols., ed. by ‘Alī Shūrī, Bayrūt: Dār al-Aḍwā’, 1990.
- Ibn Rushd, Muḥammad ibn ‘Alī, *Faṣl al-Maqāl wa Taqrīr Mā Bayn al-Sharī‘ah wa al-Ḥikmah min al-Ittiṣāl*, trans. by Hourani, *Averroes on the Harmony of Religion and Philosophy*, (London: Luzac Company, 1961).
- Ibn Sa’d, Muḥammad, *Al-Ṭabaqāt al-Kubrā*, 9 vols., (Bayrūt: Dār al-Kutub, 1939).
- Ibn Ṣalāḥ, ‘*Ulūm al-Ḥadīth*, (n.p.: n.pb., n.d.)
- Ibn Sawrah, Abū ‘Īsā Muḥammad ibn ‘Īsā, *Sunan al-Tirmidhī*, edited and commented by Aḥmad Muḥammad Shākir, (Bayrūt: Dār Iḥyā’ al-Turāth, n.d.)
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Sharḥ al-Fiqh al-Akbar*, trans. Wensinck, A.J., *The Muslim Creed*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1932).
- Ibn Sīnā Abū ‘Alī al-Ḥusayn ibn ‘Abd Allāh. *Al-Ishārāt wa al-Tanbīhāt*, 3 vols., ed. Sulaymān Dunyā, Al-Qāhirah: n.pb., 1947-48.

- n Taymiyyah, Taqiyy al-Dīn Aḥmad, *Muwāfaqah Ṣaḥīḥ al-Manqūl li Ṣarīḥ al-Ma'qūl*, 2 vols., (Bayrūt: Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyyah, 1985).
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Fiqh al-Kitāb wa al-Sunnah wa Raf' al-Ḥaraj 'an al-Ummah*, ed. Farīd ibn Amīn, (Bayrūt: Dār al-Kutub al-Ma'rifah, 1986).
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Al-Kalām 'alā Ḥaqīqah al-Islām wa al-Īmān*, ed. by Maḥmūd Ḥasan al-Shaybānī, (Berlin: Shirkah al-'Abikān li Ṭaba'ah wa al-Nashr, 1988).
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Jahd al-Qarīḥah*, trans. by Wael Hallaq, *Ibn Taymiyyah Against the Greek Logicians*, (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1993).
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Iqtidā' al-Ṣirāt al-Mustaḳīm Mukhālafah Aṣḥāb al-Jahīm*, (Bayrūt: Dār al-Fikr, n.d.)
- une, Edward William, *An Arabic-English Lexicon*, 8 vols., (Beirut: Librairie Du Liban, 1980).
- comte, Gerárd, *Ibn Qutayba, L'homme, Son Œuvre, Ses Idées*, (Damas: Editions d'Amerique et d'Orient, 1965).
- \_\_\_\_\_, *L'Intoduction du Kitāb Adab al-Kātib d'Ibn Qutayba*, (Damas: Editions d'Amerique et d'Orient, 1957).
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Le Traité des Divergences du Hadīt*, (Damas: Editions d'Amerique et d'Orient, 1962).
- ar'ashlī, Nadīm, Usāmah Mar'ashlī, *Al-Ṣiḥḥah fī al-Lughah wa al-'Ulūm*, 2 vols., (Bayrūt: Dār al-Ḥadārah al-'Arabiyyah, 1974).

- McCarthy, Richard, *The Theology of al-Ash'arī*, (Beyrouth: Imperimerie Catholique, 1953).
- Macdonald, Duncan, *Development of Muslim Theology, Jurisprudence and Constitutional Theory*, (New York: Russel and Russel, 1965).
- Makdisi, George, *The Rise of Humanism in Classical Islam and the Christian West, With Special Reference to Scholasticism*, (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1990).
- Patton, Walter, *Aḥmad Ibn Ḥanbal and the Miḥna*, (Leiden, n.pb. 1897).
- Schacht, Joseph, *The Origins of Muhammadan Jurisprudence*, (Oxford: The Clarendon Press, 1950).
- Sproul, *An Extract from I.Q.'s Adab al-Kātib with Translation and Notes*, (Leipzig: n.pb., 1877).
- Tritton, M.A. *Muslim Theology*, (London: Luzac Company, 1947).
- Watt, William Montgomery, *Free Will and Predestination in Early Islam*, (London: Luzac Company, 1948).
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Islamic Philosophy and Theology*, (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1962).
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Formative Period of Islamic Thought*, (Edinburgh: University Press, Edinburgh, 1985).
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Early Islam*, (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1990).
- Wensinck, *The Muslim Creed*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1932).

- Olsson, Harry Austrin, *The Philosophy of Kalam*, (Harvard: Harvard University Press, 1976).
- Concise Oxford Dictionary*, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1990).
- Encyclopaedia of Islam*, 8 vols., ed. by E.J. Brill, (Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1986).
- Hadith and Sunnah, Ideals and Realities*, ed. by P.K. Koya, (Kuala Lumpur: Islamic Book Trust, 1996).
- History of Muslim Philosophy*, ed. by M.M. Sharif, (Weisbaden: Otto Harrassowitz, 1963).
- Holy Bible, New Revised Standard Version*, (Nashville: Thomas Nelson Publishers, 1989).
- Neoplatonism and Islamic Thought*, ed. by Parviz Morewedge, (New York: State University New York Press, 1992).

## ARTICLES

- Cherry, A.J., "A New Material on the *Kitāb al-Fihrist* of Ibn al-Nadīm," *Islamic Research Association Miscellany*, (London: University of Oxford., 1948-1949).
- Adawī, 'Abd al-Rahmān, "New Philosophical Texts Lost in Greek and Preserved in Arabic Translations," *Islamic Philosophical Theology*, ed. by Parviz Morewedge, (Albany: State University Press, 1979).



- Badawi, M.M., "Abbāsīd Poetry and Its antecedents," *The Cambridge History of Arabic Literature*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990).
- Brunschvig, R., "Logic and law in Classical Islam," *Logic in Classical Islamic Culture*, ed. by Von Grunebum, (Weisbaden: Otto Harrasowitz, 1970).
- Bosworth, "The Ṭahirids and Saffavids," *The Cambridge History of Iran*, ed. by Frye, (London: Cambridge University Press, 1975).
- Bonebaker, S.A. "Adab and the Concept of Belles Lettres," *The Cambridge History of Arabic Literature*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990).
- Deeb, K. Abu, "Literary Criticism," *The Cambridge History of Arabic Literature*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990).
- Frank, Richard, "Kalām and Philosophy, A Perspective from One Problem," *Islamic Philosophical Theology*, ed. by Parviz Morewedge, (Albany: State University of New York, n.d.)
- Gardett, Louis, "Religion and Culture," *The Cambridge History of Islam*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1970).
- Guillaume, Alfred, "Philosophy and Theology," *Legacy of Islam*, ed. by Thomas Arnold, (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1931).
- Haleem, M. Abdel, "Early Kalām," *History of Islamic Philosophy*, ed. by S.H. Nasr, Part I, (London: Routledge, 1996).

- rb, F., "Wine Poetry (*Khamriyyāt*)," *Abbāsīd Belle-Lettres*, ed. Julia Ashtiany, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990).
- rovitz, Joseph, "Ibn Quteiba's '*Uyūn al-Akhbār*,'" *Islamic Culture*, vol. 4, 1930.
- comte, Gérard, "L'Enseignement Primarie Byzance et au *Kuttāb*," *Arabica*, September, 1954.
- \_\_\_\_\_, "Les Citations de l'ancien et du Nouveau Testament dans l'oeuvre d'Ibn Qutayba," *Arabica*, January, 1958.
- \_\_\_\_\_, "Muḥammad bin Gahm al-Barmak," Gouverneur Philosophe, Jugé Par Ibn Qutayba, *Arabica*, September, 1958.
- \_\_\_\_\_, "La Wasiyya (Testament spirital) Attributé Ibn Qutayba, *R.E.I.*, (1960).
- \_\_\_\_\_, "Les Disciples Directs d'Ibn Qutayba," *Arabica*, 1963.
- \_\_\_\_\_, "Le Problème d'Ab, 'Ubayd: Reflections sur l'erreur" qui lui Attribue Ibn Qutayba," *Arabica*, 1965.
- \_\_\_\_\_, "Ibn Qutayba," *Encyclopaedia of Islam*, (Leiden: E.J.Brill, 1982).
- akdisi, George, "Ash'arī and the Ash'arites in Islamic Religious History," *Studia Islamica*, 17, 1962.
- akki Mahmoud, "The Political History of al-Andalus," *The Legacy of Islamic Spain*, ed. by Salma Kadra Jayyusi, (Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1922).

- Norris, H.T., "Shu'ūbiyyah in Arabic Literature," *Abbāsid Belle-Lettres*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990).
- Peters, F.E., "The Origins of Muslim Platonism: The School Tradition," *Islamic Philosophical Theology*, ed. by Parviz (Morewedge, Albany: State University Press, 1979).
- Pellat, "Le Traité d'Astronomie et de Meteorologie Populaire d'Ibn Qutayba," *Arabica*, 1, January, 1954.
- \_\_\_\_\_, "Dictons Rimes, *Anwā'* et Mansions Lunaires Chez Les Arab," *Arabica*, 2, January, 1955.
- \_\_\_\_\_, "Ibn Qutaybah wa al-Thaqāfah al-'Arabiyyah," *Melanges Tāḥā Husayn*, Al-Qāhirah, 1962.
- Pines, Simon, "Philosophy," *The Cambridge History of Islam*, (London: Cambridge University Press, 1970).
- Smith, William Craig, "The Concept of Sharī'ah among some *Mutakallimūn*," *Arabic and Islamic Studies in Honour of H.A.R. Gibb*, 1965.
- Turki, A.M., "Argument d'Autorité Preuve Rationnelle et Absence de Preuve dans la Méthologie Juridique Musulmane," *Studia Islamica*, 1975.
- Werblosky, "Anthropomorphism," *The Encyclopedia of Religion*, ed. M. Eliade, (New York, Collier Macmillan, 1987).
- Vajda, "Observations sur Quelques Citations Bibliques Chez Ibn Qutayba," *R.E.J.*, 1935.

egane Shayegan, "The Transmission of Greek Philosophy to the Muslim World," *History of Islamic Philosophy*, Part 1, ed. by Nasr, (London: Routledge, 1996).

The Origins of the Controversy Concerning the Creation of the Koran," *Religious Schools and Sect in Medieval Islam*, ed. by Madelung, (London: Variorum Reprints, 1985).





# TA'WIL MUKHTALIF AL-HADĪTH

## AN ANNOTATED TRANSLATION

**TA'WIL MUKHTALIF AL-HADĪTH: AN ANNOTATED TRANSLATION** is a work of translation of an Arabic text into English. This text is worthy to be translated because it deals with the need to understand and appreciate (1) the reason behind the citation of the *hadīth* of the Prophet, (2) the dynamism of the context of the *hadīth* of the Prophet, (3) the correct and proper method of *hadīth* interpretation and (4) the method of contextualizing the *aḥādīth* of the Prophet in the contemporary life.

**Che Amnah binti Bahari**, born in Alor Star, Kedah Darul Aman, Malaysia, is an Assistant Professor at the Department of Uṣūl al-Dīn and Comparative Religion (UDCR), Kulliyah of Islamic Revealed Knowledge and Human Sciences, (KIRKHS), International Islamic University Malaysia (IIUM). She is also the Chairperson for Research and Publication Committee for UDCR and a member of the Academic Board of KIRKHS. She has taught Islamic Ethics, Islamic *Aqīdah*, Methods of *Da'wah*, Contemporary Moral Issues and Readings in Islamic Thought.

IIUM Press  
International Islamic University Malaysia  
Box 10, 50728 Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia  
603-6196 5014 Fax: +603-6196 4862  
E-mail: [rescenter@iium.edu.my](mailto:rescenter@iium.edu.my)  
Website: <http://rescenter.ph.iium.edu.my>

ISBN 978-983-3855-89-6



9 789833 855896